

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

THE STRONG ROPE (A.S.)



وَاعْتَصِمُوا بِحَبْلِ اللَّهِ جَمِيعًا وَلَا تَفَرَّقُوا...

And hold fast by the rope of Allah all together and be not disunited...

Encouraging one and all to fasten unto The Strong Rope of Allah i.e. the Wilaayah of Imam Ali Ibn Abi Talib & the Imams from his pure progeny (peace be on them).

WWW.THESTRONGROPE.COM

FEATURES
OF
THE TWO
SCHOOLS

By

The Learned `Allamah

Sayyid Murtada Al-`Askari

Vol. 1

Translated From the Original Arabic

By

M.J. Khalili

FEATURES OF THE TWO SCHOOLS

Vol. 1

Written By: The Learned ‘Alla mah Sayyid Murtada Al-‘Askari

Translated By: M.J. Khalili

Distribution Center: Bunyad Be‘that

First edition: 1998

Address: No 109, Somayyeh St., Teharn, The Islamic Republic of Iran

Tel: 009621 - 8822244

Fax: 009621 - 8821370

P.O. Box: 15815/1361

All Rights Reserved

Bismillah al-Rahman al-Rahim

[In The Name Of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful]

Dedication

O Imam of the Time, Peace and Allah's mercy and blessings be upon you!

O my master, son of the Messenger of Allah, Sallallahu 'alayhi wa Alihi wa sallam (peace be on him and his progeny), to you I dedicate this trivial effort.

"O Ruler! Misfortune has touched us and our folk, and we have come with poor merchandise, so grant us full measure and be charitable to us. Surely Allah rewards the charitable." (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 88)

O Generous and Magnanimous One! Intercede with Allah for us to forgive our sins and remove misfortune from us and our people, He is the most Merciful of the merciful ones.

The humblest of your servants

Murtada al-'Askari

[In The Name Of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful]

I take refuge in Allah from the outcast Satan!

"... therefore give good tidings to My servants who listen to the word and follow the best of it. Such are those whom Allah has guided and such are men of understanding." (Surah Zumar (39): Verses17 - 18)

The Translator's Preface

If you were an Arabic reader, you could have immediately recognized the significance of this book after reading only a few of its pages. This significance is caused by two points:

The first is the scarcity of the analytic studies of what happened to the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) after him and of the relevant events in the early Islamic history - I mean the impartial studies devoid of sectarianism and religious fanaticism. But the author, from the beginning, pledges not to deviate "a hair's breadth" from his obligation of complete neutrality in his discussion, and he keeps his word along the lines of the book. The certain signs of anger which you may see in a sentence here or an expression there are but the signs of anger for the sake of Allah and for the truth, as whoever is in quest of the truth cannot but be angry for it.

The second is the "collective duty" which is to be borne by the capable ones. Thus, our learned 'Allamah, al-'Askari, has shouldered this duty in his capacity of being one of the elite scholars of the nation who are to convey the word of truth to the Muslims who have been deceived by scholars and historians bought over by the rulers of their times, and also to the non-Muslim scholars and historians, who were deceived by the fabrications and distortions which they took to be true, or, driven by carnal desires, they tread the same path of deviation.

Nevertheless, there were always a few who preferred poverty with truth to prosperity with falsehood; so, they did not refrain from saying the truth to please their consciences and for the sake of Allah. The truth which is announced by this book is the fact that the Islamic history had witnessed rulers who obeyed neither Allah nor His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). They actually disobeyed Him openly and for everyone to see (such as Khalid Ibn al-Walid who killed one of the pious companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) (viz. Maalik Ibn al-Nuwayhrah) and immediately married the victim's wife even before her husband's blood had dried. Or, such as Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah, who killed the grandson of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Imam Husain (peace be on him), in the first year of his rule; in his second year, he attacked the Holy K'abah with his catapults of fireballs, and in his third year, he plundered the

city of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and made it permissible for three days to his soldiers to do as they pleased).

All these had been definitely proved and they had to be announced. It is the right of Arab Muslims to know the truth which had been kept away from them.

When I was asked to translate this book into English, it occurred to me whether it would also be as important if presented to non-Arabic readers, and whether it could be of any benefit to them.

Here, too, appear two points confirming the importance of the translated version of the book in different languages:

The first is that there are Muslims who do not speak Arabic, and they are millions in number, entitled to the same right as Arab readers, in also knowing the truth which has been concealed from them, even by those who wrote for them in their own languages, such as Thomas Patrick Hughes, a clergyman, who published his Dictionary of Islam, in which he levelled false allegations against Islam and the Prophet of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), denying the Holy Qur'an to be a divine Book, renouncing the importance of Muslims, saying that their numbers all over the world did not exceed 175 million, and that the Shiite population is only ten million. He also regards "the khalifah 'Umar as the real founder of the religious and political power of Islam". He disregards all proved scholarly evidences when he says that the general construction of the Holy Qur'an supports the opinion which said that its subject matter Muhammad had received by hearing, then he ingeniously formed it poetically.

Or take the orientalist, Mr. F. Pincott who, on the authority of the aforementioned T.P. Hughes, had said that: "Sikhism has been treated as a sect of Islam...", and that: "The religion of Nanak was really intended as a compromise between Hinduism and Muhammadanism, if it may not even be spoken of as the religion of a Muhammadan sect."

Or, the Encyclopedia of Islam, new edition, of 1986, Leiden, which was prepared by "a number of leading orientalists", in Volume One, p.382 (a), says: "... Whether 'Ali really hoped to succeed Muhammad is doubtful... The Shiites, by inventing or interpreting in the light of their beliefs certain words said to have been used by Muhammad concerning 'Ali, have always maintained that the Prophet intended to

transmit the succession to his son-in-law and cousin, but it is certain, in any case, that in his last illness he did not express this desire..."

Take another example of Dr. Muhammad Muhsin Khan, professor at the Islamic University of al-Madinah. He translated al-Bukhari's Sahih, and his translation was endorsed by a group of University professors to be correct: "and acquired a high degree of precision." But, the least that can be said about him is that he changes what he does not like in al-Bukhari's (original) text or even deletes it. Take, for instance, the Hadith No.307, Chapter of "How do people give the oath of allegiance to the Imam (Ruler)?" of the Book of "al-Ahkam", p.236 of Vol. IX. The Arabic text of the hadith reads: "... We gave the oath of allegiance to Allah's Apostle (peace be on him and his progeny)that we would... and not dispute over the Amr [affair] with its people." But the translator wrote: "... and that we would not fight against the ruler or disobey him..."

The second is that the destructive and falsifying effects of the hostile orientalist on the distortion of truth were no less than the bought-over Arab scholars and fabricating historians, as their allegations were taken as unquestionable and reliable facts. Some were even more deceitful than deviated Arab historians. They adulterated honey with poison. They distorted on the pretext of reformation, and destroyed in the name of construction. They disregarded the real truth either because they depended on sources which concealed the truth or they did so on purpose.

Such being the case, there was no way but to throw light for millions of non-Arab Muslims, to place them on the path of right guidance. At the same time, it is fair enough to offer an equitable chance to the orientalist who have for centuries followed the path of deviation, knowingly or unknowingly.

This book, because of all the aforementioned features, is different from the general books on Islamic studies, which you can evaluate after reading only a few pages. It compels you to continually keep back your judgment until you come to its end. Only then you will find yourself - should your heart be free from certain illnesses - obliged to submit to what the author says, or rather, to what the straight, true and undistorted facts of the history, and the consecutive and authentic narrations say, because of their irrefutable and persuasive evidences.

My claim is clearly evident in the letters of applause and exaltation that poured on the author, confessing their gratitude for the torch he had placed in their hands. I will be contented with showing only two specimens of those letters:

Letters of Gratitude

After the publication of the Arabic version of *The Features of the Two Schools*, the learned 'Allamah al-'Askari received many letters of commendation from renowned international scholars and personalities in praise of his highly scholarly work. Here are excerpts of some.

"... Allah has bestowed upon me the favour of coming across your book, *The Features of the Two Schools*, which had a great effect on me through its explicit presentation and objective argumentations. Consequently, I was compelled to have a second look into many of my earlier indisputable opinions, until, at last, I was guided by Allah's guidance to follow the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on him) and the Imamate, after I had spent all my years as a follower of the (so-called) School of Caliphate.

Much as I was pleased with the contents of your great book, I felt sorry for the fact that this luminous thought is out of the reach of the Muslims in the Arabic West... Thus, I am writing you to request the following:

- 1 - Please send me a copy of this valuable book, as the copy which I read was borrowed from an Iraqi friend. I tried hard to obtain a copy of it, but movement is too constrained in this remote country.
- 2 - Be kind enough as to supply me with some of your valued works, as I am sure they, too, contain the necessary remedies for our chronic diseases and would satisfy our thirst for the truth.
- 3 - Please permit us to quote from your "glowing torch" to be published in the Moroccan and Algerian press in particular. We will summarize or translate parts of your discussions for French periodicals, without transgressing or misinterpreting the text..."

Your humblest servant

Muhammad Hasani,
Algiers, 1990.

From Holland, Mr. Abu J'afar, wrote to Al-Jihad weekly which is published in Tehran, I.R. of Iran, saying:

"... I request you to publish this letter, addressed to our brother, the 'Allamah Ayatullah Sayyid Murtada Al-'Askari, may Allah reward him good on our behalf.

So much pleased this humble servant (of Allah) was, after 25 years of wandering astray from the right path marked by the torches of the light of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), on receiving the first dispatch of the works of the Sayyid (Al-'Askari), which helped me a great deal in comprehending the fact as they really were, including irrefutable proofs and clear evidences defying the people of the falsehood, the treacherous rulers and their fake preachers, the mercenary scholars, working for the world of arrogance and super powers, who stand like stumbling blocks in the way of advancement of the Islamic nation in playing its natural historical role of fighting the line of Mu'awiyah and his son, Yazid - the line deviated from that of the tolerant Shari'ah.

The 'Allama's works advocate a true call to a quiet argument founded on scientific bases, avoiding insults. They invite to a brotherly constructive discussion, away from sectarian disputes, which have so far torn up the unity of this ummah..."

What is the aim and purpose of this book?

The objective of the book announced by the author is that: "Today's Muslims, while on the threshold of a comprehensive Islamic renaissance... should return to the true Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), uncovering what had been concealed by the policy of rulers over centuries. They should strive for the sake of the unity of the Muslims, by acting according to the Book of Allah and the true Sunnah of His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), otherwise the Muslims cannot be gathered around the Book and the Sunnah which is acceptable to all of them..."

This very objective is true in respect of the English version of the book, to which can be added the sincere directing of the orientalist who are free from the fetters of imperialistic policies, and of the historians looking for the truth in history, or, rather, true history. I am sure that such people do exist, though few in number, and this book will guide them to the right path and teach them how to read history and scrutinize its events. It will also tell them that among Muslim scholars, there are those who are enlightened, know how to explore the inner folds of the hadiths and the historical events and to distinguish between the meagre and the fleshy and hence, capable of relating the historical events as they actually happened. Prominent among these scholars is our 'Allamah al-'Askari. A brief account of his biography is as follows: He was born in Saamarra' (Iraq) in the year 1332 A.H. He studied the Arabic language, logic and the preliminary stages of jurisprudence (al-fiqh) and its principles (al-usul) in his birthplace.

In 1350 A.H., he moved to the holy city of Qum (Iran), a center of the Islamic studies for acquiring other branches of knowledge.

In 1353 A.H., he returned to Saamarra' where he continued his studies.

Educational Activities

In 1363 A.H. he started establishing a series of formal religious schools, beginning with the establishment of a school in Kazimayn (a suburb of Baghdad).

In 1373 A.H. he was elected chairman of the Islamic Charity Fund in Baghdad, for the establishment of educational schools for the primary up to the secondary stages, admitting boys and girls separately. Such schools had been established in the towns of Kazimayn, Baghdad, Hillah, Diwaniyyah, Nu'maniyyah and Basrah.

He, then, established the 'Usul al-Deen College [a college for religious studies] in Baghdad, under his direct administration. It granted B.A. degrees, and lasted for several courses. Its graduates continued their activities under his patronage and guidance. He issued Islamic periodicals, such as: Risaalah al-Islam [The Message of Islam] and Al-Mujtama' al-Islami [The Islamic Society].

In 1383 A.H., he undertook a charity project in al-Kazimayn and Baghdad, called "The Project of Islamic Welfare". It covered the following activities:

1. Providing for the visitors of the holy shrines, including medical treatment.

2. Meeting the material and spiritual needs of the students of Islamic studies in Iraq, including their medical care.
3. The establishment of dispensaries in al-Kazimayn and Baghdad.

Political Activities

Due to the advent and growth of the Communist and Nationalist parties in Arab countries, such as the Arab Baath Socialist party in Iraq, he launched a strong ideological campaign against them, by way of spreading the Islamic culture.

After the Baath party came to power in Iraq he joined the late Grand Ayatullah Sayyid Muhsin al-Hakeem (r.a.) in his political activities against the said party. Consequently, the leaders of the said party decided to arrest him, but they failed because he migrated to Lebanon, whence he travelled to Iran and settled in Tehran.

His Works

Encyclopedic Studies scrutinizing the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

1. Ahadith Umm al-Mu‘minin ‘A’ishah (Stages of her life). Vol. 1. Printed.
2. Ahadith Umm al-Mu‘minin ‘A’ishah (Studying her hadiths) (MS).
3. ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba and Other Myths vol. 1. (Published)
4. ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba and Other Myths, vol. 2. (Published).
5. Abdullah Ibn Saba and the myth of Sabaism, vol. 3. (MS)
6. One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions from Bani Tamim, vol.1, (published)
7. One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions from different tribes. vol. 2. (Published)
8. One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions, vol. 3. (MS).
9. Fabricated Narrators (MS)
10. Fabrications and Fabricators (MS).
11. Israeli Narratives and the Narratives of the Atheists and the Fanatics (MS)

12. The Lives of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) (MS).
13. Biographies of the companions who saw and quoted the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) (MS).
14. Biographies of the companions who saw him (peace be on him and his progeny) but did not quote him (peace be on him and his progeny) (MS).
15. Biographies of those who were regarded as companions though they neither saw him (peace be on him and his progeny) nor quoted him (peace be on him and his progeny) (MS).

The Encyclopedia of Features of Islam

A. The published:

1. Ta'alim al-Islam [The Teachings of Islam].
2. Ahkam al-Islam [The precepts of Islam].
3. Selected Invocations. B. The MS.:
4. The Islamic Manners.
5. The Ideological Terminology.
6. The Islamic Beliefs in the Glorious Qur'an.
7. Politics in Islam or the Sultan's Judgements.
8. The Role of the Imams (peace be on them) in the Revival of Religion
9. The factors of distorting the Sunnah of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny).
10. The Islamic Sects and the Reasons of their Appearance
11. The Revival of Monotheism by the Imams (peace be on them)
12. The Revival of the Sunnah by the successor (peace be on him)
13. Miscellaneous

The Encyclopedia of Features of the Two Schools

A. The Published:

1. Discussions of the Two Schools about the Companions and the Imamate.
2. Discussions of the Two Schools about the Sources of the Islamic Shari'ah.

3. The Effect of the Imam Husain's (peace be on him) uprising in reviving the Sunnah of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny).

B. The MS.:

4. The Caliphs' Biographies.

5. The Transferred Narratives - The narratives and opinions transferred from the Khulafa School to Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School

6. Discussions of Comparative Jurisprudence in the Two Schools.

7. a. The Ages of the Establishment of the Two Schools and their Rules.

b. The Disaster of the Mongolian Invasion of Islamic Countries and how the Two Schools Dealt with Them.

c. Slanders against Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school.

8. The Glorious Qur'an and the Narratives of the Two Schools - Preliminary Discussions

9. The Glorious Qur'an and the Narratives of the Khulafa School.

10. The Glorious Qur'an and the Narratives of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School.

11. Oriental Studies and the Missionaries Relations with the Two Schools.

This prolific author is spending his life for the realization of his objective in all that he did and wrote, despite his poor health.

I pray to Allah the Almighty to assist him in continuing his blessed line of enlightening the scholars – through his writings –to stir up their determination to implement Islam's goal of uniting the Muslims in worshipping Allah the One.

M. J. Khalili

N.B. Certain Islamic terms have been printed in italics and explained in a glossary at the end of the book.

A Brief Outlook of the Book

The book begins with Preliminary studies showing the origin of the differences between the two schools of the Imaamah and Khilaafah. Then the discussions of the book are divided into two parts:

PART ONE:

This part covers the discussions of the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah and the ways of approaching them by the two schools. They are the foundations of the Islamic ideology and precepts. They cover the following five topics:

First: The discussions of the two schools about the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companionship and his companions.

Second: The discussions of the two schools about the Imamate and the Caliphate, both being among the ways of getting to the Islamic Law and forming a correct vision of Islam.

Third: The discussions of the two schools concerning the sources of the Islamic Law which are divided into two groups: (1) Studying the narratives of the two schools and the Glorious Qur'an. (2) Their discussions concerning the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah, and how the school of the Caliphs took "Ijtihad" and "acting upon whimsical interpretation/opinion" to be among the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah together with "the Book" and "the Sunnah" of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Here, the discussions on the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah, and the ways of approaching them by the Khulafa School are ended.

Fourth: The uprising of the Imam Husain (peace be on him) against the deviation from the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah because of Ijtihad and acting upon opinion.

Fifth: The success of the Imams (peace be on them) of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) in restoring the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah to the community after the uprising of Imam Husain (peace be on him), and the success of their school in spreading the Sunnah of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) thereafter. This ends the discussion on the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah and the ways of approaching them by the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), by which, the discussions on the bases of thought in both schools end.

PART TWO:

This part covers the different aspects of the activities of the followers of the two schools in the intellectual, political and social fields. It will, Insha'Allah, cover the following four chapters:

- a. The spread of the opinions of the school of the Caliphs from Iran, and the establishment of the states of its followers in it.
- b. The Mongolian invasion of Islamic countries and their annihilation of the 'Abbasid Caliphate in Baghdad.
- c. The spread of Shi'ism, especially from Iran, in the Kufah region (in Iraq), the activities of its people in spreading the thoughts of the School of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and the establishment of the states of their followers.

- d. The fabrications against the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them).

Preliminary Discussions

- Forward
- Consequences of the Differences within the Islamic Ummah

- Some Attributes of Allah and the Origin of Dispute about them
- The Differences about the Prophets' (peace be on them) characteristics and their origin
- The Differences on celebrating the Birthdays of the Prophets (peace be on them)
- The Difference on building on the Graves of the Prophets (peace be on them)
- The Difference on Weeping over the Dead and its Origin
- The Difference on the Interpretation of Some Verses of the Book of Allah
- Conclusions

FOREWORD

Allah, in conformity with His Lordship, has legislated a religion which regulates human life, makes him happy and takes him to his humanistic perfection. He guided man through his Prophets (peace be on them) to this religion and named it Islam.¹ He also enacted for all His creatures such rules as per their nature and disposition to lead them to their existential perfect development proceedings either by inspiration or subjugation².

In the past, on the death of a Prophet in a nation, the powerful and influential elite of that nation used to hasten to distort or conceal whatever they did not like of their Prophet's religion and then ascribed to Allah and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) their own distorted Shari'ah³.

¹ Allah the Exalted says: **"Surely the religion with Allah is Islam."** (Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 19), and says: **"And whoever follows a religion other than Islam, it shall not be accepted from him."** (Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 85).

² Allah the Exalted says: **"Glorify the Name of your Lord, the Most High, who creates, then makes complete, Who measures, then guides, Who grows out pasture, then turns it to russet stubble"** (Surah A'laa (87): Verses 1-5). He also says: **"He said: Our lord is He who gave to everything its creation then guided it."** (Surah Taha (20): Verse 50) and **"And your Lord inspired the bee (saying): Build honeycombs in the mountains, trees and in whatever they build."** (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 68), and **"He created the sun and the moon and the stars subservient by His command."** (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 54)

³ Allah the Exalted says, **"There is a party of them who distort the Book with their tongues, that you may think it to be from the Book, while it is not from the Book, and they say, 'It is from Allah' while it is not from Allah, and they tell lies against Allah, while they know."** (Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 78). He also says, **"Do you then hope that they would believe in you, while a party of them used to listen to the word of Allah, then distorted it after they had understood it, while they knew."** (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 75) You can also refer to the following verses Surah Baqarah (2): Verses 42, 146, 159, 174; Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 187; Surah Nisaa (4): Verses 46, Surah Maedah (5): Verses 13, 15, 41, 59-61.

Thereafter, Allah the High, renewed the religion of Islam by sending a new Prophet, who used to abrogate the distorted rites and rituals. Finally, when Allah the High sent the Seal of the Prophets, Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa (peace be on him and his progeny) with the Noble Qur'an, He offered in it the principles of Islam, such as beliefs and precepts in indisputable verses, and inspired him (peace be on him and his progeny) with the details of what had been revealed in this holy Book. He (peace be on him and his progeny) was told to explain to the people what had been sent to them¹. So, he taught them the precepts of Islam, such as: the ritual and numbers of the prayers (*salaah*), what they are to refrain from during the fasting (*sawm*) and its conditions, the circumambulation (*tawaaf*) of the Holy Ka'bah and its numbers, beginning and end, and many other precepts of obligatory, recommended and forbidden acts, all of which constituted the noble Sunnah for the Muslims. Furthermore, Allah the High, said that Islam was embodied in the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), ordering the people to follow his example, as in the verse:

"You have in the Messenger of Allah a good example (to be followed) ..."

(Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 21). The total conduct of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and his speeches are called "the Sunnah in the Islamic Shari'ah. We are ordered by Allah and His Messenger to follow that Sunnah².

Thus, Allah the Almighty completed for us the communication of Islam through the Noble Qur'an and the Sunnah. Before his demise, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) informed and warned his Ummah that there would happen to Islam exactly what had happened to the past nations, and that if

¹ Allah the Exalted says: **"And We have revealed to you the remembrance that you may explain to the people what has been revealed for them, and that haply they may reflect."** (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 44).

² In the verse: **"You have in the Messenger of Allah a good example ..."** Allah the Almighty orders us to follow the example of His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). And in the verse: **"... and whatever the Messenger gives you, take it, and whatever he forbids you, abstain (from it)..."** (Surah Hashr (59): Verse 7). He orders us to act according to the instructions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

someone in the older times had entered into the hole of a lizard, someone of this Ummah would have done exactly the same.¹

Owing to the practice of distortion among this Ummah, it was that Allah the Exalted protected Qur'an from being distorted. He says: **"It is We Who revealed the Reminder and it is We Who are guarding it."** (Surah Hijr (15): Verse 9) and says: **"Falsehood does not come to it from before it nor from behind it..."** (Surah Fusselat (41): Verse 42).

As regards the Sunnah, which narrates for us the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) conduct and speeches in numerous narratives, Allah the High did not guard it against distortion and deviation. This is quite clear from the discrepancies in the narratives on Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) traditions, which are in the hands of the Muslims today, some of them contradicting the others. This fact motivated some of the scholars to reconcile

¹ Look up the details of the relevant narrations in the 5th discussion of the preliminary discussion of Vol.2 of "A hundred and fifty fabricated companions"; Refer, also, to the texts of the narrations in the following references:

- a. Kamaal al-Deen, by al-Shaikh al-Saduq, p.576, quoted by al-Majlisi in al-Behaar al-Anwaar, vol. 8, p. 3, and under the exegesis of the verse: **"You shall ascend a stage after a stage"** (Surah Insheqaaq (84): Verse 19) in "Majma' al-Bayaan" by Shaikh al-Tabarsi, and "Jalaa al-Azhaan wa Jelaa al-Ahzaan" (famous as Tafseer Gaazor) by Husain Ibn Hasan al-Jurjaani (r.a.).
- b. "Sahih al-Bukhari", Chapter on (the Prophets), see on what is stated on Bani Israel (H.3), Vol.2/ 171, and Al-I'tisamu Bi al-Kitab Wa al-Sunnah (Fastening unto the Book and the Sunnah), Chapter on Aqwaal al-Nabi (The Sayings of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)): "You will follow the tradition of those who were before you..." H.1, 2, Vol.4, p.174 and "Fath al-Baari fi Sharh al-Bukhari", (vol.17, pp.63, 64).
- c. Sahih Muslim bi Sharh al-Nawawi, 916/219, the Chapter on "al-'Ilm."
- d. Sahih al-Tirmidhi, 9/27, 29 and 10/ 109
- e. Sunan Ibn Maajah, H. 3994
- f. Musnad al-Tayaalisi, H.1346, 2178
- g. Musnad Ahmad 2/327, 367, 450. 511, 527. 31/84, 94. 4/125. 5/218, 340
- h. Majma' al-Zawaaed, 7/261 quoting from al-Tabaraani
- i. "Kanz al-Ummaal", 11/123, quoted from al-Tabaraani in "Al-Mo'jam al-'Awsat", and from al-Haakem in "al-Mustadrak"
- j. In the exegesis of the verse: **"And be not like those who divided ..."** (Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 105) in "Al-Durr al-Manthur" by al-Suyuti quoting from "al-Mustadrak" by al-Haakem

such contradictory traditions, and they wrote books, such as: "Ta'wil Mukhtalaf al-Hadith"¹, "Bayan Mushkil al-Hadith"², and "Bayan Mushkilah al-Athar"³.

Due to the discrepancies of the traditions, the Muslims differed on understanding the Holy Qur'an, and their unity disrupted forever. To this we may add their living in diverse environments and among peoples of different opinions and religions. All those caused them to have diverse opinions about Islam. Some of them took to interpreting the glorious verses and the available true noble hadiths to suit their own ideas and understanding of Islam, leading to the rupture of their relations among themselves, refraining from listening to one author's opinions and accusing each other of unbelief".

Those were the factors of the internal confusion, as there were some external factors which acted from inside by their agents, as below:

External Destructive Factors

Among the factors of ruination and distortion in the sources of Islamic studies, i.e. the books of traditions, the biographies of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and the commentaries of the Holy Quran, were the external ones, which were as follows:

1. The narratives of the Christians and the Jews which were infused in the sources of Islamic studies, like those of Ka'b al-Ahbaar and al-Tamim al-Daari.
2. Narrations and traditions fabricated by atheists like Ibn Abi al-'Awjaa and Saif Ibn 'Umar and which were disseminated in reference books.⁴

¹ Sahih Muslim, book on "The Merits", Chapter on "The nearness of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) to the people and their receiving his blessings.", hadith No. 74, P. 1812.

² Shih al-bukhari, commenting on Surah al-Zumar (39), vol. 2, p. 122, and book on "Al-Tawhid", Chapter "**Allah's saying: When I created with my hand**", Vol. 4/186, and Chapter "Faces on that day will be bright" Vol. 4/192.

"Sahih Muslim", book on "Descriptions of the Resurrection, Paradise and Hell", Traditions 19, 21, 22.

³ By Abu Ja'far Ahmad Ibn Muhammad al-'Azdi, known as al-Tahaawi (d.331 or 332 A.H).

⁴ We discussed the diffusion of the narratives of the people of the Book into the sources of the Islamic studies in Vol.6 of the series The Role of Imams in Reviving the Sunnah. The ruinous effects of the orientalisists were discussed in its Vols. 3 and

3. Finally, when the forces of disbelief (the imperialists) invaded the Muslim countries, they fought Islam with the most destructive weapon when they employed the Jewish and Christian scholars, known as the orientalist, to find out the frailties (as per their understanding) in Islamic sources and employed them in their war against Islam. So, they did their best to organize indices, arranged them properly, published and broadcasted them heavily in the most skilful manner possible. Through these programs, they had a bird's view of everything. They picked out from various books every fabricated and narrative to deform the face of Islam, such as the legend of the cranes and the like. Out of their findings they composed wonderful and contemporary styles, such as The Islamic Encyclopedia and Muhammad the Politician Prophet.¹

The invading imperialists were more perilous in their war against Islam when they pushed to the front, in the Muslim countries, the disciples of those orientalist, the graduates of their schools of thought, the advocates of their ideas and the proponents of their civilization. They highlighted them and described them as "the reformers of Islam", "the enlightened" or "the progressive" elements. They started importing the products of their opinions to the Islamic countries and used all means of spreading them under different attractive names and titles.

Among those were Sir Sayyid Ahmad, the founder of the Islamic university of Aligarh in India; Ahmad Lutfi al-Sayyid, famous as "the teacher of the generation", and Qasim Amîn, the champion of women's rights in Egypt. They did the same in Iraq, Iran and other Islamic Countries. (1)² It was natural, thus,

4. The ruinous effects of the atheists were studied in its Vol.6. and in the "Preliminary Discussions" of Vol.1 of One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions. We particularly studied Saif's distortions in the said Book, as well as in Abdullah Ibn Saba'.

¹In every era there were exceptions among orientalist who spoke the truth.

² These and their ilk were the propagandists for Western civilization in the Islamic countries. They strived to destroy Islamic traditions and reject them. We had formerly argued some of what they used to publish imported Western thought. We tried to publish the first volume in Iraq, but the publishing houses refused it. The (Christian) MHaroonite government banned its publication in Lebanon then. So, we could not publish the other volumes of the book. We noted that the best book published in this respect was The Three Wings of Cunning by Abd al-Rahman

that a war should take place between them and the protectors of the genuine Islamic thought, in which the imperialists and their agents would support the deceived disciples of the orientalist. The most destructive weapon in their hand was the pretext with which they fought Islam under the name of introducing Islam and Islamic personalities, such as what had been done by Sir Sayyid Ahmad, who wrote what he alleged to be an exegesis of the Holy Qur'an and Georgi Zidane in his novels. They and their oriental tutors exerted all their efforts to carry out a single objective, which is expressed in a unit shell by one of them: "Religion can only be killed by the sword of religion itself".

To execute this plan, they wrote exegeses for the Qur'an, explained the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) honourable narrations and wrote biographies for the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and the Imams (peace be on them), with the sole aim of divesting them of their communication with the unseen (i.e. celestial being), showing them to be of ordinary human nature, and hinting at or even declaring that, every one of them, and everything in Islam, was suitable just for that particular time, and was regarded to be progressive and useful at its time. But today, they say, Islam needs reformation and renewal so as to conform with the time and the needs of its people.

They, with the hidden effect of their weapon, are more harmful to Islam than some politicians in our countries, who are agents to the infidel invaders and are appointed as rulers of Islamic countries. They waged an intellectual war by means of distorting the facts of Islam, under the title of introducing it, or presenting an improved Islam that meets the needs of the time.

It can be understood from what has been said that the Muslims, today, and after what Islam has suffered from the many trends of thought, are in need of elaborated studies on the sayings of the Islamic schools of thoughts, so as to scrutinize what they have to say, contrary to some zealous Muslims who think that to keep silent is better for preserving the unity of the Muslims!

Hasan Habankah al-Maydani, of the series of The Enemies of Islam, though we have some critical points against it.

I wonder how is this possible while the Khawarij [Kharijites]¹, whose basic ideologies are built on accusing the Muslims in general, of disbelief? They say that they are the only Muslims, and that all other Muslims are polytheists. They also declare their renunciation of the Caliph 'Uthman, the Imam 'Ali, the Mother of the Believers 'A'ishah, Talhah, az-Zubair, Mu'awiyah, 'Amr Ibn al-'As and their followers, and they curse them as they curse all the Muslims.

How can it happen, while there are among the Muslims people who are anxious to visit the tombs of the holy Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), and the Imams of the Muslims, to receive their blessings, to get Allah's pleasure by means of their intercession? How can this be, while there are those who regard all these things to be signs of polytheism, deviation from Islam and unlawful innovations? Consequently, they regard all Muslims, as from the third century A.H. uptill now, to be polytheists. Thereupon, they pulled down the Muslims' mosques built along the road to Hira' cave. They did the same to the sacred places of worship, besides destroying the tombs of the Imams of the Muslims, the Mothers of the Believers [The wives of the Prophet(peace be on him and his progeny)]. The Messenger's uncle, his son, his companions and the martyrs of 'Uhud Battle. They do not treat, on the same footing, the Jews with their Torah and Synagogues and the Christians with their Churches, which are filled with crosses and statues of Jesus and Mary (peace be on her) announcing Jesus to be their Lord, and that Allah is the third of the three (gods) in their trinity (God forbid!) Yet, they conclude treaties with them and never accuse them of being polytheists!

Furthermore, the aforementioned matters and the like are not regarded as personal matters concerning the Muslim individual, such as hanging one's hands during the Salat, which is the case with the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and the Malikis, whereas the Hanafis and the Hanbalis believe that the hands must be folded on the chest during the Salat, or like the difference in the washing, or anointing the feet in the wudu'. Such precepts can be performed by the Muslim individual according to his own belief acquired by imitation or personal inference, whereas the individual from any other sect can perform it according to his own belief, and yet, both of them can coexist in complete harmony in a single. Islamic

¹ . They are spread along the eastern part of the Arab peninsula and in North Africa. They even have a government in Oman and are called as al-Ebadhiyyah.

society. Are those the foundations on which society is to be built, and the society is either built on this belief, in which case that one should disappear, or it is built on that belief, in which case this one should disappear?

Moreover, they are not political and non-religious questions, and can be disregarded for the sake of the unity of the Muslims. The publication of millions of books like "Now it is The Magi's Turn", under pseudonym or frank names, financed by some governments, in order to accuse a large section of the ummah of deviation and the spending of millions of dollars to spread their propaganda in thousands of institutes, mosques and schools, all over the world, to the effect that all Muslims, other than themselves, were polytheists, and their sending out thousands of emissaries to all parts of the world to spread their unilateral propaganda. Are all these not motivated by political and non-religious motives?

Still they are not cases created by imperialism to cause dispute among the Muslims so that one may keep silent about them. They are cases which existed and had been spread among the Islamic community ever since the time of the Imam of the Hanbalis, Ahmad (d. 240 A.H.), and the time of Shaykh Ibn Taymiyyah (d. 728 A.H.) as a follower of his school, or even before that, till date. The macabre massacres of hundreds of thousands of the Muslims and burning of their libraries in diverse eras and different countries, are the best evidences of what we say. Therefore, they can politically be utilized by the rulers or by the imperialists, whenever they like, unless they are treated and cured. They are, as we said, deep-rooted beliefs, and to reluctantly keep silent about them would not fulfill the unity among the Muslims, nor can there be any mutual understanding and rapprochement. Actually, it will deepen the wound, widen the gap and lengthen its stay. For further explanation and proving the said arguments, I relate my observations of the results of the differences among the sons of the Muslim Ummah:

Consequences of the Differences within the Islamic Ummah: Personal Observations

In the aforementioned information about Muslims' accusing one another of unbelief, and in what I am going to retell, together with examples of their argumentations, I depend on my own observations during my travels in the Muslim countries, the meetings I had with the scholars and thinkers of the Muslim sects and the people, particularly during my ten Hajj journeys to the Sacred Mosque in Holy Makkah.

The First Travel

My first Hajj sojourn was during the rule of King 'Abdul'Aziz Ibn Sa'ud. When our caravan - the Iraqi caravan - arrived in the town of Ar-Rimah of Sa'udi Arabia, we stayed there for 24 hours, and took part in the congregational prayers in their mosques. Before leaving, a group of the people of the town gathered to bid us farewell. Among them was a man who looked like one of their scholars. He delivered a speech, and, pointing to the members going to Hajj, he said: "These are polytheists". He also said: "They weep for Hasan and Husain"; thereafter, pointing to me, he said: "He is their guide. If it were to me, I would have slaughtered him and licked his blood." "But why are we polytheists?" retorted one

of our group member, and added: "We have performed our Hajj and visited the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) shrine..." The man, yelled in anger: "You are a polytheist. Even if the father of Ibn Sa'ud comes, now he cannot protect you. Who could Muhammad be? He was a man like me." That is: he was just a man like him and had passed away, and his effect had ended, too.

The Iraqi man was trembling: "What shall I say? he pleaded. "Say: No one brings harm save Allah! No one grants benefit save Allah!" The scholar told him. The Iraqi repeated the instruction. Another Iraqi said: "Was Muhammad a man like you?" "Yes," said the so-called scholar. "He was a man like me and died." "But Muhammad received the Holy Qur'an", retorted the Iraqi, "Do you also receive the Qur'an?" The scholar did not reply. We got into our cars and drove away. A member of our caravan was of Sa'udi nationality but used to live in Iraq. When the officer checking the passports saw his Sa'udi passport, shouted at him, mockingly: "How could you leave the land of Islam and dwell in the land of the polytheists?" The Sa'udi national, lowering his esteem, began imploring the officer until he got his passport back!

The Second Travel

The scholars of Iraq were, at that time, striving for the restoration of the Islamic precepts in the community, trying to awaken the Islamic Ummah to achieve that objective in their mosques, ceremonies and festivals, and to protest against the legislation of non-Islamic laws by the authorities. We used to nose about for information on the Islamic activities in this way everywhere. We supported the Algerian revolution against France, backed the Palestinian rights with all our might as well as the uprising in Eritrea against the Ethiopians. We believe that to succeed in the struggle for the restoration of the Islamic rules, it is necessary to enlighten the Muslims, to enhance their solidarity and cooperation and to ignore the differences among them.

When the struggle between the tyrannical rule of the Shah and the Muslim scholars in Iran broke out, starting from Faydiyyah School in the great Islamic university of Qum, on the 25th of Shawwal, 1382 H. [1962], we saw a good augury in it, mobilized our resources to help it and conscripted ourselves to serve

it. Iraqi religious scholars too exerted all their efforts in supporting it. May Allah grant them all a good reward!

I too sponsored large ceremonial gatherings in three successive nights in Baghdad, in which many speeches were delivered, explaining the dimensions of the Islamic struggle in Iran, its effects and significance.

In those circumstances I travelled for Hajj, carrying a slogan and a treatise. The slogan was an invitation to unite the Muslims for the restoration of the Islamic life in Muslim countries. The treatise for the Islamic uprising, whose forerunners appeared in Iran, was brought about by the Muslim religious scholars. I did my best to explain its motives to the Muslim leaders and thinkers, inciting them to support it, explaining that the Muslims battle for the sake of the restoration of the Islamic teachings was the same everywhere, and that if it succeeded in any Muslim country, its effects would spread to other nations as well, manifesting its tangible benefits. I was hoping to find listening ears to what I was going to relate to them of the tragedy of the Muslims in Iran, putting emphasis on the oneness of cause and singleness of destiny.

During this journey, I met the leaders of Ikhawn al-Muslimîn of Syria and Sa'îd Ramadan in Makkah, Muhammad Adam, the leader of the Eritrean revolution, in 'Arafat site, the educated Palestinians in Jordan and in al-Quds, and the reporters of the Islamic papers, the Muslim scholars and preachers, the leaders of Islamic movements, such as Abul Hasan An-Nadawi and Abul 'A'la al-Maududi, the then head of the Islamic Group in India and Pakistan, and other countries.

I started my activities in al-Madinah by writing out circulars for distribution among the pilgrims. I made some revision on the texts of those circulars, explaining the dimensions of the Islamic uprising in Iran, exposing the injustices of the tyrannical rule there, and its being agent of the infidel superpowers. In those circulars, we asked the Muslims to help the Islamic Ummah in Iran. I recommended them to be distributed among the pilgrims in the night before the 'Id al-Dhuha in al-Mash'arul-Haraam. But, to my surprise, I was told, on the seventh of Dhul Hijjah, in the holy city of Makkah, that the person who was to distribute them at the stated time and place, had distributed some of them in the Haram of Makkah. He was arrested, imprisoned and the circulars confiscated. We, the scholars of Iraq and Iran, gathered on the day of the 'Id and visited the then

Crown Prince, Faysal, demanding the release of the detained person and the circular. I seized the opportunity and said to him: "Your government raised the motto of applying the precepts of the Holy Qur'an in this country. This requires that you should help the Muslims fighting for the establishment of the rule of the Holy Qur'an in their countries against their rulers who want to establish the rule of infidelity, and to turn this holy country into a refuge for the homeless Mujahidin, to help them explain their calamities to the pilgrims. This would be an evidence of the verse: **"That they may witness benefits for them."**(Surah Hajj (22): Verse 28) Then I told him about the uprising of the Muslim scholars in the great Islamic university in Qum. I elaborately told him about the dimensions of new uprising in Iran, and the duty of Islamic leaders, especially the Sa'udi government, towards it. Finally, I explained the case of the scholar who was arrested for distributing the protesting circulars among the pilgrims. There was a lengthy discussion between us, resulted in releasing the detainee.

After the completion of the Hajj rites and returning to the holy city of Makkah, a statement was published in the newspapers inviting the people to a meeting in the Indian Mosque in Makkah, on Friday evening to hear a speech to be delivered by Professor al-Mawadudi. After the Eshaa prayers, we attended the meeting. The professor delivered his speech.¹ He counted eight conditions for the Muslims to restore the Islamic life to the society. After his speech, I delivered a speech and commenting on his discourse, I said:

The Muslims, in their present uprising are in need of three things:

First: The Muslims, after fourteen centuries of the advent of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and the circumstances which passed over them, need to have an objective and a comprehensive study of how to infer the precepts from the sources of the Islamic shari'ah to understand Hadith, to have deep knowledge of the sunnah, and to stop imitating the scholars of the past in all these matters.

¹ It was intended to be delivered in the inaugural meetings of Raabitah al-Aalam al-Islami to which he had been invited. But as he was prevented from speaking there, he delivered it in the aforementioned Mosque.

Second: The infidel invaders of the Islamic countries, the imperialists, were successful in breaking the unity of the Muslims, and thus, could crush every Islamic movement wherever it may appear. I explained the Algerian Revolution against the French, the Eritrean uprising against the Ethiopians and the Iranian scholars against the agent tyrant [the Shah]. I spoke elaborately, and tried to arouse their fervour to help them.

Third: I said: Today, we need a faith like that of Abu Dharr (al-Ghaffari), 'Ammar (al-Yaasir), and Summayah (the mother of 'Ammar and the first female martyr of Islam). I talked about the sufferings of those people on the burning sands of Makkah for the sake of Islam.

In al-Madīnah al-Munawwarah, Shaykh 'Abdul 'Azīz Ibn Baz, president of the Islamic University, was informed about my meeting with the Islamic delegations. Thinking that I was one of Baghdad's scholars of the followers of the Caliph's school, he wanted me to visit the recently established Islamic University in al-Madīnah. He sent us a number of the university's cars, and took me and a number of Baghdad's scholars, intellectuals and notables. The university's professors were gathering in a large hall, where they received us. The windows were crowded with curious students.

After having our seats, I began my speech by thanking Allah, and conveying the greetings of the scholars of Iraq and their congratulations on the occasion of the establishment of the Islamic University in al-Madīnah al-Munawwarah. Then I said: When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came to this blessed town, he announced the immigrants (Muhajiroon) and the Helpers (Ansaar) to be brothers. he founded his glorious Islamic community on this brotherhood. You, by taking in students from 45 countries, can follow his example and offer this great service to Islam and the Muslims, who are very much in need of such services, because, in their countries all over the world, they are inflicted with imperialism -the infidel invader - some are under direct suffering, and some under the grip of its agents. They are fighting today against imperialism and its agents. Here in Algeria, the Muslims are fighting France, which is inflicting constant sufferings on them. In Eritrea, the Muslims are struggling against Haile Selassie, the Emperor of Ethiopia, the despotic tyrant. The Muslim scholars of

Iran are fighting against the devil and his master, imperialism, are fighting to expel the cruelest infidel agent of imperialism in the world, and to restore to this Islamic country its great Islamic precepts; in this tussle, they are suffering a great deal.

Having spoken extensively about the tragedies of disunity among the Muslims, I finished my speech with some examples. It was then the turn of our host, Shaykh bin Baaz, to speak. He had been informed that I was a follower of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school. He was visually challenged. Clearing his throat, he started speaking and uttered exactly the following words:

"You are polytheists. Accept Islam (first), then ask the Muslims to unite with you!" Hearing this, my blood boiled and I got involved in a lengthy argument with him. But right now, it is irrelevant to talk about it.¹

During my travels to Makkah and al-Madinah, I listened to preachers and leaders of Friday congregational prayers. I participated in discussions with those preachers between the prayers of Maghrib and Esha in al-Khaif Mosque (in Mena). I attended seminars arranged by the Islamic World league in Makkah and was among the audience. In my travels, I met Egyptian scholars, especially of the celebrated al-Azhar University and other Islamic countries such as Lebanon, the Gulf countries (GCC), India, Pakistan, Kashmir, etc. I interacted with them and heard stories that are hard to recount. I deduced from my conversations with Muslim thinkers, scholars and leaders - and 'no one can inform like an expert, as the proverb goes - that no rapprochement can be achieved before diagnosing the disputed questions, finding out their root causes and then hastening to cure them. Now, if it is necessary to recognize the origin of the disputes to be cured, we shall hereunder cite their examples. At the end of each discussion we shall state, with the help of Allah, what is needed to be done to cure them. We start our discussions with reference to disagreements about some attributes of Allah, the Almighty.

¹ I have mentioned my speeches in this journey to show my sincerity to my slogans and my beliefs. Sometimes it was so painful for me while talking that tears rolled down my cheeks. And yet, I faced such rudeness from that Shaykh!

Some Attributes of Allah and the Origin of Dispute About them

Some Muslims believe that Allah created (Prophet) Adam in His own (physical) shape¹, with fingers², legs³ and feet. He will put His foot, on the Day of Resurrection, over the fire of the Hell, or over the Hell, and it will say: Enough, enough⁴, and that he has a place and moves from place to place.

This is because the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)–as they narrate – had said: "Before creating the creatures, Allah was in ‘ama’ i.e. nothing was with Him beneath which was air, and above which was air then He created His ‘Arsh on water”⁵.

And that he said:

¹ Sahîh al-Bukharî, book on "Getting Permission", Chapter on "Beginning the Greeting". Sahîh Muslim, book on "Paradise and its Graces", Chapter "Paradise is entered by people whose hearts are like those of the birds", hadîth No. 28, and book on "kindness", Chapter on "Forbidding slapping the Face", hadîth no.115. Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2/244,251, 323, 365, 424, 462 & 569.

² "Sahîh al-Bukharî", commenting on Surah al-Zumar, Vol. 2, p. 122, and book on ."Al-Tawhîd", Chapter "Allah’s saying:When I created with my hand", Vol. 4, p.186, and Chapter "Faces on that day will be flourishing" Vol. 4, p.192. "Sahîh Muslim", book on "Descriptions of the Resurrection, Paradise and Hell", hadîths 19, 21, 22.

³ "Sahîh al-Bukhari", commenting on Allah’s saying: "**The day when grave calamity is uncovered**". (Surah Qalam (68): Verse 42), Kitab al-Tawhîd, vol. 4, p. 189.

⁴ Sahîh al-Bukharî, commenting on Surah Qaaf, and Kitab Al-Tawhîd", Chapter on: "Allah’s mercy is near the Benevolent," Vol. 4, p.191. Al-Tirmidhî, book on "The Description of Paradise", Chapter on: "Concerning the eternity of the people of Paradise and the people of Hell". Sahih Muslim, book on: "Paradise and the description of it, graces and people", Chapter: "Hell is entered by the tyrants, and Paradise is entered by the weak", hadîths 35 - 38.

⁵ Sunan Ibn Maajah, the preface, Chapter on "That which had been denied by al-Jahmiyyah, hadîth No. 182.

Sunan al-Tirmidhî, exegesis of Surah Hud, the first hadîth in which ‘ama’ (i.e. nothing with Him) occurs. "Musnad Ahmad" Vol. 4, p. 11 & 12.

"His Throne is over His heavens like this, (and he made his fingers like a dome over him), and it creaks under Him as a (camel's) saddle creaks under the rider"¹.
and that he said:

"Allah descends late at night to the lower heaven and says: 'Who asks me so that I may respond to him? Who demands so that I may give him?...'"² and that he said:

"He descends in the night of the middle of the month of Sha'baan to the lower heaven to forgive..."³

And that concerning the Day of Resurrection, he said:

¹ Sunan Abî Dawud", book on "as-Sunnah", Chapter on "al-Jahmiyyah", hadîth No. 4726.

"Sunan Ibn Maajah", the preface, Chapter on "That which had been denied by al-Jahmiyyah."

Sunan al-Daaremi, book on "the Weak" Chapter "concerning The Hour and the descending of Allah the Exalted".

Refer to "al-Tawhîd" by Muhammad Ibn Abd al-Wahhaab (D. 1206 A.H.), and Minhaj al-Sunnah by Ibn Taymiyyah.

² Sahîh al-Bukharî, book on "Spending the night in praying," Chapter "Invocation and prayer late at night", Book on al-Tawhîd, Chapter on Allah's saying: "They want to alter the words of Allah", book on "invocations", Chapter "prayer at midngth".

Sahîh Muslim, book on "Invocation", Chapter on "Incitement to invocation and prayer late at night".

Sunan Abî Dawud, book on "as-Sunnah", Chapter on "Refuting al-Jahmiyyah", hadîth No. 4733. Sunnan at-Tirmidhî, Book on "Al-Salaah", Chapter on "Concerning the descending of the Lord to the lower heaven every night", vol. 2, pp. 233 and 235, book on "Invocations" Chapter "the Ansari told me", vol. 13 p.30.

Sunan Ibn Maajah, book on "Performing the Salaah", Chapter on "The best hours of the night", hadîth No. 1366.

Sunan al-Daaremi, book on "the Salaah", Chapter "Allah descends to the lower heaven".

Al-Mawattaa by Maalik, book on "al-Qur'an", Chapter 30.

Musnad Ahmad, Vol. 2, pp. 264, 267, 282, 419, 433, 487, 504, 521, Vol. 3, p. 34, Vol. 4, p.16.

³ Sunan al-Tirmidhî, Chapter on "Fasting", Chapter on "That which is said about the night of the middle of the month of Sha'baan"

Sunan Ibn Maajah, book on "performing the salat" Chapter on "That which is said about the night of the middle of the month of Sha'baan. Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p. 433.

"The Hell will be asked: 'Have you filled up?' and it will say: 'Can there be any more?' the Lord will then put His foot over it, and it will say: 'qat! qat!'."

They further related.

"The Fire will not be filled until He puts His foot, then it will say: 'qat! qat!', there it is filled and contracts on itself".¹

Concerning Visibility

They narrated that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a) will see his Lord on the Day of Resurrection, he had said:

"The believers come to me for intercession after that the other Prophets had rejected them. I go and ask permission to see my Lord. It is granted. As soon as I see my Lord I fall to prostration... (till his saying) Then I intercede. He assigns a limit [a number]. I show them to Paradise. Then I come back. As I see my Lord I fall to prostration..."²

And that he said:

"Allah, Blessed and High, will descend on the Day of resurrection to the servants to judge among them."³

And that he said:

¹ Both these narratives are quoted from the companion, Abu Hurayrah, in his exegesis of Surah Qaaf, stated by "Sahîh al-Bukharî", vol. 3, p. 128. and in Chapter "Faces on that day will be shining" in the book on "al-Tawhîd", vol. 4, p. 191. Also quoting from Anas the hadîth of "the foot", in Chapter on the saying of Allah, Almighty, the Wise: "glory to your Lord...", book on "al-Tawhid", vol. 4/129. Look up "Sunan al-Tirmidhî, Book on "Paradise", Chapter "Concerning the eternity of the people of Paradise and the people of Hell", vol. 10/29 Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2/396

² Sahih al-Bukharî, book on "al-Tawhîd", Chapter on Allah's saying: "When I created with my hands", Vol. 4, p.185, and Chapter on Allah's saying: "Faces on that day will be shining", with more details. Refer to vol. 4, p. 190.

³ "Sunan al-Tirmidhî," the book on "Asceticism", Chapter on "Ostentation and Seeking Reputation", vol. 9, p. 229.

"Soon, you will see your Lord with your eyes,"¹ and that the Muslims will see their Lord, on the Day of Resurrection, as they see the moon, without any difficulty in seeing Him"², and that Allah says on that day:

"Whoever worshipped something (in the world) let him follow (it). So, whoever worshipped the sun will follow the sun, and whoever worshipped the moon will follow the moon, and whoever worshipped the devils will follow the devils, and yet there remains this nation with its hypocrites Allah will come to them in an image unknown to them and say: "I am your Lord." They will say: "We take refuge in Allah from you! We will stay here till our Lord comes; for, when our Lord comes we will recognize Him." So Allah will come to them in His appearance which they know, and will say: I am your Lord. They will say: You are our Lord, and follow Him...³.

In another narration, it is said:

"When there remains none but those who worshipped Allah, both the pious and the mischievous, the Lord of the worlds will come to them in a shape other than that in which they had seen Him. It will be said to them: "What are you waiting for? Every nation is to follow what they used to worship." They will say: "... We are waiting for our Lord whom we worship." He will say: "I am your Lord." They will say, twice or thrice: "We worship nothing besides Allah." He will say: "Do you know any sign by which you may recognize Him?" They will say: "The shin."

¹ Sahih al-Bukharî, book on "al-Tawhîd", Chapter on: "Allah's saying: **"Faces on that day will be shining,"** Vol.4, p. 188.

² Sahih al-Bukharî, book on "al-Tawhid", Chapter on Allah's saying: "Faces at that day will be shining", and the Book on al-Salaah", Chapter on "The Superiority of Salaah al-'Asr", and Chapter on "The time of al 'Eshaa' up to midnight, and the book on "Exegesis", Chapter on "Surat Qaf."

"Sahih Muslim", book on "Al-Salaah", Chapter on "Superiority of the two salaah of the morning and of the afternoon and observing them."

Al-Tirmidhî, book on "Description of Paradise." Chapter on "Concerning seeing the Lord the Almighty", Vol. 10/18,20.

³ . Sahih al-Bukhari, Chapter on "Faces on that day will be shining", vol. 4, p. 188. Refer to exegesis on Surah Qaaf, Vol. 3/128. Sahih Muslim, Book on "Faith", Chapter on "proving that the believers will see their Lord in the Hereafter."

He will uncover His shin. (They then fall in prostration)¹. Then they will raise their heads to see Him changed to the shape in which they saw Him for the first time. He will say: "I am your Lord." They will say: "You are our Lord."²

On Paradise

About the believers in Paradise, he said:

"... and there will be nothing between them and seeing their Lord except the cloak of Majesty on His face in the Paradise of Eden."³

When the people of paradise enter Paradise, Allah, Blessed and Most High, says:

"Do you want anything more that I may give you?" They will say: 'Did you not whiten (honoured) our faces? Did you not enter us in Paradise, and delivered us from Hell?' He will then unveil, and Lo! They had never given a thing more loved by them than looking at their Lord, glorified and Almighty."⁴

They say that the Messenger of Allah(S.A) said:

"While the people of Paradise will enjoy their comforts, a bright light will shine upon them. Raising their heads, they will see their Lord overlooking them from above. He will say: 'As-salamu 'alay kum [peace be upon you], O people of Paradise! 'He added: 'That is His saying: Peace! A word from a Merciful Lord.

¹ This is the gist of the text of the tradition on prostration.

² Sahih Muslim, book of "Faith", Chapter on "knowing the way of visibility", hadith no. 299 (whence the text is quoted).

Sahih al-Bukhari, in the exegesis on suratun Nisa', Chapter on Allah's saying: "Surely Allah wrongs not even as the weight of a Particle", Vol. 3/80, where the text is concised. Also in the book on "at Tawhid" Chapter on Allah's saying: "Faces on that day will be flourishing", Vol. 4/189

Had those who had seen their Lord been so kind as to describe for us the shape of their Lord which they saw and His shine which was a sign by which they had recognized Him, it would have been a great favour of them worthy of thanks and praise.

³ Sahih al-Bukhari, book on "al-Tawhid" Chapter on Allah's saying: "Faces on that day will be shining." Vol. 4 p.194.

Sahih Muslim, book on "Faith", Chapter on "proving that the believers will see their Lord in the Hereafter," hadith no. 296.

⁴ . Sahih Muslim, book on "Faith", Chapter on "proving that the believers will see their Lord in the Hereafter", hadith no. 297.

'He said: 'He will look at them and they will look at Him, so they will turn away from all comforts as long as they will look at Him, until He disappears, leaving His light and blessings behind'".¹

He also said:

"The most favorable among you in front of Allah is the one who looks at His face in the morning and at night". Then the Messenger (S.A) recited: "Faces on that day will be flourishing, looking to their Lord."²

They also say that the Messenger of Allah(S.A) said that "The people of Paradise will visit Allah, the Glorified, the Almighty, and He will show them His Throne, appear to them in one of the gardens of Paradise, such that none in that meeting will remain unless Allah, the Glorified and the Almighty, will talk to him in person, that He ever asks anyone of you: You so - and - so, do you not remember the day you did so and so? He will say: 'O my Lord! Did you not forgive me?' He will reply: 'Yes..' Then we will go to our houses, where we will be received by our wives who will say: Welcome! You have come back with a beauty, light and fragrance better than when you left.' We say: 'Today our Lord, the Glorified and the Almighty, sat with us; so it is right that we should change as we did.'"³

So much for what we have so far related of the many hadiths about the description of Allah's Organs, and about His visibility to the people on the Day of Resurrection, as our intention is to present some examples, to show the origin of the disputes, not to count all such hadiths. Hereunder, we shall study the differences concerning the interpretation of those hadiths.

The Difference in interpreting these narrations

Some Muslims believe in the literal meaning of these narrations, thinking that believing them is to belief in Allah the Exalted, and in His oneness, labelling those

¹ Sunan Ibn Maajah, Book of "The proface", Chapter "That which had been devied by al-Jahmiyyah," Hadith No.184

² Sunan al-Tirmidhi, book "The Characteristics of Paradise," Chapter "Seeing the Lord", vol. 10, pp. 18 & 19.

³ Ibid, Chapter on "The market of Paradise," pp. 16-17 Also "Sunan Ibn Maajah", book on "Asceticism", Chapter "Characteristics of the people of Paradise", Hadith No. 4336, pp. 1451 - 52

who interpret them not to be evidences of Allah's corporality, as the "Deniers of Allah's Attributes" (*Mu'attilaat al-Sifaat*).

Such narrations have been recorded by Muslim in the book on "Faith" and by al-Bukharî in the book on "al-Tawhîd" in their Sahîhs. Ibn Khuzaymah¹ wrote a book under the title: "Al-Tawhîd and proving the Attributes of the Lord the Glorified and Almighty, with which He Described himself in His Revelation and through His Prophet, quoting the true narrations by the equitables with uninterrupted chain of narrators and no weak narrators, relating reliable narratives".

Hereunder is the index of some chapters of the book, as listed at its end:

Chapters of Ibn Khuzaymah's Book	Page
Proving that Allah has a soul. .	6
Proving that Allah has a face	10
Chapter mentioning the image of our Lord – Majestic and High be He.	19
Chapter discussing to prove that Allah – Majestic and High be He – has eyes.	42
Chapter to prove hearing and seeing for Allah – Majestic and High be He.	44
Chapter to prove that the Creator, the Maker - Majestic and High be He – has hands .	53
Chapter to prove that Allah – Majestic and High be He – has legs.	80
Chapter to discuss that all the believers will see Allah – Mighty and Majestic be He .	167
Chapter stating that all the believers will see Allah, privately, on the Day of Resurrection.	178

The Imam al-Haafiz 'Uthman Ibn Sa'd al-Daaremi (d. 280 A.H.) wrote a book, "A Refutation of the Jahmiyyah". Some of its chapters are as follows:

¹ He is a renowned scholar of the Holy Qur'an, regarded by the Ahle Tasannun as the Imam of the Imams, Muhammad Ibn Ishaq Ibn Khuzaymah (d. 311 A.H.), teacher of al-Bukharî and Muslim in traditions. The book was printed in 1378 A.H. and published by the Library of the faculties of al-Azhar, al-Azhar Square, Cairo. Refer to the preface of the book for the author's biography.

Chapter on Allah's sitting on the 'Arsh, ascending to the heaven and His distinction from the creatures.

Chapter on descension on the night of the middle of the month of Sha'baan.

Chapter on descension on the Day of Arafah.

Chapter on the Lord's descension on the Day of Resurrection for reckoning.

Chapter on Allah's descension to the people of Paradise.

Chapter on His visibility.¹

Al-Dhahabî wrote the book *Al-'Uluww al-Aal li al-Ali al-Ghaffaar* ² in which he stated the verses and hadîths from which they understand that Allah's place is in the spatial altitude. Then he cites the statements of the companions, their followers, the scholars and the narrators in its support.

The Origin of the Difference on Allah's Attributes and Visibility

We have studied the opinions of some of the Muslims about Allah's aforementioned attributes. There are others who, by way of refusing them, recite Allah's saying: **"Eyes can see Him not, and He comprehends (all) vision..."**(Surah Aale Imraan (6): Verse 103) Or say that Allah's saying: **"Faces on that day will be flourishing, and to their Lord looking"** means that they are looking for or expecting, the command of their Lord. This is like Allah's saying, Through the sons of Jacob to their father. **"Ask the village in which we were..."** (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 82) which means *"ask the people of the village"*. So, in that verse the word "command", and in this verse the word "people", are implied. Thus, they interpret all the verses whose outer appearances denote that Allah, Blessed and Most High, is corporeal.

They call those who say so "al-Mujassimah", i.e. those who say Allah has a body, or "al-Mushabbihah", i.e. those who liken Allah to His creatures.

They quote the Imam Ja'far Ibn Muhammad al-Sadiq (peace be on him) to have said: *"Whoever thinks that Allah is above the Throne has made Allah as the carried one, which necessitates that the thing that carries Allah must be stronger than Him. And whoever thinks that Allah is in something or on something or any*

¹ Printed in Leiden, 1960.

² The Imam al-Hafiz Shamsuddîn Muhammad Ibn Ahmad ib 'Uthman Ibn Qaymaaz al-Dhahabî (D. 748 A.H.), published by as-Salafiyyah Library in al-Madînah al-Munawwarah, Bab al-Rahmah, 2nd ed., 1388 A.H.

*thing is void of Him and makes Him occupy something, ascribes to Him the attributes of His creatures, whereas Allah is the Creator of everything, cannot be measured by any measure, cannot be likened to people, nowhere is void of Him and no place is occupied by Him."*¹

They also cite the Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) saying:

*"Allah does not descend and He does not need to descend. But this is said by those who ascribe to Him decrease or increase. Every moving thing needs someone who moves it or is moved by it. So beware concerning His Attributes that you follow for Him a limit by which you confine Him with a decrease or increase or that He moves or is moved or that He will vanish or descend or movement or sitting."*²

The narrator told Imam ‘Ali Ibn Musa al-Rida (peace be on him):

"It has been narrated unto us that Allah – Mighty and Majestic be He - favoured Musa with talking [to him] and favoured Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) with (His) vision." Abul-Hasan al-Rida (peace be on him) inquired: *"Who, then, brought the message from Allah, the Glorified, the Almighty, to the two main creatures, the jinn and the humans, that ‘Eyes can see Him not, but He comprehends (all) vision’, ‘They do not comprehend Him in knowledge’, ‘Nothing is as His likeness’? Was it not Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny)?"*

"Yes," the narrator confirmed.

"So," he retorted, *"how is it that somebody comes to the whole mankind and tells them that he has come from Allah and calls them to Allah by Allah’s command and says ‘Eyes can see Him not, etc’. Then he says: ‘I saw Him by my eyes,*

¹ Al-Kafi, vol. 1, book of "al-Tawhîd", Chapter on "al-'Arsh and al-Kursi", Hadith No. 7, and Chapter on "Movement and Transition", Hadiths 3 and 9. Al-Tawhîd by Al-Shaykh al-Saduq, Chapter on "Negating His being temporal, spatial and moving", Hadith 11, and Chapter on the meaning of "**The Beneficent sat on the 'Arsh**", hadiths 5 - 8. Al-Bihar by al-Majlisi, new ed., book of "al-Tawhid", Chapter on "Negating incarnation, image, similarity, meterpschosis and union", Hadith 23, vol. 3, p. 87.

² Al-kafi, book of "at-Tawhîd", Chapter on "Movement and transition", hadith No. 1, At-Tawhîd by as-Saduq, Chapter on "negating His being temporal, spatial and moving", hadith 18. Al-Bihar by al-Majlisi, book of "at-Tawhîd", Chapter on "Negating His being temporal, spatial, moving and transferable," hadith 25, 3/311.

comprehended Him in knowledge and He is in the image of a human being'. Have you no shame? The atheists could not accuse him of this, i.e. to come with something from Allah, then to tell its contrary from a different aspect."

The narrator asked: "He (Allah) says: '**And certainly he saw Him in another descent**'?"

Abu al-Hasan (peace be on him) replied: "*If you read the next verse, you will understand what he saw: 'The heart lied not as to what it saw', i.e. Muhammad's (peace be on him and his progeny) heart did not lie to him and told what his heart had seen: 'He saw of his Lord's signs the greatest ones.'* So, Allah's signs are other than Allah – Mighty and Majestic be He. He also said: '**They do not comprehend Him in knowledge**', but if eyes could see Him, then He can be comprehended and known."

Abu Qarrah said: "So you refute the narrations?"

"If they contradict the Qur'an I refute them" snapped Abul-Hasan (peace be on him)¹

Hence, the Imams of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) interpreted the verses which seem to speak of Allah's visibility and incarnation, and explained what was meant by "shin", "hand", "Throne" and other similar words mentioned in the noble verses, and that Allah created Adam (peace be on him) in His image, as has come in the tradition,² which we would not relate, since we do not intend to relate the proofs of the two schools which they offered as evidences. We wanted only to give examples of the contradictory narrations about Allah's Attributes in both schools, and to show that each school interprets the verses of the Holy Book according to its own inclination, and that the differences had appeared in this way about Allah's Attributes.

Later, we shall study – by Allah's power – the origin of the differences about some attributes of the Prophets (peace be on them).

¹ A-Tawhîd by as-Saduq, Tehran, 1387 A.H. PP. 111, 112. The hadîth is related in brevity. "Al-Bihar". book on Chapter on. "at-Tawhîd" "Negation of visibility and interpreting the ayat", hadîth Vol. 14/31.

"Al-Kafi" book on "at-Tawhîd", Chapter on: "Negation of visibility of Allah" hadîth

² concerning Allah's Attributes, consult the books al-Kafi, by ash-shaykh al-laynî, book on "at-Tawhîd", and "Uyunu akhbarir-Rida", by ash-Shaykh asaduq. Chapter no. 11, which mostly contains the narratives of the Imam al-Rida (peace be on him) about at-Tawhîd.

The Difference About The Prophets' (peace be on them) Attributes

What Allah Had Bestowed Upon Them And Their Origin

Concerning the attributes of the divine Prophets (peace be on them), some think that:

To get the blessings by the relics of the Prophets (peace be on them) and to use their graves as places for worship, are acts of polytheism.

To build shrines on their graves is rather polytheism.

To celebrate their birthdays and the birthdays of godly persons, is an act of disobedience of Allah and a prohibited innovation.

To seek mediation to Allah, through other than Him is in the realm of polytheism.

To seek intercession from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) after his death is contrary to Islamic law.

Their opponents prove the contrary by the following evidences:

a. Getting Blessed by the Prophets' (peace be on them) Relics.

They prove the lawfulness of getting blessed by the relics of the Prophets (peace be on them) by the successively quoted narrations in many books that the companions (of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)) got the blessings of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his relics during his lifetime by contacting him in person, as he invited them to, and they got his blessings by his relics after his death, too.

Hereunder are some of their proofs:

Getting Blessed by the Prophet's saliva

Sahîh al-Bukharî, quoting Sahl Ibn Sa'd, in the chapter on "What had been said about the flag of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), in the book on "al-Maghazî,"¹ that Allah's Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) said, on

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "al-Maghaazi", Chapter on "The Battle of Khaibar", vol. 3, p. 35, book on "al-Jihad wa al-Seyar", Chapter No. 102, vol. 2, p. 108, Book of "What had been said about the Prophet's flag", vol. 2, p. 115, and the Book of "The merit of the person at whose hands a man accepted Islam," vol. 2, p. 115,

the day of Khaybar: *"Tomorrow I will give this flag to a man through whose hands Allah will give us victory. He loves Allah and his Messengers, and he is loved by Allah and His Messenger."* The people spent the night wondering as to who would be given the flag. In the morning, the people went to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), everyone of them hoping it to be given to him. The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) asked: *"Where is 'Alī Ibn Abi Talib?"* It was said: "He is suffering from conjunctivitis (sore eyes)." He (peace be on him and his progeny) sent for him (peace be on him) and he (peace be on him) was brought to him (peace be on him and his progeny)..." The text in "The Book on Jihad and Seyar" is as follows"¹: "... He was brought and the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) applied saliva in his eyes and he was cured instantly as if he had no illness at all..." etc.

Quoting Salamah Ibn al-Akva', in Sahih Muslim.

He said: "I came to 'Alī and guided him, as he had sore eyes, to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He (peace be on him and his progeny) applied saliva in his eyes and he was cured; thereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) gave him (peace be on him) the flag..(till the end of the narration)."²

Getting blessed by the Ablution of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

In Sahih al-Bukhari, quoting Anas Ibn Malik, that he said: "I saw the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) when the afternoon prayer was due and the people searched for water to perform the Wudu', but they could not find it. A pot of water for Wudu' was brought to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He put his hand in that pot and ordered the people to

and the Book of "Merits of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions", Chapter on "The Merits of 'Alī Ibn Abi Talib, vol. 2, p.199." Sahih Muslim, Book of "The Merits of the companions", Chapter on "Some of the Merits of 'Alī Ibn Abi Talib (may Allah be pleased with him), hadiths 32 and 34, and Chapter on "The Battles of Dhi Qirad and others", hadith 132. Sunan al-Tirmidhi, "Book of Merits", Chapter on "The Merits of 'Alī Ibn Abi Talib," vol.13, p. 172.

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, Chapter on "The Prophet's call to Islam" vol. 2, p. 107.

² Sahih Muslim, the book on "Jihad and Seyar", Hadith No. 132.

perform the wudu' from it. I saw water spring from underneath his fingers till all of them performed the wudu'."¹

In another narrative from Jabir Ibn 'Abdillah, he said:

"I was with the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) when it was time for the afternoon prayers. We had no water except a little of it. However, it was poured into a pot and brought to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). He inserted his hand into it and parted his fingers, then he said: '*Let them come who want to perform the wudu*'. The abundance is from Allah'. I saw water spring from among his fingers. The people performed the wudu' and drank. I tried to have much of it in my stomach, as I knew it was a blessing." Asked: "How many were you then," Jabir said: "Fourteen hundred." In another version, he said: "Fifteen hundred."²

Getting Blessed by the Saliva of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

Al-Bukharî, writing about al-Hudaybiyyah agreement, quoting 'Urwah Ibn Mas'ud, who heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his companions, to have said:

"By Allah! It never happened that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) should spit his sputum that it did not fall on the palm of a man from them, who would rub it on his face and skin. After performing the wudu', they would almost fight each other to get hold (of the remnant water) of his wudu'."³

¹ Sahîh al-Bukharî, the book of "The Ablution", Chapter on "Searching for water when the time of prayers is due", vol. 1, p. 31.

² Sahîh al-Bukhari, book of "Drinks", Chapter on "Drinking blessing and the Blessed water", vol. 3, p.219. Sunan al-Nisaa'i book of "Purification," Chapter on "The ablution' from the pot," vol. 1, p. 25. Musnad Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, vol. 1, p. 402; Sunan al-Daaremi, quoting Abdullah Ibn 'Umar, in the "Preface", Chapter on "The Prophet being honoured by Allah through bursting water from among his fingers", vol. 1, p.15.

³ Sahîh al-Bukhari, book on "Conditions", Chapter on "Conditions concerning the Jihad and Reconciliation with the warring people and the writing down of the conditions." Also the book on "the Ablution", Chapter on "Spittle, snot and the

Getting blessed by the Hair of the Noble Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

In his "Sahih", Muslim narrated:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came to Mena, and, having finished 'throwing the stones' and offering the sacrifice, he had his hair cut and distributed it among the people."

In another narration:

"He called for a barber, shaved his head and gave (its hair) to Abu Talhah and said: 'Divide it among the people'."¹

It is also narrated by Anas who said:

"I saw the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) with the barber shaving his head, and he divided it (the shaved hair) among his companions, as they did not want even a single hair to drop except in a man's hand."²

In Khalid's biography in "Usud al-Ghaabah", it is written:

"Khalid Ibn al-Walid had a renowned effect in fighting the Persians and the Romans. He conquered Damascus. In his cap there was some hair of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), through whose blessings he sought victory, and he was victorious."

like..." vol. 1, p. 38, and Chapter on using the remnant of the people's ablution'," vol. 1, p. 33, and "Musnad Ahmad", vol. 4, pp. 329 and 330.

¹ Sahih Muslim, Book of Hajj, Chapter on "Stating that the tradition on the 'Day of slaying' is first to 'throw' (the stones) then to slay, then to (have the hair) cut, starting the cutting from the right side of the head of the one (whose hair is being) cut." (Hadith 323 and 326). Refer also to ibid, the hadith 324 and 325, in Sunan Abi Dawud, Book on "The Hajj Rituals", Chapter on "Shaving the Hair and Cutting the Hair" hadith 1981, vol. 2, p. 203. "Al-Tabaqaat" by Ibn Sa'd, vol. 1, p.135, "Musnad Ahmad", vol. 3, pp. 111, 133, 137, 146, 208, 214, 239, 256, 287, and Vol. 4, p. 42, and al-Waqidi's Maghaazi p. 429

² Sahih Muslim, book on "The Merits", Chapter on "The nearness of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) to the people and their getting his blessings.", Hadith No. 74, p. 1812

In the same biography, and in "Al-Isaabah" and in "Al-Mustadrak" by al-Haakim al-Neshaapouri, whose text is quoted here:

"On the Day of al-Yarmuk Battle, Khalid Ibn al-Walid lost his cap. He ordered his men to search for it. They could not find it at first, then they searched for it again and found it. It was a worn out cap. Khalid said: 'In an 'umrah ritual, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)shaved his hair. The people raced to get parts of it I hastened and got his forelock and placed it in this cap. I entered no fight, having it with me unless I was given the victory'."¹

Al-Bukharî narrated: "'Umm Salameh, the wife of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), had some of the Prophet's hair. Whenever a person was stricken by an evil eye, a cup of water was sent to her, and she would dip the hair in it, by which the sick person was cured."²

In Sahîh al-Bukahrî and other books:

"'Ubaydah said: 'To have a hair from him (the Prophet) is much more loved by me than the world and what is in it.'"³

Getting Blessed by the Arrow of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

Al-Bukhari narrated about al-Hudaybiyyah war, saying:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)descended with his army at the far end of al-Hudaybiyyah, near a pond with little water. Shortly its water was exhausted and they came to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)complaining of thirst. He took out an arrow from his quiver, and ordered

¹ Al-Mustadrak by al-Haakim, book on "Knowing the companions", Chapter on "Khalid's Merits", vol. 3, p. 299, quoted here. Khalid's biography in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and in "Al-Isaabah", summarized in Selections from Kanz al-Ummaal, and in the footnote of Musnad Ahmad, vol. 5, p. 178. Ibn kathir's 'History", vol. 7, p. 113.

² Summarized from Sahîh al-Bukahrî, book on "Clothes", Chapter on "What is related in old age", vol. 4, p.27

³ Ibid., the book on "Ablution" Chapter on "The water with which man's hair is washed," vol. 1,p. 31. Al-Tabaqaat of Ibn Sa'd, vol. 6, p. 63

them to plant it into the pond. By Allah, it started to bubble up with water until they all turned away, satisfied."¹

Getting blessed by the place of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny)hand.

In the biography of Hanzalah in al-Isaabah and in "Musnad Ahmad", it is said, briefly:

"Hanzalah said: 'My grandfather took me to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)and said to him: I have sons; some have beards (i.e. they are matured and grown up) while some are below that. This is the youngest of them; so, invoke Allah (for him). He (peace be on him and his progeny)stroked his hand gently on the boy's head and said: *May Allah bless you - or: he may be blessed.*' The narrator says: I saw persons with swollen faces, or an animal with swollen breasts brought to Hanzalah. He would spit into his hands and say: 'In the name of Allah' and put his hand on his own head, and say: 'On the place where the hand of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)' then he would stroke his hand gently on the swollen parts.

The narrator says: And the swelling would vanish!"² The text of al-Isaabah is: "He says in the name of Allah, and puts his hand on the spot, where the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)had placed his hand, rubs the swelling and it would disappear."

The spreading of blessings from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to his surroundings was like the spreading of light from the sun or the fragrance from roses. It was with him wherever he went, as a child and as a grown up, in his travel and stay, day and night, during his suckling days in the tent of Halimah al-Sa'diyyah and during his journey to Syria as a merchant, and in the

¹ Sahîh al-Bukhari, the book on "Conditions," Chapter on "The Conditions of Jihad and Reconciliation with the warring people and the writing down of the conditions", vol. 2, p.81. Refer to its book on "al-Maghaazî", Chapter on The Battle of al-Hudaybiyyah. Look up Ibn Sa'd's Al-Tabaqaat", vol. 3, p.29. Chapter on "Stating signs after the descending of revelation," vol. 1, Section 1, p. 118. Al-Waqidi's al-Maghaazî, p. 247.

² Musnad Ahmad, vol. 5, p. 68 detailed in the biography of Hanzalah Ibn Hudhaym Ibn Hanîfah al-Tamîmî in al-Isaabah. The text and the narration is stated by other authorities too.

tent of Umm Ma‘bad as an immigrant and in Madinah as leader and Ruler. The aforementioned are just examples, not an entire account, since this is not easy for the researcher. The said examples are sufficient for "**The one who has a heart or lends (his) ear and is a witness**". In the following pages, we shall study the question of asking for the intercession of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), the source of the disagreement about a number of the characteristics of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his excellence over ordinary people.

b. Seeking the Intercession of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

The group of people, who believe in the lawfulness of soliciting and referring to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) for an intercession any time, say that it takes place with the consent of Allah, before the creation of the Prophet, during his life and after his death. It also takes place on the Day of Resurrection. The Proof is as follows:

Recoursing to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) before being Created:

A group, including al-Haakem in his al-Mustadrak, narrated a hadith from ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab that when Adam committed the sin, he said: "O Lord! I ask you by Muhammad's status to forgive me." Allah asked him: "How did you know Muhammad whom I have not yet created?" Adam replied: "*O my Lord, when You created me by Your hand and blew in me of Your spirit, I raised my head and saw that on the legs of the Throne it is written: 'There is no god save Allah, Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah', so I knew that You would not add to Your name but the name of the one You loved the most.*" Allah, the Blessed and Almighty, said: "*You are right, Adam. He is the one most loved by Me. If you ask Me by his status, I will forgive you. Had it not been for him, I would not have created you.*"

Al-Tabaranî quoted it, and added: "*He is the last Prophet of your offspring.*"¹

Commenting on the verse: "**And when there came to them a book from Allah verifying that which they have, and aforetime they used to pray for victory over those who disbelieved, but when there came to them whom they knew they disbelieved in him, so, Allah's curse is on the disbelievers,**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 89), the traditionsists and the commentators say that the Jews of al-Madinah and Khaybar, fighting their neighbours i.e. the pagan Arabs of al-'Aws and al-Khazraj tribes and others, before the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) was sent as a Prophet, used to ask victory by means of his (peace be on him and his progeny) name which they found mentioned in the Old Testament (i.e. Torah). They used to curse the disbelievers and say: "O Allah! We pray for your victory. By the unlettered Prophet make us victorious over them." Or they said: "O Allah! Our Lord! Make us victorious over them by the name of your Prophet..."² and they would be victorious. But when there came to them a Book from Allah, the Holy Qur'an, verifying what they had, i.e. the Old and the New Testaments, and the one whom they knew better than their sons, viz. Hazrat Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), in whom they had no doubt, they denied him because he was not from Banu Israel.³

Referring to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) during his life

¹ "Al-Mustadrak" by al-Haakem, book on "History" at the end of the book of "Al-Ba'th", vol. 2, p.615; "Majma' al-Zawaaed" vol. 8, p. 253; "Tahqîq al-Nusrah" by al-Maraaghî (d. 816 A.H.) pp. 113 & 114 quoting from al-Tabaranî.

² It appears from the narratives that they used to invoke such invocations containing imploring Allah the Almighty by means of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

³ Narratives are successive in this context in the following: Dala'il al-Nobuwwah by al-Bayhaqî, pp. 343 - 345, commenting on the verse 89 of the Surah Aal Imran (3), in the exegesis of Muhammad Ibn Jarîr at-Tabarî, vol. 1, pp. 324-328, and the exegesis of Al-Naysaaburî, annotation to vol. 1, p. 333. Al-Haakem in the commentary of the verse 89 of Surah al-Baqarah (2), in the book of exegesis, in his Mustadrak, vol. 4, p. 263. Al-Suyutî's quoting Dala'il al-Nobuwwah by Abu Na'im. The exegesis of Muhammad Ibn 'Abd al-Hamîd. The exegesis of Abu Muhammad Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abî Haatim Ibn Idrîs al-Razî. The exegesis of Abu Bakr Muhammad Ibn Ibrahîm al-Mundhir al-Naysaaburî. (d. 310 A.H.)

It is narrated by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, al-Tirmidhî, Ibn Maajah and al-Bayhaqî, quoting ‘Uthman Ibn Hunaif that he had said that a blind man came to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and requested: "Invoke Allah to cure me." The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) told him: *"If you insist I will invoke Him!"* He (peace be on him and his progeny) asked him to perform wudu’, with care and to recite the following invocation:

*"O Allah! I ask you, and turn to you through your Prophet Muhammad, the Prophet of mercy. O Muhammad! I turn through you to my Lord so that my need may be met. O Allah! Accept his intercession for me,"*¹ The hadîth is confirmed by al-Baihaqî and al-Tirmidhi.

Referring to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) after his death

Al-Tabaraanî, in his "al-Mo’jam al-Kabeer", quoting the hadîth of ‘Uthman Ibn Hunaif, that a man used to frequent ‘Uthman Ibn ‘Affan (May Allah be pleased with him) to get his need granted, but ‘Uthman used to ignore him and never asked what his need was. The man once met Ibn Hunaif and complained to him about the situation.

‘Uthman Ibn Hunaif told him to perform wudu’, go to the mosque, perform a two units of prayers and supplicate thus:

"O Allah! I ask you and turn to you through our Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) the Prophet of mercy. O Muhammad! I turn through you to my Lord to fulfil my need," and mention your need. The man went off and duly complied with the instructions. Then he came to the door of ‘Uthman Ibn ‘Affan. The doorkeeper came to him and took him to ‘Uthman, who asked him to sit beside him on a velvet cushion and asked him: "What is your need?" he told him what it was. He

¹ Musnad Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 138; Sunan al-Tirmidhî, the Book of Invocations, vol. 13, pp. 80 – 81; Sunan Ibn Maajah, the book on "Establishing the Prayers and the traditions therein," Chapter on "Prayers for fulfilment of needs", hadîth No. 1385 p. 441. Ibn al-Athîr, according to the biography of ‘Uthman Ibn Hunaif in Usud al-Ghaabah. Al-Bayhaqî quoting the author of Tahqîq al-Nusrah. Tahqîq al-Nusrah p. 114. We have deliberately mentioned the title "Imam of the Hanbalîs", , because the deniers of intercession from the followers of the two Shaykhs viz. Ibn Taymiyyah and Ibn ‘Abd al-Wahhaab, are also the followers of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal.

fulfilled it for him and told him: "I have remembered your need just now. Whenever you need something, tell me."¹

Referring to the Uncle (Abbas) of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

It is stated in *Sahîh al-Bukharî* that when there was a famine, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab referred to al-'Abbas Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib to get rain. He used to say: "O Allah! We implored You through our Prophet for rain, and You used to grant us that. Now we invoke You through our Prophet's uncle, so give us rain." He said: 'They used to have rain'."²

This referring to al-Abbas was only because he was the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny)uncle, not because of anything else.

Despite the existence of such hadîths of the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), there must be no dispute about the accepted attributes of the Prophets, especially those of the Seal of the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny), with which Allah the Almighty had preferred them to all people. Hereunder, we shall refer to some of the causes of the dispute about the attributes of the Seal of the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny)in particular.

The Origin of the Difference about the Attributes of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Despite the explicitness of the successive texts already mentioned about some of the attributes of the Prophets, one wonders what can be the cause for such differences?

¹ Tahqîq al-Nusrah pp. 114 & 115, narrated by al-Tabaraanî in his *al-Mo'jam al-Kabeer*

² *Sahîh al-Bukharî*, the book on "Seeking Rain," Chapter on "People asking the Imam to seek rain in case of a famine," and the book on "The merits of the companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)", Chapter on "the Merits of al-'Abbas Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib." vol. 1, p. 124 and vol. 2, p.200. *Sunan al-Bayhaqî*, the book on "Prayers for rain," Chapter on "Seeking rain with the intercession of the one whose invocation's blessings are hoped for," vol. 3, p. 352

If we look carefully into many other narratives in lowering the position of the divine Prophets and spread across the books of narrations and those that lower the ranks of the divine Prophets than those of the ordinary people, we find these are those that comprise for those who believe in their correctness a special view, contradicting the contexts of the recent narrations. For the sake of brevity, we will be satisfied with relating some of what has been narrated about the Seal of the Prophets and the Best of the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny), as these would be enough for those who want to deliberate and gain insight:

1. al-Bukharî in his "Sahîh" records:

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), before being sent as a prophet, offered to Zayd Ibn 'Amr Ibn Nufail a meal containing meat. He refused to eat of it, saying: "I eat only the meat on which the name of Allah had been recited [during slaughtering]".¹

That is, Zayd, in the Jahiliyyah (era of paganism) [before Islam] was better than (Prophet) Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), because he avoided such an act of the Jahiliyyah that Muhammad did not avoid.

2. Al-Bukharî and Muslim record that when the archangel Gabriel came down to him (peace be on him and his progeny) with the verses: **"Read in the name of your Lord Who created."** till **"Who taught with the pen"**, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) returned home trembling, and told (his wife) Khadijah: *"I was afraid for myself."* Khadijah told him: *"Relax! Nay! Never will Allah disgrace you!"* She then took him to Waraqah Ibn Nawfal, who was a Christian among the pagans. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) told him what he had seen. Nowfal said: "This is the Namus [revelation] which was descended on Moosa", etc.²

¹ Al-Bukharî, the book on "Slaughtering", Chapter on "What is slaughtered for the idols", vol. 3, p. 207; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 2, pp. 69 & 86; Zayd Ibn 'Amr Ibn Nufail was the cousin of 'Umar Ibn Khattaab and the father of his wife. He is mentioned in the biography of his son, Sa'id, in al-Ist'âab, vol. 2, p. 4

² Sahîh al-Bukharî, Chapter on "The commencement of Revelation," vol. 1, p.3. The exegesis of Surah al-Iqraa' . Sahîh Muslim, "The Book on Imam," Chapter on "The Beginning of Revelation", Hadîth No. 252; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, pp. 223 & 233.

The narrative is summarized. Al-Bawaadir: "The (piece of) flesh between the shoulder and the neck flickers when frightened."

So Waraqah, the Christian, knew more about the revelation and Gabriel than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) who received the revelation. It seems that it was Waraqah's words that reassured the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) of his destiny, as otherwise he was about to hurl himself from the height of the mountain, according to Ibn Sa'd in his *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*. Al-Tabari said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said: "*The remote one (meaning himself) is either a poet or a madman. Never relate it to Quraysh.*"¹

3. Al-Bukharî and Muslim record that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to become angry and curse and abuse the one who did not deserve it. He invoked Allah the High to regard it as poor-rate (zakaat) on behalf of the aggrieved party."²

4. They also narrate that some Jews had bewitched him (peace be on him and his progeny) such that he imagined himself doing things which he did not do.³

5. Muslim narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) passed by some people pollinating date palms. he said: "*If you do not pollinate them, they will be better.*" They stopped pollinating them,, but they grew dried up dates. He commented on that saying: "*You know better about your worldly matters.*"⁴

We have discussed the narratives concerning the prophethood of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) stated in the books of narrations. The biographies and the exegesis, and we stated their reasons in vol. 4 of *The Role of the infallible Imams (peace be on them) in Enlivening the Religion*, which is a series of studies about the role of the infallible Imams of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) in giving a fresh lease of life to the Prophetic Sunnah, in which the correct narratives had been related. All praise is for Allah!

¹ Al-Tabari's *Tarikh*, En. ed., 1/1150.

² Sahîh al-Bukharî: book on "Invocation" Chapter on "The Messenger's saying The one whom I hurt". Sahîh Muslim, the book of "Benevolence and relation", Chapter on Ó The one cursed by the prophet(peace be on him and his progeny) undeservedly".

³ Sahîh al-Bukharî: book on "The Beginning of Creation", Chapter on "The qualities of Satan and his soldiers". The book of "Medicine", Chapter on "Can magic be extracted; Chapter on Magic; Chapter on "Good Manners"; Chapter on "Allah enjoins justice. Book on "Invocations"; Chapter on "Repeating invocations"; Sahîh Muslim: Chapter on "Magic".

⁴ Sahîh Muslim: Book on "Merits", Chapter on "it is a duty to obey what he (The Prophet) (peace be on him and his progeny) said according to the Sharî'ah,

6. They also narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) listened to some slave-girls of the Ansar singing. Abu Bakr scolded them.

7. Muslim narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) raised 'A'ishah on his shoulder to watch some Ethiopians playing in the mosque, but 'Umar scolded them.¹

In Al-Tirmidhî's narration, it is said: When 'Umar came in, the people dispersed. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *I see the satans of Jinn and humans have run away from 'Umar.*²

In another narration, it is said:

"A black slave-girl played the tambourine and sang in the presence of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) on his return from one of his wars. When 'Umar entered, the maid put the tambourine under her buttocks and sat on it. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'The satan is afraid of you, O 'Umar.'*"³

8. Al-Bukharî and Muslim narrated in their Sahîhs, quoting 'A'ishah, that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) hearing a man reciting (the Holy Qur'an) in the mosque, said: *May Allah have mercy upon him. He reminded me of such - and - such verses which I dropped from so - and - so surah.*"⁴

excluding what he said concerning peoples' livelihood... "Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah: Chapter on "Pollinating date palms."

¹ Sahîh al-Bukharî: Book on "the Merits of the Prophet's Companions", Chapter on "The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and his companions entry in Madinah." Book on the "two Eids", Chapter on "The tradition of the two 'Eids' for people of Islam."; Sahih Muslim: Book of the Prayers of the two Eids; Chapter of Licence to play on the Day of Eid; Chapter of Licence of playing in which there is no sin on the Day of Eid; Traditions Nos 18-22

² Sunan al-Tirmidhî: Section on "The Merits", Chapter on "'Umar's Merits"

³ Sunan at-Tirmidhî, Chapter on "The Merits", Chapter on "'Umar's merits Musnad Ahmad," vol. 5/353. We had discussed these hadîths and stated their causes in Vols. 2 - 5 of The Effect of the Imams in Reviving the sunnah.

⁴ Sahîh al-Bukharî, book on "Allah's saying: Send blessings upon them." The book on "Testimonies", Chapter on "The Testimony of the blind and wedding him." Sahîh Muslim, book on "The Merits of the Qur'an", Chapter on "Enjoining taking care of the Qur'an". Hadîth 225, Sunan-o-Abi Dawud, Book on Volunteering" Chapter on "Raising the voice in reciting the night-vigil prayers" Hadîth 1331, and book on: "The Letters and Recitings", Chapter 1, Hadîth 397.

We have noted in the aforementioned narrations: that Zayd Ibn ‘Amr Ibn Nufail, cousin of the ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, was more God-fearing and pious than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), since Zayd refrained from eating what had been slaughtered for the idols, whereas the messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ate from it.

That Waraqah Ibn Nawfal, the Christian, recognized that the one who came to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was the archangel Gabriel, whereas the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not recognize him. He (peace be on him and his progeny) was afraid lest he should be touched by the jinn and that the verses of Surah Iqra’ were of their rhyming.

That the witchcraft of the Jews affected the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and made him think that he did things which he actually did not.

That he (peace be on him and his progeny) forgot some verses till the recitation of some companions reminded him of them.

That he (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered the date palms not to be pollinated, but when they dried up, he apologized to them that they know better about their worldly affairs than him.

That he (peace be on him and his progeny) listened to the singing of some slave-girls, which Abu Bakr detested, and that he said about ‘Umar that satans run away from him (but they don’t run away from him (peace be on him and his progeny)).

All those narrations and similar ones show that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was inferior to Zayd in the era of paganism, and after announcing Islam, Waraqah Ibn Nawfal, the Christian, was more informed about the revelation and Gabriel more than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and that Abu Bakr and ‘Umar were more careful to avoid amusements and nonsense than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and the Companion who recited the verses which were forgotten by the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had a stronger memory than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), like other ordinary people, was not

protected by Allah against the follies and witchcraft of the Jews, and that he got angry, cursed and abused undeserved persons.¹

Believing in the truthfulness of the said narrations would create a vision contradicting the traditions which we referred to in respect of the virtues bestowed by Allah the High upon the seal of His Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny), distinguishing him from ordinary people by numerous merits. Therefore, we should not be surprised when a so-called learned Saudi Wahhabi declares: "Muhammad was an ordinary mortal like me and he died."

In addition to such blasphemous narrations, which formed a vision contrary to those virtues, the so-called companion and (second) ruler, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, upon his own judgement, cut-off the tree under which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) received the people's allegiance². Look up the details in the Commentary on "Nahjul Balaghah" by Ibn Abi Hadid, vol. 1/59.

All the narrations that degrade the status of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), however, had been refuted by Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) sermon called Khutbah al-Qasi'ah, (The Sermon of Disparagement). He (peace be on him) said:

"From the time of his weaning, Allah had put the mightiest of his angel with him to take him along the path of high character and good behavior, day and night, while I used to follow him like a young camel following in the footprints of its mother. Every day he would show me a standard of his high traits, and commanded me to follow it. Every year he used to go in seclusion to the hill of Hera, where none else saw him except me. In those days, Islam did not exist in any house except that of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and Khadijah, while I was their third. I used to see and watch the effulgence of divine revelation and message, and I breathed the scent of

¹ Since the narrations of the School of Rulership create a viewpoint which degrades the status of the honorable Messenger(peace be on him and his progeny)to a status lower than that of an ordinary man, especially concerning the fabricated story of "the cranes" which we had refuted in Vol. 4 of our book The Role of Imams in the Revival of Religion, as it throws doubts on the revelation and the Holy Qur'an. The Christian missionary orientalis, in their studies on Islam, depended on the of narrations of the School of Rulership, disregarding the teachings and sayings of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school.

² Shifaa al-Sudur, P. 27, It was the "Ridwan Tree" in the al-Hudaybiyyah peace treaty

Prophethood. I also heard the moan of satan when the revelation descended on him (peace be on him and his progeny). I asked: 'O, Messenger of Allah! What is this moan?' He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: 'This is Satan who has lost all hope of being worshipped'."¹

I wonder how the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) could not know himself, as it was related in the narrative with Waraqah, while the 'seal of Prophethood, was on his shoulder, by which he was recognized by all the people of the Book who saw it?'²

They are also contradicted by the narratives which state the signs of Prophethood which he showed of himself or shown to him, before being sent as a Messenger, such as what had happened to him in his first journey to Syria with his uncle, 'Abd al-Muttalib, and the second business journey for Khadījah, and the monks' information about his prophethood, and being shadowed by a cloud, which was obvious to all of his mates in the two journeys. All these had been recorded in the books of traditions and biographies.³

Also "the people of the Book" informing about his appearance before being sent as a prophet, and the narration about him in the Torah,⁴ and his being greeted by trees and stones before being sent as a Prophet.⁵

¹ "Nahj al-Balaghah", explained by Shaikh Muhammad 'Abduh, sermon No. 192.

² Sahīh Bukharī, Book on 'The merits, the patients and Good Manners'. Sahīh Muslim, Book on "The merits". Chapter on "Proving the seal of the Prophethood". Sunan-o-Abi-Dawud, Book on "Clothes". Al-Tirmidhī, Book on "The Merits". Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 2, p. 223, vol. 3, pp. 434, 442, vol. 4, p. 195, vol. 5, pp. 35, 77, 82, 90, 95, 98, 104, 340, 341, 354, 438, 442, 443 and vol. 6, p. 329.

³ "Al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra" by Ibn Sa'd, Ed. Europe, Vol. 1, pp. 76, 98, 99, 109, 83, 101, 73, 100 and Vol. 3, p. 153. Al-Bukharī's narration at the end of book on "The Beginning of the Revelation", concerning Hercules' information about his appearance. "Sunan" by al-Tirmidhī, Book on "The Merits", Chapter on "What had been said about the beginning of the Prophethood." vol. 13, p. 106. Ibn Hisham's "al-Seerah", vol. 1, pp. 194 & 203. Refer also to pages: 231, 239, and 251.

⁴ Sahīh al-Bukhari, book of "Sales", Chapter on "The dislike of raising voices in the market", vol. 2, p.10, Book of "Exegesis", Chapter on commenting on Surah al-Fath, and Book of "The virtues of the Qur'an", Chapter 1. Ibn Sa'd's "al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra", Eu. Ed., Vol. 1/123, Q 2/17, 87, 89. Sunan al-Tirmidhi, book of "Virtues", Chapter 1. Sunan al-Daarimi, the preface, Chapter 1.

How could he (peace be on him and his progeny) not recognize himself, whereas Jesus, son of Mary (peace be on them both) had heralded his coming, as is stated in the Holy Qur'an: **"... and giving the good news of a Messenger who will come after me, whose name is Ahmad."** (Surah Saff (61): Verse 6)?

How could he (peace be on him and his progeny) not recognize himself, while the people of the Book could: **"recognize him as they recognize their sons"** (Surah Baqarah (2): Verses 146 and Surah An'aam (6): Verse 20)? They knew: **"The Messenger - Prophet, the unlettered, whom they find mentioned with them in the Old and the New Testaments."** (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 157)

In the discussions of "The sources of Islamic Shari'ah" in this book, we shall refer to the attempts of the Islamic rulers to elevate the position of the Caliphate before the Muslims to a position higher than that of Prophethood. Here, we mention only a single example, referring to the conduct of al-Hajjaaj Ibn Yusuf al-Thaqafi, appointed by Abdul Malik as governor of Iraq. In his speech, delivered in Kufah, referring to Muslims, who visit the shrine of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), he said: "Shame be upon them! They only circumambulate around mere sticks and a rotten corpse! Why do they not rotate around the palace of the Commander of the Believers, Abdul Malik? Do they not know that one's caliph is better than his messenger?"¹

We notice that some of the Muslims during the recent centuries were inclined towards belittling the status of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), is nothing but a result of such attempts of many centuries. Those attempts are manifest in the particular narratives related to debase the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) dignity, and in their interpretations of the Qur'anic verses, besides other activities intended to direct the Muslims to what

Musnad-o-Ahmad, 2/174, 3/467. Ibn Sa'd's Tabaqat, Vol. 1/ Q 1/64, 103, 104, 106, 108, 111.

⁵ Sahih Muslim, Book of "Virtues", Chapter on "the Prophet's Lineage", hadith No. 2, p. 1782.

Musnad-o-Ahmad, 5/89, 95, 105. Musnad al-Tayaalisi, hadith No. 781.

Ibn Sa'd's "al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra", vol. 8, p. 179. "The trees greeting him" in

Sunan al-Daarimi, the Preface, Chapter No. 3.

Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Vol. 8, p.179.

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, Ibn Abil Hadid al-Motazeli, vol. 15, p. 242

Also refer Kitaab al-Mubarrid, published by al-Nahdah, Egypt, p. 222.

they themselves desired, such as their opinion about celebrating the birthday of the Messenger, to which we shall refer later on.

5

The Differences on Celebrating the Birthdays of the Divine Prophets (peace be on them) and Allah's Righteous Servants (may Allah be satisfied with them)

From those who deem it unlawful to celebrate the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) birthday, it is sufficient to quote the decree issued by Shaykh Abd al-Aziz bin Baaz, Chairman of the Decreeing, Missions and Guidance in the Saudi Arabia. He says: "It is not permitted to celebrate the birthday of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) nor of any one else, because it is an innovation in religion"¹

As to those who believe it commendable to celebrate their memories, put forth the argument that most of the Hajj rituals are eventually celebrations of the divine Prophets (peace be on them) and holy men, such as:

a. "The Maqam-e-Ibraheem (peace be on him)":

Allah, the Exalted says: "... **and take of Ibraheem's maqam a place for prayers...**"(Surah Baqarah (2): Verse125)

¹ "Al-Sharq al-Awsat" newspaper dated 3/12/1982 in an article captioned: "The Judgement concerning the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) birthday and other birthdays."

In "Sahîh al-Bukharî"¹ it is said that when (Prophets) Ibraheem and Ismaaeel were jointly building the Bait [the Ka'bah], Ismaaeel used to fetch the stones to Ibraheem who started building. When the building was raised, Ibraheem brought this stone and placed it for him. Ibraheem stood on it and continued to build while Ismaaeel continued fetching the stones.

In a further narrative, it is said that when the building rose too high, and Ibraheem, due to his old age, got tired of carrying the stones, he stood on the Maqam, and went on building.

It is clear that Allah, the Glorified, commands the people to get blessed by Ibraheem's standing place, in His Sacred House, taking it a place for prayers, in order to revive and immortalize Ibraheem's memory. It has nothing to do with associating partners with Allah, the Glorified.

b. Al-Safa and al-Marwah:

Allah, the Glorified, says: "**Al-Safa and Al-Marwah are of the rites of Allah, so, whoever (goes to) hajj to the Bait, or makes 'amrah to It, there is no blame on him if he goes round them.**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 58)

Al-Bukhari narrated, briefly, that when Haajar and her son, Ismaaeel, were left alone by Ibraheem (peace be on him) with no water to quench their thirst, she, seeing her son writhe with thirst, started walking up the hill of al-Safa, turning away from the painful scene. She stood on the hill looking around for some human being, but in vain. She walked back down the valley, exhausted, then once again went up the other hill of al-Marwah, looked around, but again there was no one to be seen. She went down again, then up to al-Safa again. She repeated this seven times.

Ibn 'Abbas said: The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *This effort is repeated by the pilgrims (during Hajj as a ritual).*²

Allah the Almighty ordained that "running between al-Safa and al-Marwah." should be a part of the "Hajj rituals" to revive the memory of Haajar's running between them, celebrating her toil. It is also recommended to hasten when

¹ Sahîh al-Bukhari, book of "the Prophets," Chapter on "Enhancing the quick walker" Vol. 2/158 & 159.

² ibid. Also look up Mu'jam al-Buldaan, under the entry of "Zamzam", concerning Ismaaeel's history, taken from the historical accounts of al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir.

reaching the place of the valley where Haajar hastened her weary steps, to revive her "trotting" (called in religious parlance as "*herweleh*").

c. Throwing the Pebbles:

Ahmad and al-Tayaalisi, both in their books called Musnad, quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), said: "*Gabriel took Ibraheem to Jamarah al-Aqabah. There, Satan appeared to him. He threw at him seven pebbles till he sank away. They came to the middle "Jamarah", where Satan appeared to him once again. Again, he (Ibraheem) threw seven pebbles at him till he sank away. Then they came to the farthest "Jamarah" where Satan appeared again. Again, Ibraheem threw at him seven pebbles till he sank away...*"¹

In this way Allah the Almighty revived the memory of Ibraheem's throwing the pebbles at Satan - a procedure ordained to be a part of the hajj rituals (called as Ramy al-Jamaraat).

d. The Sacrificial Slaughter

Ahhah, the Exalted, in the story of Ibraheem and Ismaaeel, says: "**So we gave him the good news of a forbearing boy. When he (Ismaaeel) attained (the age) of working with him, he said: O my son! I have seen in a dream that I should sacrifice you; consider, then, what you see. He said: O my father! do what you are commanded; you will find me, if Allah wills, of the patient ones. So, when they both submitted and he threw him down on his forehead. We called out to him saying: O Ibrahîm! you already fulfilled the vision; we thus reward the good-doers. Surely this is an obvious trial. And we ransomed him with a great sacrifice.**" (Surah Saaffaat (37): Verses 101-107)

Thus, Allah made the revival of the memory of Ibraheem's sacrificing his son, Ismaaeel, and the offering of great sheep as a ransom, and celebrating it, also parts of the Hajj rituals, ordering the pilgrims to offer a sacrifice in Mena, following Ibraheem's example and to celebrate his obedience and submission to Allah the Almighty.

¹ Musnad Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 306. Almost, the same narration is also found on p. 127. Musnad al-Tayaalisi, Hadîth No. 2697. Look up the entry of "al-Ka'bah" in the Majma' al-Buldaan and the history of Ibraheem and Ismaaeel in the Tarikh al-Tabari and Tarikh Ibn al-Athîr.

In "Maqaam-e-Ibraheem", the blessing passed from Ibraheem's feet to his standing place, which Allah ordered to be used as a place of prostration in the Sacred Mosque in order to keep his memory alive.

Hereunder, we relate how blessings spread from Prophet Adam the father of mankind (peace be on him).

The spreading of blessings from Adam (peace be on him) and celebrating his memory:

It has been narrated that Allah, the Glorified, forgave Adam in the afternoon of the month of Dhu al-Hijjah in 'Arafat. At sunset, Jibraeel took him to al-Mash'ar al-Haram (Muzdalefah), where he spent the night before the tenth (of the month) in invocation and thanking Allah for accepting his repentance. In the morning, he went to Mena, where he had his hair cut on the 10th day, as a token of accepting his repentance and of being delivered from sins. Allah announced that day as Eid, a feast for him and his progeny. He ordained that whatever had been done by Prophet Adam (peace be on him) were to be parts of the Hajj ritual, forever, for his offsprings, accepting their repentance on the afternoon of the 9th day, when they remember Allah at night in al-Mash'ar al-Haram and have their hair cut on the 10th in Mena. To these rituals were later added all that had been done by Ibraheem, Ismaaeel and Haajar, thereby marking the end of the rituals of Hajj for the pilgrims. So, all the acts of Hajj actually get the blessings of those times and places which were frequented by the good servants of Allah. All these rituals are now celebrations commemorating those occasions forever. Here, we shall give an example of the spread of evil omen to a place from its occupier.

The spread of evil omen to a place due its occupier

Muslim narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in the year of Tabuk, alighted at a place called al-Hijr, near the houses of (the ancient nation) Thamud. The people brought water from the wells from which Thamud used to drink. So, they kneaded with it and erected pots to cook meat.

But on the order of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), they spilled the pots, gave the dough to the camels, and left the place till he came to the well from which the "she camel" [of the Prophet Salih] used to drink, where he ordered the army to descend, and told them not to enter the dwelling places of those people who were punished, *"lest a calamity like theirs should befall you."*¹ To quote Muslim verbatim: *"Do not enter the dwelling places of those who were unjust to themselves, unless you are weeping, lest it should befall you what had befallen them. Then he scolded and hurried away till he left it behind."*

In Sahîh al-Bukharî it ends: *"... then he covered his head and increased his speed till he crossed the valley."*

In another narration in Musnad Ahmad: *"... and he covered his face with his garment while still on the saddle."*²

The Origin of Evil Omen and Blessings of a Place:

What was the origin of the evil omen of the lands and wells of Thamud people, and how did it spread to other lands, had it not originated from Thamud people themselves? From them it spread to their land and wells, and remained there till the Prophet's days, and then as long as Allah wills. Wherefrom came this blessing to the well of Salih's she-camel, if not merely from her drinking from it? Her blessing passed from her to the well, and remained till the days of the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny), and as long as Allah wills.

Salih's she camel and her well are not more honourable to Allah than Ismaeel and his well, Zamzam. Similarly, Allah had put blessings in Zamaam due to Ismaeel's blessings, forever.

The same is the case of the spread of blessings from what Allah emanates upon His virtuous servants in particular times, such as the blessings of Fridays.

¹ Muslim summarized it in his Sahîh, "The Book of Asceticism..." Chapter on "Do not enter the dwelling places of those who wronged themselves", hadîth 40. The text is from Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p.117 and Sahîh al-Bukhari, "Book on Wars," Chapter on "The alighting of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in al-Hijr"

² Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p.66

The Blessings of Friday:

Sahîh Muslim states: "Allah had created Adam on Friday, and made him enter in Paradise on Friday as well."¹

These and other emanations of Allah on His pious servants on Friday made the blessings of Friday eternal.

The Blessings of the Month of Ramadan:

The same is true with the month of Ramadan, as Allah, the Exalted said: "**The month of Ramadan in which the Qur'an was revealed, a guidance to men and clear proofs of guidance and distinction.**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 185)

He the High also declares: "**We revealed it on the night of Qadr [the grand night]. And how do you know what the night of Qadr is! the night of Qadr is better than a thousand months...**" (Surah Qadr (97): Verses1-3)

So, the blessings of the night of Qadr, in which the Noble Qur'an was revealed to the Seal of Allah's Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) spread to the entire month of Ramadan, and the blessings remained in that month from that night forever till the Day of Judgment.

Thus, we notice that the blessing of a blessed time or a blessed place spreads out because of Allah's blessing over His chosen Ones. Allah the High has ordered us to take the deeds of His chosen ones as examples to be imitated in their particular time and place, by way of celebrating their memories and keeping alive their deeds, so that we may also be blessed by their blessings. What lawful objection can prohibit us from celebrating similar Islamic occasions, such as the birthday of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), the night of his ascension (*israa'*) from the sacred Mosque [in Makkah] to al-Aqsa Mosque [in al-Quds], and the day on which Allah sent him (peace be on him and his progeny) as a mercy to the worlds?

Having finished stating the Preference of celebrating the memories of those most favoured by Allah, we do confirm that by such celebrations, we only mean, for

¹ Sahîh Muslim, book of "Friday", Chapter on "the merits of Friday", hadîths nos. 17 & 18

example, the recitation of the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) - his correct and undistorted biography - in the night of his birthday, giving out food in the way of Allah, sending its reward to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and avoiding innovations by mystics and charlatans.

Hereunder, we shall have a passing hint to the disagreement about the question of building tombs on the graves and using them as places for worship.

The Disagreement on building on the graves of Divine Prophets (peace be on them all) and using them as places for worship

Some Muslims support their claim that it is prohibited to build on the graves by some narratives, prominent among them are as follows:

a. Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) reports: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in a funeral, said:

'Who will go to Madinah, leaving no idol unless he breaks it, no grave unless he levels it and no picture unless he smears it?' A man said: 'I, O Messenger of Allah'. He went, but, dreading the people of Madinah, he came back. 'Ali said: 'I will go, O Messenger of Allah.' He went, returned and said: *'O Messenger of Allah, I left no idol unless I smashed it, no grave unless I leveled it and no picture unless I smeared it'.*"

This narrative is stated in the books of narrations. We have reproduced its most complete text.¹

¹ . Musnad Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 87, 89, 96, 110, 111, 28, 138, 189, 145, 150. "Musnad al-Tayaalisi" hadiths 96 and 155

The Cause of the Hadīth

First: We will mention in the forthcoming discussions that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had visited his mother's grave and wept so bitterly that the people wept with him. She had died when he was six years old in al-Madinah al-Munawwarah. When he visited her grave after forty years approximately, on his migration to al-Madinah, he recognized his mother's grave because it was visible to bare eyes, as otherwise he could not have recognized it. So, if it was the Islamic law to level down all graves, why, then, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not order his mother's grave to be levelled with the earth?

Second: When a number of the people of Madinah adopted Islam, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sent to them, at the beginning, Mus'ab Ibn 'Umayr to teach them what had been revealed of Islam. When the people of Madinah came to the Hajj, the Muslims among them attended the 'Aqabah meeting and paid allegiance to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). But Islam did not spread among them until the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) migrated to them, followed by the Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) after three days or so. The story of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) arrival in Madinah is very well known.

He gradually spread his rule over the city after concluding an agreement with the Jews of Banu Quraydah, Banu Nazir and Banu Qaynuqa'. Gradually, the entire city of Madina entered the fold of Islam. So, when could he have sent Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) from a funeral to Madinah to smash the idols, level the graves and smear the pictures - as a ruler whose order none could reject? Furthermore, the content of the narrative is incredible: The first envoy went while they were in a funeral procession. he came back unsuccessful. Then the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) sent 'Ali while they still were in the same procession. How could this be?

Third: The continuation of the narrative adds that 'Ali (peace be on him) told Abu al-Hayyaa al-Asadi: *"I am sending you to (do) what the Messenger of Allah*

*(peace be on him and his progeny)" has sent me to do. He ordered me to level every grave and to destroy every idol."*¹

But the sending of Abu al-Hayyaaj by the Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) on a mission can only be during his caliphate. Here a question arises: After expansion of Islam during the three rulers before him, to which country did the Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) send Abu al-Hayyaaj to destroy the grave and smash the idols?

Finally, even if we take both the narratives to be true, it is clear that they contain orders from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and from the Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) to destroy the graves in a country of idolaters, but there is no evidence that those orders were meant to cover the graves of the Muslims too.

b. They quote the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to have said: *"O Allah! Do not make my grave an idol. May Allah curse those who took the graves of their Prophets places for worship."*²

In a second narrative he (peace be on him and his progeny) named those who took the graves of their Prophets as places for worship. He said *"May Allah kill the Jews who took the graves of their Prophets as places for worship."*³

The cause of the Hadîth

Banu Israel, having left Egypt and crossed the sea and the desert, reached Palestine, where they could have a place for worship viz. Bait al-Maqdis. They had no other place for worship. Prophet Sulaiman (peace be on him), during his reign, had a court called Solomon’s Temple. So, where were the graves of their Prophets which they used as worshipping places? Bait al-Maqdis and the whole country were under the observation of the Muslims and the Arabs before Islam. As to the remnants of their Prophets’ (peace be on them) graves, such as the graves of Ibrahim and Moosa, the son of ‘Imran, we have not seen nor heard nor is it written anywhere about the Jews taking them as idols. Now, even if we assume that a grave had been taken as a place of worship, but this does not apply to

¹ Ibid., Vol. 1/89 and 96

² Ibid., 2/285.

³ Ibid., 2/246

respecting a grave or just visiting it, because to take it for an idol means it should be regarded as a Ka'bah during prayers but how far is this from that!

The subject of our suspicion in what we have said, and in what we are going to say, are not the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)- God forbid! Our doubts concern the reporters of those narrations, since they are not infallible against mistakes, negligence and forgetfulness.

The Proofs Supporting the Lawfulness of Taking the Prophets' Graveyards as Places for Worship

Those who say it is lawful to take the graveyards of the Prophets (peace be on them) as places for worship support their claim by saying that those who go around the Ka'bah, simultaneously go around Ismaaeel's place, rub themselves to its walls which encircle the graves of Isma'il and his mother, Haajar, as was unanimously accepted by the Muslim scholars.

It is stated in al-Seerah of Ibn Hisham (d. 218 H.), Tarikh al-Tabari (d. 310 H.), Tarikh Ibn al-Athir (d. 630 H.) and Tarikh Ibn Kathir (d. 774 H.), quoting Ibn Hisham: "He (Ismaaeel) was buried in the Hijr, beside his mother." Ibn al-Athir says: "Ismaaeel willed that he should be buried near his mother's grave in al-Hijr."¹ According to Ibn Sa'd in his al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra: "When Ismaaeel was twenty, his mother, Haajar, died at the age of ninety. Ismaaeel buried her in his room. When Ismaaeel died, after his father, he was buried in the room near the Ka'bah, with his mother, Haajar."

In a narrative next to it, he says:

"The grave of Ismaaeel is under the roof-drain, between the corner and the House of Allah."²

In al-Iktifa' by al-Kala'i: "Haajar, Ismaaeel and his son, Naabit, were buried in al-Hijr."³

¹ Look up the story of Ismaaeel (peace be on him) and his son in al-Seerah of Ibn Hisham, Egypt ed, 1355 H. vol. 1, p. 6; Tarikh al-Tabari, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 352. Tarikh Ibn al-Athir, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p.89; Tarikh Ibn Kathir, vol. 1, p. 193. The entry "Hijr" in Mu'jam al-Buldaan.

² These three narratives have been summarized from al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa'd, vol. 1, p. 25, Eu. Ed.

Ibn Jubair, in his travelogue, described the graves of Ismaeel and his mother, Haajar, as below:

"Under the roof-drain in the square of Hijr, near the wall of the noble old House of Allah, is the grave of Ismaeel (peace be on him), marked with a semi-oblong green marble in the shape of a prayer-niche to which a round green marble is connected. Both make a strange spectacle, as they have rather yellowish scratches, as if veined. They resemble the scratches which remain in a melting pot after pouring out the molten gold. Next to it, adjacent to the Iraqi Rukn," is the grave of his mother Haajar (may Allah be pleased with her); it is marked with a green marble of a width of a span and a half. People expect blessings by performing prayers in these two places of the Hijr, and they must do so, because these are part of the Old House of Allah, embrace two noble and sacred personalities, illuminated by Allah the High, and whoever performs his prayers there will enjoy their blessings. The space between the two sacred graves is seven spans of a hand.¹

This is what is stated in the books of the opponents. In the books of Ahl al-Bait School the following are stated:

³ Al-Iktifaa Fi Maghazi al-Mustafa wa al-thalaathah al-Khulafaa', p. 119, edited by Henry Maasah, printed in Algiers, 1931. Al-Kala'i is Abu al-Rabi' Sulaiman Ibn Musa Ibn Saalim al-Himyari al-Kala'i, born 565 H. and d. 634 H. His biography is quoted from the book's Preface.

¹ Ibn Jubair: He is Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Jubair al-Kinaani al-Aandalusi, of a Balansion origin, lived in Granada, born on Friday night, 10th of the month of Rabi' al-Awwal in the year 540 or 539 H. He died in Alexandria (Egypt) on Tuesday night the 9th or the 27th of the month of Sha'baan, in 616 H. He was a litterateur, poet, generous and of high morals. He was a Spanish (old name Aandaaloos) scholar well-versed in jurisprudence and narrations. Ibn Jubair's Travel is his book in which he describes his travel to the Hajj, which took 27 months and a half, started on Monday, the 19th of the month of Shawwaal, 578 H. and ended on Thursday, the 22nd of the month of Muharram, 581 H. During his journey, he visited Egypt, the Arab lands Iraq, Syria, Sicily and other countries. He wrote describing the towns he passed through, as well as the places wherein he halted. Our quotation is taken from the edition of Daar Misr li al-Taba'ah, 1374 H., edited by Dr. Hossein Nasr, p. 63. We referred to the preface of Ibn Jubair's book for his biography.

In al-Kafi by al-Kulayni (d. 329 H.), Man laa Yahdoro al-Faqih and Elal al-Shara'i by al-Saduq (d. 381 H.), al-Waafi by al-Fayd (d. 1089 H.), and al-Bihar by al-Majlisi (d. 1111 H.), In the first book it is stated that in it (al-Hijr) are the graves of Haajar and Isma'il (peace be on him).¹

We also read in them: In it (the Hijr) there are graves of divine prophets (peace be on them).²

In al-Kafi, al-Wafi and al-Bihar, it is also recorded that there were buried in al-hijr, next to the third corner, the unmarried daughters of Ismaeel.³

Abu Bakr al-Faqih narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said:

"No Prophet ran away from His people unless he went to the Ka'bah to worship Allah till his death. The graves of Prophets Hud, Shu'ayb and Saalih (peace be on them) are between Zamzam and Maqaam (of Ibraheem). In the Ka'bah are the graves of 300 divine Prophets (peace be on them). Between Rukn al-Yamani up to Rukn al-Aswad, there are graves of 70 Prophets (peace be on them)."⁴

Moreover, to support their argument regarding the correctness of building on graves, they state that the graves of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and Abu Bakr and 'Umar, are under a roofed building from their deaths till date.

¹ Furu al-Kafi, Book of Hajj, Chapter on the Hajj of Ibraheem and Ismaaeel (peace be on them both) and their building the House of Allah, vol. 14, printed by Daar al-Kutub al-Islamiyyah, Tehran, 1391 H., vol. 4, p.210. Man laa Yahdoro al-Faqih, Book of Hajj, Chapter on Reasons for Hajj, Hadith 3, printed by Daar al-Kutub al-Islamiyyah, Tehran, (390 H. 2/125 & 126,) and Chapter on "Notes on the Hajj of the Prophets and Messengers", Hadith 8, vol. 2, p.149; al-Waafi, Book of Hajj, Chapter on "the Hajj of Ibraheem and Ismaaeel (peace be on them both)" 1st ed. vol. 8, p. 28; al-Bihar, book of "Prophethood", Chapter on "The conditions of Ibraheem's sons and his wives, and the building of Allah's House," hadith 41, vol. 5, p. 143 and hadith 54, vol. 5, p.144

² Furu' al-Kafi, the Book of Hajj, Chapter on "Hajj of Ibrahim (peace be on him)", hadith 15, vol. 4, p. 210. Al-Bihar quoting al-Saduq, Book of "the prophethood", Chapter on "The conditions of Ibrahim's sons", hadith 40, 5/142, 1st ed. company, and Chapter On "Reports on Ibrahim's sons", hadith 55, 5/144. Al-Wafi, the book of hajj, Chapter on "Hajj Ibrahim", 8/28.

³ Furu'ul Kafi, book of hajj, Chapter on "Hajj" Ibrahim", hadith 16, vol. 4, p. 210. Al-Wafi, Book of Hajj, Chapter on "Hajj of Ibraheem", vol. 8, p. 28; Al-Bihar, hadith 56, vol. 5, p. 144.

⁴ The summary of Kitab al-Buldaan by Abu Bakr Ibn Ahmad Ibn al-Faqih al-Hamadani (d. 340 H.), Brill, Leiden, 1302 H., P. 17.

They also reason, by referring to the verse: "... **and take the place of Ibrahîm as a place for worship**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 125) and verse concerning the story of "the people of the cave": "**Those who won their case said: We shall build a place of worship over them.**" (Surah Kahf (18): Verse 21).

The Wahhabis call the Muslims who visit the graves of the Prophets, the companions and the Imams as "worshippers of graves". But after what we have mentioned above, they should call the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), his companions and the Prophets before them who circumambulated the Hijr of Ismaaeel (peace be on him) as "worshippers of graves" because in the Hijr of Ismaaeel are the graves of Haajar, Ismaaeel, his sons and the Prophets before them!!

Thus, the difference in the hadîths, or rather the difference in understanding the hadîths concerning building tombs over the graves, was the origin of the disagreement.

Hereunder, we shall refer to the difference concerning weeping over the dead and its origin.

The Difference on Weeping over the Dead and its Origin

Weeping over the dead, especially the martyr, is from the traditions of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

Al-Bukhari, in his Sahîh, narrates:

"The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had informed the people about the death of Zayd, Ja'far and Ibn Rawaahah, before the news of their death reached them. He said: 'Zayd took the flag and was martyred, then Ja'far took the flag and he was martyred, and then Ibn Rawaahah took the flag and was martyred...' while tears flowed from his eyes."¹

In al-Istî'aab, Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah, introducing Ja'far, as well as relating about the Battle of Mootah, in Tarikh al-Tabari, and elsewhere, it is said, briefly:

"When Ja'far and his companions were martyred, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) went home, asked for Ja'far's sons, and began embraced them. His eyes filled with tears. Ja'far's wife Asma' asked him: 'May my father and mother be your ransom! What makes you cry? Did you receive any

¹ Sahîh al-Bukhari, the book of "the Virtues of the companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)", Chapter on the Merits of Khalid Ibn al-Walîd, vol. 4, p. 204

news about Ja'far and his companions?' Yes,' he said, '*They were martyred today.*' She continued 'I began to cry out and call the women. Fatimah came in weeping and saying 'Alas! My uncle!'. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'It is over someone like Ja'far should the crying women cry!'"

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) cries over his son Ibraheem

In the "Sahîh al-Bukharî" is stated that Anas reports:

"We went in with Allah's Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny)... while Ibraheem was breathing his last. Allah's Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) started crying. Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf (may Allah be pleased with him) said: 'O Allah's Messenger, even you (cry)?' '*O son of 'Awf,*' he said, '*It is mercy.*' Then, he wept more, and said:

'The eyes shed tears, the heart feels sorrow and we say nothing except what pleases Allah, our Lord. O Ibrahim! Indeed we are grieved by your separation.'"

Ibn Maajah, in his "Sunan", adds: "He (peace be on him and his progeny) threw himself on him and wept."¹

The Crying of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) over his grandson

It is in Sahîh al-Bukhari that the daughter of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) sent (somebody) to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) telling him that her son was dying and requested him to come... He, together with Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah, Mu'aadh Ibn Jabal, 'Ubayy Ibn Ka'b, Zayd Ibn Thaabit and

¹ Ibid., the book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "The Prophet's saying: We are grieved by your separation", vol.1, p.158, from which the text is quoted.

Sahîh Muslim, book of "Merits", Chapter on "His kindness to the children and the household", hadîth 62.

Sunan Ibn Maajah, Book of "The Funerals," Chapter on "Looking at the dead", hadîth 1475, vol. 1, p. 473.

Al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa'd, Eu. Ed., vol 1, Q 1, p.88.

Musnad Ahmad, vol.3, p. 194

others (came to her). The boy was lifted to him while his soul rattled in his chest. (The prophet's) eyes welled up with tears. Sa'd said: "What is this, O Messenger of Allah?" "It is mercy," said he, "Allah placed it into the hearts of His servants. Allah is merciful to those who are merciful."¹

The Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny) Demands Weeping on his Uncle, Hamzah

When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) heard the Ansar weeping in their houses, over their deads, after the Battle of Ohod, his eyes filled with tears. He wept and said: "*But Hamzah has no one to weep over him.*" Sa'd Ibn Mu'adh and 'Usayd Ibn Hudayr heard him say so. He went to the women of Banu 'Abd al-Ashhal and took them to the house of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), where they started weeping over Hamzah. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) heard them. So, he prayed for them and sent them back. Ever since no woman from the Ansar wept over a dead unless she first wept over Hamzah and then over her own deceased.²

¹ Sahîh al-Bukhari, book of "The Funerals," Chapter on "The Prophet's saying: The deceased is tortured because of some weeping of his relatives", from which the text is quoted. Book of "Those who are patient", Chapter on "Visiting the children", vol. 4, p.3; Sahîh Muslim, Book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "Weeping over the dead", hadîth 11, p. 636.

Sunan Abi Dawud, book of "The Funerals," Chapter on "Weeping over the Dead", hadîths: vol. 3, p. 25, vol. 3, p. 193.

Sunan al-Neasa'i, book of "The Funerals," Chapter on "Patience and Allah's reward," vol. 1, p.264.

Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p. 306 & vol. 3, pp. 83, 88 & 89.

² Quoted from the biography of Hamzah in al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa'd, published by Dar Saadir, Beirut, 1377 H., vol 3, p.11. It is more detailed in Al-Maghaazi of al-Waaqedi, vol. 1, p.163.

Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, p. 40.

Also stated by Ibn 'Abd al-Birr, briefly, in Hamzah's biography from al-Ist'ab and also brought briefly by Ibn al-Athir in Usud al-Ghaabah.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) wept over his mother's grave and caused the people around him to weep too.

The Messenger(peace be on him and his progeny) visited his mother's grave, wept and _____ caused _____ those around him to weep.¹

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered food to be sent to the afflicted family.

When the death of Ja'far was announced, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said:

*"Make food for Ja'far's family, as they have now what would engage them."*²

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) assigned the mourning period

It was successively narrated that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had decided that a woman's mourning on other than her husband should be no more than three days, and on her husband, as Allah had ordained, it should be three months and ten days.³ (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 224).

¹ Sunan al-Nesaa'i, Book of "the Funerals", Chapter on "Visiting the grave of an idolater", vol. 1, p. 267; Sunan Abi Dawud, Book of "Funerals," Chapter on "Visiting the graves", hadith 3234, vol. 3, p. 218.

Sunan Ibn Maajah, book of "The Funerals," Chapter on "What had been said concerning visiting the graves of the idolaters", hadith 1572, vol. 1, p. 50

² Sunan Ibn Maajah, book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "What is said about sending food to the people of the deceased," p. 511, hadiths: 1610 & 1611, vol. 1, p. 514.

Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 4, p.219, Chapter on "The Funerals", Chapter on "What is said about preparing food and sending it to the family of the deceased". He said it is a good and correct hadith.

Sunan Abi Dawud, book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "Preparing food for the family of the deceased," hadith vol. 3, p. 32, vol. 3, p. 195. Musnad Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 205 & vol. 6, p. 370.

³ Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "The woman's mourning over other than her husband," vol. 1, p.154; Book of "Divorce", Chapter on "A widow's mourning is for four months and ten days", vol. 3, p.189; Chapter 68 "A mourning widow using kohl," Chapter on "A mourning widow using incense after purification from her menses," Chapter on "The mourning widow wearing the browband types of clothes", Chapter on "And those of you who die and leave wives", vol. 3, pp. 189 – 190. Sahih Muslim, Book of "Divorce", Chapter on

The Origin of the Difference about Weeping over the Dead

It has been related earlier that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had wept over a dying person before and after his death, especially the martyrs. He (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered weeping over the martyrs. He (peace be on him and his progeny) wept over his mother's grave, causing the people around him to weep too. He (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered food to be sent to the people of the deceased. He (peace be on him and his progeny) limited the mourning of a woman over other than her husband to three days. Thus, weeping over the dead, going into mourning and offering food to the deceased family are from the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). So, what is the origin of the difference and the reason for forbidding the weeping over the dead? Let us return to al-Bukhari and Muslim in their "Sahih". There we find that the origin of the traditions concerning forbidding weeping over the dead or the martyrs is from 'Umar.

Umar narrates that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had forbidden weeping but 'A'ishah, redressed him.

It is in the Saheeh al-Bukhari and Saheeh Muslim, quoting Ibn Abbas, that: "... when 'Umar was dying, Suhayb came in weeping and saying: 'O my brother! O my friend!' On this 'Umar said to him: 'O Suhayb! Are you weeping while the

"Compulsory mourning during the waiting period, and prohibiting it except for three days," hadiths: 1486, 1487, 1490, 1491, pp. 1124-1128.

Sunan Abi Dawud, Book of "Divorce", Chapter on "The mourning of the widow", hadith: 2299, vol. 2, p.290 and Chapter on "What are to be avoided by the widow still in her waiting period," hadith: 2302, vol. 2, p. 291. Sunan al-Tirmidhi, the book of "Divorce and Allegation of Adultery", Chapter on "What is said concerning the mourning of the widow", vol. 5, pp. 171-174. Sunan al-Nesaa'i, book of "Divorce", Chapter on "The waiting period of the widow", Chapter on "Mourning", Chapter On "The exemption of the widow of the followers of Divine Books (other than Islam) from mourning", Chapter on "Avoiding make-up by the Muslim mourning widow, excluding the Jews and the Christians"; Chapter on "Avoiding the dyed dresses by the mourning widow"; Chapter on "The mourning widow applying dyestuff".

Sunan Ibn Maajah, Book of "Divorce", Chapter on "Is the widow allowed to mourn on other than her husband?", hadiths: 2085-2087, vol.1, p.374

Sunan al-Daaremi, Book of "Divorce," Chapter 11, vol. 1, p.167. Maalik's al-Mawatta', Book of "Divorce," hadith: 101 & 105.

Musnad Ahmad, vol. 5, p.8, vol. 6, pp. 37, 184, 249, 281, 286, 287, 324, 325, 326, 369, 408, 426.

Musnad al-Tayaalisi, hadith: 1587, 1589, 1591

Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *The dead person is tormented by some of the weeping of his relatives?* Ibn Abbas said: 'When 'Umar died I told this to 'A'ishah. She said: 'May Allah have mercy on 'Umar. By Allah! The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not say that Allah would torment the believer due to the weeping of his relatives. But the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'Allah increases the torment of the non-believer due to the weeping of his relatives'*. She further added: 'The Qur'an is enough (To clear up this point), as it says: **"No soul would bear the burden of one another."** (Surah Faatir (35): Verse 8). Ibn 'Abbas then said: 'Only Allah makes one laugh or cry.'¹

In "Sahîh Muslim" it is said that "'A'ishah was informed that Umar's son quoted the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) to have said: "The deceased is tortured in his grave by the weeping of his relatives over him." She said: "He has erred [he was mistaken]! But the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had actually said that he would be tortured by his error, or sin, and that his people do weep over him."

In an earlier narrative it is said that when it was mentioned to 'A'ishah the saying of 'Umar's son that: "the deceased is tortured by the weeping of his people over him," she said: "May Allah have mercy on Abu 'Abd al-Rahman, he heard something but he did not retain it. In fact, a Jew's funeral procession once passed by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). They were weeping over their dead. He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"You weep while he is being tortured."*²

Imam al-Nawawi (d. 676 A.H.), in his commentary on Sahîh Muslim, in respect of the narratives which prohibit weeping over the dead, quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "These were narrated by 'Umar Ibn

¹ Sahîh al-Bukhari, Book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "The statement of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) "The deceased is tormented by the weeping of his relatives", vol. 1/155-156.

Sahîh Muslim, Book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "The deceased is tormented by the weeping of his relatives over him", hadîth: 22 p. 641

² Sahîh Muslim, book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "The deceased is tortured by his family's weeping over him", hadîths 25 and 26, pp. 642-643, hadîth 27, p. 643. Al-Tirmidhi's text is nearly the same in book of "The Funerals", Chapter on "Permission to weep over the dead," vol. 4, p. 225; Sunan Abi Dawud, Book of "The funerals", hadîth No. 3129, vol. 3, p. 194

al-Khattaab and his son ‘Abdullah and which ‘A’ishah denied and ascribed to forgetfulness and obscurity on their part. She denied that the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) should have said so.”¹

From the following narration, it appears that the origin of the difference was the personal (whimsical) jurisprudence of ‘Umar in prohibiting weeping, in opposition to the Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) tradition allowing the weeping. The narrative says: "A person of the Prophet’s relatives died. The women gathered and wept over him. ‘Umar asked them to stop and dismissed them. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him: *‘Let them, O ‘Umar. The eye sheds tears and the heart is afflicted and (it is) still fresh’*".²

Sahîh al-Bukhari says: "... ‘Umar used to beat with a stick and throw stones and scatter dust".³

Thus, the origin of the difference about weeping over the dead was the contradiction in the narrations stated in the "Sahîh" books. Probably, the (whimsical) jurisprudence of ‘Umar in prohibiting it was the origin of the related narratives on the prohibition of weeping over the dead.

Besides the narratives already stated, there are some other narratives in support of the whimsical jurisprudence of ‘Umar. As of now, we do not intend to explain the causes behind those narratives. What has already been said is enough to show the origin of the difference concerning the weeping over the dead as we intended to present.

¹ An-Nawawi’s annotation on Sahîh Muslim, the Egyptian printing press, 1349 H., vol. 6, p.228, Chapter on "The deceased is tortured by his family’s weeping over him."

² Sunan al-Nesaa’i, Book of "The funerals", Chapter on "Allowing weeping over the dead." Ibn Maajah, book of "The funerals", Chapter on "What is said about weeping over the dead", hadîth: 1587, p. 505. Musnad Ahmad, vol. 2, pp. 110, 273, 333, 408, 444

³ Sahîh al-Bukhari, book of "The funerals", Chapter on "Weeping near a patient", vol. 1, p.158. By "Beating... etc" he means he did so to prevent the weeping".

So far, we have cited examples of the disputed questions whose origin were contradictory narratives. Hereunder, we shall, with the help of Allah, demonstrate the verses of the Book of Allah about whose interpretations there were differences.

8

The Difference on the Interpretation of Some Verses from the Book of Allah

Among the examples of the verses causing differences are the interpretations of some of the following verses:

The Judgment of other than Allah and Invoking other than Him

Shaykh Muhammad Abd al-Wahhab, the founder of Wahhabism, in his book, 'Al-Usul al-Thalaathah wa Adillatuha (The Three principles and their proofs), p. 4, says:

"Know - may Allah have mercy upon you - that every muslim, man and woman, must learn and practice these three principles:

The first: Allah created us...

The second: Allah does not accept to be associated with a partner in worshipping Him. Be it a proximate angel or a sent prophet. The proof is the saying of Allah, the Most High: '**And that the mosques are Allah's, therefore call not upon any one with Him**'"¹ (Surah Jinn (72): Verse 18)

¹ Risalaalah al-'Usul al-thalaathah, Al-Madani printing Press, Cairo, 1380 H., including Risalaah al-deen and its conditions. They also argued that Allah, the Most High, saying: "**Say: Call on those whom you claimed besides Him, yet they are incapable of ridding you of misfortune or of changing.**" (Surah Israa (17): Verse 56), and other similar verses.

On page 5, he says: "The hanifiyyah, the religion of Ibrahîm, is to worship Allah alone and be sincere to Him in religion. To this He ordered all the people and for this He created them, as He, the Most High, said: '**And I have not created the jinn and the ins except that they should worship Me.**' (Surah Zaariyaat (51): Verse 56). The meaning of '**worship Me**' is that "they must believe in My Oneness". The greatest thing commanded by Allah is monotheism i.e. to worship Allah alone. The greatest thing He forbade is polytheism i.e. believing in and calling associates other than Him...", Then in page 8 he says: "And the proof is His saying: **and that the mosques are Allah's...**"

On page 46 of the same book, he says:

"The fourth rule: The polytheist of our time are more ruthless than those of the early times, because the former used to be idolaters in prosperity and sincere in hardship, whereas in our time they remain polytheists in both prosperity as well as hardship. The proof is Allah's saying:

'So, when they mount upon the ships they pray to Allah, sincere in their belief in Him (alone), but when he brings them safe to the land, they ascribe partner (to Him)' (Surah Ankaboot (29): Verse 65)."

In his Al-Deen wa Shurut al-Salaat¹ (Religion and the conditions of prayers), he said, in brief: Worship is of many kinds. One of them is invocation (dua); the proof is in Allah's saying: "**and that the mosques are Allah's...**"

In Shifa' al-Sodoor, which was issued by Dar al-Iftaa' al-'Aammah as a refutation to Risalaah al-Jawaab al-Mashkur, it is stated on page 3: "They were raised to the successor of the leaders of the call for monotheism, those who removed the darkness of polytheism from this country – i.e. Makkah al-Mukarramah and al-Madînah al-Munawwarah - and purified them from its filths and effaced all its traces..."²

¹ Ibid., as well as Risalaalah al-Deen wa Shurut al-salaah, printed in the same press, undated.

² Risaalah Shifaa al-Sudur, 1st ed. Al-Nur Establishment for Printing and Book binding.

By "invoking other than Him or besides Him" they refer to a Muslim's saying: "O Messenger of Allah!" by way of beseeching Allah through him, or through anyone else of godly men. All their proofs stem from **"call not upon any one with Him."** and similar verses which prohibit invoking besides Allah or other Allah.

Their opponents say: How like is this night to yesternight! And how like is this argument to that of the khawarij who accused those who accepted the arbitration in the Battle of Siffeen as disbelief, by quoting verses: **"Judgment is only Allah's; on Him do I rely, and on Him let the relying ones rely."**¹ (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 67) or: **"Shall I, then, seek a judge other than Allah? And He is who has revealed to you the Book in detail..."** (Surah An'aam (6):Verse 114).

It started in the Battle of Siffeen when Mu'awiyah ordered copies of the Holy Qur'an to be raised on top of the spears, calling the Iraqi army to resort to the judgement of the Book of Allah. Most of the reciters of the Holy Qur'an present were deceived by this trick. So, they forced Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to stop the fight and accept Mu'awiyah's call to arbitration, whereupon Mu'awiyah appointed 'Amr Ibn al-Aas to represent him, while 'Ali (peace be on him) was forced to appoint Abu Musa al-Ash'ari to represent him. When the two representatives met, 'Amr deceived al-Ash'ari, telling him that they should remove 'Ali and Mu'awiyah from their posts and let people choose their ruler. Abu Musa agreed and addressing the people, said: "I depose 'Ali and Mu'awiyah from the rule so that the Muslims may choose their Imam." Then 'Amr played the trick up his sleeve, saying to the people: "As you heard, he deposed his companion while I appoint my companion to the Imamate." At that there was a quarrel and exchanged abuses between the two of them, and then they parted. Only then those of the Iraqi army who had accepted the arbitration realized their mistake, and raised the slogan of **"There is no judgement but Allah's"**, and said: "We returned to disbelief by accepting the arbitration but we repent to Allah. So, the others will also have to confess their disbelief and repent, too, as we did, and whoever does not do that, he is an unbeliever."

Thus, they regarded as unbelievers those who first participated in those events, such as 'Aisha, 'Uthman, 'Ali, Talhah, Al-Zubair, Mu'awiyah, 'Amr Ibn al-Aas

¹ We repeat that we do not intend to numerate the proofs of the two parties. We only give examples

and their followers. Later, their sentence of unbelief was spread to cover all the Muslims, and called themselves "al-Shuraah", keeping their swords unsheathed for centuries, killing the Muslims with these swords and being killed.¹ The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) truly predicted about the Khawaarij, saying: "*They would kill the people of Islam and leave the people of the idols. Had I been to lay hands on them I would have killed them like the killing of Aad,*"² and in other sources, "*like the killing of Thamud.*"³

Their Opponents' Reply

In reply to both sides, their opponents say that one part of the Holy Qur'an interprets the other. So, when the Holy Qur'an says: "**Judgment is only Allah's**", it also says: "**... if they come to you, judge between them or turn them away, and if you turn them away, they shall not harm you at all. And if you judge, judge between them with equity.**" (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 42).

He had vested His Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in this verse with judging among the people of the divine Books. In another verse, He commands the people to nominate an arbitrator, as He says: "**And if you fear a breach between the two, then appoint a judge from his people and a judge from her people. If they both desire reparation, Allah will bring them to harmony.**" (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 35)

¹ Refer to the events of Siffeen in al-Tabari's Tarikh, as well as in Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Kathir, and in them about "al-Khawaarij" and other books of history

² That was when the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) cousin, ' Ali (peace be on him), sent to him from Yemen a piece of gold and He distributed it among four of the mu'allafatun qulubuhum (those whose hearts required to be reconciled). The Quraysh and the Ansar felt angry and said: "He gives it to the chiefs of Najd and leaves us". The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*I only want to unite their hearts.*" There came a man with his head shaved and said: "O Muhammad! Fear Allah!" The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) retorted: "*Who obeys Allah if I disobey Him? Should He entrust me with the people of the earth, while you distrust me?*" When the man went away, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) prophesied: "*From the offspring of this man, there will be people who will recite the Qur'an but it will not go beneath their throats. They will go out of Islam as an arrow leaves the bow. They will kill the Muslims....*" Sahih al-Bukhari, book of at-Tawhid, Chapter on "Allah's saying: **The angels ascend...**", vol. 4, p.188.

Sahih Muslim, book of Zakaat, Chapter on "Al-Khawaarij and their Characteristics", hadith 143, p.741.

³ Sahih Muslim, Hadiths: 144-146

Yet, there is no contradiction between the two verses. When the first verse confirms that judgment is Allah's, it does not speak of a limited judgment like that of the judges in the courts, who have to judge among the people according to the accepted laws, yet they have no right to appoint by themselves any judges, as that is up to a higher authority. So, the judges have no right to be absolute arbitrators. Their right is confined to judging among the people only, while Allah can judge among the people according to His own decision, and can give permission to others to judge. That is, He can appoint a governor for any part of His domain, since He is the absolute Ruler. Therefore, when the Prophets (peace be on them) judge, they judge according to Allah's judgment. Similar is the judgement of the two who judge as arbitrators between a man and his wife. Consequently, the judgment of those judges - if they judge according to Allah's order - is the very judgment of Allah, not without Allah, nor together with Allah. It is a judgment on Allah's order and a judgment by Allah's permission. As to the reply to invoking other than Allah will come under "calling the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and imploring Allah through him."

The same can be said in respect of some other verses which confirm some attributes of Allah. They do not confirm them as limited attributes, but as absolute ones, such as the attribute of Allah' sovereignty.

Allah's Ownership

There is no contradiction between confirming Allah's absolute ownership, as in the verse: **"... and Allah's is the ownership of the heavens and the earth and what is between them, and to Him is the destination"** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 18) or **"Who has not taken a son and who has no partner in ownership"**, (Surah Israa (17): Verse 111 and Surah Furqaan (25): Verse 2 and numerous other verses) and the verse: **"... and what your right hand possess"** (Surah Nisaa (4):Verses 3, 24, 25, 36) and other verses to the same effect because Allah, the Exalted, says: **"Say: O Allah! O the Owner of the kingdom! You give the kingdom to whoever You will and You expropriate the kingdom from whom You will. You exalt who You will and You abase who You will. The choice lies with You. Surely, You have power over everything"** (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 26).

So, when Allah grants ownership to servant, he will not be the owner along with Allah, as Allah, Alone is the absolute Owner; none besides Allah and none but Allah. Actually, the servant and what he owns belongs to his master. The servant's ownership is with the permission of Allah is one of the most manifest evidences of "Ownership belongs to Allah". That is Allah's ownership is not limited like the servant's ownership, which depends on Allah's will and permission. The servant has no right to dispose of what had been entrusted to him by Allah except within the limits ordained by Allah in respect of time, place and control. This is true also in respect of the attribute of creativity.

The Creator and the Giver of Life

Concerning the Attributes "Creator" and "Giver of Life", Allah, the Exalted and Highest, says: "... **the Creator of all things**" (Surah An'aam (6): Verse 102), "... **is there any creator besides Allah...?**" (Surah Faatir (35): Verse 3), "...**For Him is the creation and the command**" (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 54), "**He is who gives life and causes death**" (Surah Mominoon (23): Verse 80). and "**But Allah is the Guardian and He gives life to the dead.**" (Surah Shuraa (42): Verse 9). All these, as a matter of fact, do not contradict the fact that Allah the High gave permission to Prophet Eesaa, son of Maryam, (peace be on them both) to create and give life, as Allah, the Exalted says: "...**and how you created out of clay the shape of the bird by My permission, then you blew into it and it became a bird by My permission, and you healed the blind and the leprous by My permission, and you raised the dead by My permission**" (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 110), and Prophet Eesa (peace be on him) himself says: "**I create out of clay the shape of a bird, then I blow into it and it becomes a bird by Allah's permission, and I heal the blind and the leprous and raise the dead to life by Allah's permission.**" (Surah Aale Imran (3): 49).

When Allah, the Glorified, creates, He is not like a machine which keeps on making the same job, He is above that nor is He like the human being who cannot transfer his power of working to any body else. Allah is capable of creating life, in a human or in an animal, by means of impregnation between male and female. He even can create without there being a male and a female, just as He created

Prophet Adam (peace be on him). He can also permit Prophet Eesaa (peace be on him) to create by His permission, yet the creator is Allah Himself all the time.

The same holds true for giving life. Allah is capable of raising to life the dead on the Day of Resurrection without any means. He can, likewise, grant the power of giving life to His apostle Eesaa, son of Mary (peace be on them both) such that he brought to life the dead by Allah's permission.

He can also put the power of giving life into the body of the yellow cow of Banu Israel, with part of which they stroke the body of their dead, who returned to life and showed them his murderer.¹

When Eesaa, son of Mary, (peace be on them both) created the bird and brought the dead to life, the creation and the giving of life to the dead were with the permission of Allah the High. So, when Prophet Eesaa (peace be on him) did so, he did not do it partnership with Allah, nor without Allah, as the creator and the giver of life is none but Allah Himself. Prophet Eesaa (peace be on him) only received Allah's permission to do what he did.

The Guardian and the Intercessor

Similar is the case of the attribute of being Guardian and Intercessor.

There is no contradiction between the verses:

"Or have they intercessors besides Allah? Say: Even if they owned nothing and did not understand? Say: Allah's is all intercession. His is the ownership of the heavens and the earth. Then to Him you will be returned." (Surah Zumar (39): Verses 43 & 44)

b. **"... you have not, besides Him, any guardian nor any intercessor. Do not you, them, remember?"** (Surah Sajdah (32): Verse 4)

c. **"There is no guardian for them nor any intercessor besides Him"** (Surah An'aam (6): Verse 51)

d. **"... lest a soul be destroyed for what it earned. It shall not have besides Allah any guardian nor an intercede"** (Surah An'aam (6): Verse 70) and the verses:

¹ Refer to verses 67-73 of Surah al-Baqarah.

- a. **"There is no intercessor except after His permission"** (Surah Yunus(10): Verse 3).
- b. **"Who is he that can intercede with Him except by His permission"** (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 255).
- c. **"On that day no intercession shall avail except of him whom the Beneficent allows and whose words He accepts."** (Surah Taha (20): Verse109).
- d. **"And intercession will not avail with Him except of him whom He permits..."**
(Surah Sabaa (34): Verse 23).
- e. **"They own not intercession except the one who has made a covenant with the Beneficent."** (Surah Maryam (19): Verse 87).
- f. **"and they do not intercede except for him whom He approves."** (Surah Anbiya (21): Verse 28).

So, when Allah, the High, permits His good servants to intercede, it is because intercession belongs to Him exclusively, and He permits them to intercede. The intercessor, therefore, is not independent of Allah the Almighty.

The Guardian

The same is true with guardianship. Allah, the Exalted, says:

"Allah's is the ownership of the heavens and the earth and besides Him you have no guardian or helper" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 107).

"Do those who disbelieve think that they can take My servants as guardians besides me? We have prepared hell for the disbelievers a (becoming) abode."
(Surah Kahf (18): Verse 102).

All these do not contradict the following verses:

"Your guardian is but Allah, His Messenger and those who believe, who keep up the prayers, pay the poor-rate in a state of bowing." (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 55).

There is no contradiction between them. It is not polytheism to say our guardian is Allah, His Messenger and those who keep up the prayers and pay the poor-rate

during bowing from among the believers, because the guardianship is Allah's, and it is He who gave it to them, as He gave the father the guardianship over his son.

* * *

In all the aforesaid attributes it is correct to say: Allah is the Ruler, the Owner, the Intercessor, the Guardian, etc. It is correct also to say to the servant to whom Allah had given those attributes: the owner, the ruler, the intercessor and the guardian. The best evidence for this is as follows:

WHO MAKES PEOPLE DIE?

Allah the Almighty said: **"Those whom the angels cause to die, while still wronging themselves."** (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 28).

"Those whom the angels cause to die (when they are) good, saying: peace be upon you!" (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 32).

"Our messengers caused him to die and they do not neglect" (Surah An'aam (6): Verse 61)

"Say: The angel of death, who is given charge of you, causes you to die, and then to your Lord you will be returned." (Surah Sajdah (32): Verse 11).

"Allah causes the souls to die at the time of their death" (Surah Zumar (39): Verse 42)

So, the one who says that the angels capture the souls at the time of their death with Allah's permission is neither a liar nor a polytheist. The one who says that the angel of death, 'Izraaeel, siezes the souls at the time of death with Allah's permission is neither a liar nor a polytheist. There is no contradiction between these two sayings and the saying that Allah the Almighty captures the souls at the time of their death. In all these cases, none takes the souls except Allah, not together with Allah. It is Allah who takes the souls,¹ i.e. it is He who causes death. The same is true of the other attributes mentioned before.

Invoking the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and Approaching Allah through his (peace be on him and his progeny) mediation

¹ This argument is based on a saying of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), according to al-Saduq's narration, concerning refuting the dualists and the atheists, in his book al-Tawhid, p.241

It has already been said that any judgement, ownership, intercession, creation, giving life, causing death and guardianship, if it was with Allah's permission, then it is certainly not independent of Allah, without Allah nor in partnership with Allah. Therefore, invoking the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and approaching Allah through him, if done with Allah's permission, there would be no invocation to other than Allah nor without Allah nor along Allah, and it does not come among the evidences of what Allah had prohibited in the verse: **"Call not upon any one with Allah"**. We have already referred to the hadith narrated in Musnad Ahmad, Sunan al-Tirmidhi, Ibn Majah and al-Baihaqi, and they have also confirmed to its veracity, to the effect that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had taught his blind companion to invoke after the prayers by saying: "O Allah! I ask you and turn to you through your Prophet, the Prophet of mercy. O Muhammad! I turn through you to my Lord with my demand to be accomplished for me. O Allah! Accept his intercession for me."¹

Allah did accomplish his demand, accepted His Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) intercession and returned his vision to him. This kind of indirect invocation to Allah is the evidence of His saying: **"And seek the means (to approach) to Him"** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 35) **"...seeking the means of access to their Lord..."** (Surah Israa (17): Verse 57)

* * *

So far we had presented some of the differences and indicated to their apparent sources. Hereunder, we shall study the real cause of the differences and they are two issues:

A. The Actual Incentive to the Dispute

Formerly we mentioned examples of the source of the difference in the hadiths and in interpreting the verses of the Glorious Book, behind which we find two real incentives:

- a. The interminable arrogance of the creatures.

¹ Refer to its sources under "Seeking the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) intercession during his life" in the preliminaries of this book

b. The need of the authorities ruling the society to show the lives of the humanity's exemplars as not contradicting their own lustful and indecent lives. The details are as below:

A. The First Real Cause for Dispute

First: At the beginning of creation

Allah, the Glorified, tells us about Iblis (the Satan) and his refusal to bow down to (Prophet) Adam (peace be on him): **"He said: O Iblis! What prevented you from prostrating to what I created with My two hands? Were you proud or were you from the exalted ones?" "He said: I am better than him (Adam)..."** (Surah Saad (38): Verses 75 & 76). Iblis also argued: **"I am not such that I should prostrate to a mortal whom You have created from black mud fashioned into shape"** (Surah Hjr (15): Verse 33)

Iblis had worshipped Allah – the One and Who has no partner – equal to the life of an angel. Yet, he did not bow to Adam, Allah's chosen one in his time, offended him; the rest is history. As to the people who were arrogant in front of Allah's Prophets (peace be on them) and His friends afterwards, we present hereunder examples of their destinies:

Second: In the past nations

His people told their Nooh their Prophet (peace be on him): **"We do not consider you but a mortal like ourselves... and we do not see in you any excellence over us."** (Surah Hud (11): Verse 27)

They said: **"He is naught but a mortal like you who intends to dominate you."** (Surah Mominoon (23): Verse 24)

The nations of Nooh, Aad and Thamud told their Prophets (peace be on them): **"...you (Prophets) are naught but mortals like us..."** (Surah Ibraheem (14): Verse 10)

They also told their Prophets (peace be on them): **"...he is naught but a mortal like you, eating of what you eat from and drinking of what you drink."** (Surah Mominoon (23): Verse 33)

The answer of the Prophets (peace be on them) to their people in respect of their objections and disrespect was, as Allah narrates, **"Their Messengers said to**

them: We are naught but mortals like you but Allah bestows (His) favors on whom He wills from His servants." (Surah Ibraheem (14): Verse11)

Ibn Hajar, in the biography of Dhul KhuwaySeerah, the chief of the Kharijites, in al-'Isaabah, quoting Anas, says:

Third: In the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

"In the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), there was a man whose worship and servitude were admirable. We informed the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) about him. He did not recognize him. We described him, still he did not recognise him. Meanwhile the man showed up. We said: "That is him." The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*You are telling me about a man on whose face there are ulcers from Satan.*" The man came near them and stopped without greeting them. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny): "*By Allah, when you stopped here, did you not say: 'No one among them is better than me?'*", 'By Allah, I did', said the man. Then he went in for the prayers. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)said: "*Who kills the man?'*"..." etc. as the hadith goes, at the end of which the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*If he is killed no one would quarrel over him.*"¹

Fourth: In the contemporary era

The knowledgeable Saudi man said: "Muhammad was a man like me, died."

¹ Al-'Isaabah, the biography of Zu al-KhuwaySeerah al-Tamimi Harqus Ibn Zuhair, the leader of the Kharijites, who said to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while he was distributing something: "O Messenger of Allah! Be just!" He said: "*Woe unto you! Who would be just if not me?*" He (peace be on him and his progeny) said about him: "*He has companions you would scorn your prayers compared to theirs, and your fasting compared to theirs; but they dart away from religion like an arrow leaves the bow*". Refer to the biography of Zu al-KhuwaySeerah in Usud al-Ghaabah and detailed speech of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about him and the Kharijites and Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) fight with them in Sahih Muslim, Chapter on "The Khawaarij" and Chapter on "Provocation to kill the Khawaarij" and Chapter on "The Khawaarij are the most vicious people and creatures."

Ulcer implies that appears on the heads and faces. It points to a scar remaining from a strike of Satan on his face

The cause behind this answer is also arrogance, as was the case with the people of the past.

Conclusion:

Iblis does not see for Adam, Allah's prophet and chosen one, any excellence over himself, does not submit to him and says: "**He is merely a mortal.**"

The people of Nooh, 'Aad and Thamud did not find merit for their Prophets (peace be on them) and said to them: "**You are but mortals like us.**"

Zu al-KhuwaySeerah, the chief of the Khawaarij, says to a group of the people, including the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny): "None of the group is more merited, or better, than me." The same applies in our times.

Consequently, the first incentive behind disdaining the Prophets of Allah (peace be on them) is conceit, arrogance and boastfulness.

B. The Second Real Motive for Dispute

The second motive for the dispute in the Umaah along centuries is the attempts of the authorities ruling over the Muslims to show that the lives of the human examples of the Prophets and godly men do not contradict their own lives of indulgence in satisfying their selfish whims and following their personal desires. These two incentives had resulted, among many other things, in interpreting the Qur'anic verses in such a way as to accept the idea of committing of sins by the Prophets (peace be on them) and the friends of Allah. Many hadiths were forged to prove them (peace be on him and his progeny) indulgent in worldly pleasures and desires. Sometimes they made use of the Israelite narratives, such as what they narrated about the Prophet Dawood (peace be on him) and the wife of Uriah¹, and many other similar fables about the Prophets (peace be on them), of which we have already stated examples of what they had alleged about the best and the seal of the prophets, Hazrat Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny). By way of his lighting the positions of the prophets of Allah, alleging that they had no merits over the other ordinary people, they interpreted the verses from the Glorious Qur'an - such verses explicitly refer to the miracles of the prophets, like 'Isa's

¹ Look up the biography of the Prophet Dawood (peace be on him) in Tarikh al-Tabari and elsewhere.

creating a bird out of clay by permission of Allah, and the like - forging such narratives as to support what they wanted to propagate about the Prophets (peace be on him) being no better than ordinary people.

Defying those forged hadiths and the misinterpretations of the Qur'anic verses, caused by the said two incentives, there are in the books of exegeses, hadiths and biographies, many other narratives which confirm the merits and the superiorities of the Prophets (peace be on them) chosen by Allah the Almighty as His close friends. These were endorsed by groups of Muslims, and the Qur'anic verses were accordingly interpreted. These different stands resulted in different visions of the attributes of Allah and of His Prophets (peace be on them), as well as of the Throne, the Chair and many other Islamic knowledge. The one view point contradicts the other. Each group has believed in what it had to the extent of accusing the other group of unbelief. This separation during many centuries was a result of that. Now as to how to set things right, as a conclusion, we suggest the following:

Summary and Conclusion

Allah, the Exalted, legislated Islam for man as a system coinciding with his disposition, and to which He guided him by means of His Prophets (peace be on them). Whenever a divine Prophet died and his people distorted his religion, Allah the Omnipotent would renew the religion by sending another Prophet. His wisdom decreed that the religions end with the seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny). He protected the principles of Islam by way of protecting the Qur'an against any increase or decrease forever. The explanation of the precepts was done through the sunnah, the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), though it was not protected, like the Qur'an, against increase and

decrease, nor were its narrators immune against forgetfulness and negligence, nor were the scripts of the books of hadiths against mistakes and errors. Fourteen centuries have now passed since the traditions of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had first been narrated, during which the Muslims had to deal with such narratives representing both the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) conduct and sayings - that were contradictory, and divided into the brief and the expanded, the general and the particular. They were subject to external factors affecting the narration of the hadiths, as we had mentioned before. Differences appeared in the views of the jurists, concerning their preferred hadiths, in addition to their personal opinions on different Islamic sciences and precepts, each group fanatically supporting its opinions and opposing others. Thus, each group formed its special viewpoint about Islam, according to which it tried to interpret the ambiguous verses of the Holy Quran, using them to explain the clear ones.

* * *

Thus, the Muslims were divided into groups and sects. Centuries passed during which they accused one another of disbelief. Sometimes, they even slayed their ideological opponents and plundered their properties! Such being the case, and with the existence of such differences, how can the Muslims be united, while the disputed questions (some of which had already been related here) are still there? No, no rapprochement among the Muslims is possible, if the situation remains as it is and if they remain imitating their ancestors' opinions. Every group of the Muslims is to display its views of Islam and of the interpretations of the Qur'an and what it has of the narrated hadiths and personal opinions which caused the difference. This, however, should be done motivated by the quest for the truth and solemn scholarly research, without resorting to abuse, cursing or falsifying in support of the opinions of one's group, may Allah protect us against such things. Each group must listen to what the other groups have to say. Reality is the offspring of research!

The best way to attain this result is that the Muslim scholars should study those questions with complete scientific impartiality. Then the results of those studies are to be offered to the great Islamic academies, such as al-Azhar ash-Sharîf in Cairo, the Islamic University in al-Madinah al-Munawwarah, the Islamic World

League in Makkah Al-Mukarramah and the big Shia scholarly circles in an-Najaf al-Ashraf, Qum, Mashhad, Qayrawan and al-Zaytunah, in order to be scrutinizingly studied. Thereafter, the Islamic governments should publish their conclusions for Muslims all over the world, so that anyone who wishes to understand the opinions of the other groups as best as possible can do so without obscurity or abuse. It will then be up to him to properly receive the others' opinions, or accept the excuses of his Muslim brother for the opinion he had adopted. Hence, all the Muslims will be able to understand one another, get nearer to each other and unite their efforts in their mutual interest.¹

On this subject, it is necessary to begin the research with studies on the sources of the Islamic shari'ah, how the Muslims used to resort to them and the way of reaching to the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) sunnah. To

¹ I explained the necessity of conducting comparative studies of the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), with complete scholarly researches to Muslim scholars, writers and thinkers, in Egypt, Syria, Lebanon, India, Pakistan, Iraq etc. I talked about this during my visits to the Islamic circles and scholarly establishments, as well as during my personal contacts with the individual scholars. Moreover, with the help of Allah, I started these suggested studies some fifty years ago. During my studies, I realized that Umm al-Mu'minin, 'Aishah, was the most prolific narrator of traditions about the biography of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), even more prolific than the other wives of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and all his companions. Most of the Muslim and non-Muslim orientalists and their students, studied the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) biography by referring to the narratives quoting her. No academic researches about the life of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) can be conducted without carefully and impartially studying the collection of the hadiths narrated by her or citing her. Consequently, I had to comparatively study her narrations, and published the 1st volume, while the 2nd volume is still unpublished. During my studies, I found so many discrepancies in relating the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) biography and the history of the early years of Islam that I was compelled to write a book titled "**A Hundred And Fifty Fabricated Companions**". By this title I wanted to draw the attention of the scholars to the enormous fabrications of narratives during the first Islamic era. Two volumes had been printed in which I cited 93 fake companions and some 50 fake narrators, who are quoted as narrators of the conquests and the apostasies etc. all of which were fabricated. I wrote an introduction for this study in the 1st and 2nd volumes of Abdullah Ibn Saba'. The 3rd volume of A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions is still not published, as well as the 3rd volume of Abdullah Ibn Saba'. I complain to Allah for what I had faced of false rumors in this respect!

accomplish this great objective, I composed this book, with the help of Allah, and I based it on the following plan:

The Research Methodology of this book

We have already given examples of the disputed questions and their sources, as well as their most important two incentives. A study of the roots of differences and disputes is still pending. These shall be studied in Discussions and Chapters, so that the reformers on Islam and the Muslims may study them and coordinate their efforts in the light of their understanding of rapprochement among the Muslims and unite them against the enemies of Islam, by Allah's will.

In this respect, since all the Islamic groups follow either of the two schools of thought¹, the School of the Imamate and the School of the Caliphate, these will be studied in this book, as below:

First: We shall study the opinions of the two schools of the companions and of their justice (infallibility) because they are one of the ways of getting acquainted with the sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). The school of the Caliphate regards them all to be just without doubt, and the hadiths of every single one of them are to be accepted as true. The other school believes that among the companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) there were the pious and the God-fearing ones whose hadiths are acceptable as true, while there were among them others whom the Majestic Qur'an has accused of hypocrisy: **"And from among those who are round about you of the dwellers of the desert there are hypocrites and from among the people of al-Madīnah (there are those who are) also stubborn in hypocrisy, you do not know them, we know them."** (Surah Taubah (9): Verse 101)

So, I have studied the proofs of both sides in this respect, with complete impartiality. Thereafter, I studied the opinions of both schools concerning Imamate and Caliphate and their supporting proofs because the first four Caliphs are regarded by one of the two schools as to be one of the ways of attaining the Islamic Shari'ah after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), as it says, had endorsed them by saying: *"Follow my sunnah and that of the Rightly*

¹ Details will follow at the beginning of the discussions

Guided caliphs after me and stick doggedly to them." It, further, takes their personal opinions to be a source of the Islamic shari'ah ¹

Similarly, the twelve Imams are taken by the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) as a source of attaining the Islamic shari'ah, receiving from them all that they quote from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as divine commands. Therefore, it is necessary to scrutinize the arguments of both sides.

Second: I studied the discussions of the two schools on the sources of the Islamic shari'ah with complete scholarly honesty and ended my studies with examples of educational, political and social activities of the two schools and their effects on the Islamic society.

Third: Finally, I retold examples of the falsities ascribed to the school of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and tied to analyze them.

Hereunder are my studies, which I present to the generous Islamic public, hoping that some would be booked into, with utmost impartiality, and inform me about my mistakes, for the sake of spreading Islamic knowledge, so as to facilitate rapprochement and co-understanding among the Muslims, by Allah's will.

"Say: This is my way: I call to Allah with insight, I and those who follow me. Glory be to Allah! And I am not of the polytheists." (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 108)

¹ This will be expanded upon in the chapter on "The Discussions of the two schools on the sources of the Islamic shari'ah", by Allah's will.

**The Researches of the Two
Schools on the Sources of the
Islamic Shari`ah**

Introduction

In the history of the Islamic thought there happened, after the demise of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), a manifest division between two contradictory schools of thought: the school of the authority ruled after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) until the decline of Ottoman Empire, and the school of the Imams of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them all) until the 12th Imam.¹ The dispute between the Muslim graduates of these two schools and their followers is still going on till date and may go on forever.

In the following discussions, the first school will be called The Caliphate School, and the other, the Ahl al-Bait School. We begin with the source of the dispute between them. Thereafter, we shall give examples of the aspects of the differences, Allah willing!

¹ . Limiting the period of the first school by the decline of the Ottoman Empire, and the second school by the 12th Imam of the Ahl al-Bait's Imams (peace be on them) is based on the fact that the School of Caliphate considers the rule of the Caliphs after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) to be lawful, as it call them the caliphs (successors) of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), while the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school considers the 12 infallible Imams (peace be on them) to be lawfully entitled to rule after the Prophet, and it calls them the vicegerent of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Hence, we called the first the School of Caliphate and the second as the school of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them).

The Origin of the Difference

Both schools accept the Holy Qur'an and observe what it regards as permissible, prohibited, compulsory, recommended and abominable. The differences lie in the interpretations, especially the ambiguous verses (*al-mutashaabihaat*). They also differ in respect of the following three points:

- a. The Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions
- b. The Imamate and Caliphate as ways of reaching to the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah.
- c. The sources of the Islamic Shari'ah besides the Noble Qur'an.

We shall study the arguments of both schools concerning each of these points, after acquainting ourselves with the particular terminology pertaining to each, at the beginning of each study, preceded, firstly by the study of the general terms current through the discussions of the book, and, secondly, by the study of how the Arabic lexicons were written down.

The Arabic Language and the Islamic Terminology

First: Definition of the terms:

- a. Arabic literature
- b. Islamic literature or Shar'i literature
- c. Jurisprudence literature or Muslims' literature
- d. The literal and the figurative

The first one is also called the nomenclature of the Arabs, the second is named nomenclature of the Legislator (viz. Allah) and the third is the nomenclature of the Muslims.

a. Arabic Literature

We speak the language of the Arabs only because the Holy Qur'an descended in it.

Most of the Arabic words used in the pre-Islamic era are still used in their former common meanings, such as: eating, sleeping, day and night.

Some other words in Arabic bore multiple meanings, such as the verb: gha-na-ma, which originally meant: to gain the ghunm, ie. the spoils; later, it was used to denote easy gaining of something. Thereafter, in Islam, it meant anything gained, whether easily or with difficulty.

A word may bear a certain meaning in the dialect of a certain tribe and have another implication in the parlance of another tribe. For example, the word: athlab, which means "stone" in the idiom of the people of Hijaz, while in the language of the Tamîm tribe it means "dust".¹

In contemporary Arabic, the word mabsut in Iraqi dialect implies a "beaten" person while in the Syrian and the Lebanese dialect it means a "pleased" person. In such cases, we should say, for example, that athlab in Tamîm's dialect means so, - and - so and in Hijaz's dialect means so - and - so, and likewise the word mabsut, etc.

b. Shar'i literature or Islamic literature

¹ Tahdhîb al-Lughah by al-Azhari, printed in Cairo, 1384 H., Vol. 15, p. 91

On sending the seal of His Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny), Allah the High used some Arabic words in meanings different from their common implications to the Arabs; for instance, *salaah*, which was used to denote invocations and supplications in general. But the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) used it to denote a certain act of worship with particular recitations and actions, such as standing, bowing, prostration, etc., hitherto unknown to the Arabs. This is what we call a shar'î or Islamic term be it an old word with a new meaning, or a new word with a new meaning, such as the word al-Rahman, one of Allah's attributes.

These terms are found only in the Glorious Qur'an or in the noble hadiths of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), as otherwise the word would not be a shar'î term.

Therefore, an Islamic term is that which was used by the shari'ah in a special meaning and conveyed by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

c. Jurisprudence literature or Muslims' literature

There are words common to all Muslims with their special meanings like *ijtihad* and *mujtahid*, which are prevalent among the Muslims, denoting jurisprudence and jurist. Their original literal meaning was *to strive hard in getting something*,¹ and *the one who does so*. Both terms were used by the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in their literal meaning:

*"The learned is superior to the mujtahid (i.e. the one who takes great pains in worshipping) by a hundred degrees."*²

Concerning the tradition of the Noble Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), it is said:

*"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to strive harder [ijtihad] during the last ten days (of the month of Ramadan) than his striving in any other time."*³

¹ Look up the entry: jahada in Ibn al-Athîr's *Nihayah al-Lughah*.

² The preface of Sunan al-Daaremi, Chapter on "The Priority of Knowledge and the learned hadith 23, vol. 1, p.100.

³ Sahih Muslim, book of al-I'tikaaf, Chapter on "Ijtihad during the last ten (days) of the month of Ramadan", hadith 1175

The words *ijtihad* and *mujtahid* have never been used in the Holy Qur'an to mean fiqh (jurisprudence) or faqih (jurist) nor in the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) noble hadiths. These are called "religious parlance" or "the nomenclature of the Muslims."

And from this type of nomenclature covers is whatever was not prevalent among the Muslim commonality and customary among only some of them, such as the term "*Sawm-o-Zakariyyaa*" (the fasting of Zacharias) used only by some groups of Muslims who observe complete silence while fasting and conversation in fasting as prohibited. Such terms may be ascribed to the place where they are conventional. So, we may say that this is the custom of Muslims of Baghdad or of Cairo. They cannot be called the terminology of Muslims or of the jurists, without certain stipulations.

The same thing is true in respect of the terms common only to one another, or to a group of a given sect, such as *al-shaari* and *al-mushrik* used by the Kharijites: the first meaning the same as the word *mujahid* by all Muslims, and the second implying all Muslims who are not Kharijites; or, the word *rafidi* with which some followers of the Caliphate School try to insult the followers of Ahl al-Bait school (peace be on them); or the word *naasibi* which is used by the followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school to describe anybody who bears malice against the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them).

In such cases, the first is called "the terminology of the Kharijites", the second "the term of the Caliphate school," and the third, "the term of Ahl al-Bait school (peace be on them)".

Consequently, when it is noted that the Caliphate school used the term *naasibi*, it may not be taken to mean the enemy of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them). Similarly, when the term *shaari* is used by other than the Kharijites, it must not be taken to denote the same concept as that by the Kharijites.

d. The Literal and the Figurative

When a word is commonly used to denote its original meaning familiar to the ordinary hearer, such as a lion, which denotes that well-known wild beast, or *salaah* which refers, in the Muslims' minds, to certain rituals and recitations, the

word lion and *salaah* are used in their literal meanings: the first represents a "linguistic reality" and the second represents a "juristic reality".

But the word lion may be used to describe a brave man too. Somebody may say: "I saw a lion speaking in the mosque." This is a figurative usage of the word, i.e. the word lion is figuratively used for "a brave man." In such a case, there must be a semantic coherence in the speech or in the situation, denoting that the literal meaning of lion was not intended. When it is said: "... speaking in the mosque", the hearer will understand that it is not a real lion speaking in the mosque but implies a brave man because a real lion does not speak, and this is a semantic coherence denoting the intended meaning.

Second: Methodology of Compilation of Arabic Lexicons

In the second and third centuries of Hijri, the Arab litterateurs commenced compiling the Arabic lexicon, putting down before each entry their current meanings, ever since the pre-Islamic era till their days, concerning the terms used by the litterateurs, the Islamic sharî'ah and the Muslims. Nevertheless, the Islamic jurists exerted tremendous efforts throughout the centuries to pick out and define terms of Islamic jurisprudence such as *salaah*, *sawm*, *hajj* etc. Thus, the Islamic terminology became known to all Muslims. Similar efforts were not offered by any group concerning the non-juristic terminology. Thus, some terms remained unknown to the majority of the Muslims and they could not tell whether they were shar'î, Muslim's naming or juristic terms. All this led to a state of ambiguity in understanding the Islamic concepts, or even misunderstanding some of the Islamic percepts, like the word "*companion*", which will be studied presently.

The first discussion

**The research of the two schools
concerning companionship and the
companions**

**© Chapter One: The Two Schools’
Definitions of the Companion**

**© Chapter Two: The Justice of the
Companions according to the Two
Schools**

**© Chapter Three: Summary of
Discussion of the Two Schools vis-a-vis
the Companions**

The First Discussion

Chapter One: The Definition of a Companion according to the two schools

The Definition of the Caliphate School of "The Companion"

In the preface of his book *al-Isaabah*, the first section concerning "The Definition of the companion (*sahaabi*), Ibn Haajar writes:

"The companion (*sahaabi*) is the one who has met the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), believed in him and died as a Muslim. It will apply for all those met him, whether for a short time or for a longer duration, whether he narrated from him or not, whether he accompanied him in his wars or not, one who saw him with his eyes even if he did not get his company, and even the one who could not see him due to some defect like blindness."¹

"A rule useful in recognition of the companionship of many", he adds: "In the conquests, none were put in command except the companions...", "In the 10th year of Hijri, there remained none in Makkah and a-Taaef but that he adopted Islam and witnessed the Final Pilgrimage with the Prophet...", "and that during the last days of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), there remained none among the (tribes of) Aws and the Khazraj but that he had accepted Islam" and "when the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) died, none from them showing disbelief."²

If the researcher refers to parts of our book, "One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions", he will observe the extent of their carelessness in this regard and the range of harm it inflicted on the hadiths.

The Definition of "Companion" in the school of the Ahl al-Bait School

The Arabic equivalent to "Companion" is *sahib* (pl. *sahib*, *ashab*, *sihab* and *sahabah*)³ *As-sahib* means *al-mu'ashir*⁴ (with whom one socializes) or *al-*

¹ *Al-Isaabah*, vol.1, p. 10. This opinion of the Caliphate school is sourced from al-Shaheed al-Thani's book *Al-Deraayah*, Chapter 4, concerning some terms about the people's names and levels, saying: The companion (*sahaabi*) is the one who met the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and died a Muslim.

² *Ibid*, pp. 13 & 16.

³ Look up *Lisanul Arab*, entry: *sahiba*.

⁴ *Ibid*.

mulaazim¹ (inseparable friend). It is not used except for the one whose company is for a long duration².

¹ Raghīb's Al-Mufradaat, Root: sa-hi-ba.

² Ibid

Companionship demands prolonged friendship. ¹

Al-suhbah (companionship) happens between two things and implies that it should be in the genitive case, ie. it should be annexed to another noun, such as: "**O you the two companions of the prison**", or "**the companions of Moosa**". During the days of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), they used to say: "the companion(s) of the Prophet", ie. the word "companion" was annexed to "the Prophet", as they used to say: "the companions of the allegiance of the tree" or "the companions of the Suffah", both attributed to some noun (person or place). In those days, the words *saahib* and *ashaab* were not used to refer to the companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

Later on, the followers of the Caliphate School took to call a companion of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) as a *sahaabi* and *ashaab*. Therefore, this was one of the nomenclature of Muslims and those of the jurists.

This was the definition of the two schools vis-à-vis the term *sahaabi* (the companion).

Their Criterion for Recognition of a Companion (*sahaabi*)

The biographers of the companions, at the Caliphate School, presented a criterion for recognizing the Companion, as reported by Ibn Hajar in his *al-Isaabah*. He said: "Among the general statements quoted from the Imams concerning the description by which a Companion can be recognized - even without there being any specific text about him - is what was quoted by Ibn Abi Shaybah in his book, through reliable narrators, to the effect that: In the conquests, they did not put in command anyone except the companions."²

The report narrated "through good narrators" in this respect is that which had been narrated by al-Tabari and Ibn 'Asaakir vide their chain of narrators, who quoted Saif from Abu 'Uthman from Khalid and 'Obaadah, who said: "The leaders were

¹ Ibid

² *Al-Isaabah*, 1/13.

from among the companions (*sahaabah*), unless they could not find anyone to take charge.”¹

In another narration stated by al-Tabari, quoting Saif, he said: "The Caliph ‘Umar did not digress from putting into command the sahaabah if he found among them someone who could replace him in his war. If there had been no such person, he would choose one from among the good tabe‘een (i.e. those who had seen the companions but not the Prophet). None of the apostates could ever hope to obtain command of the army...”²

Discussion vis-à-vis Criteria of recognition of the Companion

The origin of both narratives is Saif, notorious for fabrication (of traditions) and of being an atheist.³

Saif quotes the "criterion" from Abu ‘Uthman who quotes Khalid and ‘Ubaadah in Saif’s narrations - is taken by Saif to be Yazid Ibn Usayd al-Ghassani, a narrator created by Saif’s imagination.⁴

Whatever the reality of those narrators and whoever they may be, historical facts deny their claims.

The author of Al-Aghaani says:

"Imra’ al-Qays adopted Islam at the hands of ‘Umar, who immediately made him a commander, although he had not yet performed a single unit (of prayers) for Allah."⁵

The details of this event are in a narrative next to it, quoted from ‘Auf Ibn Kharijah al-Mirri, who said:

"By Allah, I was with ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab (may Allah be pleased with him) during his caliphate, when a man with wide-apart gaits and bald at the sides of his thin-haired head, entered, passed through the people until he stopped before ‘Umar and greeted him as a caliph is greeted.

‘Who are you?’ asked ‘Umar.

‘I am a Christian,’ said the man. ‘I am Imra al-Qays Ibn ‘Uday al-Kalbi.’

Recognizing him, ‘Umar asked: ‘What do you want?’

¹ Al-Tabari, Eu. Ed. vol. 1, p. 2151.

² Ibid., vol. 1, pp. 2457-2458.

³ Look up Saif’s biography in Abdullah Ibn Saba’, vol. 1.

⁴ Refer to the manuscript of the books "Disputed Narrators" and "Abdullah Ibn Saba'" by the author, vol. 1, p. 117, Beirut, 1403 H.

⁵ Al-Aghaani, Sasi ed., 14/158.

‘Islam’, he replied. ‘Umar invited him to Islam, accepted his Islam and ordered a spear to be brought for him and appointed him as commander over those in al-Sham (Syria) of the (tribe of) Quda‘ah who accepted Islam.¹ The old man turned round, with the flag fluttering over his head..." etc. as the hadith goes.²

It is also contradicted by the story of giving commandership to ‘Alqamah Ibn ‘Alathah al-Kalbi after his apostasy from Islam. This story, as per his biography in al-Aghaani and al-Isaabah³, is as follows:

Alqamah accepted Islam during the life of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progen) and accompanied him. Then he rejected Islam during the days of Abu Bakr, who sent Khalid after him, but he escaped. It was later claimed that he reverted to Islam.

It is in al-Isaabah that he drank wine in the days of ‘Umar, who punished him for that, due to which he again quit Islam and fled to the Romans. The Roman king received him with honor and told him: "You are the cousin of ‘Aamir Ibn al-Tufayl." He became angry and retorted: "Am I known only through ‘Aamir?"⁴ He returned and accepted Islam once again.

¹ Quda‘ah means large tribes, which included the tribes of Haidaan, Bahra’, Balaa and Juhaynah. Look up their biographies in Ibn Hazm’s Jamhartu Ansaab al-Arab, pp. 440-460. They dwelt in al-Shahar, then in Najran and then in al-Shaam so they ruled the territory between al-Shaam and al-Hijaz up to Iraq. Refer to Mu‘jam-o-Qabaa’il al-Arab, entry: Quda‘ah, vol. 3, p. 957.

² Al-Aghaani, Sasi ed. vol. 14, p.157. Summarized by Ibn Hazm in Jamharatu Ansaab al-Arab, p. 284

³ Al-Isaabah, vol. 2, pp. 496-498; Al-Aghaani, Sasi ed. vol. 15, p. 56. The story of the dispute between ‘Alqamah and ‘Aamir is stated in al-Aghaani, vol. 15, pp. 50-55 and in Ibn Hazm’s Jamharah, p. 284.

⁴ There was a dispute between ‘Alqamah and ‘Aamir, which had been reported by the historians. In al-Aghaani, Sasi ed., vol. 15, p. 50, it is reported: Once ‘Alqamah was sitting and uniring. ‘Aamir, seeing him, said: "I have never seen, as I saw today, private parts of a man uglier than..

‘Alqamah said: To be sure, they never jumped over their neighbours nor do they quarrel with their sisters-in-law", meaning to abuse ‘Aamir.

‘Aamir said: "By Allah! I am of nobler birth and of firmer lineage (than you)."

‘Alqamah retorted: "Verily I am better than you, day and night (i.e. any time)."

‘Aamir said: "Surely I am more loved by your women..." etc. as the story goes in al-Aghaani, and ‘Alqamah’s biography in al-Isaabah, this was why ‘Alqamah loathed being honoured on account of his being a cousin to ‘Aamir and disdained being known for that kinship.

It is also in al-Aghaani and al-Isaabah, (quoting the former) that ‘Alqamah Ibn ‘Alathah arrived in al-Madinah, while still an apostate. He was a friend of Khalid Ibn al-Walid. Entering the mosque in the dark of the night, he met ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab (may Allah be pleased with him) and thought him to be Khalid, as ‘Umar and Khalid resembled each other. He greeted him, thinking him to be Khalid, and asked him:

"Did he depose you?"

"It was so," ‘Umar replied.

"By Allah! It is nothing but envying you and coveting (your position)," he said.

‘Umar said: "What remedy have you for that?"

"Allah forbid!" said ‘Alqamah, "We are but to listen to ‘Umar and obey him, and shall not differ with him."

In the next morning ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) permitted the people to enter. Khalid and ‘Alqamah went in. ‘Alqamah sat beside Khalid. ‘Umar turned to ‘Alqamah and said: "O ‘Alqamah, was it you who told Khalid so and so?"

‘Alqamah turned to Khalid and said: "O Abu Sulaiman, did you do it?" (i.e. you squealed?)

"Woe unto you!" retorted Khalid, "By Allah, it is just now that I meet you. I see that you had met the man (viz. Umar)!"

"By Allah! I think so." Then he turned to ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) and said: "O Commander of the Believers! You have not heard but good."

‘Umar said: "Yes. Would you like me to appoint you as governor of Hauraan?¹"

"Yes," said ‘Alqamah. He went there as a governor and died there. Al-Hutay’ah said an elegy (in his mourning) (till the end of the narration).

Al-Isaabah adds: ‘Umar said: "To have behind me someone with an opinion like yours is dearer to me than such-and-such."

* * *

What we related was a historical fact. But the scholars of the Caliphate School, depended on what they had narrated and worked out of what they narrated a criterion for recognizing the Companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), accepting among the companions those who had been forged by Saif

¹ Hauraan: a vast district connected to Damascus, Syrai with several villages and plantations. (Ma’jam al-Buldaan, vol. 2, p. 358)

Ibn 'Amr, the one who was accused of atheism, as we had discussed in our book One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions.

Having studied the opinions of the two Schools about recognizing the Companions, we shall study the justice of the companions according to the two Schools.

Chapter Two:

Justice of the Companions as seen in the Two Schools

© The Opinion of the Caliphate School of the Companions' Justice

© The Opinion of Ahl al-Bait School (peace be on them) of the Companions' Justice.

© A Criterion for distinguishing the Believer from the Hypocrite

The Opinion of the Caliphate School of Companions' Justice

The Caliphate School believes that all the companions are equitable and relies on all of them for obtaining their religious teachings.

The master of reconcilers of narrations, the memorizer of the Holy Qur'an, Abu Haatim al-Raazi¹ says in the preface of his book:

"Regarding the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), they are those who were present during the revelations, those who knew the explanation and interpretation (of the Qur'an) and those whom Allah, the Great and Almighty, had chosen to accompany His Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), support him, establish His religion and proclaim His truth. So, He accepted them as his Companions, and appointed them as guideposts and examples. They learnt from him (peace be on him and his progeny) what he conveyed to them from Allah the Great and Almighty, and what he legislated, enacted, ruled, judged, assigned, bade, forbade, prohibited and educated. They realized and understood it all, comprehended the religion and learnt what Allah liked and disliked by observing His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), hearing from him how to explain and interpret the Book, absorbing from him and practising inference. So, Allah had honoured them by making them examples, clearing them from doubt, lie, mistake, suspicion, boasting and abusing, and named them "the equitables", as He, the Glorified, says in His Book: **"And thus we have made you a moderate nation that you may be witnesses against the people"** (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 143). The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) explained the word 'moderate' to mean, as Allah told him, 'equitable'. So, they were the just people of the nation, the leaders of guidance, the evidences of religion and the conveyers of the Book and the Sunnah.

Allah, the Great and Almighty, commanded that their guidance should be adhered to, their method should be imitated, their way should be followed and their example should be copied. Thus, He said: **'And whoever acts with hostility to**

¹ Abu Muhammad Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Haatim al-Raazi (d. 327 H.). His book Taqdemah al-Ma'rifah li Kitab al-Jarh wa al-Ta'deel. Hyderabad ed., 1371 H., pp. 7-9.

the Messenger... and follows other than the way of the believers, We will turn him to that to¹ which he (himself) turned...' (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 115).

Then we found that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), in many hadiths, motivate the people to narrate from him. He used to talk about it with his Companions. Once he invoked for them: *'May Allah flourish the one who listens to my speech, learns it and retains it until he conveys it to the others'*. He (peace be on him and his progeny) also said in a speech: *'Let the present of you convey to the absent.'* Further he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'Convey from me, even if its a verse, and narrate from me at your liberty'*.

Then, the Companions (may Allah be pleased with them) dispersed in different cities, countries and harbours, in conquests, wars, rulings and courts. Each one of them spread in his place what he had learnt from the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). They issued their edicts in answer to the questions they received according to what they remembered of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) replies to similar questions. They devoted themselves, with good intention and seeking Allah's pleasure, to teach the people their religious duties, precepts, laws, the permissible and the prohibited, until their souls were received by Allah, the Great and Almighty, may He be pleased with them and grant them all His forgiveness and mercy." Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, in his book al-Isti'aab², says: "They were all proved to be equitable." He goes on to repeat the verses and the hadiths in praise of the believers, the ones we had related from al-Raazi.

Ibn al-Athîr, in the Preface of his book Usud al-Ghaabah³ says: "... the traditions around which revolve the detailed precepts, the recognition of the permissible and the prohibited and other affairs of religion could be confirmed only after knowing their authorities and narrators, the first and at the top of whom are the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). So, if one did not know them, one would surely be more ignorant of the others and deny

¹ Ahl al-Bait School believes that only the believers of them are meant, as the text of the verse goes. This will be further elaborated later, by Allah's will.

² Al-Isti'aab fi asma' al-As'haab, by al-Hafiz, the narrator of hadiths, Abu 'Umar Yusuf Ibn Abdillâh Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Nimri al-Qurtubbi al-Maaliki (363-463 H.). We quoted from the book printed in the margins of al-Isaabah, p.2.

³ Usud al-Ghaabah fi Ma'rifah al-Sahaabah by Abu Hasan 'Izziddin 'Ali Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Abd al-Karîm al-Jazari, known as Ibn al-Athîr, (d. 630 H.), vol. 1, p.3

them even more. Thus, it is appropriate that they should be known through their ancestors lineage and their conditions... This is true of all the Companions as it is to all other narrators, except in the reconciliation of traditions, as all of them are equitable and cannot be reconciled, as all of them are equitable and cannot be invalidated..."

Al-Hafiz Ibn Hajar, in chapter three: "Concerning the position of the companions vis-à-vis equitableness," in the preface of his *al-Isaabah*¹, says: "The followers of the sunnah had agreed that all (the companions) are equitable. This was not objected except by few of the heretics..."

Abu Zar'ah is quoted to have said: "If you saw some one disparaging anyone of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions, know that he is an atheist, since the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) is true, the Qur'an is true and what he brought is true; and what he brought was conveyed to us by his companions. But those people want to invalidate our witnesses so as to invalidate the Book and the Sunnah, while they deserve more to be invalidated as they are atheists."²

The aforementioned was the opinion of the Caliphate School of the equitableness of the Companions. The opinion of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school is as follows:

Ahl al-Bait's (peace be on them) view of the companions' Equitableness

This school, following the Holy Qur'an, believes that among the Companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), there were those whom Allah had

¹ *Al-Isaabah fi Tamiyz al-Sahaabah* by al-Hafiz Shihaab al-Dîn Ahmad Ibn 'Ali Ibn Muhammad al-Kinani al-'Asqalani, known as Ibn Hajar (773-852 H.). We quoted from *al-Maktabah at-Tijaariyyah*, ed. 1358 H., Egypt, vol. 1, pp. 17-22.

² *Al-Isaabah*, vol.1, p.18. Abu Zar'ah is 'Ubaydullah Ibn 'Abd al-Karim Ibn Yazid. Ibn Hajar, in *Taqrib at-Tahdhîb*, Vol.2, p.536, biography No. 1479, says: "He is an Imam, memorizer of the Qur'an, trustworthy, well-known, one of the 11th class of the narrators. Died in 264. He was quoted by the authors of the following Sahîhs: Muslim, al-Tirmidhi, al-Nessa'i and Ibn Maajah."

I say: "I do not know what the Imam Abu Zar' ah would say about the hypocrites of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions."

praised in the Qur'an, as concerning "The Allegiance of the Tree" He said: **"Allah was well pleased with the believers when they swore allegiance to you under the tree. He knew what was in their hearts, so, He send down tranquility on them and rewarded them with a near victory."** (Surah Fath (48): Verse 18). Here Allah the Almighty has praised the believers in particular who attended the Allegiance of the Tree, excluding the hypocrites who were also present there, like 'Abdullah Ibn Ubayy and Aws Ibn Qaidhaa.¹

It also believes that among them, there were hypocrites, quoting the Holy Qur'an in which there are many verses condemning them, such as: **"...and from among those who are around you, in the desert, there are hypocrites, and from among the people of al-Madinah (too). They are stubborn in hypocrisy; you do not know them; We know them. We will torture them twice, then shall they be turned back to a tremendous torment."** (Surah Taubah (9): Verse 101). Some of them were accused of lying, i.e. those who told lies about the disloyalty of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) wife,² (we take refuge in Allah from such a lie). Some others of them were described as: **"And when they see merchandise or amusement, they break off to it and leave you (O Prophet) standing."** (Surah Jumuah (62): Verse 11). This happened when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was standing in the mosque delivering the sermon of the Friday prayers.

Some of them even intended to assassinate the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) while concealing themselves in the mountains on his return from the Battle of Tabuk³ or from the Farewell Pilgrimage (al-Hajjah al-Wedaa').⁴

¹ Look up "The Allegiance of the Tree" or "The Allegiance of al-Ridhwaan", in al-Waqidi's "al-Maghaazi" and al-Miqreezi's "al-Imtaa' al-Ismaa".

² This is a reference to the story of "the lie" about which the verses 11-17 of Surah al-Nur concerning 'A'ishah, being innocent of what she had been accused of, as she herself told it. Or proving that Maariyah, the mother of believers, was innocent of what she was accused of, according to other narrators, as is in vol. 2 of The Hadiths of Ummul Mu'minin 'A'ishah.

³ Musnad Ahmad, vol. 5, pp. 390 & 453. Look up Sahih Muslim, vol. 8, pp. 122 & 123, Chapter on the description of the hypocrites; Majma al-Zawa'id, vol. 1, p. 110 & vol. 6, p. 195; Al-Maghaazi of Al-Waqidi, vol. 3, p. 1042; Imtaa' al-Asmaa' by al-Miqreezi, and in the interpretation of the verse **"and they determined upon what they have not been able to effect"**, (Surah Taubah (9): Verse 74) in al-Suyuti's exegesis Al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 3, pp. 258 & 259.

Certainly, the wives of the Holy Prophet were more privileged than his companions because matrimony is certainly of a closer nature than companionship. Allah the Exalted says concerning them: **"O wives of the Prophet! whoever of you commits an open indecency the torment will be twice as much for her, and that is easy for Allah, And whoever is obedient to Allah and His Messenger, and does good, we will give to her twice as much a reward, and we have prepared for her a generous provision. O wives of the Prophet! you are not like other women..."**(Surah Ahzaab (33): Verses 30-32)

Concerning two of his (peace be on him and his progeny) wives, the Majestic Qur'an says: **"... If you both repent to Allah, then your hearts are already inclined (to this), and if you back up each other against him, then Allah is indeed his guardian, and Gabriel, the good ones of the believers and the angels after that back him... And Allah cites an example for those who disbelieve the wife of Noah and the wife of Lot - They were both under two of Our righteous servants, but they betrayed them, so they availed them naught against Allah, and it was said: Enter both with those who enter. And Allah cites an example to those who believe the wife of Pharaoh when she said: My Lord! Build for me a house with You in Paradise... and Mary, the daughter of 'Imran..."**(Surah Tahreem (66): Verses 10-12)

About some others, on the Day of Resurrection, the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said:

"Some men of my people will be brought, taken to the left. I will say: 'O my Lord! My companions!' It will be said to him: 'You do not know what evil they introduced after you'. I will say as the righteous servant said: '... and I was witness of them so long as I was among them, but when You took me You were the watcher over them.' (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 117). It will be said that these people never stopped retreating upon their heels ever since you left them."¹

⁴ It is the Shiite narrations that it was in his return from the Farewell Pilgrimage, in a place called Ghadîr-e-Khumm in al-Juhfa region that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) delivered this sermon. Look up Bihar al-Anwaar, published by the Islamic Library, Tehran, 1392 A.H., vol. 28, p.97

¹ Al-Bukhari, commenting on Surah al-Maa'idah, Chapter on "O Apostle (Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny))! Proclaim (the Message) which

Another hadith says: "Some of my Companions would come to me at the pool, but no sooner I recognize them than they will be taken away. I will say: 'My companions!' I will be told: 'You do not know what mischief they introduced after you.'"¹

It is in sahih Muslim: "Men of my followers will come to me at the pool, and as soon as I see them they will be taken away. I will say: O my Lord! my Companions! I will be told: You do not know what misdeeds they did after you."²

A Criterion for Distinguishing the Believer from the Hypocrite

Since there were among the Companions some hypocrites whom none except Allah knew, since His Prophet had said that 'Ali is not loved but by (every) believer and is not hated but by (every) hypocrite, as narrated by the Imam 'Ali³

has been sent down to you from Your Lord." (Surah Maidah (5): Verse 67). Also commenting on Surah al-Anbiyaa'.

¹ Al-Bukhari, book of "Invocations", Chapter "At the Pool of Paradise (Haudh)". Ibn Maajah, book of "Al-Mamaasik", Chapter on "The speech on the day of sacrifice", Hadith 5830. Look up Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol.1, p. 453, vol. 3, p. 28 and vol. 5, p.48.

² Sahih Muslim, book of "Al-Fadaa'il", Chapter on "Confirming the pool of our Prophet", Hadith 40.

³ Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), cousin of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), son of Abu Talib Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib. He was born inside the Holy Ka'bah, as is narrated by al-Haakem in his al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p.483, Ibn Sabhaagh al-Maliki in his al-Fusul al-Muhimmah, al-Maghaazili al-Shafi'i in al-Manaaqib, and al-Shablanji in Noor al-Absaar, p. 69. He was born on the 13th Rajab, in the year 30 after the Year of the Elephant (Aam al-Feel), the Muhajirs and the Ansaar gave him their allegiance in the year 35 A.H. He was struck by the accursed Ibn Muljam al-Muradi on the 19th Ramadhan circa 40 A.H. while performing his morning prayers in the mosque of al-Kufah. He died on the 21st Ramadhan. He had been quoted by the authors of the sahihs in 536 hadiths. Look up his biography in al-Isti'aab, 'Usud al-Ghaabah, al-Isaabah and Jawami' al-Seerah, p. 276. His hadith concerning the hypocrites is stated in Sahih Muslim, vol. 1, p.61, Chapter on "The evidence proving that loving the 'Ansar and 'Ali is a sign of faith, and hating them is a sign of hypocrisy", Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p.177, Chapter on "Merits of 'Ali", Sunan Ibn Maajah, the 11th Chapter of his Preface, Sunan al-Nesaa'i, vol. 2, p. 271, Chapter on "The sign of the believer" and in Chapter on "The sign of the hypocrite" of the book "Faith and its Laws", al-Nesaa'i's al-Khasaa'is, p. 38, Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 84, 95 & 128, Tarikh Baghdad, vol. 2, p.255, vol. 8, p. 417 & vol. 16, p.426, Abu Noaim's Hilyah al-Awliyaa', vol. 4, p.185 (He said that the said hadith was true and agreed upon), al-Dhababi's Tarikh al-Islam, vol. 2, p. 198, Ibn Kathir's al-Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 354 and

(peace be on him), Ummu Salamah¹, ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Abbas², Abu Dharr al-Ghaffari³, Anas Ibn Maalik⁴ and ‘Imran Ibn Husain⁵ since it was further

in his biography in al-Istî‘aab, vol. 2, p.461, Usud al-Ghaabah, vol.4, p.292, Kanz al-Ummal, vol. 15, p.105 and Al-Riyaadh al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p.284.

¹ Ummu Salamah, Hind, the daughter of Abu ‘Umayyah Ibn al-Mughîrah al-Qarashi al-Makhzumi. Before being married to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), she was the wife of Abu Salamah Ibn ‘Abd al-Asad al-Makhzumi. They were of the early Muslims. They both migrated to Habashah and then to Madinah. Abu Salamah was wounded in the war of ‘Uhud and died in the year 3 Hijri. Umm Salamah had a child when the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) married her. She died after the martyrdom of Imam Husain in the year 61 Hijri. The authors of the Sehaah quoted her in 378 hadîths.

Look up her biography and her husband’s in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, p. 276 and Taqrîb al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p. 617. Her hadîth concerning the hypocrites is recorded in Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p.168, Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p.292, al-Istî‘aab, vol. 2, p.460 through many channels, and also in Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 7, p.354 and in Kanz al-Ummaal, 1st ed. vol. 6, p.158.

² ‘Abdullah, son of al-Abbas Ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib, the Holy Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) cousin. He was born three years before Hijrah and died in the year 68 Hijri in al-Ta’îf. The authors of the Sehaah quoted 1660 hadîths on his authority. His biography is in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, al-Isaabah and Jawaame’ al-Seerah, p. 276.

³ Abu Dharr, Jundub, or Burayd, Ibn Janaadah or ‘Abdullah, or as-Sakan, etc. He adopted Islam before migrating to al-Madînah. He attended the Holy Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) battles that happened after the Battle of Badr. He died in exile in al-Rabadhah circa 32 Hijri. The authors of the Sehaah quoted from him 281 hadîths. His biography is available in Taqrib al-Tahdîb vol. 2, p.420, Jawaame’ al-Seerah, p. 277, and in Abdullah Ibn Saba’, vol. 2

⁴ Anas Ibn Malik Ibn al-Nadr al-Ansari al-Khazraji. He told that he served the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) for ten years. He used to tint his arms because of some whiteness on them, caused by Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) curse on him (for concealing his testimony about the incident of Ghadeer) that he will receive from Allah a white spot which cannot be concealed by a turban. This is referred to in al-A’laq an-Nafsiyyah, p. 122, and detailed in Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 4, p. 388. He died in Basrah when he was more than 90 years old. The authors of the Sehaah quoted from him 2286 hadîths. His biography is in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, Taqrîb al-Tahdhib and Jawaame’ al-Seerah, p. 276. His hadîth concerning the hypocrites is stated in Kanz al-Ummaal, 1st ed. vol. 7, p.140.

⁵ Abu Najîd, ‘Imran Ibn Husain al-Khuza’i al-Ka’bi. He adopted Islam in the year of the Battle of Khaibar. He accompanied the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), acted as a judge in al-Kufah and died in Basrah in the year 52 Hijri. The authors of the Sehaah quoted from him 180 hadîths. His hadîth concerning the hypocrites is stated in Kanz al-Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 7, p.140. His biography is in Taqrîb al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p.72 and Jawaame’ al-Seerah, p. 277.

commonly known in the days of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) that Abu Dharr was quoted to have said: "We could not recognize the hypocrites except who denied Allah and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and refrained from sending greetings on and hated 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on both of them)."¹

Abu Sa'id al-Khudri said. "We, the Ansar, used to know the hypocrites by their hatred for 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on both of them)",² Abdullah Ibn Abbas said: "During the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), we used to know the hypocrites by their hatred for 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both)."³

Jabir Ibn 'Abdillah al-Ansari said: "We could not tell the hypocrites except by [their] hatred for 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both)."⁴

Therefore, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said of the Imam 'Ali (peace be on him): *"O Allah: Love him who loves Ali and be the enemy of him who is his (Ali's) enemy,"*⁵ the followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on

¹ Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p.129 and Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 15, p.91.

² Abu Sa'id, Sa'id Ibn Malik Ibn Sinaan al-Khazraji al-Khudri. He participated in "The Battle of The Trench" and all the battles thereafter. He died in Madinah in 63, 64, 65 or before 74 Hijri. The authors of the Sehaah quoted 1170 hadiths from him. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, p.289, Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 289 and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 276. His hadith on the hypocrites is stated in Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p.167 and Abu No'im's Hilyah al-Awliyaa', vol. 6, p. 284.

³ It is in Tarikh Baghdad, Vol. 3, p. 153 that he said that they were with Ibn Mas'ud, when Ibn Abbas recited: "... **delighting the sowers that He may enrage the disbelievers...**" (Surah Fath (48): Verse 29) and said "Ali Ibn Abi Talib." Then he told them his hadith as stated above.

⁴ Jabir Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn 'Amr al-Ansari was a companion and son of a companion. He attended al-'Aqabah allegiance with his father. He also attended 17 of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) battles, as well as the Battle of Siffin with Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). He died in Madinah when he was more than 70 years old. The authors of the Sehaah have recorded 1540 hadiths from him. His biography is in 'Usd al-Ghaabah, vol. 1, pp. 256-527, al-Taqrib, vol. 1, p.122, Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 276. His hadith concerning the hypocrites is stated in al-Isti'ab, vol. 2, p.464, al-Riyaad al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p.2841, Tarikh al-Dhahabi, vol. 2, p.198, with the wordings: "We could not tell the hypocrites of this nation...", and in Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p.133, with the wordings: "We, the Ansar, could not tell the hypocrites among us...".

⁵ Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 165, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali (peace be on him)" and Sunan Ibn Maajah, Chapter on "The virtues of 'Ali (peace be on him)",

them) school take care not to take the symbols of their religion from a companion who was hostile to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and did not accept his mastership, lest that companion be of the hypocrites whom none knows except Allah.

hadîth no. 116. Also in al-Khasaais of al-Nisaai, p. 430; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp.84,88,118,119,152,330; vol.4, pp.281,368,370,372; vol. 5, pp. 307,347,350,358,361,366,439 and 568; Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 2, p.129 and vol. 3, p.9; al-Riyaadh al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, pp. 222-225; Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol. 7, p.377; vol. 8, p.290; vol. 12, p.343 and other reference books.

Chapter Three:

Summing up the discussion of the Two Schools on the Companions

© The Companion and his Equitableness in the School of Caliphate

v/s

© The Companion in the School of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

The Companion and His Equitableness as seen by the School of Caliphate

The School of caliphate believes:

A Companion is he who had met the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), believed in him even for a single hour of a day, and died as a Muslim.

And in the tenth year after the Hijrah, there remained none in Makkah and al-Ta'if but that he adopted Islam and attended the Farewell Pilgrimage (Hajjah al-Wedaa) with the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

There remained none from the tribes of al-Aws and Al-Khazraj but that they had, in the last days of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), accepted Islam.

That "they used to put in command none except a Companion", and, accordingly, they were all counted as the Holy Prophet's Companions {although we had proved, in our book One hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions, that they all were fabricated ones and they never existed at all}.

That all the Companions are equitable and immune against any invalidation, and whoever disparages any one of them is a disbeliever. The followers of this School regard as true everything that is narrated by the so-called Companions of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), and take from them their religious instructions.

A Companion as seen by the School of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

The School of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) believes that the term Sahabi [Companion] is not a divine term. It is an ordinary word as other words of the Arabic language. A "Companion" denotes the accompanying associate or the concomitant, and it is said to the one who frequents his friend. Companionship is a correlation between two persons. Thus, the word companion is used only in the genitive case, as is used in the Glorious Qur'an: "**O the two companions of the prison.**" (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 39) and: "**Moosa' companions said**" (Surah

Shuaraa (26): Verse 61). It was also used in the same sense during the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) time. For instance, the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions, or the companions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) i.e. it was always added to "the Prophet", or to some other, such as Ashaab al-Suffah (The stone-bench's companions or mates), an epithet given to the poor group who used to take a stone bench annexed to the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) mosque as their home. After the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), the genuine case was omitted when the word "Companion" referred to the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companions, and, thus, it became their name. Therefore, the term "saahib" (pl.sahabah) is a nomenclature of the Muslims and not an Islamic one but wrongly assumed as a divine term.

As regards their equitableness, the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school, following the Noble Qur'an, sees that among the Companions there were those who were hardcore hypocrites, who accused the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) wives of disloyalty, who attempted to kill the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and about whom the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said that on the Day of Resurrection, his Companions would be taken away from him, and he (peace be on him and his progeny) would call: *"My companions! My companions!"* But he (peace be on him and his progeny) would be told: *"You do not know what evil they introduced after you had left them."*

Among them, yet, are believers praised by Allah the Almighty and by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his talks and it is they who had been intended by the praise of the Holy Qur'an and of the hadiths. Actually, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) himself had assigned the distinguishing sign that marks out the believer from the hypocrite: *Loving or hating the Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)*. Consequently, the followers of this School investigate about the status of the narrator of a hadith. If he was found to have fought against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) or against the Imams of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them all), or was antagonistic towards them, his narratives would not be regarded as authentic, be he a Companion or otherwise.

* * *

These were the opinions of the two Schools concerning the definition of a Companion and his equitableness. In the discussions to follow, we shall study their views about Imamate and Caliphate.

The Second Discussions Concerning the Two Schools' Opinions on Imamate

Chapter One: The Historical Reality of the Caliphate in Early Days of Islam

Chapter Two: The Caliphate School's Discussions on the Imamate

Chapter Three: The Ahl al-Bait's (peace be on them) School Discussions on the Imamate

Chapter Four: Summary of the Discussions on the Imamate

Chapter One:

Historical Reality of the Caliphate in the Early Days of Islam

Recording the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) will

Attitude of the Caliph 'Umar towards the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Al-Saqifah and Abu Bakr's Allegiance

The Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Burial and the Participants

Taking Refuge in the House of Fatemah (peace be on her and his progeny)

Those who stayed back from Abu Bakr's Allegiance

Appointing 'Umar as Caliph and His Allegiance

The Council and 'Uthman's Allegiance

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) knows that Caliphate was diverted away from him

Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him and his progeny) Allegiance

Historical Reality of the Caliphate in the Early Days of Islam

Before starting our study of the opinions of the two Schools on the Imamate and the Caliphate, we have to study the historical reality of the establishment of the Caliphate in the early days of Islam.

The dispute concerning the Rule in Islam began on the very day of the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Before his death, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had personally appointed Usaamah Ibn Zayd as Commander of the army to wage a war against the Romans. This army was to be joined by all the notables of the early migrants (*muhaajir*) and helpers (*ansaar*), including Abu Bakr, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, Abu 'Ubaydah, Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas, Sa'id Ibn Zayd, and others. The army camped at al-Jurf, three miles from al-Madinah. Some of them objected: "How is it that he (peace be on him and

his progeny) appoints this lad as a commander upon the early migrants?" On hearing this grouse, the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) was extremely furious, and came out wearing a head-band and a velvet garment. He (peace be on him and his progeny) ascended the pulpit and demanded: "*What is this talk I heard from some of you concerning putting Usamah in the command? You had already impeached his father's command. By Allah! He deserved it and so does his son.*" Saying this, he (peace be on him and his progeny) descended. There came to him those who were to leave with Usamah to take leave from him and join the army. The Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) state became serious and he was continually repeating: "*Carry out Usamah's mission.*" On Sunday, his (peace be on him and his progeny) condition worsened. On Monday, Usamah ordered the army to depart. They were informed that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) was dying. Usamah, 'Umar and Abu 'Ubaydah returned to al-Mainah.¹

The Writing of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Will

Ibn 'Abbas narrated: "When the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) was about to die and there were men in the house, including 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, he (peace be on him and his progeny) requested: '*Bring (me) pen and ink to write a letter that you would not go astray with it.*'" 'Umar said: 'The Prophet is overcome by pain. You have Allah's Book. The Book of Allah is enough for us.' The people of the house disputed: Some echoed 'Umar's view. When the dispute and clamor rose high, he (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered: '*Get away! Don't argue before me!*'"²

In another narrative: "Ibn Abbas wept till his tears wetted the gravels and said: 'As the illness of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) aggravated, he said: '*Bring paper that I write you a letter which you will never go astray.*' They (those present there) differed in that matter, whereas they should not have differed before a Prophet.

¹ Summorized from Ibn Sa'd's Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, Beirut ed., vol. 2, pp.190-192. Look up further references in the Chapter On "Usamah's Mission in Abdullah Ibn Saba', Vol. 1.

² Al-Bukhari, Book of "Knowledge", Chapter on "The Writing of Knowledge".

They said: 'The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is speaking in delirium.'¹

Another narrative adds: "... and Ibn 'Abbas used to say: It was a great disaster that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) should be prevented from writing that letter for them, because of their dispute and din."²

The Attitude of the Caliph 'Umar at the time of the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Demise

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died on Monday noon, in the absence of Abu Bakr while 'Umar was present. 'Umar sought permission and entered along with al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah and uncovered his face. 'Umar said: "What an unconsciousness! How deep is the unconsciousness of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)." Al-Mughirah said: "By Allah! The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is dead!" "You lie!" said 'Umar. "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is not dead but you are man who is put in doubt due to mischief. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) will not die till he extinguishes the hypocrites."³ Then 'Umar went on saying: "Some hypocrites allege that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is dead. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is not dead, but he went to his Lord as Moosa left his people and was absent for forty nights. By Allah, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) will return and will cut off the hands and

¹ . Ibid., Chapter on "Presents given to Delegates", Book on "al-Jihad", and Chapter on "Expelling the Jews from the Arabian Peninsula"; Sahih Muslim, Book on "The Will", Chapter on "Neglecting the Will". Look up other references of the narrative and its texts in the the first narrative on the Saqifah in other than Saif's hadith, in the book Abdullah Ibn Saba', Beirut edition, 1403 Hijri, vol. 1, pp.98-102.

² Sahih al-Bukhaari Book of "Fastening to the Qur'an and the Traditions", Chapter on "It is disliked to differ", Book of "the Patients", Chapter on "The patient saying: Leave me alone, and Book of "Al-Maghaazi" Chapter on "The Prophet's illness". Sahih Muslim, Book of "The Will", Chapter on "Neglecting the Will", and other references as stated in Abdullah Ibn Saba', vol. 1, p.101.

³ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p.219, and other references as in Abdullah Ibn Saba', vol. 1, pp. 102-103.

legs of those who allege he is dead.¹ Whoever says: 'he is dead,' I will chop off his head with my sword. He has ascended to the heaven."²

In the mosque, they recited to him: "**Muhammad is but a messenger; (other) messengers have passed before him. If he dies or is killed, will you turn back on your heels?**"³ (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 144).

Al-'Abbas Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib said: "The Messenger of Allah is dead. I have seen on his face what I am used to recognize in the faces of Banî Abd al-Muttalib at the time of their death." Then he asked: "If anybody of you has any agreement with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his death, let him speak." "No," they said. So he said: "O people, bear witness that nobody has any covenant with the Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny) in his death..."⁴

'Umar continued talking until his mouth foamed,⁵ and until Abu Bakr came from al-Sunh, and recited: "**Muhammad is but a Messenger (other) messenger have passed away before him...**" 'Umar asked: "Is that in the Book of Allah?" He said: "Yes". 'Umar said nothing.⁶

Al-Saqifah and Abu Bakr's Allegiance

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed. vol. 1, p.1818

² Abu al-Fida's Tarikh, vol. 1, p.164.

³ Narrated in Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, chapter 2, p. 57; Kanz al-'Ummal, vol. 4, p.53, hadith 1092; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p.243; al-Amini has narrated it in al-Ghadeer from Sharh al-Mawaahib of al-Zarqaani, vo. 8, p. 281; Ibn Maajah, H. 627 under verse 144 from Surah Aal Imran.

⁴ . Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, Chapter 2, p. 57; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p.243; Al-Seerah al-Halabiyyah, vol. 3, pp. 390-391; Kanz al-'Ummal, vol. 4, p. 53, Hadith 1092. Al-Baqalani's al-Tamhid, pp. 192-193.

⁵ Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p.567; al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, chapter 2, p.53; Kanz al-'Ummal, vol. 4, p.53; Tarikh al-Khamis, vol. 2, p.185; al-Sirat al-Halabiyyah, vol. 3, p. 392.

⁶ Al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, chapter 2, p. 54; al-Tabari, vol. 1, pp.1817-1818; Ibn Kathir's vol. 5, p.243; Al-Seerah al-Halabiyyah, vol. 3, p.392; Ibn Maajah, hadith 1627. This same verse had already been recited to 'Umar by Ibn Umm Kulthum in the mosque. It was a characteristic of only the caliph 'Umar to cast doubt on the death of the Messenger on the day of his demise. No biographer or historian has recorded any such suspicion on the part of any other companion than 'Umar.

The helpers (*ansar*) gathered under the Saqifah (shed) of Banu Sa'idah, where a group of the migrants (*muhaajiroon*) followed them. None remained beside the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) except his close relatives who were busy washing and shrouding his body. They were: 'Ali, al-'Abbas, his two sons: al-Fadl and Qutham, Usamah Ibn Zayd, Salih - the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) servant and Aws Ibn Khawla al-Ansari.¹

As-Saqifah Events as Narrated by the Caliph 'Umar

He said: "When Allah captured the soul of His Prophet, someone informed us that the Ansar had gathered in the Saqifah of Banu Sa'idah. 'Ali, al-Zubair and their companions were absent. I told Abu Bakr: 'Let us go to our brothers the Ansar.' So we went until we joined them. There, we saw a man wrapped in his cloak. They said: 'This is Sa'ad Ibn 'Ubaadah; he is unwell.' We sat down for a little while when a speaker from them recited the two testimonies, praised Allah and said: 'We are the Ansar of Allah and the Battalion of Islam, and you, O Muhaajir, are family...' I wanted to speak but Abu Bakr told me to be quiet. Again, he continued talking. By Allah! He let no word unsaid, which I liked to say, or even he said a better one. He said: 'What you said of good has its people. This affair is not known except for this branch of Quraysh, as they are the center lineage and position of the Arabs. I approve for you to give your allegiance to either of these two'. Then he held my hand and that of Abu Ubaydah. I disliked nothing of his speech except this. A man from the Ansar said: 'I am the most respected and honoured expert at that. From us an Emir and from you, O Quraysh, an Emir'. There was a huge din and voices were raised. I feared dispute. I said: 'O Abu Bakr, extend your hand.' He did, and I paid my allegiance to him. The Muhajirs did the like, and so did the Ansar. We were greatly agitated by Sa'd Ibn 'Ubada's saying: 'Whoever gives his allegiance to anybody among you without consulting

¹ Refer the text in Ibn Sa'd's *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, vol. 2, chapter 2, p.70, and almost similar narration is in *al-Bid'ah wa al-Tarikh*; *Kanz al-Ummal*, vol. 4, pp.54 & 60, its text is as follows: "Four men attended his shrouding and burial" then he mentions whatever we have stated above; *Al-'Iqd al-Farid*, vol. 3, p. 61, and nearly the same text is in *Al-Dhahabi's Tarikh*, vol. 1, pp. 321, 324 & 326

other Muslims, neither the person who gave the allegiance nor the person to whom your allegiance was given, are to be supported, lest they both be killed."¹

Al-Tabari, writing about al-Saqifa and the allegiance with Abu Bakr, says²:

"The Ansar gathered in the Saqifah of Banu Sa'idah, leaving the body of the Messenger to be bathed by his folks. They said: "We appoint Sa'd Ibn Ubadah to this affair after Muhammad", and they brought out Sa'd, who was unwell.

He thanked Allah and praised Him. Then he referred to the Ansar's early adoption of Islam, their religious merits, their endearing the Prophet and his companions, and their waging a holy war against his enemies until the Arabs came to righteousness, and when the Messenger died, he was pleased with them. Then he said: "Take possession of this affair, excluding the people." They all replied: "You are right in your opinion! You are correct in what you say, and we shall not deviate from what you say. We therefore, assign this affair to you." Then there were heated arguments exchanged among them. They said: "But what if the Muhajir of Quraysh declined, saying: "We are the Muhajir, the early Companions of the Messenger of Allah, his tribe and guardians. So, why do you pull at this affair with us after him?" Some said: "We will say: From us an Emir and from you an Emir." Sa'd Ibn 'Ubadah said: "This is the beginning of weakness."³

Hearing that, Abu Bakr and 'Umar hurried to the Saqifah together with Abu 'Ubaydah al-Jarrah, then they were joined by 'Usayd Ibn Khudair,⁴ 'Uwaym Ibn Saidah,⁵ and 'Aasim Ibn 'Adi⁶ of Bani al-'Ajlal⁷.

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, Book of "al-Hudud", Chapter on "Stoning the pregnant by adultery", vol. 4, p.120.

² This narrative is summarized from Al-Tabari's al-Tarikh stating the events of the demise of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). Quotes from other than al-Tabari are referred to their sources in the footnotes. The details of this narrative are stated in Abdullah Ibn Saba', vol. 1.

³ Al-Tabari in reporting the events of the year 11 Hijri. vol. 2, p.456, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p.1868, quoting Abdullah Ibn 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi 'Umrah al-Ansari. Ibn al-Athir, vol. 2, p.125. Ibn Qutaybah's Tarikh al-Khulafa', vol. 1, p.5 nearly like it. Al-Saqifah by Abu Bakr al-Jawhari, vol. 2 from Ibn Abi al-Hadid on the sermon "on the meaning of Ansar". [Nahj al-Balaaghah].

⁴ His name is stated in al-Seerah of Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p.335. Usayd Ibn Khudayr Ibn Samak Ibn 'Utayk Ibn Raafi' Ibn Imra al-Qays Ibn Zayd Ibn 'Abd al-Ashhal Ibn al-Harth Ibn al-Khazraj Ibn 'Amr Ibn Malik Ibn al-Aws al-Ansari al-Ashhali. He attended the second 'Aqabah. He was among those who was steadfast in the Uhud

Preventing 'Umar from delivering a speech, Abu Bakr began himself delivering a speech. He thanked Allah and praised Him. Then he referred to the precedence of the Muhajir and their believing in the Messenger, prior to all other Arabs, and said: "... They were the first who worshipped Allah on the earth and believed in His Messenger. They were his close friends and kinsfolk, and more entitled than anyone to this affair after him. None but an unjust would deny them that." Then he mentioned the merits of the Ansar and said: "Therefore, there is none more favoured to us, after the early Muhjirs, than you, so, we are the Emirs and you are the viziers."

Al-Habbaab Ibn al-Mundhir stood up and said: "O Ansar! Control yourselves. The people are under your shadow and protection. None would dare to dispute with you. So do not differ or your decision will go bad and your status will collapse. If these people refuse what you heard, then (let it be) an Emir from us and an Emir from them."

'Umar said: "What an idea! No two persons can gather in one peak... By Allah! The Arabs would refuse to give you command while their Prophet was not from among you. But the Arabs would not refuse giving their rule to those in whom the Prophethood appeared and from whom was their guardian. Against the one who denies this, we have a manifest proof and a clear authority. Who would dispute

Battle, and was present at all the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) battles. Abu Bakr never gave priority to any of the Ansar other than him. He died in the year 20 or 21 H. 'Umar himself carried his coffin. Al-Isti'aab, vol. 1, pp.31-33; Al-Isaabah, vol. 1, p.64.

⁵ 'Uwaym Ibn Sa'idah Ibn 'Aa'ish Ibn Qays Ibn an-Nu'man Ibn Zayd Ibn 'Umayyah Ibn Malik Ibn 'Awf Ibn 'Amr Ibn 'Awf Ibn Malik Ibn Al-Aws al-Ansari al-Awsi. Attended the 'Aqabah, the Battle of Badr and the battles thereafter. He died during 'Umar's rule. In his biography in al-Nubalaa, it is said that he was Caliph 'Umar's brother. 'Umar said over his grave: "No one on the surface of this earth can say: I am better than the one in this grave." Al-Isti'aab, vol. 3, p.170; Al-Isaabah, vol. 3, p.45. Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, p.158.

⁶ Aasim Ibn 'Adi Ibn al-Jidd Ibn al-'Ajlaan Ibn Harithah Ibn Duallegiance Ibn Haram al-Balwa al-'Ajlan, the ally of the migrants. He was the head of Banu 'Ajlaan, attended the Battle of Uhud and the battles thereafter. He died in 45 A.H. Al-Isti'aab, vol.3, p.133; Al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p.237; Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p.75.

⁷ Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p.339

with us about Muhammad's authority and rule, whereas we are his people and kinfolk¹, unless he be talking falsehood inclined to sin or entangled in a total loss. Al-Habbaab Ibn al-Mundhir² stood and said: "O Migrants! Control your hands and do not listen to this (man) and his companions who want to take away your share of this rule. If they denied you what you demanded from them, expel them from this land and take the command over these affairs. You have, by Allah, more right to this rule than them. It was because of your swords that this religion was adopted by those who refused it. I am the most respected and honoured at that. However, I swear by Allah, if you want we will repeat it anew."

¹ On hearing this argument on the part of the migrants, 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) said: "They argued by the tree but squandered its fruit." Nahj al-Balaaghah, Commentary on, vol. 2, p. 2.

² Al-Habbaab Ibn al-Mundhir al-Jamuh Ibn Zayd Ibn Haram Ibn Ka'b Ibn Ghanam Ibn Ka'b Ibn Salaamah al-Ansari. He attended the Badr war and the battles thereafter. He died during 'Umar's caliphate. Al-Isti'aab, vol. 1, p. 353; Al-Isaabah, vol.1, p. 302; Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 1, p. 364. His lineage is quoted in Ibn Hazm's Jamharah, p. 359

‘Umar said: "May Allah kill you!"

"Nay! He may kill you!" said al-Habbaab.

Abu ‘Ubaydah said: "O Migrants! You were the first to back and support, so do not be the first to change and alter."

At this, Bashîr Ibn Sa‘d al-Khazraji, father of Nu‘man Ibn Bashir, stood up and said: "O Migrants! By Allah! If we had a virtue for fighting the polytheists and for being of the early believers, we just wanted by that to please our Lord, to obey our Prophet and to toil for ourselves. So, we ought not to boast against the people because of that, nor do we desire some of worldly trash, as Allah is our Provider for that. But Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) is from Quraysh and his people are more entitled and have more right to him. By Allah! I would rather never have Him see me quarrel with them in this affair (of caliphate). Fear Allah. Do not differ with them. Do not dispute with them."

Abu Bakr said: "Here is ‘Umar and here is Abu ‘Ubaydah. Pay allegiance to either of them." They both said: "By Allah! We would never take it, leaving you aside,¹ and so on and so forth.

‘Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Auf stood up and said: "O Migrants! Although you have merits, yet you have not among you men like Abu Bakr, ‘Umar and ‘Ali."

Al-Mundhir Ibn al-Arqam stood up and said: "We do not deny the merits of those you mentioned. Among them is a man none would dispute it with him if he demanded it - meaning ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib,"² and so on and so forth.

"The Ansar, or some of them, said: We will not pay allegiance to anyone except ‘Ali"³

"Umar said: There were so much clamour and shouting that I feared there would be a dispute, so I said: Extend⁴ your hand to give you my allegiance.⁵

¹ We cut the argument up to here as it is lengthy.

² Narrated by al-Ya‘qubi, after stating what had already been mentioned, vol. 2, p. 103 of his History, and in Ibn al-Zubair’s al-Muwaffaqiyyat, p. 579.

³ . In al-Tabari’s narration, vol. 3, p.208 (Eu. ed. vol. 1, p.1818), quoting Ibrahîm, and in Ibn al-Athîr, vol. 2, p. 123 it is stated that: "That was said by the Ansar after Umar paid allegiance to Abu Bakr."

⁴ To Abu Bakr.

⁵ Sirat Ibn Hisham, 4/336, and many others. Look up after that the hadîth about "the Error" regarding ‘Umar’s opinion of giving allegiance to Abu Bakr.

As they started to approach him, Bashir Ibn Sa'd vied them to him and gave him his allegiance. Al-Habbaab Ibn al-Mundhir called to him: "O Bashir Ibn Sa'd! You have refracted too far! Do you envy your cousin becoming Emir?" "Not at all, by Allah!" said Bashir, "but I detest quarelling with a people about a right which Allah has assigned to them." When the Aws saw what Bashir Ibn Sa'd did, and what Quraysh want and the Khazraj's intention to appoint Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah, conversed with one another, and with them was 'Usayd Ibn Khudayr as one of their chiefs. A leader said: "By Allah, if the Khazraj took it over once, they would get the merit against you, and they would never give you any share of it. Come! Let us pay allegiance to Abu Bakr¹

They all stood up and gave their allegiance to him, where upon the predetermined plans of Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah and the Khazraj were defeated... people from everywhere came to offer their allegiance to Abu Bakr, such that they were about to tread upon Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah.

Some of his companions shouted: "Beware! Don't trample upon Sa'd!"

'Umar said: "Kill him! May Allah kill him!"

Then he came up to him and said: "I was going to tread upon you so much as to crush your limbs." Qays Ibn Sa'd siezed 'Umar by the beard and said: "By Allah, if you harmed even a single hair of him, you would go home with no visible tooth."

Abu Bakr said: "Be quiet, O 'Umar! Leniency is more effective here." So,

'Umar turned away from him.²

Sa'd said: "By Allah! If I had the strength to stand up, you would have heard from me such a roar resounding in the regions and the roads of the land that it would force you and your companions into your holes! By Allah, I would have then

¹ . Abu Bakr, in telling about his Saqîfah, said: "When the Aws noticed that a leader of the Khazraj had given his allegiance, 'Usayd Ibn Khudayr, the leader of the Aws, also gave his allegiance due to his rivalry with Sa'd and envying him, lest he takes over. Look up the commentary on Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 2, p. 2 on "the meaning of al-Ansar."

² This incident reveals the general attitude of the two would be Caliphs in their policies of severity and leniency.

made you join the people among whom you were a follower, not a leader! Carry me out of this place." So, he was taken to his home.¹

Abu Bakr al-Jawhari narrated: "On that day i.e. the day of allegiance to Abu Bakr - 'Umar, wearing tight his garment, was hurrying before Abu Bakr, shouting: 'Oh! the people have paid allegiance to Abu Bakr!'"²etc.

People paid their allegiance to Abu Bakr and took him to the mosque for more allegiance. Al-Abbas and 'Ali heard the takbîr in the mosque, while they had not yet finished washing the body of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)".

'Ali said: "What is this?"

"This has never been seen before!" said al-Abbas, "Did not I tell you?"

The Warners

Al-Baraa' Ibn 'Aazib came knocking at the door of Banu Hashim and screamed: "O Bani Hashim! Abu Bakr has been given the allegiance!"

They said to one another: "The Muslims never used to do things in our absence as we are more entitled to Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny)."

Al-Abbas said: "They did it, by the Lord of the Ka'bah!"

As a matter of fact, all the migrants and most of the Ansars had no doubt that 'Ali (peace be on him) would have been the sovereign after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).³

The migrants and the Ansar "had no doubt about 'Ali (peace be on him)".

Al-Tabari narrated: "When (the tribe of) Aslam came with their group, the streets were crowded with them, and they gave their allegiance to Abu Bakr. Impressed by this, 'Umar said: When I saw Aslam I felt sure of victory."⁴Having given their allegiance to Abu Bakr, the people brought him, in a ceremonial procession, to the mosque of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). There he

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarîkh, pp. 455-459. Eu. ed. vol. 1, p. 1843.

² Al-Saqîfah, Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 1, pp.133 and 74 in different wordings.

³ Al-Muwaffaqiyyat, by al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar, p. 580.

⁴ Al-Tabari's Tarîkh, vol. 2, p. 458. Eu. ed. vol.1, p.1843. Ibn al-Athir's narration vol. 2, p. 224 on "Aslam came and pledged allegiance." Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkar says in his al-Muwaffaqiyyat, as quoted by Ibn Abi al-Hadîd in his commentary on Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 6, p. 287: "Abu Bakr felt strong by them". They did not state when Aslam had come. Most probably they came on Tuesday. Al-Mufid in his al-Jamal says: "The tribe had come to get provision from the town", p. 43.

ascended the pulpit [of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)]. The people continued to give him their allegiance till the evening, too engaged with that to attend the funeral of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till it was the night of Tuesday.¹

The General Allegiance

"The next day after taking allegiance from the people at Saqifah, Abu Bakr ascended the vostrum. But 'Umar stood up and delivered a speech before him. He thanked Allah and praised Him... Then he said that what he had uttered the day before was not from the Book of Allah nor a covenant from His Messenger. But he believed that the Messenger would manage their affairs and would be the last." Then he said: "Allah has left His Book with you, with which He guided His Messenger. If you adhere to it, Allah will guide you to what He had guided him. Allah has made you gather around the best of you, the companion of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), the second of the two when they were both in the cave. So come on, give him your allegiance." At that juncture, the people swore allegiance in general, to Abu Bakr after having done so in the Saqifah"

So, the people concluded the general allegiance with Abu Bakr, in addition to their allegiance of Saqifah.

Al-Bukhari says: "Some groups had already given him their allegiance in the Saqifah of Banu Sa'idah, while the general allegiance with Abu Bakr was on the pulpit." Anas Ibn Malik said: "I heard 'Umar on that day telling Abu Bakr to ascend the pulpit, and he kept pressing upon him until he did, and the people gave him the allegiance in general."

Thereafter, Abu Bakr spoke. He thanked Allah and praised Him. He then said: "O people! I have been given authority over you, though I am NOT the best of you. So, if I do good, you must assist me, and if I do wrong, you must correct me...", till he said: "Obey me as long as I obey Allah and His Messenger. If I disobeyed

¹ Al-Muwaffaqiyyat, p. 578. Al-Riyaad al-Nadira, vol. 1, p. 164; Tarikh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p.188

Allah and His Messenger, you should not obey me. Perform your prayers! May Allah have mercy on you!"¹

After the General Allegiance

"The Messenger of Allah died on Monday, when the sun was declining. The people were too busy to attend his funeral."²

The people were detracted from attending to the Messenger of Allah the rest of Monday and all Tuesday till evening - they were detracted by the speeches of Saqifah by Abu Bakr's first allegiance, by his and 'Umar's speeches, and then his leading them in the prayers.

It was said: "Having paid their allegiance to Abu Bakr, the people turned to attend the funeral of the Messenger of Allah on Tuesday."³ "Then the people entered to perform their funeral prayers on him."⁴ The prayers was performed on him with no Imam to lead it. People went in groups after groups and performed the prayers.⁵

The Messenger's Burial

The burial of the Messenger of Allah in his grave was attended by the same group who washed him: al-Abbas, 'Ali, al-Fadl and his servant Salih. The Companions of the Messenger of Allah left him with his relatives who undertook the burial preparations."⁶

¹ Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p.340; Al-Tabari, vol. 3, p.203 or in his Eu. ed. vol. 1, p.1829; Ibn Qutaybah's 'Oyoon al-Akhbaar, vol. 2, p. 234; Al-Riyaad al-Nadira, vol. 1, p. 167; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 248; Al-Suyuti's Tarikh al-Khulafaa, p. 44; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 129, hadith No. 2253; Al-Halabiyyah, vol.3, p. 397; Al-Bukhari, in his Sahih, vol. 4, p. 165, Book of Allegiance, quoting Anas, states 'Umar's speech, with a slight difference.

Others who stated only 'Umar's speech are: Abu Bakr al-Jawhari in his book Al-Saqifah, according to Ibn Hadid's quotation vol. 1, p. 134 and Safwah al-Safwah, vol. 1, p.98.

² Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2. Q. 2 p. 78, ed. Leyden

³ Seerah al-Nabi of Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p. 343. Al-Tabari

⁴ Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p. 343.

⁵ Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, 2Q 2p. 70; Ibn al-Athir's Al-Kaamil; vol. 2 concerning the events of the year 11 A.H.

⁶ The text is from al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra by Ibn Sa'd, vol. 2, Q 2, p.70, nearly the same as in al-Bad' wa al-Tarikh; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 4, pp. 54 & 60 whose text

"Ali entered the grave, as well as al-Fadl and Qutham, the two sons of al-Abbas, and Shuqran, his servant. Some said that 'Usamah Ibn Zayd was there, too among those who undertook the ritual washing and shrouding, and all that was needed."¹

"... and Abu Bakr and 'Umar did not attend the burial of the Prophet."²

'A'ishah said: "We knew nothing about the burial of the Messenger until we heard the sound of shovels in the heart of the night on Wednesday."³

"He was not taken care of except by his relatives. Banu Ghanm heard the sound of shovels afterwards while they were in their houses."⁴

The chiefs of Banu Ghanm said: "We heard the sound of shovels late at night."⁵

After Burying the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny)

Sa'd and his supporters were defeated, and there remained 'Ali and his group, though a minority, combating Abu Bakr's victorious party, each side trying to attract more supporters to its party. Al-Zubair Ibn al-Bakkaar, in his al-Muwaffaqiyyaat, says: "After giving the allegiance to Abu Bakr and consolidating his position, many Ansar regretted having given their allegiance to him. They blamed one another, mentioned 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib and acclaimed him."⁶(3)

Al-Ya'qubi said⁷(4)8: "Some of the Muhajirs and the Ansars did not come to give the allegiance to Abu Bakr, turning to 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib. Among them were al-'Abbas Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib, al-Fadl Ibn al-'Abbas, al-Zubair Ibn al-

is: "Preparing and burying were undertaken by four people." Then it states what we already mentioned.

¹ Al-'Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, p. 61 nearly the same as al-Dhahabi's text in his Tarikh, vol. 1, pp. 321, 324 and 326.

² Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 140.

³ Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p. 344; al-Tabari, vol. 2, pp.402 & 455. (Eu. ed. 1/1833 & 1837). Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 270; Ibn al-Athir from Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 1, p. 34, on the Messenger's biography. In other narrations, it is said: "Their hearing of the sound of the shovels was on the night of Tuesday", as in Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, Q. 2, p. 78; Tarikh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p. 191; Tarikh al-Dhahabi, vol. 1, p. 327. Actually, it was on the night of Wednesday. In Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p. 62: "Late on the night on Wednesday", while on pages 242 & 247 he says: "We knew nothing where he was being buried until we heard..."

⁴ Ibn Sa'd, vol. 2, Q 2, p. 78

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Al-Muwaffaqiyyat, p. 583

⁷ In his Tarikh, 2/103. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari in his as-Saqifah, as quoted by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 2/13. At-Tafsil, Vol.1/74, and, in almost similar wordings, in al-Imaamah was - Siyasah, Vol. 1/14.

‘Awwaam, Khalid Ibn Sa‘id, al-Miqdad Ibn ‘Amr¹(5)1, Salman al-Muhammadi, Abu Dharr al-Ghaffaari, ‘Ammar Ibn Yasir, al-Baraa’ Ibn ‘Aazib²(6) Ubay Ibn Ka‘b³(7).

Abu Bakr sent for ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, Abu ‘Ubaydah Ibn al-Jarraah and Mughirah Ibn Shu‘bah and sought their advice in the matter."

They said⁴(8)4: "We suggest that you should meet al-‘Abbas Ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib and offer him a share of this affair and for his offspring after him; thus,

¹ Al-Miqdad Ibn al-Aswad al-Kindi is the son of ‘Amr Ibn Tha‘labah Ibn Malik Ibn Rabī‘ ah Ibn ‘Amir Ibn Matrud al-Bahrani. He was wanted for a "blood" in his people, he ran away to Hadramoot, where he pledged an alliance with Kindah tribe. He married and his wife bore him a boy, al-Miqdad. As a grown up, al-Miqdad had a quarrel with Shimr Ibn Haajar al-Kindi. He struck him with his sword on the leg and ran away to Makkah, where he concluded an alliance with al-Aswad Ibn ‘ Abd Yaghuth al-Zohri, who adopted him. There upon he was called al-Miqdad Ibn al-Aswad al-Kindi. When the verse: "**Call them by their fathers...**" (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 5), he was called: al-Miqdad Ibn ‘Amr.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Allah the Glorified and Almighty, ordered me to love four of my companions, and He told me that He loved them*". Asked who they were, he said: "*Ali, al-Miqdad, Salman and Abu Dharr*." He died in 33 A.H.

Look up al-Isti‘aab, in the margin of al-Isaabah, vol.3 ,p. 451. Al-Isaabah, vol. 3 pp. 433-434.

².. Abu ‘Amr al-Baraa’ Ibn ‘Aazib Ibn al-Harith Ibn ‘Adi Ibn Jashm Ibn Majda‘ah Ibn al-Harith Ibn ‘Amr Ibn Malik Ibn al-Aws al-Ansari al-Awsi. He was not allowed by the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) to take part in in the Battle of Badr as he was too young. Later, he took part in 14 of the Prophet’s battles. He also accompanied ‘Ali in al-Jamal, Siffin and an- Nahrawan battle. He lived in Kufa where he built himself a house. He died there during the rule of Mas‘ab Ibn al-Zubair. al-Isti‘aab, vol. 1, p. 144; al-Isaabah, vol. 1, p.147.

³ Ubayy Ibn Ka‘b Ibn Qays Ibn ‘Ubayd Ibn Zayd Ibn Mu‘awiyah Ibn ‘Amr Ibn Malik Ibn al-Najjaar, Taymul-lat Ibn Tha‘labah Ibn ‘Amr Ibn al-Khazraj the senior. He attended the Second Allegiance of ‘Aqabah, where he paid allegiance to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). He was present in the Battle of Badr and the battles thereafter. He was the Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) stenographer. He died late in the days of ‘Umar’s Caliphate, or in early days of ‘Uthman’s Caliphate. al-Isti‘aab, vol. 1, pp. 27-30; al-Isaabah, vol. 1, pp. 31 & 32.

⁴ According to the text of al-Jawhari, this was said by al-Mughirah Ibn Shu‘bah, which is nearest to be acceptable.

you will turn him away from ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib ‘and it will be a proof for you¹(9)5’ against ‘Ali if he showed inclination towards you.

Consequently, Abu Bakr, ‘Umar, Abu ‘Ubaydah Ibn al-Jarrah and al-Mughirah hurried until they entered upon al-‘Abbas at night.²6(10) Abu Bakr thanked Allah and praised Him, then said: "Allah had sent Muhammad as a Prophet, and as a guardian for the believers. He placed him among them out of His benevolence, until He chose for him what He has. So, He left the affairs of the people to them³(11)7 so that they may choose for themselves, together, what is in their interest. They chose me to be their guardian and protector of their affairs. I accepted that, fearing no weakness, by Allah’s help and guidance, and no confusion nor cowardice. My success is only by Allah, on Him I rely and to Him I return. I have after been informed about some who refute by alleging difference among the Muslims, taking refuge in you to be their strong fortress and wonderfull quest. So, you may either join the people in what they had joined together, or prevent them from what they are inclined to. We have come to you intending to let you have a share of this, for yourself and your offspring after you, as you are the Prophet’s uncle, although the people, noticing your position and your companion’s, had transferred the affair away from you.⁴ So, take it easy, O Banu Hashim, the Messenger of Allah was from us as well as from you..‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab said: "Another point! We did not come to you because we need you, but we dislike to see that the rejection of what the Muslims unanimously accepted should come from you, and that the calamity should aggravate for you and for them. So, see what you may!"

Al-‘Abbas thanked Allah and praised Him, and said: "Allah had sent Muhammad, as you said, as a Prophet, a guardian for the believers and a grace to his nation, until He made him die, choosing for him that which He has, and leaving to the Muslims their affairs to choose for themselves, aiming at the right, not strayed by whims of deviation. So, if your demand came through the Messenger of Allah,

¹ This addition is in al-Imaamah wa al-Siyaasah, vol. 1, p.14.

² . Ibn Abi al-Hadid narrates that this happended in the second night after the demise of the Prophet

³ The pronoun them is stated in Ibn Abi al-Hadîd’s narrative

⁴ The addition is in Ibn Abi al-Hadîd’s copy and in al-Imaamah wa al-Siyaasah

then you have taken our right, and if you took it with the support of the believers, then we are a part of them. We did not take any excessive step against you, nor we poised at the top, nor we deposed indignantly, If this affair has become yours by the believers, it can not be so since we dislike it. How far your saying that they refuted you is from your saying that they chose you and tended towards you. And how far your calling yourself the successor of the Messenger of Allah is from your saying that He had left to the Muslims their affairs and to choose, and they chose you. As to your saying that you intend to let me have a share of this, if it belongs to the believers, you will have no right to take any decision about it.¹ But if it is ours, we will not accept some of it and leave the rest. Take it easy, as the Messenger of Allah is of a tree of which we are the leaves and you are its neighbours." Hearing this, they left.

Taking Refuge in Hazrat Fatima's (peace be on her) House

'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab said: "... And there was someone who told us - when Allah captured the soul of His Prophet - that 'Ali, al-Zubair and some others with them had remained behind us in Fatimah's house."²

The historians counted among those who refrained from giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr and remained in Fatima's house with 'Ali and al-Zubair, the following:

1. Al-'Abbas Ibn 'Abdul Muttalib,
2. 'Utbah Ibn Abi Lahab,
3. Salman al-Farsi,
4. Abu Dharr al-Ghifari,
5. 'Ammar Ibn Yasir,
6. al-Miqdad Ibn al-Aswad,
7. al-Barra' Ibn 'Azib,
8. 'Ubayy Ibn Ka'b,

¹ In the copy of al-Jawhari and in al-Imaamah wa al-Siyaasah, the expression is: "If it were your right we would not need it."

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol.1, p. 55; Al-Tabari, vol. 2, p. 466 (Eu. ed. 1/1822); Ibn al-Athîr, vol. 2, p. 124; Ibn al-Kathir, vol. 5, p. 246; Safwah al-Safwah, vol. 1, p. 97; Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 1, p. 123; Al-Suyuti's Tarîkh, on "Giving allegiance to Abu Bakr," p. 45.

Ibn Hisham, vol. 4, p. 338; Taysir al-Wusul, vol. 2, p. 41

9. Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas,¹

10. Talhah Ibn 'Ubaydillah, and a number of Banu Hashim as well as a group² of the migrants and the Ansar.

There are successive narratives about 'Ali and those who refrained, with him, from giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr, and stayed in Fatima's house in the books of biography, history, sahihs, musnad, literature, theology, etc. But as their authors disliked what had happened between those persons and the victorious party, they did not explicitly record the events except what was unintentionally mentioned at random. For example, al-Balaadhuri says: "Abu Bakr sent 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab to 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with them) when the latter refrained from giving his allegiance, and told him: "Bring him here most violently". When Umar came to Ali, there ran a conversation between them. 'Ali said to him: "Milk you a milking of which half shall be yours. By Allah, your exerting yourself on protecting his rule today is not but to have his preference tomorrow", etc. as the hadith goes³. In his death illness, Abu Bakr said: "I indeed shall regret nothing of this word but three things which I did and which I should not have done..." until

¹ Abu Is'haaq Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas. His father, Abu Waqqas, is Malik Ibn 'Uhayb Ibn 'Abd Munaf Ibn Zuhrah Ibn Kilab al-Qarashi. He was the seventh of the early seven persons who adopted Islam. He participated in the Battle of Badr and the later ones. He was the first one who threw an arrow in Islam. He was the head of the conquerers of Iraq and those who thronged the Kufah, on which he was appointed as a governor by 'Umar. He was among the six persons suggested by 'Umar to form the consulting Council. He went into seclusion after the murder of 'Uthman, and died in his house in al-'Aqîq during Mu'awiyah's Caliphate, was transported to al-Madînah and buried in al-Baqî'. al-'Istî'âab, vol. 2, pp.18-25; al-'Isaabah, vol. 2, pp. 30-32.

² The following reference books state, besides the aforementioned ones, that those persons had refrained from giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr and gathered in Fatimah's house. Some of the books stated the names of some of them, and said that they had gathered there to pay their allegiance to 'Ali: al-Riyaad al-Nadhirah, vol. 1, p. 167; Taarîkh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p. 188; Ibn 'Abd Rabbah, vol. 3, p. 64; Tarîkh Abi al-Fida', vol. 1, p. 156; Ibn Shuhnah in the margin of al-Kaamil, p. 112; al-Jawhari as narrated by Ibn Abil-Hadid, vol. 1, pp. 130-134 and al-Halabiyyah, vol. 3, pp. 394 & 397

³ Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 587

he said: "As to the three things which I did: I wish I had not exposed Fatimah's house for anything, although they had closed it for war."¹(2)2

Al-Ya'qubi quotes him to have said: "I wish i had not searched the house of Fatimah, daughter of the Messenger of Allah, and let men enter it, even if it had been closed for war."²(3)3

The historians counted among those who had been let to enter Fatimah's house the following person:

1. 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab.
2. Khalid Ibn al-Walid.³
3. 'Abdur-Rahman Ibn 'Awf.
4. Thabit Ibn Qays Ibn Shammah.⁴
5. Ziyad Ibn Labid.⁵(1)6

¹ Al-Tabari, vol. 2, p. 619 (Eu. ed. vol. 1, p. 2140) on the death of Abu Bakr. Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 1, p. 414; Ibn 'Abd Rabbah, vol. 3, p. 69 on appointing 'Umar as Caliph by Abu Bakr; al-Kanz, vol. 3, p. 135; Muntakhab al-Kanz, vol. 2, p. 171; al-Imamah wa al-Siyaasah, vol. 1, p. 18; al-Mubarrid's al-Kamil, according to Ibn Abi al-Hadid's quote, vol. 1, pp. 130-131. Abu 'Ubayd in his al-Amwaa, p.131, quoted Abu Bakr to have said: "... As to the three things which I did but I wished I had not done them, were such - and - such, and he mentioned some fault which I. 'Abu 'Ubayd' do not like to mention! The end. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari as quoted by al-Nahj, vol. 9, p. 130; Lisan al-Mizan. Look up Abu Bakr's biography by Ibn 'Asakir and in Mira'at al-Zamaan by Sibṭ Ibn al-Jawzi, and al-Dhahabi's Tarikh, vol. 1, p. 388.

² . al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p.115.

³ Abu Sulaiman, Khalid Ibn al-Walid Ibn al-Mughirah Ibn 'Abdullah Ibn 'Umar Ibn Makhzum al-Qarashi. His mother was Lubabah bint al-Harith Ibn al-Huzn al-Hilali, sister of Maymuna, the Prophet's wife. he was a man of nobility in the Jahiliyyah. He emigrated after the Hudaibiyyah treaty and witnessed the conquest of Makkah. Abu Bakr appointed him as commander of the armies. He was named as Saifullah (Allah's sword). He died in Hums or in al-Madinah, in circa 21 or 22 A.H. al-Isti'ab, vol. 1, pp. 405-408.

⁴ Thabit Ibn Qays Ibn Shammah Ibn Zuhayr Ibn Malik Ibn Imra' al Qays Ibn Malik Ibn Tha'labah Ibn Ka' b Ibn al-Khazraj al-Ansari. He participated in the Battle of Ohod and the later ones. He was killed with Khalid in al-Yamaamah. al-Isti'ab, p. 193; al-Isaabah, vol. 1, p. 197

⁵ Ziyad Ibn Labid Ibn Tha'labah Ibn Sinaan Ibn 'Amir Ibn 'Adi Ibn 'Umaiyah Ibn Bayadah al-Ansari, of the Bani Bayadah Ibn ' Amir Ibn Zurayq. An emigrant of the helpers, as he had come to the Prophet while still in Madinah and then migrated with him to Makkah. He participated in the al-'Aqabah, Badr and later battles. He

6. Muhammad Ibn Muslemah.¹(2)1
7. Zayd Ibn Thabit.²(3)2
8. Salamah Ibn Salamah Ibn Waqash.³(4)3
9. Salamah Ibn Aslam.⁴(5)4
10. 'Usayd Ibn Khudayr.⁵(6)5

The details about attacking Fatimah's house and what happened to those in it and about those men, has been recorded by the historians. They said: "A number of migrants and Ansar were angry with Abu 'Bakr's allegiance. Among them were 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, and al-Zubair. They entered Fatimah's house with their arms"⁶(7)6, "Abu Bakr and 'Umar were informed that a group of the migrants and the Ansar had gathered with 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib in Fatimah's house, the daughter

died early in Mu'awiyah's Caliphate. al-Ist'āab, vol. 1, p. 545. al-Isaabah, vol.1, p. 540. In Jamharat of Ibn Hazm, p. 356, where the word Bayadah is omitted from his lineage.

¹ Muhammad Ibn Muslemah Ibn Salamah Ibn Khalīd Ibn 'Adi Ibn Majda'ah Ibn Harithah Ibn al-Harith Ibn al-Khazraj Ibn 'Amr Ibn Malik Ibn al-Aws. He participated in the battles of Badr and the later battles. He neither paid allegiance to 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib nor did he participate in his battles. He died in circa 43, 46, or 47 A.H. al-Ist'āab, vol.3, Section 3, p. 5; al-Isaabah, vol.3, pp. 363 & 364. His lineage is in Jamharat of Ibn Hazm, p. 361.

² Look up Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 585.

³ Abu 'Awf, Salamah Ibn Salamah Ibn Waqsh Ibn Zughbah Ibn Za'ura', Ibn 'Abd al-Ashhal al-Ansari. His mother was Salmah bint Salamah Ibn Khalid Ibn 'Adi al-Ansari. He participated in al-'Aqabah, the first and the last. He participated in the battle of Badr and the later battles and died in Madinah in 45 A.H. al-Ist'āab, vol. 2, p. 84; al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 63.

⁴ Abu Sa'id, Salamah Ibn Aslam Ibn Harīsh Ibn 'Adi Ibn Majda'ah Ibn Harithah Ibn al-Harith Ibn al-Khazraj Ibn 'Amr Ibn 'Adi Ibn Malik Ibn al-Aws al-Ansari. He participated in the Battle of Badr and the later battles. He was killed in a battle called Jisr Ali 'Ubayd, in 14 A.H. al-Ist'āab, biography No. 2455, vol.2, p. 83. al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 61.

⁵ Al-Tabari, vol. 2, pp. 443 & 444. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadīd, vol. 1, pp. 130-134 & vol. 2, p. 819. The biography of 'Usayd Ibn Khudayr has already been referred to in an earlier footnote.

⁶ Al-Riyaad al-Nadira, vol. 1, p. 218, Egypt, 2nd ed. of 1372 A.H. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p. 132, vol. 6, p. 293. Tarikh al-Khamees, vol. 2, p. 169 ed. by Sha'baan Organization, Beirut (b.t.).

of the Messenger of Allah¹(1)7, and they had gathered to give their allegiance to 'Ali.²8(2) So, Abu Bakr sent 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab to drive them out of Fatimah's house, and told him: "If they refuse, fight them." So, he brought a fire-wood with the intent to burn the house. Fatimah stopped them and asked: "O son of al-Khattaab! Have you come to burn our house?" 'Yes,' he said, "yes or you accept what the 'Ummah has already accepted."³9(3)

In Ansaab al-Ashraaf, it is said: "Fatimah stopped him at the door and said: 'O son of al-Khattaab! Are you going to burn my door?' 'Yes,' he said."⁴(4)10

To this 'Urwah Ibn al-Zubair was referring when he apologized on behalf of his brother, Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair, concerning what had happened between him and "Banu Hashim and how he had blocked them in the gorge, and gathered wood to burn them... to have them obey him. So, Banu Hashim were terrified, and wood was gathered to burn them because they refused to give their allegiance in the past."⁵(5)1 By this, he was referring to what had formerly happened to Banu Hashim concerning the wood and the fire, when they refused to give their allegiance to Abu Bakr.

In this context, the "Poet of the Nile", Hafiz Ibrahîm, said:

A saying 'Umar said to 'Ali

Noble its hearer, great its sayer:

"I would burn your house to destroy you in it,

If you would not give your allegiance, even if in it was

The daughter of the (Prophet) Mustafa !

No one but Abu Hafs ['Umar] would say it⁶(6)2

Before the warriors and Protector of 'Adnan!

¹ Al-Ya'qubi, vol. 2, p. 126.

² Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 1, p. 134. Ibn Shuhnah in al-Kaamil's margin, vol. 11, p. 113, whose text is: "and they moved towards 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib

³ Ibn 'Abd Rabbeh, vol. 3, p. 64. Tarikh Abu al-Fida', vol. 1, p. 167

⁴ Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 586; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 140; al-Riyad al-Nadira, vol. 1, p. 167. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 1, p.132 & vol. 6, p. 2. Tarikh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p.178. Abu Bakr al-Jawhari as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p. 136. Tarikh Ibn Shuhnah, p. 113 in al-Kaamil's margin, vol. 11, p. 113.

⁵ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol.2 p.100, also quoted by Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 20, p.48. (Iran ed.), commenting on 'Ali's saying: "al-Zubair was from us until his son grew up".

⁶ The collection of poetries of Hafiz Ibrahîm, ed. in Egypt.

Al-Ya'aqubi says: "They came in a group, attacked the house" then he says:

"His sword broke ['Ali's] and they entered the house."¹(1)3

Al-Tabari says: Umar Ibn al-Khattaab came to 'Ali's house. There were Talhah, al-Zubair and some men of the migrants. Al-Zubair came out with his sword unsheathed, but he tumbled over and the sword fell from his hand. They jumped upon him and arrested him."²(2)4

Abu Bakr al-Jawhari says: "... and 'Ali, while saying: 'I am the servant of Allah, the brother of the Messenger of Allah', was taken to Abu Bakr. he was told to give his allegiance. He said: 'I am more entitled to this affair than you. I would not give you my allegiance. It is you who should pay me your allegiance. You took this affair from the Ansar, on the pretext of your relation to the Messenger of Allah. So, they gave you the leadership and handed over to you the rule. I opt for the same argument which you resorted to against the Ansar. So be fair, if you fear Allah by yourselves, and acknowledge for us the like of which the Ansar had acknowledged for you, or else you will turn wrong doers, intentionally.' 'Umar said: 'You will not be allowed to go before giving your allegiance'.

'Ali told him: 'O 'Umar, milk you a milking of which half shall be yours. Consolidate the situation for him today so that he may return it to you tomorrow. Never, by Allah. I shall not accept your talk nor shall I follow it.' Abu Bakr said: 'If you do not give me your allegiance I will not force you to.' Abu 'Ubaydah said: 'O Abul Hasan, you are still young, while these are the elders of your people, Quraysh. You have neither experience nor knowledge of things as they have. I do not think but that Abu Bakr is stronger, more tolerant and apter to shoulder this affair than you. So, hand this matter over to him and accept him. If you lived long you would be deserving this affair and be worthy of it because of your merits, kinship, antecedents and participations in the holy war.'

'Ali said: 'O Migrants! Beware of Allah! Do not take Muhammad's authority from his circle and house to your circles and houses. Do not push his family away

¹ Al-Ya'aqubi, vol. 2, p. 126.

² Al-Tabari, vol. 2, pp. 443, 444 & 446. (Eu. ed. vol. 1, pp.1818, 1820; vol. 2, p. 822), quoted by al-'Aqqad in his Abqariyyaat 'Umar, p. 173. Muhib al-deen al-Tabari the breakage of al-Zubair's sword in al-Riyad al-Nadrah, vol. 1, p. 167; Tarikh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p. 188; Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 1, pp. 122, 132, 134, 58 and vol. 2, pp. 2-5; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 128

from its position and right among the people. O Migrants! By Allah, we, Ahl al-Bait, have more right to this affair than you have. Was not the receiver of the Book of Allah from among us, as was the well-versed in Allah's religion, the undertaker of the peoples' affairs? By Allah, it is ours, so do not follow (your) desires or you will be farther away from the truth.'

Bashir Ibn Sa'd said: 'Had the Ansar heard this from you before giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr, no two persons would have differed with you. But they have already paid their allegiance.' 'Ali returned home without giving his allegiance to Abu Bakr." This is narrated by Abu Bakr al-Jawhari, as in Ibn Abi al-Hadid's commentary on Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 2, pp. 2-5. He also narrated:

"Witnessing what happened to them ('Ali and al-Zubair), Fatimah stood at the door of the room and said: 'O Abu Bakr, how quick you raided the Ahl al-Bait of the Messenger of Allah! By Allah, I will never talk to 'Umar till I meet Allah!'"¹(1)1

In another narrative, it is said:

"Fatimah came out weeping and crying, and stopped the people."²(2)2

Al-Ya'qubi says: "... Fatimah came out and said: 'By Allah, you must go out or I will uncover my hair and cry out to Allah', They left, and those in the house left it."³(3)3

Al-Mas'udi says: "After the allegiance had been given to Abu Bakr in the Saqifah and renewed on Tuesday, 'Ali came out and said: 'You have misappropriated our affairs, did not consult us and did not care for our right.' Abu Bakr said: 'Yes, but I feared mischief.'⁴(4)4

Al-Ya'qubi says: "A group met 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, wanting to give him their allegiance. He said to them: 'Come back to me with your hair shaven.' But they did not turn up except three of them."⁵(5)1

'Ali, then took Fatimah, riding on a donkey, to the houses of the Ansar, at night, asking them to support him, and Fatimah pleading them to support him. They told

¹ As narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol.1, p.134 & vol. 2, pp. 2-5.

² Al-Saqifah by Abu Bakr al-Jawhari, as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p.134.

³ Tarikh al-Ya'qubi, vol. 2, p. 126.

⁴ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 1, p. 414; al-Imamah wa al-Siyaasah, vol. 1, pp. 12-14, with slight variation.

⁵ Tarikh al-Ya'qubi, vol. 2, p. 126, and in the Commentary on Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 2, p.4.

her: "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, we have already given our allegiance to the man. Had your cousin preceded Abu Bakr in approaching us, we could not have found none equal to him."

‘Ali said to them: "Were I, then, to leave the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) dead in his house unprepared, and go to the people to quarrel with them about his authority?"

Fatimah said: "Abul Hasan did only what he ought to do, while they did what they would be questioned about by Allah."¹(6)2

Mu‘awiyah had referred to this and to what we quoted from al-Ya‘qubi before it, as in his letter to ‘Ali:

"I do remember when you, the other day, carried your spouse at night on a donkey, holding your two sons, Hasan and Husain, by the hands, on the day Abu Bakr, the ṣSiddiq, was given the allegiance. You left none of the participants of Badr and the early Muslims without inviting them to yourself, walking to them with your wife and pressing on them with your two sons, seeking their support against the Companion of the Messenger of Allah. But none, except four or five, responded to you. By my life! Had you been in the right, they would have responded to you. But you said what was unknown and desired what was incomprehensible. Whatever I may forget, I shall not forget your telling (my father) Abu Sufyan, when he moved you and instigated you: ‘Had I found forty resolute men among them, I would have risen against these people.’"²(1)3

Mu‘ammar, quoted al-Zuhri, from ‘Umm al-Mu‘minîn ‘A’ishah, informing about what happened between Fatimah and Abu Bakr, in respect to the Prophet’s heritage, that she said: "Fatimah renounced him. She never talked to him till she died. She lived after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) for six months. When she died, her husband performed the funeral prayers upon her and buried her without informing Abu Bakr about her death and burial. ‘Ali had a face among the people during the life of Fatimah, but after her death, the people turned

¹ Abu Bakr al-Jawhary in his *Al-Saqîfah*, as narrated by Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 6, pp. 5-28, Egyptian ed. Ibn Qutaybah, vol. 1, p. 12

² Ibn Abi al-Hadîd, vol. 2, p. 67; al-Siffîn by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim, p. 182.

their faces away from 'Ali. Fatimah lived for six months after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), then she died."

Mu'ammār said: "A man asked al-Zuhri: 'Did 'Ali give no allegiance to him for six months?'" 'No,'¹4(2) said he, "and none from the Banu Hashim, until 'Ali gave his allegiance (to Abu Bakr). When 'Ali realized that the people have turned away from him, he tended to make peace with Abu Bakr... as the hadīth goes."²

Al-Balaadhuri says: "As the Arabs turned away from Islam, 'Uthman went to 'Ali and said: "O cousin! None is apt to fight this enemy, and you have not yet paid your allegiance," and he continued to pressurize him until Ali went to Abu Bakr and gave him his allegiance. The Muslims were glad to hear it and they were vigorous in the fight, and there were no more delegations."³(1)2

'Ali tended to make peace with Abu Bakr after the death of Fatimah and after that the faces were turned away from him. Nevertheless, he kept complaining of what had happened to him after the death of the Prophet ever during his Caliphate. He referred to his complaint in his well-known speech called al-Shiqshiqiyah, which shall be stated at the end of this chapter.

¹ In Tayseer al-Wusul it is said: "No, by Allah, and none of Banu Hashim either."

² I have summarized this hadīth from al-Tabari, vol. 2, p. 448 (Eu. ed. vol. 1, p.1825), Sahīh al-Bukhari, Book of the Battles, Chapter on "The Battle of Khaibar", vol. 3, p. 38; Saheeh Muslim, vol.1, p. 72 & vol. 5, p. 153; Chapter on the Prophet's saying: "We leave no heritage. What we leave is charity," Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, pp. 285-6. Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, vol. 3, p. 64. Ibn al-Athir stated it briefly in vol. 2, p. 126, in al-Ganji's Kefaaayah al-Ta'alib, pp. 225-6, Ibn Abi al-Hadīd, vol. 1, p. 122, al-Mas'udi, vol. 2, p. 414; In Muruj al-Dhahab, in al-Tanbīh wa al-'Ishraaf on p. 250 it says: "and 'Ali did not give his allegiance until Fatimah died,"; al-Sawa'iq al-Muhreqah, vol. 1, p. 2; Taarikh al-Khamees, vol. 1, p. 193; in al-Imaamah wa al-Siyaasah, vol. 1, p. 14, it is said: "'Ali did not pay him allegiance until after the death of Fatimah." She survived after him (her father) for 75 days", in al-Ist'aaab, vol. 2, p. 244: "'Ali did not give him his allegiance except after the death of Fatimah," Abu al-Fida', vol. 1, p. 156; al-Bid' wa al-Tarīkh, vol. 5, p. 66, Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 6, p. 586; in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 222 in the biography of Abu Bakr, it is said: "Their allegiance was after six months, as it is more correct," al-Ya'qubi in vol. 2, p. 126, says: "Ali did not give the allegiance except after six months," in al-Ghadīr, vol. 3, p. 102, quoting Ibn Hazm's al-Fasl, pp. 96-97: "We find that 'Ali, may Allah be pleased with him, delayed the allegiance by 6 months."

³ 1. Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 587

The Abstainers From Giving their Allegiance to Abu Bakr

a. Farwah Ibn 'Amr:

Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkar, in his *al-Muwaffaqayaat*, says: "Farwah Ibn 'Amr was among those who abstained from giving the allegiance to Abu Bakr. He participated in the holy war with the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and led two cavalries in the way of Allah, and used to give out of his date-palms fruits a thousand loads as charity every year. He was a nobleman, a companion of 'Ali and participated with him in the Battle of al-Jamal."

Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkar further says that Farwah blamed some of the Ansar for having supported Abu Bakr by giving him their allegiance.¹ (2)3

b. Khalid Ibn Sa'id al-'Umayy:

He was appointed by the Prophet as governor of San'a' in Yemen. On the death of the Prophet, he quit his post, and, together with his two brothers, Aban and 'Umar, returned home. Abu Bakr asked them: "Why did you abandon your posts? None has more right to governance than the agents of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Go back to your posts." They retorted: "We, the Banu 'Uhayhah, will not work for anybody after the Messenger of Allah."²(3)1

Khalid and his brother, Ab'an, delayed thier allegiance to Abu Bakr. He told Banu H'ashim: "Certainly, you are tall trees with the good fruits. We will follow you."³2(1) And "He waited with his allegiance for two months, saying: 'The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed me as governor, and did not depose me till he passed away. He met 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace beo on them both) and 'Uthman Ibn 'Affan and said:

¹ *al-Muwaffaqayaat*, p. 590. Farwah Ibn 'Amr al-Ansari al-Bayadi participated in the battles of al-'Aqabah, Badr and others with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, p. 178.

² Khalid Ibn Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas Ibn 'Umayyah Ibn 'Abd Shams. He was the third or the fourth of the persons who delayed giving his allegiance for six months."

³ 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, p. 82; Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 2, p. 125, Egypt, 1st ed.

‘O Children of Abd Manaaf! You gladly gave up your affair to the others to take it." Abu Bakr did not pay attention to him, while ‘Umar bore a grudge against him.¹(2)3

"He came to ‘Ali and said: "Come, I will give you my allegiance, as, by Allah, there is none among the people who is more entitled to have the place of Muhammad than you."²(3)4

"Then Abu Bakr dispatched his troops to al-Sham [Syria]. The first one he put in command to lead a quarter of them was Khalid Ibn Sa‘id. But ‘Umar kept telling him: ‘Would you make him a commander, whereas he did so and so, and said such and such?’ He (Umar) continued instigating Abu Bakr until he deposed him and replaced him by Yazid Ibn Abi Sufyan."³(4)5

c. Sa‘d Ibn ‘Ubaadah⁴(5)1

¹ Al-Tabari, vol. 2, p. 586 (Eu. ed. vol. 1, p.2079). Tahdhib Tarikh Ibn ‘Asaakir, vol. 5, p. 51; Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 588 also states that Khalid was among the first to accept Islam. Some said he was the fifth. Ibn Qutaybah in al-Ma‘arib, p. 128, says' "He accepted Islam before Abu Bakr." The same is said by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 2, p. 13. He was among those who had migrated to Abyssinia (al-Habasha). The Prophet appointed him and his two brothers as his agents on the charities of Madhhaj tribes. Thereafter, he appointed him as the governor of San'a' in Yemen" They returned after the Prophet's death. Later, all of them went to Syria where they were killed. Khalid was martyred on Saturday, two nights before the end of the month of Jamaadi al-'Ula circa 13 A.H. al-Isti'aab, vol. 1, pp. 398-400; al-Isaabah, vol. 1, p. 406; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, p. 82. Also refer Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 6, pp. 13 and 16.

² Al-Ya'qubi, vol. 2, p. 126

³ Al-Tabari, vol. 2, p. 586 (Eu. ed. vol. 1, p. 2079). Tadhîb al-Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 51. In Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 588, it is said: "Khalid Ibn Sa'id delayed his allegiance."

⁴ . Sa' d Ibn 'Ubaadah Ibn Dulaym Ibn Harithah Ibn Abi Khuzaymah Ibn Tha'labah Ibn Taarîf Ibn al-Khazraj Ibn Sa'idah Ibn Ka'b Ibn al-Khazraj al-Ansari. He participated in the Battle of al-'Aqabah and other battles with the Prophet except Badr, about which it is disputed whether he participated in it or not. He was very generous. He used to carry the banner of the Ansar on the Conquest Day. But when he shouted: "Today is the day of butchery, Today the women are captured:", the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) took the banner from him and gave it to his son, Qays. He did not pay allegiance to Abu Bakr till he was killed by two arrows in Syria, in 15 A.H. and was buried in Hawaarîn. His lineage is in Ibn Hazm's Jamharah, p. 65 and his biography is available in al-Isti'aab, vol. 2, pp. 23-27 and in al-Isaabah, vol. 2, pp. 27-28

It is stated that: "Sa'd was left alone for days, then he was sent for and told: 'Come, give your allegiance as people have already given theirs, including your kinsmen'. He said: 'By Allah I would not give it before throwing all the arrows in my quiver, painting the blade of my spear (with your blood), striking you with my sword as long as it is in my grip and fighting you with my household and those who follow me of my people. By Allah, if all the jinn gathered to back you together with all the humans, I would not give you my allegiance unless I am brought before my Lord to know my account.'"¹(1)2

When Abu Bakr was told about that, 'Umar said: "Do not leave him until he pays allegiance."

But Bashir Ibn Sa'd said: "He is obstinate in his refusal. He will never pay allegiance until he is killed, and he will not be killed unless his sons, his household and group of his tribe are killed too. So, leave him, as it will not harm you. He is but a single person."

Thus, heeding the advice of Bashir Ibn Sa'd, they heed his advice. Thenceforth Sa'd never performed his prayers with them nor did he meet them nor go to Hajj with them nor did he enter into any negotiations with them, etc." He continued to do so till Abu Bakr died and 'Umar took over".²(2)3

One day 'Umar, during his rule, met him in a street of al-Madinah. Umar called out to him: "O Sa'd!" "O 'Umar!" retorted Sa'd. 'Umar asked him: "Was it you who said so and so?" "Yes," said Sa'd, "it was I. Now it has been turned over to you. By Allah! Your friend was more likeable to us than you. By Allah! I now dislike (living) in your neighbourhood."

'Umar said: "Whoever dislikes the neighbourhood of somebody turns away from him." "I am not displeased with that," said Sa'd. "I am turning to the neighbourhood of someone who is better than you..."

¹ Al-Tabari, vol. 3, p. 459; Ibn al-Athir, vol. 2, p. 126, quoted the narration up to: "... leave him"; Kanz al- 'Ummal, vol. 3, p. 134, hadith: 2296; al-Imamah wa al-Siyaasah, vol. 1, p. 10; al-Seerah al-Halabiyyah, vol. 4, p. 397, after that it says: "... and he greeted none of those he met." al-Tabari, Eu. ed., vol.1, p. 1844.

² Al-Riyaadh al-Nadira, vol. 1, p. 168, besides other references

It did not take long before he left for Syria during the early days of 'Umar's reign" ...etc.¹(1)1

Al-Balaadhuri, in his narration says, "Sad Ibn Ubaadah did not pay his allegiance to Abu Bakr, and left for Syria. 'Umar sent a man, telling him: 'Invite him to give his allegiance and trick him into it. If he refuses, ask Allah's help against him.' The man travelled to Syria where he found Sa'd in an orchard in Hawaarin.²(2)2 He invited him to give his allegiance.

Sa'd said: "I will never give my allegiance to any Qurashi." "So I will fight you." the man said.

"Even if you did," replied Sa'd.

The man said: "Are you, then, rejecting what the Ummah has accepted?" "As regards the allegiance, yes, I reject it." The man then killed him with an arrow.³(3)3

It is in TabSeerah al-'Awaam that: "They sent Muhammad Ibn Maslamah al-Ansari, who threw at him an arrow (and killed him)."

It was also said that Khalid was in Syria at that time and he helped the man in that.⁴(4)4

Al-Mas'udi says: "Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah left for Syria without giving his allegiance. where he was killed in 15 A.H."⁵(5)5

Ibn Abd Rabbih narrated: "Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah was killed by an arrow which was found embedded in his body. It is said that a jinn had killed him.

Sa'd's son narrated: "He sat to urinate in a tunnel where he was attacked and he died on the spot. He was later found with his skin green in colour."⁶ In Usud al-

¹ Al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra of Ibn Sa'd, Section 3, vol. 2, p. 145; Ibn 'Asaakir's al-Tahdhib, vol. 6, p. 90, biography of Sa'd; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 134, No. 2296; al-Seerah Al-Halabiyah, vol. 3, p. 397

² . A known village near Aleppo - Mu'jam al-Buldaan.

³ Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 1, p. 589; Al-'Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, pp. 64-68 with a slight difference.

⁴ TabSeerah al-'Awaam, Tehran ed., p. 36.

⁵ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 6, pp. 301-302.

⁶ Al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, 3/Q vol. 2, p. 145; Al-Ma'arif by Abu Hanifah Ibn Qutaybah al-Daynuri, p. 113.

Ghaabah¹(7) it is said: "Sa'd gave his allegiance to neither Abu Bakr nor Umar. He went to Syria and stayed in Harraan until he died in 15 A.H. They were unanimous on finding him dead on his wash-basin, with his body turned green. They were unaware of his death until they heard somebody yelling from inside a well without seeing anybody" etc.

Thus, Sa'd Ibn 'Ubadah was neutralized. His murder was one of the incidents which the historians dislike to relate, and a group of them did not even mention it.²(1) Some others left out its details and ascribed it to the Jinn but did not cite the reason or enmity on account of which the latter killed Sa'd Ibn Ubaadah. Why did the arrow of the Jinn pierce the chest of Sa'd only and none of the other companions of the Prophet (in the history of Muslims)?

Had they completed their fable by alleging that the pious jinn disliked him for not giving his allegiance, so they threw at him two arrows which did not miss his heart, it would have been more fitting. The historians who said that Sa'd did not give the allegiance are:

Ibn Sa'd in his *al-Tabaqaat*, Ibn Jarir al-Tabari in his *Tarikh*, al-Balaadhuri in his *Ansaab al-Ashraaf* (vol. 1), Ibn 'Abd al-Barr in his *al-Isti'ab*, Ibn 'Abd Rabbih in his *al-'Iqd al-Farid*, Ibn Qutaybah in his *al-Imamah wa al-Siyaasah*, vol. 1, p.9, al-Mas'udi in his *Muruj al-Dhahab*, Ibn Haajar al-'Asqalaani in his *al-Isaabah*, Muhib al-Din al-Tabari in his *al-Riyaadh al-Nadira*, vol. 1, p. 168, Ibn al-Athir in his *'Usud al-Ghaabah*, vol. 3, p. 222, *Tarikh al-Khamees*, 'Ali Ibn Burhan al-Din in *al-Seerah al-Halabiyyah*, vol. 3, pp. 396-397 and Abu Bakr al-Jawhari, as quoted by Ibn Abi-Hadid.

The aforementioned was a summary of the narratives about Abu Bakr's caliphate and allegiance, as detailed in the book *'Abdullah Ibn Saba'*, vol. 1.

Hereunder is the narrative concerning Umar's caliphate.

'Umar's Caliphate and His Allegiance

¹ Sa'd's biography. *Al-Isti'ab*, 2/37.

² Such as Ibn Jarir, Ibn Kathir and Ibn al-Athir, in their *Tarikhs*.

Abu Bakr summoned 'Uthman to an exclusive meeting and told him: "Write down: In the Name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful. This is what Abu Bakr Ibn Abi Qahaafah had enjoined to the Muslims." Then he fainted and lost his senses. Uthman wrote, 'Surely I appoint Umar Ibn al-Khattaab is my successor in the Caliphate upon you. I spared you no good.' When Abu Bakr regained consciousness, he asked Uthman, 'Read for me'. 'Uthman read for him. Abu Bakr exclaimed: "Allah is the Greatest". I think you were afraid of possible discord among the people if I died in my unconsciousness." "Yes," affirmed 'Uthman. Abu Bakr said: "May Allah reward you good on behalf of Islam and its people." And Abu Bakr (may Allah Be pleased with him) endorsed it at that point. Earlier, it was said that 'Umar was sitting among the people with a list in his hand. There with him was Shadid, the slave of Abu Bakr, with a paper in which 'Umar was appointed as Caliph. 'Umar was calling: "O people! Hear and obey what the successor of the Messenger of Allah says. He says: I did not fell short of advising you."¹(3)3

How far this attitude of Abu Hafs ('Umar) was from his attitude in respect of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) demand to write his will!

The Consultation and 'Uthman's Allegiance

Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, in his al-'Iqd al-Farid, says:

When the Caliph 'Umar was stabbed, it was said to him: "If only you appointed your successor!" He said: "If Abu 'Ubaydah Ibn al-Jarraah was alive, I would have appointed him, and if my Lord questioned me I would say: Your Prophet said: "He is the trusted one in this nation." Had Saalem, the servant of Abu Hudhayfah been alive, I would have appointed him, and if My Lord questiond me, I would have said: "I heard your Prophet say: Saalem loves Allah so much that he would not disobey Him even if he did not fear Him."²(1)1

And they said to him: "Amirul Mu'minîn (commander of the Faithful), if only you appointed your successor!" He said: "I had decided, after my talk to you, to

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarîkh, Eu. ed. vol. 1, p. 2138.

² Al-'Iqd al-Farîd, vol. 4, p. 274, summarized

appoint as governor over you a man I hoped to help you in righteousness - and he pointed to 'Ali - But I saw it is not tolerable for me in life and in death..."¹(2)2 etc. Al-Balaadhuri, in *Ansaab al-Ashraaf*, says²(3)3: "'Umar said: 'call 'Ali, 'Uthman, Talhah, al-Zubair, 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf and Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqaas". He talked to none of them but 'Ali and 'Uthman. He said: "O 'Ali! Perhaps these (persons) will realize your relationship to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and (your being) his son-in-law, as well as what Allah has bestowed upon you of learning and knowledge. If you were to be in charge of this affair (Caliphate), fear Allah." Then he called 'Uthman and said to him: "O 'Uthman, perhaps these (persons) will realize your relationship to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and your age. If you were to be in charge of this affair, fear Allah, and do not impose the progeny of Abu Moeet (the Ummayyads) on to the people". Then he said: "Call Suhayb." When he was called in, he told him: "Lead the people in the prayers for three (days), and let these people consult in privacy in the house. If they agreed upon anyone of them. cut the head of any one who disagrees." When they left 'Umar, he said: "If they appointed the sparsely-haired (referring to Ali – peace be on him), he would take them along the (right) path."³(4)1

Al-Riyaadh al-Nadira (Egypt. 2nd ed. 1373 A.H. vol. 2, p. 95) states: "How excellent they would be if they appointed the little bald man, he would carry them aright, even if they put the sword to his neck." Muhammad Ibn Ka'b said: "I said: You know that of him and still you do not appoint him?" He said: "I did leave him out, as he had already been left out by the one who is better than me."

Al-Balaadhuri in *Ansaab al-Ashraaf*, vol. 5, p. 17, quoting al-Waaqedi, according to his authority, says: "'Umar mentioned whom he should appoint as his successor. He was told: "How could you forget 'Uthman?" He said: "If I did, he would impose the progeny of Banu Moeet on the people". It was said: "Al-Zubair?" He said: "(He is) a believer when contented and a disbeliever when angry." He was told: "Talhah?" He said: "His nose is turned up in the sky and his

¹ *Ansaab al-Ashraaf*, vol. 5, p. 16.

² *Ansaab al-Ashraaf*, vol. 5, p.16

³ Nearly the same is stated in Ibn Sa'd's *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, vol. 3 Q 1 p. 247. Also refer 'Umar's biography in *al-Isti'aab* and in *Muntakhab al-Kanz*, vol. 2 p. 429

bottom is the water." It was said: "Sa'd?" He said: "He is a man of warring people. A village is too much for him." It was said: "'Abd al-Rahman?" He said: "It suffices him to run his family."

Al-Balaadhuri, in vol. 5, p.18 of his *Ansaab al-Ashraf*, narrates that: "When 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab was stabbed, he ordered Suhayb, the servant of 'Abdullah Ibn Jud'an, to summon the heads of the Emigrants and the Ansar. When they came to him, he said: 'I referred your matter (of caliphate) to a council of six persons from among the early Emigrants with whom the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was pleased at the time of his death, so that they may choose one of them to lead you' and he named them. Thereafter, he told Abu Talhah, Zayd Ibn Suhayl al-Khazraji: 'Choose fifty men of the Ansar to be with you. When I die, urge these persons to choose for themselves and for the nation one of them. They should not delay it for more than three (days).' He also ordered Suhayb to lead the prayers until they agree upon an Imam. Talhah Ibn 'Ubaydillah was absent in his estate in al-Suraat¹(1)1.

'Umar said: "If Talhah did not return within the three days, don't wait for him, and conclude the affair by paying your allegiance to the one you agree upon. Should any one disagree, behead him." They sent a messenger to Talhah exhorting him and asking him to hasten his return. But he could get there only after the death of 'Umar and allegiance was paid to 'Uthman. So, he remained in his house, sulking: "Do they lie to one like me?" 'Uthman called on him. Talhah said to him: "If I took it back, would you give it back?" "Yes," said 'Uthman. "I endorse it, then," said Talhah and gave his allegiance to him. Nearly the same is stated in al-'Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, p. 73.

It is also narrated on page 20 of the above reference: "...then Abdullah Ibn Sa'd Ibn Abi Sarh (the foster brother of Usman) said: 'I was constantly afraid that this affair (of caliphate) will collapse till Talhah did what he did (i.e. paid allegiance), since they were relatives. 'Uthman remained generous to Talhah, until he was encircled. At that, he became the severest against him." Al-Balaadhuri, in his

¹ As-Surat: The nountain at a side of which at-Ta'if is situated there are other places which take the same name. Mu'jamul Buldan.

Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 5, p. 18, quoting Ibn Sa'd, says: "'Umar said: 'Let the minority follow the majority, and whoever disagrees, cut off his head.'"

On page 19, quoting Abu Mikhnaf, he says:

"'Umar ordered the shura (the council) to confer about the affair for three days. If two of them agreed upon one of them, and two of them agreed upon another, let them confer again. If four of them agreed upon one of them, with one of them disagreeing, they should be with the four. If they were three against three, they should be with the three including Ibn 'Auf, as he is trusted concerning his piety and opinion, and safe to be chosen for the Muslims." Nearly the same is stated in al-'Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, p. 73.

It also narrates, quoting Hisham Ibn Sa'd, who quoted Zayd Ibn Aslam, who quoted his father, saying that 'Umar said: "If they agreed three to three, follow those with Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf. Hear and obey." This was also stated in Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, 3/Q, vol. 1, p. 43.

In al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 160, it is stated: Al-Balaadhuri, in his Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 5, p. 15, says that 'Umar said: "Some say that Abu Bakr's allegiance was an error whose evil Allah had warded off, and that 'Umar's allegiance was without consultation. So, it will be with consultation after me. If four agreed, let the two follow the four. If they agreed three to three, let them follow the opinion of Abdur-Rahman Ibn 'Awf, in totality. If Abd al-Rahman clapped one hand on the other, then follow him."

Al-Muttaqi in Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 3, p. 160, quoting Muhammad Ibn Jubayr, who quoted his father, narrates that 'Umar said: "If Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf clapped one hand on the other, pay him your allegiance."

'Umar is quoted by Aslam to have said: "Give your allegiance to the one whom Abd al-Rahman gives his. Whoever disagrees, cut off his head!!"

From all that has been stated, it is clearly obvious that Umar had placed the decision of candidature in the hands of Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf, having conspired with him to put for the allegiance the condition that the elected one should follow the example of "The Two Elders" [Abu Bakr and 'Umar] in his ruling. They knew, however, that Ameer al-Momineen 'Ali (peace be on him) would refuse to follow the practice of "The Two Elders" on the same footing as the Book of Allah and the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah,

and that ‘Uthman would agree and he would be given the allegiance, (and since) ‘Ali would disagree, and he would be threatened to death.

As a proof of what we say, besides what had already been mentioned, is what Ibn Sa‘d in his *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, quoting Sa‘id Ibn al-‘Aas, says, and which we summarize hereunder:

Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas came to the Caliph 'Umar and asked him to give him more land as he wanted to expand his house. The Caliph promised him to do so after the morning prayers. Then he went with him to his house. Sa' id says: "He increased it by drawing a line with his foot. I said: 'O Amirul Mu'minîn! Give me more, as I have large number of children and family members.' He said: 'Enough for you. Let me tell you a secret. There will take over after me someone who will observe your kinship and will meet your needs.' Then he said: 'The Caliphate of 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab continued until 'Uthm'an was appointed through a consultation and by consent. He obliged me, favoured me, fulfilled my needs and shared with me his trust.'"¹(1)

Therefore, 'Umar had informed Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas that one of the relatives of Sa'id would succeed him in the Caliphate viz. 'Uthman, and asked him to keep it a secret. From the above conversation, it is clear that the question of appointing 'Uthman as Caliph had been decided during 'Umar's lifetime. As to the nomination of a six-membered council, it was merely a hoax to show the people that it was a consensus by the elite of the society so that the masses would agree.

Regarding exposing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) for assassination, it is proved - besides what has already been stated - by what is narrated by Ibn Sa'd in his biography of Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas. He says: "'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab asked Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas: What is the matter with you? I see you are avoiding me as if it was I who killed your father? I did not. It was 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib who did it!'" The matter of fact was that 'Ali (peace be on him) did kill him (Sa'id's father) in the Battle of Badr.

Does this not mean an instigation against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and a stirring rancor towards him?

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) knew that the Caliphate had been snatched from him again

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) did know that the caliphate had been kept away from him, yet he took part with them in the council so that nobody could allege: "He

¹ . Look up the biography of Sa'id Ibn al-Aas in al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Eu. ed., vol. 5, pp. 20-22.

himself did not want it." The evidence that he was aware of the conspiracy against him is derived from the following narrative:

Al-Balaadhuri in his *Ansaab al-Ashraaf*, vol. 5, p.19, narrates:

‘Ali complained to his uncle al-‘Abbas about ‘Umar’s saying: "Be with those who have ‘Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Awf with them," and told him: "By Allah, the affair has gone out of our hands." al-Abbas said: "How do you say so, my nephew?" ‘Ali told him: "Sa’d would never disagree with his cousin, ‘Abd al-Rahman, and Abd al-Rahman, like ‘Uthman and his brother-in-law, would never disagree with one another, and even if al-Zbayr and Talhah were with me I would not benefit by it if Ibn ‘Awf was with the other three." Ibn al-Kalbi says that Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Awf was the husband of Umm Kulthum, daughter of ‘Uqbah Ibn Abi Mu‘eet. Her mother was Arwa daughter of Kurayz and Arwa was ‘Uthman’s mother. That is why ‘Ali said: "and his brother-in-law."

Al-‘Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, p. 74, states a similar narrative.

On page 21, it also states, quoting Abu Mikhnaf:

"After burying ‘Umar, the members of the council, led by Abu Talhah, did nothing. The next morning Talhah started rounding them up to discuss in Daar al-Maal (the treasury). ‘Umar was buried on Sunday, the fourth day after his being stabbed. Suhayb Ibn Sinaan performed his funeral prayers. So, when Abd al-Rahman saw them whispering and discussing, every one trying to push his companion away from it, he told them: O you! I take myself and Sa’d out of this, provided I chose one of you four, since there was much whispering and argument, while the people are waiting to know their Caliph and Imam, because some of those who are waiting, have come from other towns and need to return home. They all responded to the suggestion, except ‘Ali who said: ‘I will see.’

Abu Talhah came to them, ‘Abd al-Rahman informed him about the suggestion and that it was accepted by all, except ‘Ali. So, Abu Talhah turned to ‘Ali and said: ‘O Aba Hasan! Abu Muhammad is trusted by you and by the Muslims. So, why do you disagree, now that he had rejected it for himself, he would never undertake to shoulder the sin of someone else?’ Then, ‘Ali told Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Awf to swear that he would not be attracted by desire, to prefer the right, to exert himself for the ummah and to be impartial towards relatives (i.e. not to

indulge in nepotism). He (Abd al-Rahman) promised accordingly. ‘Ali said: ‘Then choose, you may be well-guided.’ This took place in Daar al-Maal, or, it is said, in the house of al-Miswar Ibn Makhramah.

Then Abdur-Rahman told each one of them to swear to him with solemn oaths, and took their covenants and promises, that they would not disagree with him when he gave his allegiance to any one of them, and that they should back him against the one who may oppose him. They duly complied. Thereafter, he held ‘Ali’s hand and said to him: ‘The oath and covenant by Allah’s attestation are binding on you. If I gave you my allegiance, you will not impose the Banu ‘Abd al-Muttalib on the people, that you will follow exactly the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and will never deviate from it nor fall short of it’. ‘Ali said: ‘I will neither accept a covenant nor give a promise for something which none can attain. Who is it who can bear to carry on a conduct similar to the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)? But I will follow his conduct as best as I can and as much as is in my power and knowledge.’ Abd al-Rahman let go his hand, and turned to ‘Uthman and asked him to swear and pledge that he would not impose the Banu Umayyah on the people and to follow the example of the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr and ‘Umar, and that he would not deviate from them. ‘Uthman promised (as asked). ‘Ali said: "Abu ‘Abdillah has given you his assent, so, it is upto you now. Give him your allegiance. But ‘Abd al-Rahman once again turned to ‘Ali, took his hand and asked him to swear similarly not to deviate from the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr and ‘Umar. ‘Ali said: ‘Upon me is to make every effort’, while ‘Uthman said: ‘Yes, I give my pledge and a promise attested by Allah, and the strongest covenants taken by Him from His Prophets, that I shall not do contrary to the conducts of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr and ‘Umar, in any thing not to be short of them.’ So, Abd al-Rahman gave his allegiance to ‘Uthman, shook hands with him, and so did the others. ‘Ali, who was standing, sat down. Abdur-Rahman told him: ‘Give your allegiance or I will behead you.’ But none of them had a sword. It is said that ‘Ali went out angrily. The members of the council caught him and said: ‘Give your

allegiance or we will fight against you.' He came with them walking to 'Uthman and paid allegiance to him." (Unquote)

There is an omission in this narrative, at the beginning of Abd al-Rahman's saying: "and the conduct of the two elders" narrating the beginning of the Imam 'Ali's words, and distortion and omitting some of its end.

The entire narrative is in the following tradition: Al-Ya'qubi, in his *Tarikh*, vol. 1, p. 162, says:

"Abd al-Rahman met 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib alone and said to him: 'We ask you, by Allah, if you got this affair, to lead us according to the Book of Allah, the Sunnah of His Prophet and the conduct of Abu Bakr and 'Umar.'" He said: 'I will lead you according to the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Prophet as I can.' He then spoke to 'Uthman alone and said to him: 'We ask you, by Allah, if you got this affair, to lead us according to the Book of Allah, the Sunnah of His Prophet and the conduct of Abu Bakr and 'Umar.' He said: 'Agreed! I will lead you according to the Book of Allah, the sunnah of His Prophet and the conduct of Abu Bakr and 'Umar.'" Once again he talked to 'Ali alone and told him as before, and he got the same reply. Then he again talked to 'Uthman alone and asked him the same question. He got the same answer from 'Uthman. Again he conferred with 'Ali alone and repeated to him his demand. 'Ali said: 'Allah's Book and the Sunnah of His Prophet do not need to be accompanied with the ways of anybody. You are trying your best to keep this (i.e. the caliphate) away from me.' He again conferred with 'Uthman and repeated the same thing, to hear the same reply. He clapped his hands."

In al-Tabari's *Tarikh*, vol. 3, p. 297, referring to the events of the year 23 A.H. (and also in Ibn al-Athir's *Tarikh*, vol. 3, p. 37), Imam 'Ali said to 'Abd al-Rahman, when he gave his allegiance on the third day: "You have granted him a life-time grant. This is not the first time you (all) support one another against us. But (mine) is good patience, and it is Allah whose help is sought for against what you describe. By Allah, you did not appoint 'Uthman but to have him return it to you. **And Allah is every day in a (different) state.**" This is also stated in al-'Iqd al-Farid, vol. 3, p. 76, in "The Second 'Iqd" concerning the Caliphs and their history, No.5.

Allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him)

‘Uthman was killed and the affair of the Muslims returned to them, relieved from every former allegiance that chained them. They rushed to ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him), asking his hand so that they may pay allegiance to him. Al-Tabari in this respect says¹(1)1: "The Companions of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) came to him and said: ‘This man had been killed and the people must have an Imam. Today, we find no one to have more right to this than you, neither in priority nor in being nearer to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).’"

He said: ‘Do not do it, because I am better as an advisor than as a ruler.’ They said: ‘No, by Allah, we shall do nothing before giving you our allegiance.’ He said: ‘Then let it be in the mosque. My allegiance is not to be in secret, and cannot be except by the consent of the Muslims...'” Another narration, quoting other authorities, says:

"The Emigrants and the Ansar, including Talhah and al-Zubair, gathered and came to ‘Ali and told him: ‘O Aba Hasan! Let us give you our allegiance.’"

He said: ‘I don’t need your affair. I am with you. I will accept whomever you may choose, so, choose.’

They said: ‘By Allah, we shall choose none but you.’

It is said that after the murder of ‘Uthman, people frequented him several times, at the last of which they came to him and said: ‘The people cannot do well except under a leadership, and the matter has been waiting long.’

He told them: ‘You have come to me frequently. I am telling you some thing, if you accept it, I will agree your affair, or else, I am not in need of it.’

They said: ‘We shall accept what you say, Allah willing.’ Thereafter, he came and ascended the pulpit while the people had gathered and addressed:

‘I have disliked your affair but you insisted me to rule you. Truly, I can have no command without you. The keys of your property are with me, but I am not to take a dirham of it without your assent. Do you agree?’

They said: ‘Yes.’

¹ Al-Tabari vol. 5, pp.152-153, Eu. ed. vol.1, p. 3066; Kanz al-‘Ummal, vol. 3, p. 161, Hadith No. 2471, relates in details ‘Ali’s allegiance, the coming of Talhah and al-Zubair, and his refraining from accepting the allegiance. It is also detailed in Ibn A’tam’s Tarikh, pp. 160-161.

He said: 'O Allah! Be witness against them.' Then he accepted their allegiance accordingly."

Al-Balaadhuri narrates¹(1)1: "'Ali went home. All the people hurried to him, the companions of the Prophet and others, shouting: 'Amirul Mu'minîn is 'Ali,' until they entered his house, They said to him: 'We give you our allegiance. Hold out your hand, as there must be an Emir.'

'Ali said: 'This is not up to you, it is up to the people of Badr [meaning those who partook in the Battle of Badr.] Whoever was accepted by them would be the Caliph.' So, there remained none of the Badris unless he came to 'Ali, telling him: 'We find none to have more right to this than you.' Observing this, 'Ali ascended the pulpit. The first one to reach out to him and pay his allegiance with his hand was Talhah, who had one of his fingers paralyzed. So 'Ali felt pessimistic about it and said: 'How apt he is to break his allegiance!'"

Al-Tabari narrated²(2)1: "Habeeb Ibn Dhu'ayb looked at Talhah while he was paying his allegiance and said: 'The first to pay allegiance is a paralyzed hand. This affair will not be concluded.'" (Unquote)

*

Having studied the historical reality of the establishment of the government in the early days of Islam, we shall study hereunder the opinions of the two Schools about Caliphate and Imamate, starting with the opinion of the School of Caliphate.

¹ Ansaab al-Ashraaf, vol. 5, p. 70; Al-Haakem in al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 114 narrates that 'Ali felt Talhah's allegiance to be bad omen.

² Al-Tabari, vol. 5, p. 153 and Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 3048

Chapter Two

The Discussions of the School of Caliphate about Imamate

- The Opinion of the School of Caliphate and its Proofs –
 - The Opinions of the Followers of School of Caliphs
- Obeying the Imam is Obligatory even if he Contradicts the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)
- The Reasoning of the Followers of the Caliphate School During Recent Centuries
- Terms of Discussion in Imamate and the Caliphate
- Studying the Opinions of the School of Caliphs Concerning Caliphate
- **First**: Discussing "Consultation" as a proof
- Taking consultation as a proof with reference to the Book of
- Allah and His Prophet's Sunnah.
- **Second**: Discussing Allegiance as a Proof.
- **Third**: Discussing Taking the Companions' Acts as a Proof.

- Discussing Taking Consultation, the Allegiance and Acts of the Companions as proofs.
- **Fourth**: Discussing the reasoning that the Caliphate is Established through Force and Subjugation.
- Obeying an Unjust Imam who acts Contrary to the Prophet's sunnah
- Conclusion

The Opinion of the School of Caliphate and its proofs

First: The Caliph Abu Bakr said¹(1)1:

"This affair cannot be except for this branch of Quraysh. They are the highest of Arabs in lineage and family. I recommend to you either of these two: 'Umar or Abu 'Ubaydah, so, give your allegiance to the one you please."²(2)2

Second: The Caliph 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab said³(3)3:⁴

Let nobody be so deceived to say that Abu Bakr's allegiance was an error that came to an end. Actually, it was so but Allah warded off its evil. None of you is so respected as is Abu Bakr. Whoever gives his allegiance without having consulted the Muslims, both the giver and the taker of the allegiance should be killed."⁵ (2)1

¹ Abu Bakr: Abdullah Ibn Abi Qahaafah, 'Uthman Ibn 'Amir al-Qarashi al-Tamimi. His mother: 'Umm al-Khayr Salmah (or Laylah), the daughter of Sakhr al-Tamimi. He was born two or three years after the Year of the Elephant (Aam al-Feel). He was the Prophet's Companion in his migration to Madinah and settled in al-Sunh, outside the town. He used to milk the cattle for the people of his locality, until he was elected as Caliph. He moved into the town after six months from his Caliphate. He died in 13 A.H. He had been quoted by the authors of the Sehaah for 142 hadiths.

Look up his biography in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and in Ibn al-Athir's al-Tarikh, vol. 2, p.163, and in Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 278.

² Al-Bukhari, Book of al-Hudud, Chapter on "Stoning a Pregnant Woman", vol. 4, p.120.

³ Abu Hafs, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab Ibn Nufayl al-Qarashi al-'Adawi. His mother: Hantamah daughter of Hashim (or Hisham) Ibn al-Mughirah al-Makhzumi. He adopted Islam in his early fifties in Makkah. He participated in the Battle of Badr and the following battles. Abu Bakr, during his illness that cause his death, appointed him as his successor. He was buried in the month of Muharram, 24 A.H., next to Abu Bakr. He was quoted by the authors of the Sehaah in 537 hadiths.

His biography is in al-Ist'aaab, Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 276

⁴ Al-Bukhari, book of al-Hudud, Chapter on "Stoning a Pregnant Woman," vol. 4, p. 120.

⁵ Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah by Abu Hasan 'Ali Ibn Muhammad al-Basri al-Baghdadi, 2nd Ed. of 1356 A.H. pp. 7-11. He was one of the Shafi'i jurists and authored several books.

The Opinions of the Followers of the School of Caliphate

The Chief Justice al-Maawardi (d. 450 A.H.) in his *al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah* and Imam titled 'Allamah al-'Asr (the most learned of his time), the judge Abu Ya'laa (d. 458 H.)¹, (3)²

in his *al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah*, both had said in their books: "The Imamate is concluded in two ways: one is through the selection of the elite of the society (ahl al-hall wa al-aqd) and the other is decided by the nomination of the former Imam.

As to its being concluded through the elite of the society (ahl al-hall wa al-aqd), the scholars have differed about the number of men who can conclude the Imamate with one of them, according to different groups. A group said:

"It cannot be concluded except through the masses of the notables of each region where the acceptance of the Imam is general and the submission to him is unanimous." This opinion is refuted by Abu Bakr's allegiance as a Caliph by the selection of those who were present, not waiting for those who were absent.

Another group said: "The least number which can conclude the Imamate is five persons who gather to conclude it, or one of them concludes it on behalf of the other four. This is proved by two points: One is that Abu Bakr's allegiance was concluded by five persons who gathered for it, and then they were followed by the people. They were: 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, Abu 'Ubaydah Ibn al-Jarraah²(1)2, 'Usayd Ibn Hudayr, Bashir Ibn Sa'd³(2)3 and Salim⁴(3)4, slave of

¹ . *Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah* by Shaykh Abu Ya' la, Muhammad Ibn Hasan al-Farra al-Hanbali, 1st Ed. Egypt, 1356 A.H., pp. 7-11. We depended more on these than on other books of the School of Caliphate because such books, like *Kitabul Kharaaj* by Abu Yusuf, had been written to register the rules concerning governance according to the Caliphate School in order to be practised, unlike the books which had been written for argumentation, not for application. Whatever we quote hereunder will be from both of them. Should the quotation be from one of them, we shall state it in the footnote.

² Abu 'Ubaydah, 'Amir Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn al-Jarraah. He was a grave-digger in Makkah. He attended the Battle of Badr and the following battles. He died because of plague in 'Amwas (a village near Jerusalem) in 18 A.H. He was quoted by the authors of the *Sehaah* for 14 hadiths. His biography is in *'Usud al-Ghaabah*, Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 284, and Ibn Sa'd's *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, Eu. ed. vol. 2, p. 2174

Abu Hudhayfah. The other is 'Umar who appointed a six member council, so that they may appoint any one with the consent of five. This is the opinion of the majority of the jurists and the theologians of Basrah.

Others from the people of Kufah said:

"A caliph can be appointed by three with the consent of the other two so that one can be the ruler and the other two as witnesses like a marriage contract which would be valid with the consent of the guardian and two witnesses."

Another group said:

"He can be appointed by a single person because al-'Abbas¹(4)1 said to 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him): Hold out your hand so as to give you allegiance. So the people will say: 'The uncle of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) has paid allegiance to his cousin.' So, there will be no dispute about you because it is a judgement, and the judgement of one (judge) is valid."²(1)2

³ Bashir Ibn Sa'd Ibn Tha'labah al-Khazraji. It is said that he was the first to give his allegiance to Abu Bakr and he envied Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah. He was killed with Khalid on 'Ayn al-Tamr day. An-Nesaa'i quoted him in his Sunan. Look up Abdullah Ibn Saba', vol. 1, p. 96, al-Taqrīb and Usud al-Ghaabah

⁴ Abu 'Abdillah, Salim, slave of Abu Hudhayfah Ibn 'Utbah Ibn Rabi'ah al-'Umawi. He was from Istakhr, Persia. He was set free by Thabitah al-Ansariyyah, Abu Hudhayfa's wife, then Abu Hudhayfah adopted him. Thus, he was counted among the Emigrants. He emigrated to al-Madīnah before the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He used to lead the prayers in that town for the Emigrants, including 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, as he was the best to recite the Holy Qur'an. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) announced him and Ma'adh of the Ansar as brothers. He was killed on the Day of al-Yamaamah. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah.

¹ Abul Fadl, al-Abbas Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib. His mother: Natilah, daughter of Khabbaab al-Nimri. He participated in the Bay'ah al-'Aqabah with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He was captured in the Battle of Badr, ransomed himself and his brother's sons, 'Aqīl and Nawfal. Migrated to Madinah before the conquest of Makkah, during which he was present. In the year of al-Ramadah - the year of drought and famine, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab sought rain from Allah through the intercession of al-'Abbas. He died in 32 A.H. The authors of the Sehaah quoted 35 narrations from him. His biography is recorded in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 281

² Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah by al-Maawardi, pp. 6 & 7.

As to the conclusion of the Imamate, if it was assigned by the former Imam (to the next), it is unanimously said to be lawful. It was regarded valid for two reasons practised by the Muslims and was irrefutable. The first was that Abu Bakr entrusted it to 'Umar. Thus, his entrustment was confirmed by the Muslims. The second was that 'Umar had entrusted it to the members of a council..., till he says: 'Because 'Umar's allegiance did not depend on the companions' consent, as the Imam had more right to it.'¹(2)3

He also mentioned that the scholars differed about the necessity of knowing the Imam. Some said:

'It is compulsory for all people to know the Imam by name and in person just as it is incumbent upon them to know Allah and His Messenger.'

Then he said:

"What is commonly known among the people is that to know the Imam is obligatory for all, in general, not in detail"²(3)1

The Chief Qazi, Abu Ya'laa al-Farra' al-Hanbali, in al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyya³ (4), adds to what had already been mentioned that some others say: "It is confirmed by force and conquest, and there is no need for appointment," and "Whoever overpowered them by the sword and became caliph and was called the Chief of the Faithful (Ameer al-Momineen), none who believes in Allah and in the Last Day is allowed to pass the night without acknowledging him as an Imam. Regardless of him (the Imam) being pious or impious, he is the Chief of the Faithful (Amir al-Mu'minin)."

Concerning the Imam against whom an opponent rises to get the authority, and there appears a group backing this side and another group backing the other side, he says that "The Friday prayers should be led by the conquerer". He argued that 'Umar's son had led the people of al-Madinah in the prayers on the Day of Harrah, saying: "We are with those who have overcome (and are victorious)."⁴(5)2

¹ . Ibid., p. 10. It seems from what they say that they confess what had happened as to be religious. They do not disagree on this and the disagreement is only in the method of what occurred.

² . Ibid., p. 15.

³ Al-Ahkam al-Sultaniyyah, pp. 7-11.

⁴ Ibid., pp. 7 & 8. In another ed., pp. 20-23. 'Umar's son is Abdullah Ibn 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab. His mother is Zaynab, the daughter of Maz'un al-Jumahiyyah. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) found him too young in the

Imamul Haramayn, al-Juwayni(d. 478 H.) in his book al-Irshad, Ch. on "election, its description and what Imāmate can be concluded with", says: "Know that unanimity is not a condition for an Imamate contract, as it can be concluded even if the ummah were not unanimous about it. The evidence to this is that when the Imamate was concluded with Abu Bakr, he immediately started judging for the Muslims, without waiting for the news of his Imamate to spread out to reach the Companions who lived in remote regions, and this was not opposed by any body, and nobody asked him to wait. So, if unanimity was not a condition for concluding an Imamate contract, no particular number can be set for that either. Therefore, the Imamate can be concluded by a single person of the people of rank and high social standing."¹(1)1

The Imam Ibn al-‘Arabi (d. 543 H.) said:

"It is not necessary for an Imam’s allegiance to be by all the people. It suffices if there are two or one persons."²(2)2

The jurist, Shaykh, Imam, and learned narrator, al-Qurtubi (d. 671 A.H.), in the 8th Question explaining the verse: **"I am going to appoint a caliph in the earth"** (Surah al-Baqarah (2): Verse 30), says: "If it was concluded by a single person from the elite of the society, it would be confirmed and binding on others, contrary to the one who said: ‘It cannot be concluded except by a group of people from the elite of the society’. Our evidence is that ‘Umar concluded the allegiance

Battle of Uhud but he took part in the later battles. Many narrations have been quoted about he praising himself and his father. He gave his edicts for sixty years after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). It is said that he was a good converser, but not learned in jurisprudence. He did not participate with ‘Ali in any of his battles but later repented about it at his death, saying: "I blame myself for nothing in this world except for not fighting against the rebels of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib." He was poisoned by al-Hajjaaj Ibn Yusuf al-Thaqafi who ordered someone to stab his foot with a poisoned spear in a crowd. He died in 73 A.H. The authors of the Sehaah have recorded 2630 hadīths from him. See Usud al-Ghaabah, Seyar al-A’laam al-Nubalaa’ and Jawaame ‘al-Seerah, p. 275 for his biography.

¹ Al-Irshad fi al-Kalam by Imam al-Haramayn ‘Abd al-Malik Ibn ‘Abdillah al-Juwayni, Cairo ed. 1369 A.H., p. 424.

² Imam Abu Bakr Muhammad Ibn Abdillah al-Ishbīli, known as "Ibn al-‘Arabi", in his commentary on Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 229.

with Abu Bakr and none of the Companions opposed it. So, there is no necessity for there being a number of people for its conclusion, like any other contract."

Imam Abu al-Ma'ali says: "If the Imamate is concluded by a single person, it will be binding and it is not allowed to depose him without an incident or a change." he added: "This is unanimously accepted."

In the 15th Question of the commentary on this verse, he says, "If the Imamate was concluded by the consensus of the society's elite, or by a single person, as stated before, it would be incumbent on everybody to give his allegiance to him."¹(1)3

The most learned of the judges, 'Adud al-deen al-Eeji (d. 756 A.H.), in his book *al-Mawaaqif*, concerning "The third subject about what confirms the Imamate", says, in brief: "It is confirmed by the undisputable text of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) or by the former Imam. This is unanimously accepted. The allegiance that is concluded by the society's elite is confirmed, unlike the Shiites. Our evidence is the confirmation of the allegiance given to Abu Bakr."

He also said: "If the Imamate has taken place by selection and allegiance, then know that it would not require unanimity, since there can be no evidence of reason or hearing demanding that, as one or two of the people of the society's elite would be sufficient, depending on our knowledge that the Companions, strict as they were in religious matters, were satisfied with that, as they did in respect to the allegiance given by 'Umar to Abu Bakr, and that which was given by 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf to 'Uthman. They did not stipulate the condition of the unanimity of the people of the town, let alone the unanimity of the whole ummah. Nevertheless, nobody denied them that method, which had been followed during ages till our days."²(2)1

The commentators of al-Aiji's book, such as as-Sayyid ash-Sharif al-jurjani (d. 816 H.), confirmed his claim.³(3)2

¹ Al-Qurtubbi, Abu 'Abdillah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Abi Bakr Ibn Farah al-Ansari al-Khazraji al-Aandalusi, in his book *Jaame' al-Ahkam al-Qur'an*, ed. in Egypt, 1387 A.H., vol. 1, pp. 269 & 272.

² *Al-Mawaaqif fi 'Ilm al-Kalam*, Egypt ed. 1325 A.H., vol. 8, pp. 351-353 by al-Qadi 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Ahmad al-Eeji. He died in prison in 756 A.H.

³ As-Sayyid al-Sharif al-Jurjani, in his commentary on *al-Mawaaqif*, which was printed together with the book (*al-Mawaaqif*) in Egypt.

Obeying the Imam even if he contradicted the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

Muslim, in his Sahih, quoting Hudhayfah, narrates that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"After me there will be Imams who will not follow my wake, nor will they practise my sunnah; among them will be men with Satanic hearts in human bodies."* "What should I do?" asked Hudhayfa, "if I lived till that time?" "(You should) hear and obey the Emir (i.e. the unjust Imam). Even if he whipped your back and seized your property, you must hear and obey" he (peace be on him and his progeny) replied!!

Ibn 'Abbas was quoted to have heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) saying: *"Whoever sees from his Imam what he dislikes, let him be patient, as whoever parts from the community even for a span of space, and dies thus, his death will be that of paganism (jaahiliyyah)."*

Another narrative says: *"No one parts from the ruler (even) for a span of a hand and dies but that his death will be that of paganism."*

'Abdullah Ibn 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab is quoted to have said, concerning what was done in the Harrah by Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah (may Allah curse him): "I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *'Whoever withdraws his hand from obedience, will meet Allah on the Day of Resurrection with no excuse. Whoever dies without being bound by an allegiance will die the death of paganism.'*"¹ (1)3

In al-Nawawi's commentary, in Chapter on "Necessity of obeying the Emir without disobeying (Allah)", says: "The majority of jurists, narrators and

¹ Sahih Muslim, vol. 6, pp. 20-22, Book of "al-Emaarah", Chapter on "Necessity of adherence to the community." Hudhayfah is Ibn al-Yamaan al-'Absi. His father was wanted for murder during the Jaahiliyyah, so he ran away to al-Madīnah, where he married and pledged allegiance to Banu 'Abd al-Ashhal. He was called al-Yamaan because he pledged allegiance with al-Yamaniyyah, though his actual name was Hasal. He participated in the Battle of al-Khandaq and the later ones. 'Umar appointed him as the governor of al-Madaa'in. He died there 40 days after the Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) allegiance. He was quoted for 225 narrations by the authors of the Sehaah. Look up his biography in al-Ist'āab, Usud al-Ghaabah, al-Isaabah and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 277.

theologians of the Ahle Tasannun said: 'He cannot be deposed for deviation, injustice and rights violations. He cannot be deposed nor is it allowed to rise against him for the said reasons but he must be advised and frightened because of the quoted relevant narrations.'

Before that he said: "As to rise and fight against them (i.e. the unjust rulers), it is strictly prohibited by the consensus of the Muslims, even if they were deviated and transgressors. The traditions support this meaning. The people of the Sunnah unanimously say that the ruler cannot be deposed for deviating from the right path."¹(2)

Al-Qadi Abu Bakr Muhammad Ibn al-Tayyib al-Baaqilani (d. 403 A.H.) in his book at-Tamhid,²(3) Chapter on "On what necessitates deposing the Imam and the invalidity of the duty of obeying him," says, briefly: "The people of confirmation and the followers of narrations believe that: 'The Imam cannot be deposed because of deviation, wrongdoing, usurpation of property, unlawfully beating or killing people, dissipating the rights and suspending the penalties. He cannot be revolted against but he is to be admonished, frightened and disobeyed in some of his orders calling for disobeying Allah.' They base their argument on many supportive narrations quoting the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and his companions, denoting the necessity of obeying the rulers, even if they acted unjustly and usurp all properties, and that he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'Hear and obey even a mutilated or an Abyssinian slave, and perform your prayers behind every pious and impious.' It is also narrated that he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'Obey them (i.e. the unjust rulers) even if they appropriate your property and whip your back.'"

The Argument of the Later Followers of the Caliphate School

In recent centuries, most followers of the Caliphate school confirm the rightness of the post-rule of the Caliphs, arguing that it had been based on the caliph's consultation with the Muslims. Some of them infer from it that the Islamic rule today is also based on allegiance i.e. whoever is given the allegiance should become an Islamic ruler and must be obeyed by all Muslims.

¹ Vol. 20, p.229 of his commentary on Sahih Muslim. Look up Sunan al-Baihaqi, vol. 8, pp. 158 & 159.

² Printed in Cairo, 1366 A.H.

*

This was the opinion of the followers of the Caliphate School concerning the establishment of the Islamic rule and their evidences in support of their creed. Before studying their opinion and evidences, we ought to be acquainted with the specific terms to be used in the discussion as below:

The Terms Used in Discussing Imamate and Caliphate.

The discussion on Imamate and Caliphate revolves around the following seven terms:

- 1) Al-Shuraa (The Consultative Committee)
- 2) Al-Baiah (The Allegiance)
- 3) The Caliph (Allah's khalifah on the earth).
- 4) Amir al-Mu'minin (Commander of the faithful).
- 5) Al-Imam (The Divine Leader)
- 6) Al-Amr wa 'Ulul Amr. (The Affair and those holding authority)
- 7) Al-Wasi wa al-Wasiyyah (The successor and the succession)

1) Al-Shuraa (The Consultative Committee)

Al-Shuraa, in the language of the Arabs, means: to form an opinion through consultation.

consulted him = asked him for his opinion

Counselled him: advised him / gave him his opinion.

The Holy Quran says: "...**and their affair is a matter of consultation among them.**" (Surah Shuraa (42): Verse 38). So, this affair becomes a consultation if they counsel about it.

The meanings of the derivatives of this root do not change in the uses of the Glorious Qur'an, noble traditions or among the Muslims, as in the language of the Arabs. But the talk concerning counsel and consultation refers to their meanings and rules intended by the Islamic shari'ah as will be explained, if Allah wills.

2) Al-Baiah (The Allegiance):

a. The Allegiance in the language of the Arabs:

Allegiance, in the language of the Arabs, means a deal or an agreed Sale Deed¹.⁽¹⁾ They say: Clapped his hands, or on his hand, to denote the conclusion of the sale deal, i.e. he stroke one hand on the other at concluding the sale deal. Or they clapped their hands in concluding the sale.²⁽²⁾ This was the meaning of allegiance with the Arabs.

As to the covenant and the promise, the Arabs used to give their promises and conclude alliances in different methods, such as what Banu Abd Manaf did when they wanted to fight Banu 'Abd al-Daar in which one of them was to undertake the custody of the Ka'bah, giving drinks to the pilgrims and other offices of authority in Makkah (al-Mukarramah).

Ibn Is'haaq narrates that Banu 'Abd Manaf brought out a bowl of perfume and placed it in the mosque near the Ka'bah. They dipped their hands into it and pledged allegiance and exchanged with their allies words of promise, Thereafter, they wiped the Ka'bah with their hands as a token of confirmation. Thus, they were called the Mutayyabîn (the perfumed ones)³⁽³⁾

He also narrated vis-à-vis repairing the Ka'bah that when the reparations reached the "Corner", they disputed as to who would lift the "Stone" and put it back in its place, as each tribe wanted to have the honour of lifting it and putting it back to its place. There were arguments, controversies and preparations for fight each other. So, Banu 'Abd al-Daar brought a bowl of blood and concluded a death-alliance with Bani 'Uday Ibn Ka'b Ibn Lu'ay. They dipped their hands into the bowl of blood. From then onwards, they were called la'aqah al-dum (the lickens of blood).⁴⁽⁴⁾

b. Allegiance in Islam

The allegiance i.e. clapping the hands in Arabic literature, denotes the conclusion of a deal. In Islam, it became a sign of concluding a contract between the one who gives the allegiance and the one who receives it confirming loyalty and obedience of the giver to the receiver concerning what had been decided upon. The Glorious Qur'an says: **"Those who give you the allegiance. actually give the allegiance**

¹ Lisaan al-'Arab, root: sa-fa-qa.

² Lisaan al-'Arab, root: ba-ya-'a.

³ Seerah al-Nabavi of Ibn Hisham, vol. 1, pp. 141-143.

⁴ Ibid., vol.1, p. 213.

to Allah. Allah's hand is above their hands. Therefore, whoever breaks (it), he breaks (it) only against his own self, and whoever fulfills what he had pledged to Allah, He will grant him a great reward." (Surah Fath (48): Verse 10).

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) got the allegiance from the Muslims thrice, which were as follows:¹(1)4

1. The First Allegiance:

The first allegiance in Islam was the first al-'Aqabah. 'Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit, said about it: "Twelve men of the Ansar, who had adopted Islam in al-Madinah attended the Hajj." He added: "We gave our allegiance of women (Bay'ah al-Nisaa) to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Before imposing war upon us, provided that we should neither associate any deity with Allah, nor steal, nor commit adultery, nor kill our children, nor fabricate lies and never disobey Allah in good deeds. 'If you fulfill (your promises), you will get paradise. But if you cheat in anything of that and receive its punishment in this world, it will be an expiation, and if you keep it secret till the Day of Resurrection, you will be left to Allah the Great and Almighty, Who may punish you or forgive you if He wills."²(2)1 This was called the first allegiance of al-'Aqabah.

2. The Second Greater Allegiance at al-'Aqabah:

Ka'b Ibn Malik narrates:

"We left al-Madinah on our way for Hajj. We agreed with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to meet him at al-'Aqabah during the days of al-Tashriq (the three days following the Day of Immolation on the 10th of Dhu al-Hijjah). We sneaked away secretly, after the elapse of one-third of the night, until we gathered in the gorge near al-'Aqabah. We were seventy-three men and two women. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came with his uncle, al-'Abbas. He recited the Qur'an, called us to Allah and invited people to Islam. Then he said:

¹ .Ibid.

² . Ibid., 2/40-42.

'I accept your allegiance provided that you protect me against what you protect your women and children.'

Al-Baraa' Ibn Ma'rur took his hand and said: 'Yes, by the One who sent you with the truth, we shall protect you against what we protect our women'. Then we gave our allegiance to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as, by Allah, we are people of war.

Then Abu al-Haytham Ibn at-Tayyehaan¹ said: 'O Messenger of Allah, there are between us and the men strings which we shall cut off (meaning the Jews). So, would it be that if we did it and Allah gave you victory, you would return to your people and desert us?' The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) smiled and said:

'But blood! blood! destruction! destruction!' That is, my word is your word and my honour is your honour. Then he said: *'Point out twelve from among you to command their people.'* They chose twelve of their leaders, nine from the Khazraj and three from the Aws. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'You, as leaders of your people, are responsible like the responsibility of the disciples of 'Isa Ibn Maryam (Jesus Christ), and I am responsible for my people.'* viz. the Muslims. They said: 'Yes.' There was an argument about who was the first to clap on his hand: As'ad Ibn Zurarah or Abul Haytham Ibn at-Tayyehaan."¹(1)

3. Bay'atur-Redwaan or Bay'atush-Shajarah

In the seventh year after the Hijrah, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called upon his companions to prepare for the 'Umrah (minor pilgrimage). There came to him some 1300 or 1600 persons, with 70 animals as offerings for sacrifice. He said: "I carry no weapons, as I am only going to the 'Umrah." He asked them to wear the Ehraam (robe of pilgrimage) in Dhu al-Haleefah. Thereafter, they proceeded until they came near al-Hudaybiyyah, nine miles away from Makkah. Hearing the news of the coming of the Muslims, the polytheists of Makkah were frightened. They tried to mobilize the nearby tribes that obeyed them. They could mobilize two hundred horsemen commanded by Khalid Ibn al-Walid, or 'Ikrimah Ibn Abi Jahl. The Messenger of Allah (peace be

¹ Ibid., vol. 2, pp. 47-56.

on him and his progeny) prepared to fight them and said: "*Allah has ordered the allegiance.*" So, the people commenced giving him their pledge that they would not run away. Some said that they gave him the pledge to die. Quraysh (tribe) sent a delegation for negotiation. But when they saw the situation, they got scared and preferred to make peace with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).¹(2)2

Those were the three allegiances concluded with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), namely:

- a. The allegiance on accepting Islam.
- b. The allegiance on establishing the Islamic state.
- c. The allegiance on fighting the enemies.

The third one was a renewal of the second because the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had originally ordered to prepare for the 'Umrah. But the situation changed from 'Umrah to a battle - a situation which was different from the one they set out for. This was different from what he had promised them. Therefore, a new allegiance was required for a new situation. So he did, and it gave its fruit in terrifying the residents of Makkah and got the desired results. We conclude the discussion by relating six narratives concerning the allegiance and obeying the Imam.

1. 'Umar's son said: "We used to give our allegiance on hearing and obeying, and he used to tell us to add: 'As much as you can.'"²(1)1
2. In another narrative, 'Ali (peace be on him) said: "As much as you can."³(2)2
3. Another narrative says: Jarir said: "Say: in whatever way I can."⁴(3)3
4. Al-Hirmas Ibn Ziyaad said: "I was still a minor when I held out my hand for the allegiance, but he (peace be on him and his progeny) refused."⁵(4)4

¹ Imtaa al-Ismaa', by al-Miqrizi, pp. 274-291.

² Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "al-Ahkam", Chapter on Allegiance, hadith No. 5. Sahih Muslim, book of 'Al-Emaarah", Chapter on "the Allegiance on hearing and obeying much as one can", hadith No. 90. Sunan al-Nesaa'i, Book of "Allegiance", Chapter on "The Allegiance on what one can."

³ Sunan al-Nesaa'i, "Book of Allegiance", Chapter on "The Allegiance on what one can."

⁴ Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "al-Ahkam," Chapter on "Allegiance", hadith No. 5.

⁵ Ibid., Chapter on "The Minor Allegiance (Bay'ah al-Saghir)". Sunan al-Nesaa'i, Book of "Allegiance", Chapter on "Allegiance of a Minor (Bay'ah al-Ghulam)." Al-

‘Umar’s son said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"A Muslim has to hear and obey, whether he likes it or not, so long as he was not ordered to commit a sin, but if he was, there should be no hearing and no obedience."*¹(5)5

5. Ibn Mas‘ud said:

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"You will be ruled after me by men who will extinguish the sunnah, practise the innovations and delay the prayers to after its time."* I said: ‘O Messenger of Allah! If I lived to find their time what should I do?’ He said: *‘Is that a question to ask, O you, son of umm ‘Abd? No obedience to the one who disobeys Allah.'*²(6)6

‘Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit, at the end of a lengthy narration, says: "... So, there should be no obedience to the One who disobeys Allah, the Exalted and High, so, do not take your Lord as an excuse."³(1)7

In another version it ends by "... So do not go astray with your Lord."⁴(2)8

By studying the allegiance in the sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), it will appear that it is based on three elements:

- a. The giver of the allegiance.
- b. The receiver of the allegiance.
- c. Pledging obedience on carrying out orders.

Hirmas Ibn Ziyaad, Abu Haydar al-Basri al-Baahili. He belongs to Qays ‘Ailan. Died in al-Yamaamah after 100 A.H. Look up his biography in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah and Taqreeb al-Tahdhib.

¹ Ibid., Chapter on "Hearing and obeying the Imam except on committing a sin", hadith No. 3. Sahih Muslim, book of "al-Emaarah", Chapter on "It is obligatory to obey the rulers, but not in sinning", Hadith No. 1839. Sunan Ibn Maajah, Book of "Al-Jihad", Chapter on "There should be no obedience against Allah’s command", hadith No. 2863. Sunan an-Nesaa’i, "Book of Allegiance", Chapter on "The one who orders a sin"; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 2, pp.17 and 142.

² Sunan Ibn Maajah, vol. 2, p. 956, Hadith No. 2865. Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 400.

³ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, p. 325, quoting ‘Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit who had related the hadith in ‘Uthman’s house, as Mu’awiyah had complained against him to Uthman because of which he was brought to Madinah. A summary of Ubaadah’s hadith is in p. 329 of the Musnad-o-Ahmad.

⁴ Ibn ‘Asaakir’s Tahdhib al-Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 215.

It is based firstly on understanding what the obedience is required for. Then the covenant is concluded when the giver of the allegiance claps his hand with the hand of the receiver of the allegiance, as stated in the sunnah. Thus, the allegiance, accordingly, becomes canonical. But the conditions for a canonical allegiance to be concluded are not quite clear to many of the Muslims.

The Islamic allegiance is concluded under the following three conditions:

- a. The giver of the allegiance is to have the right to give it on his own free will.
- b. The receiver must also have the right to receive it.
- c. The allegiance must be for doing something right.

Consequently, the allegiance would be invalid if given by a minor or an insane because they are immature or underage and are not yet obliged to carry out the Islamic duties. Vis-à-vis forced allegiance, it is illegal because the allegiance is like a transaction. Just as no sale deed can be concluded by forcing the property out of the hands of its owner and forcing him to accept its value, similarly an allegiance, taken under compulsion and under the shadow of the sword cannot be regarded as valid.

It is also invalid if given to the one who commits sins openly or if given for the purpose of committing a sin. Hence, it is an Islamic term and has its regulations in the divine laws.

Conclusion

Literally, allegiance denotes the conclusion of a selling deal. In Islam, it denotes a promise or a pledge given by the promiser to the promised, to obey him in performing what had been agreed upon between them. It cannot be acceptable except under its particular conditions. It is unacceptable from a child, an insane, under compulsion or if given to a transgressor, as well as if pledged for committing a sin.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concluded the allegiance for Islam first, then for the establishment of the Islamic state. He also concluded it for fighting the enemies of Islam, to which the Holy Qur'an refers thus:

"Those who give you their allegiance they actually give it to Allah. The hand of Allah is above their hands." (Surah Fath (48): Verse 10).

*

ê . The Caliph and Allah's Caliphate on the Earth

1. The Caliph and the Caliphate

Al-Khilaafah, in the language of the Arabs, denotes the one who acts as representative (or deputy) of someone else.¹(1)1

The Khalifah is the one who succeeds another, substitutes him and fills his place. This meaning is referred to in the Noble Qur'an:

"And remember when He made you successors after (the time of) Noah's people" (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 69)

"And remember when He made you successors after 'Ad..." (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 74).

"Then there succeeded them a posterity who inherited the Book." (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 169).

"But there succeeded them a posterity who neglected the prayers." (Surah Maryam (19): Verse 59).

"...if he wills, He may take you away and make what he wills to succeed you." (Surah An'aam (6): Verse 133).

This word has been used in many other verses.

Its literal meaning is also referred to in a hadith in which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"O Allah; have mercy upon my caliphs! O Allah, have mercy upon my caliphs (successors)!"* When asked who his caliphs were, he (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: *"They are those who come after me and narrate my traditions and sunnah."*

It was also used, in its literal meaning, during the days of the companions, as follows:

a. In the days of the first Caliph

Ibn al-Athir, in *Nihaayah al-Lughah*, says: "In a narrative Abu Bakr said: A Bedouin came to him and asked: 'Are you the caliph after the Messenger of Allah?' 'No,' he said. 'Who are you, then?,' the Bedouin asked. I am merely his successor (Khaalif) after him,' he replied. Ibn al-Athir adds: "Successor (khaalif)

¹ Ar-Raghib's Mufradat, item: khalafa.

is not a needless person and there is no goodness in him. He (Abu Bakr) said this by way of modesty!"¹(1)2

b. In the days of the second Caliph

Al-Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) in his Tarikh, under "Chapter on parts of information about him and his affairs", relates that al-'Askari in al-Awa'il, al-Tabaraani in al-Mojam al-Kabir, and al-Haakem in al-Mustadrak, chronicle: "'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz asked Abu Bakr Ibn Sulyman Ibn Abi Hathmah: 'Why, in the days of Abu Bakr, he used to write: From the successor (khaalif) of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while 'Umar commenced (his correspondence) with: From the khalifah of Abu Bakr? Who began writing: From Amir al-Mu'minin?' He said: 'I was told by al-Shifa' - a woman from the Emigrants - that Abu Bakr used to write: From the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). 'Umar used to write: From the caliph of the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). One day, 'Umar wrote to his governor in Iraq to send him two trustworthy men to ask them about Iraq and its people. He sent Labid Ibn Rabi'ah and 'Adi Ibn Haatam. They arrived in al-Madinah and entered the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) mosque, where they found 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas. They said to him: 'Get us permission to see Amir al-Mu'minin'. 'Amr said: 'By Allah! You have got his right name.' He came to 'Umar and said: 'Peace be upon you, O Amir al-Mu'minin!' 'Umar said: 'What did you see in this name? Leave it!' He (Amr) told him what had happened and said to him: 'You are the Amir (Emir) and we are the Mu'minin (the believers)'. Afterwards the letters were written so." Al-Nawawi, in his at-Tahdhib, narrates, "'Umar told the people: You are the believers and I am your Amir. Thus, he was called: Amir al-Mu'minin, while before that he was called: The caliph of the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). But they gave up that name for being lengthy."²(2)1

¹ Lisan al-'Arab quoted that from Ibn al-Athir

² Al-Suyuti's Tarikh. printed in al-Sa'adah Press, Egypt, 1371 A.H., pp. 137-8; Al-Haakem in al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, pp. 81-83. Al-Asharis al-Awa'il, pp. 103 & 104

2. Allah's Caliph in the Earth

A. In Islamic terminology

Allah's caliph in the earth refers, in Islamic terminology, to someone chosen by Allah from among the human beings to make him a leader and a ruler for the people. This is clear in the verse:

"And when your Lord said to the angels: I am going to place in the earth a khalīfah..."(Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 30)

Some had interpreted this verse to mean that Allah, the Exalted, had placed (Prophet) Adam (peace be on him) as His caliph in the earth. Others said that Allah, the Exalted, had appointed the human species as His caliph in the earth. The first interpretation is supported by the verse: **"O Dawood! Indeed, We have appointed you a Caliph in the earth, so judge among the people..."** (Surah Suaad (38): Verse 26). So, if the caliph was the human species in general, there was no meaning in appointing (Prophet) Dawood alone as Allah's caliph in the earth, singled out from the entire human race, which had already been made Allah's caliph before (Prophet) Dawood, along with Dawood and after Dawood. The word caliph was used in the narratives of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) in this sense.¹(1)2

Allah made His Caliphs as Leaders (Imams) for the people:

Allah, the Exalted, had made His caliphs in the earth as Imams for the people, and gave them the Book and Prophethood. Allah, the Exalted, tells about the Prophets Ibraheem, Lut, Is'haq and Yaqoob (peace be on them all) in the Holy Quran as follows:

"... and We made (them) all good. And We made them as Imams to guide (the people) by Our command, and We inspired them the doing of good, the keeping up of the prayers and the giving of the poor-rate, and Us (alone) did they worship." (Surah Anbiyaa (21): Verses 72 & 73).

"And that was Our argument which We gave to Ibraheem against his people. We raise in degree whom We will. Your Lord is, indeed, Wise, Knowing. And

¹ Look up Behaar al-Anwaar, vol. 25, p. 263, Hadith No. 47, quoted from Kanz al-Fawa'id (by Marhoom Sharafuddin Astarabadi) and al-Kaafi, vol. 1, p. 200 and Man laa Yahdhoruhu al-Faqih, vol. 2, pp. 369 & 371.

We gave him Is'haaq and Yaqoob, and both We guided. And Noah did We guide before, and of his descendants, Dawood and Sulaiman and Ayyoob and Yusuf and Moosa and Haroon, and thus do We reward the benevolent. And Zacharia and Yahya and Eesaa and Ilyas. Each one (of them) was of the good. And Ismaaeel and al-Yasaa' and Yunus and Lut. And each (of them) We preferred above the worlds. And from among their fathers and their descendants and their brothers, and We chose them and guided them to the right path... those were to whom We gave the Book and judgement and the Prophethood." (Surah An'aam (6): Verses 84-89)

Therefore, whom Allah appoints a caliph in the earth to judge among the people is also their Imam who guides them according to Allah's Book, and conveys His laws to them. Consequently, the most important duty of Allah's caliph is conveying, as it is clearly stated by Allah, the Exalted, several times: **"... is then aught incumbent upon the Messengers except a manifest conveyance?"** (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 35) and **"And nothing rests upon the Messenger but the manifest conveyance"** (Surah Noor (24): Verse 54 and Surah Ankaboot (29): Verse 18) and this is repeated in the following verses Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verse 20, Surah Maaedah (5): Verses 92 & 99, Surah Ra'd (13): Verse 40, Surah Ibraheem (14): Verse 52, Surah Shooraaa (42): Verse 48, Surah Ahqaaf (46): Verse 35, Surah Taghaabun (64): Verse 19.

Obviously, none can convey the message of Allah, the Exalted, except His emissaries who receive His revelation, or a successor appointed by Allah to that post. A good example of this is in conveying the first ten verses of Surah al-Bara'ah, as follows:

a. In Musnad-o-Ahmad (and elsewhere):

'Ali is quoted to have said: "When the verses of Surah al-Bara'ah were revealed to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), he called for Abu Bakr and sent him with the verses to recite them to the people of Makkah. Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) called me and said:

'Go after Abu Bakr. Wherever you catch him up take the letter from him and go to the people of Makkah and read it out to them.' I did so and caught him in al-Juhfah. I took the letter from him. Abu Bakr returned to the Holy Prophet (peace

be on him and his progeny) and asked him: ‘Was there any thing revealed about me?’ ‘No,’ he said. ‘but Gabriel came to me and said: None may convey these verses except you or a man from your (household).’¹(1)1

b. In al-Suyuti’s exegesis, quoting Abu Rafi’, it is said:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sent Abu Bakr with an immunity to the (Hajj) pilgrimage. Gabriel (peace be on him) came and said: ‘It cannot be conveyed except by you or a man from your (household).’ So, he sent ‘Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) in his pursuit, till he overtook him in a place between al-Madinah and Makkah. He took it and read it out to the people during the Hajj season.”²(2)2

c. In another narration from Sa’d Ibn Abi Waqqas, who said:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sent Abu Bakr with immunity to the people of Makkah. Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) sent ‘Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) behind him. He (Ali) took it from him (Abu Bakr). Abu Bakr took offense (to this slight). The Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: ‘Woe unto you O Abu Bakr! None must convey it except myself or a man from my household.’”³(3)3

In this narrative, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sends Abu Bakr to deliver the first ten verses of Surah al-Bara’ah to the polytheists (of Makkah) during the Hajj of the ninth year of the Hijrah, but Jibraeel (peace be on him), the trustee of Allah’s revelation, comes and tells him that none should convey it except himself or a man from his family, i.e. the delivery of the ten verses of Surah al-Bara’ah directly to the addressees is a duty of conveyance exclusively to be done by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 151 and its research by Ahmad Muhammad Shakir , vol. 2, p. 322, Hadith 1296. Al-Durr al-Manthur by al-Suyuti, vol. 3, p. 209, in which it is quoted from Anas Ibn Maalik and Sa’d Ibn Abi Waqqas, that Sa’d said: "... It seemed that Abu Bakr felt offended, so the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'None should perform my duty except myself or a man from me (= my family)."

² Al-Durr al-Manthur, by al-Suyuti, vol. 3, p. 210.

³ . Ibid., vol. 3, p. 209.

progeny), a duty not to be performed by anyone except the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) or a person from his family. ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him) was his successor and entrusted with his shari’ah. This will be expanded upon through the narratives concerning appointing the successor for the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), when discussing this subject, Allah willing, it will be realized that to convey directly from Allah the High is the duty and the responsibility of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his successor.

Allah Makes His Caliphs Do What Other Human Beings Cannot Do

Sometimes Allah’s wisdom sees that His caliph - whom He appoints as an Imam for the people and a conveyor of His Book and shari’ah - should have a sign testifying his truthfulness in what he had conveyed from Allah. Such a sign is called a "miracle" in Islamic terminology, an act not within the capacity of ordinary human beings to replicate.

Allah, the Exalted, tells us about the miracles of His two Messengers, Moosa and Eesaa (peace be on them both) in the following verses as follows:

a. In Surah al-A‘raaf:

"So he threw his staff, lo! it was a manifest serpent" (Verse 107).

"And he drew out his hand, lo! it was white to the beholders." (Verse 108).

"And We inspired Moosa (saying): Throw your staff, and lo! It devoured their false show" (117).

"And We inspired Moosa when his people asked him for water, (saying): strike the rock with your staff, and there gushed out from it twelve springs, so that each tribe knew its drinking place" (160)

b. In Surah al-Shu‘araa’:

"Then he threw his staff, and lo! it became a manifest serpent" (32).

Then Moosa threw his staff, and lo! it devoured their false show." (45).

Then We inspired Moosa (saying): Strike the sea with your staff. So it split, and each part was like a huge mountain." (63).

Allah, the Exalted, also related what Eesaa, son of Maryam (peace be on them both) could do, as in Surah al-Ma'idah:

"... when I supported you with the Holy spirit, that you spoke to the people (while still) in the cradle and in old age, and when I taught you the Book and wisdom and the Torah and the Gospel, and how you could create out of clay the shape of a bird by My permission, then you blew in it and it becomes a bird by My permission, and how you healed the blind and the lepers by My permission, and how you raised the dead..." (110).

In Surah Aale 'Imran it is also said quoting Prophet Eesa (peace be on him):

"... I create for you out of clay the shape of a bird, then I blow into it and it becomes a bird by Allah's permission, and I heal the blind and the lepers, and I raise the dead to life by Allah's permission, and I tell you what you eat and what you store in your houses." (49).

He – the High - also speaks about (Prophets) Dawood and Sulaiman (peace be on them both) to whom He entrusted His sharî'ah, in Surah al-Anbiyaa':

"... and We made subservient to Dawood the mountains and the birds praising (Allah). (79).

"And (We made subservient) to Sulaiman the wind, stormy, running by his command... and of the satans (the jinn) some who dived for him and did other works for him..." (81 & 82).

It is not necessary, however, that all the divine emissaries should be granted all the miracles, as He, the Exalted, did not tell of Hud, Lut and Shu'ayb that He had made them perform miracles like those of Moosa, Eesaa, Dawood and Sulaiman (peace be on them). On the other hand, some Divine Messengers were not allowed by the people to judge among them equitably. Likewise, the Prophet Moosa and the Seal of the Prophets Hazrat Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), were not to judge among the people in their early days, though they were Imams and Caliphs, ever since they were charged with the duty of conveyance. Therefore, Imamate and Caliphate are inseparable when Allah, the Exalted appoints one of His chosen servants to undertake the task of conveying His religion and His Book. But they are not inseparable for judging among the people and performing miracles. Thus, Allah's caliph is the one who conveys His message - this is the meaning of Allah's caliph as stated in His Book.

The concept "the Messenger's caliph" appeared in a hadith from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as follows:

"O Allah, have mercy upon my caliphs"! O Allah, have mercy upon my caliphs"! O Allah, have mercy upon my caliphs!" He was asked: "Who are your caliphs, O Messenger of Allah?" *"They are those who will come after me and narrate my hadith and sunnah,"* he (peace be on him and his progeny) replied.¹⁽¹⁾1

Hence, Allah's caliph is the one appointed by Him to convey His shari'ah. The Messenger's caliph is the one who conveys his narrations and his traditions, on his own accord.

The two terms: Allah's caliph and the Messenger's caliph, are used in the Book and Sunnah, as well as in the Muslims' terminology, as below:

B. The Caliph and Allah's Caliph in the Terminology of the Muslims.

In the literal discussions of the term Caliph, we noted that Abu Bakr was called "the Caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)," while 'Umar was called "the caliph of the Messenger's caliph, but later on he was called "Amirul Mu'minin" - an epithet that remained in use to the last of the Ottoman Caliphs. On the other hand, the supreme Islamic ruler was called as below:

a. In the Umayyad and Abbaside Eras

The followers of the Caliphate School used, ever since the Umayyad and the Abbaside eras, to call the supreme ruler: Allah's caliph. Al-Hajjaaj, in a Friday prayer sermon, said: "... so, hear and obey Allah's caliph and His chosen one, 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Marwan."²⁽¹⁾1

Al-Mahdi, the Abbaside Caliph, hearing that the Umayyad Caliph, al-Walid, was an atheist, said that he thought the post of Allah's caliph was too exalted to be given to an atheist.³⁽²⁾2

The epithet was common during the Umayyad and Abbaside times, and was stated in their poetry, such as the poem composed by Jarir in praise of "Allah's caliph" 'Umar Ibn Abdul Aziz, who did not deny it, despite his known piety.⁴⁽³⁾3

¹ Look up the relevant references in the 2nd Vol. of this book.

² Sunan-o-Abi Dawood, vol. 2, p. 210 Hadith 4645, Chapter on "Al-Khulafa".

³ Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh, vol. 10, pp. 7 & 8

Likewise, the Caliph Abu Ja'far al-Mansur was addressed as "The Caliph of The Beneficent (Allah) (Khalifah al-Rahman)"¹(4) by the poet Marwan Ibn Abi Hafsah (d. 182 A.H.) in his poem praising Ma'an Ibn Za'idah al-Shaybaani (d. 151 A.H.)

b. In the Ottoman Empire:

The term "Caliph" was used during the Ottoman Empire as an epithet for their emperors, without adding "Allah" or "the Messenger of Allah".

c. In Our Times:

Nowadays, the verse: "**I am going to appoint a caliph in the earth**" is commonly interpreted in a way that Allah had appointed the human species as His caliph in the earth²(5), not a single person. It has also become common to regard the supreme ruler of the Muslims as the caliph, till the end of the Ottoman dynasty, to be the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in ruling the Muslims. So, the concept of "the caliph" denotes the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). They describe the four caliphs (as per their belief) who came immediately after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to be al-Raashidoon (the rightly guided caliphs) excluding all the other caliphs till the end of the Ottoman rule. This concept is prevalent among Muslims till date.

From the School of Caliphate to the School of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

All the said changes in the meaning of the terms "Caliph" and "Allah's caliphate in the earth" had taken place in the school of caliphate.

⁴ Sharh-o-Shawaahid al-Mughni, by al-Suyuti, vol. 1, p. 197, published by Dar Maktabah al-Hayaat, Beirut.

¹ Al-Kuna wa al-Alqaab by al-Qummi, vol. 1, p. 252.

² Sayyid Qutb, in his commentary on this verse, says: "It is, therefore, the Supreme Will that wants to hand over to this new being the reins of this earth and give him a free hand in it... It is a great position this one which is given to man within the system of existence on this vast earth" (Fi Zalaael al-Qur'an, vol. 1, pp. 65-66)

In the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school, the term Allah's caliph in the earth is also mentioned in the narrations of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) in the same sense of its Islamic terminology, as mentioned above.

The term "Caliphate", meaning the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), had been transferred from the school of caliphate to the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school and remained current ever since the 5th century Hijri. The school of caliphate, in their opinion that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had neglected his ummah and did not appoint an authorized successor after him, depended on the non-occurrence of the word caliph in his narrations in the same sense which appeared after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

To refute this opinion, the followers of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school presented the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadiths as evidences referring to his assigning Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as his successor. They say that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had actually appointed him (peace be on him) as his Caliph in the same sense of the word as was used after him, and he (peace be on him and his progeny), in fact, did not neglect his ummah¹ (1)

All these arguments were made by the followers of the two schools, unaware of the fact that the term "Caliph", in its sense innovated after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) could not have possibly been used in any narration of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

Conclusion:

- a. Literally, the caliph of a person is the one who performs the works of his principal in his absence. It has been used in its literal sense in the Holy Qur'an, the Sunnah and the parables of the companions.
- b. Allah's caliph in the earth, in the Islamic terminology, is the one appointed by Allah, the Exalted, to convey His laws, which is revealed to him, or which he receives from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and to judge among the people. He empowered some of them to do things impossible for

¹ Some of these evidences are found in the book al-Alfain by the Hasan Ibn Yusuf Ibn al-Mutahhar famous as 'Allamah al-Hilli (r.a.)

other people to do. This is stated in the Holy Qur'an and the narratives of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on him and his progeny).

c. The Messenger's caliph, as mentioned in the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny), is the one who conveys his narrations and traditions.

d. Abu Bakr, according to the Islamic terminology, was called: the Messenger's caliph, and 'Umar was called: the caliph of the Messenger's caliph. Thereafter, he ordered the people to call address him as Amir al-Mu'minin - a name which continued to describe the supreme Islamic ruler till the end of the Ottoman dynasty. During the Umayyad and the Abbaside eras, they added the title Khalifah Rasulillah (The Caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)). Besides these two epithets during the Ottoman era, there was a third one, al-Khalifah, which meant: The Messenger's Caliph. The last one was commonly used till recent times. Everyone who ruled the Muslims after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was called Caliph, i.e. the Caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), a custom that ended with the fall of the Ottoman Empire. The four caliphs who immediately succeeded the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) were called "the rightly-guided caliphs" (al-khulafa' al-rashidun). The term khalifah was transferred to Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school, as they, too, called all the rulers after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till the Ottoman kings. Paying very little attention to this point had so confused the Muslims that it was common for the school of caliphate to say that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had neglected his ummah, and that he did not declare his successor, just because the term which they themselves had invented after the death of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not occur in his narrations. But the followers of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school, depending on the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), proved that he had appointed Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as his successor after him. They said that the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had appointed him to be his caliph among the people, in the very sense of the term which the Muslims implied for the caliph after him, and for which, there was a severe dispute between among the Muslims.

We shall presently refer Insha' Allah, to what the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did and what he said in this respect, uncovering the truth.

IV. Amir al-Mu'minîn

As mentioned before, the epithet Amir al-Mu'minîn was first used in the days of 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, by which they referred to the supreme Islamic ruler. It remained in use till the Ottoman era.

V. Imam:¹

Literally, Imam means the one who leads and precedes others so as to serve as an example and is imitated in act and word, whether right or wrong, as is manifest in the verse: "... **The day when We will call every people with their Imam, then whoever is given his book in his right hand, these shall read their book, and they shall not be wronged a shred. And whoever is blind in his (world), he shall (also) be blind in the hereafter, and even more astraying.**" (Surah Bani Israel (17): Verses 71 & 72).

In another verse, we read: "... **So, fight the Imams of the disbelief - They have no binding oath - so that they may desist.**" (Surah Taubah (9): Verse 12).

In Islamic terminology, an Imam is the one who guides to the way of Allah by Allah's permission, whether a human being, as is in the verse: "**And when his Lord examined Ibraheem with (certain) words, he fulfilled them. He (Allah) said: 'Surely, I will appoint you as an Imam for the people.' He (Ibraheem) asked: 'And of my off spring?' He said: 'My covenant shall not reach the wrongdoers'.**" (Surah al-Baqarah (2): Verse 124).

"**And We made them Imams who guide by Our command.**" (Surah Anbiyaa (21): Verse 73),

or a Book, as He said:

"... **And before it, (is) the Book of Moosa, an Imam and a Mercy.**" (Surah Hud (11): Verse 17).

¹ Ibn Hisham says: Firas Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn Maslamah Ibn Washir Ibn Ka'b Ibn Rabi'ah Ibn 'Amir Ibn Sa'sa'ah.

From the context of the above two verses it can be realized that a condition for an Imam, according to Islam, in case it is a Book, is to be revealed by Allah to His Messengers (peace be on them) to guide the people, such as the Book of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), the Glorious Qur'an, and before that, the Book of Moosa (peace be on him), the Torah, as well as the Books of the other divine Prophets (peace be on them). In case it is a human being, he must be appointed by Allah, as He says: **"I am making you an Imam"** and **"My covenant"**. He must have done no wrong or injustice to himself or to the others, i.e. he must not have disobeyed Allah, because He, the Exalted, says: **"My covenant does not include the wrong-doers"**.

Accordingly, one may correctly say that the Imam, in the Islamic terminology, is:

- a. The Book revealed by Allah to His Messengers (peace be on them) in order to guide the people to the right path.
- b. A man appointed by Allah to guide the people, provided that he should be infallible.

VI. Al-Amr and 'Ulul Amr:

To know whether al-Amr and 'ulul Amr are two terms of the shari'ah or not, we shall demonstrate their usages in Arabian literature, in Arab traditions and in the Islamic texts of the Book and the Sunnah.

a. In the literature of the Arabs:

It has come in the biographies (of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)) authored by Ibn Hisham, al-Tabari and others that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to present (his message) to the Arab tribes, in the Hajj seasons, inviting them to Islam, telling them that he was a Prophet sent by Allah, asking them to believe in him and offer their protection to him so that he could proclaim his message on behalf of Allah.

They say: Once he came to Bani Aamir Ibn Sa'sa'ah and invited them to Allah, the Exalted, presenting himself to them. A man from them, called Bayharah Ibn Firas, said: "By Allah! If I had this young man from Quraysh, I would have eaten

the Arabs by him." Then he told him: "Do you see that if we followed you in your affair and Allah gave you victory over your opponents, would the affair be ours after you?" Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*The affair belongs to Allah and He places it wherever He wills.*" "So," said the man, "should we expose our throats to the Arabs in defending you, then when Allah gives you distinction, the affair should go to others? We don't need your affair." ¹(2)²

This Arab thought that the affair of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was nothing but to dominate and rule the Arabs. So, he wanted to conclude an alliance with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to transfer the rule of the Arabs to his tribe after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). But the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) refused his offer, despite his great need at that time for strong supporters. The affair was not his but Allah's, and it was up to Him to bestow it on whomsoever He willed.

Similar was the demand of Haudhah Ibn 'Ali al-Hanafi from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), when the latter invited him to Islam. This episode is summarized from Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, as below:

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) wrote a letter to Haudhah Ibn 'Ali al-Hanafi inviting him to Islam. In his reply to Allah's Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), he wrote: "How wonderful and beautiful is that which you call me to. I am the poet and the orator of my people, and the Arabs respect my standing. So, assign a portion of the affair to me, and I will follow you." The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) retorted: "*Even if he had asked me a waste piece of land, I would not have given it to him.*"²(3)³

So, Haudhah demanded from the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to grant him a part of the affair, such as an Emirate in some land, or the rule of a tribe and the like. But he (peace be on him and his progeny) said that he would not give him the Emirate of a waste land. This is similar to the episode of the people of al-Kufah or Basrah, when their governor demanded from every body to fetch a certain quantity of stones to pave their big mosque. He appointed someone of

¹ Ibid., 2/31-36. al-Tabari, Eu. ed. vol. 1, pp. 1205-6. Seerah of Ibn Hisham, vol. 2, p. 33

² Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Eu. ed. 1/Q vol. 2, p. 18

them to supervise the work. This man was too severe upon the people, regarding himself a ruler. So, they used to chide him by saying: "How wonderful is to be an Emir even on the stones!" Hudhah's demand was like asking to be an Emir (even on stones), but the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*No, not even on stones!*"

b. In the traditions of the Muslims

The term affair (*amr*), in the sense known to the early Muslims, was much used on the day of al-Saqifah when Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah said to the Ansar; "... take possession of the affair." The Ansar responded to him: "We assign this affair to you." Then talks were exchanged, and they said: "What if the Emigrants of Quraysh declined? We are... his tribe and guardians, so, why do you dispute this affair with us after him (peace be on him and his progeny)?"

Abu Bakr, protesting against them, on that day, said: "... This affair cannot be except for this branch of Quraysh."

He also said: "They are (meaning Quraysh) more entitled than anyone to this affair after him. None but an unjust would deny them that."

'Umar, on that day, said: "... Who would dispute with us about Muhammad's authority and rulership, whereas we are his people and kinsfolk." In reply, al-Habbaab Ibn al-Mundhir said: "... do not listen to this (man) and his companions who want to take away your share of this affair... take command over these affair. you have, by Allah, more right over it..."

At this, Bashir Ibn Sa'd, speaking in favour of the Quraysh, said: "... I would rather never have Him see me quarrel with them on this affair."¹(1)

c. In the Islamic Texts

The term affair has occurred several times in the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Allah willing, we shall study them in the coming discussions. It suffices here to state what the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said in his reply to the 'Amir: "*The affair is Allah's. He places it where He wills.*"

¹ All these quotations are from the chapter on as-saqifah in at-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed. 1/1837-51

The Glorious Qur'an says: "**O you who believe! obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those possessing authority ('ulul amr) from among you...**" (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 59)

In all these instances, whether in the language of the Arabs, the traditions of the Muslims or the Islamic texts, such as in the Book or the Sunnah, the intended meaning of *amr* is nothing but the Imamate and governing the Muslims.

Thus, the term affair was used, in the Islamic sharī'ah, in the same sense as was used by the Arabs and the Muslims. So, there can be no objection to '*ulul amr*' being an Islamic religious term, which implies the Imams after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). There is no dispute about this, but the difference between the two schools concerns those who can truly be called '*ulul amr*'. The Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school believes that since by the term '*ulul amr*' the Imams (peace be on them) are intended, they must be assigned by Allah and must be infallible, according to the details to follow, Allah willing.

VII . The Successor (*wasī*) and the Will (*wasiyyah*)

The terms successor (*wasī*), will (*wasiyyah*) and their derivatives have, in the speech of Arabs, the following meanings:

The living person who entrusts another person with carrying out a task after his death, is called the testator (*musī*), and the other person is called the executor (*wasī*), and the task to be carried out is called the will (*wasiyyah*). In bequeathing a will, either these very words are used, such as the testator saying to the executor: "My will to you after my death is that you take care of my family, administer my school and do so and so," or other words implying the meaning of a will, such as the testator may say to his successor/executor: "I ask you to take care of my family, administer my school and do so and so, after my death."

The testator may also inform the others about his will by using the actual vocabulary, such as saying: "I bequeathed my will to so-and-so," or "So-and-so," is the executor of my will or my successor". Or he may say: 'I entrusted so-and-so' or: "I asked him to do so and so." Both these expressions, and the like, imply the same meaning.

That was a brief explanation of the terms: successor, will and their derivatives in Arabic literature. These terms have also been used in the Glorious Qur'an and in

the noble Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Allah, the Exalted, says:

"It is prescribed for you, when death approaches anyone of you (and) if he leaves wealth, to bequeath a will," up till "But the one who fears an inclination to a wrong course or a sin on the part of the testator, and makes peace between the parties, there will be no sin upon him..." (Surah Baqarah (2): Verses 180-182)

And: **"O you who believe! (Call to) witness between you, when death draws near to anyone of you at the time of making the will, two (persons) of equity from among you..."** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 106), as well as in the Verses 11 & 12 of the same chapter.

As regards their mention in the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) sunnah, reference is made in Sahih al-Bukhari, at the beginning of the The Book of Wills (Kitab al-Wasaaya) and in Sahih Muslim, The Book of Will (Kitab al-wasiyyah).

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"It is not permissible to any Muslim, who has some thing to bequeath, to stay for a couple of nights without having with him his written will."*¹ (1)

The will is regulated by particular rules in the Islamic jurisprudence. According to what has been stated, the words successor and will are Islamic terms.

The will of Divine Prophets and Messengers (peace be on them) examples of which shall be given from the Torah and the Gospel - is that they entrusted their successors with the conveyance of their divine laws to the people, and with taking care of their nation after them.

The Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) did the same, in his nation, as the previous messengers (peace be on them) had done in theirs. He (peace be on him and his progeny) entrusted Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) with the task of conveying his canon and of taking care of his nation after him. He (peace be on him and his progeny) also entrusted that task, through Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to his offspring, the eleven Imams (peace be on them) after him. The Prophet of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had related this

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 2, p. 73 and Sahih Muslim, explained by al-Nawawi, vol. 11, p. 74.

information to his nation, using, at times, the very vocabularies: *wasi*, *al-wasiyyah* and their derivatives, and at other times using words denoting the same meanings. Thus, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was given the title “the vicegerent” (*al-wasi*) and it became like his proper name. To this we shall refer later on Insha’Allah, when discussing the texts quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning the appointment of the *ulil amr* after him, relating the arguments of those who denied it and believed that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had neglected the affairs of the nation and did not appoint any successor/vicegerent/executor of will after him (peace be on him and his progeny).

The Opinion of the Caliphate School

Having studied the past seven terms, it will be easier for us now to study the opinions of the two schools concerning the Caliphate and the Imamate, and the arguments of both sides in this respect. We begin with studying the opinion of the Caliphate School.

The Opinion of the Caliphate School and their Argument

Firstly: The Caliph Abu Bakr said:

"... This affair is not known except for this branch of Quraysh, as they are the centre of the lineage and position of the Arabs. I am satisfied with you to give your allegiance to either of these two (‘Umar and Abu ‘Ubaydah)."

Secondly: ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab said:

"Let nobody be deceived to say that Abu Bakr’s allegiance was an error that should be considered as finished. Indeed, it was so (i.e. an error) but Allah warded off its evil. None of you is as looked up to as Abu Bakr. Whoever gives his allegiance without having consulted the Muslims, both the giver and the taker of the allegiance, by deception, should be killed."

An Investigation in the Two Arguments

Here, we indicated firstly to the argument of the Caliph Abu Bakr in al-Saqifah, and secondly, to the Caliph ‘Umar’s raising the slogan of the Consultative

Committee (Shooraaa) for nominating the ruler after him. As regards the claims of the Abu Bakr in al-Saqifah, they were actually similar to the claims of all of them, on that day, were demonstrated as per tribal logic. When the Ansar left the body of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) lying unattended among his relatives, and hurried to the Saqifah of Banu Sa'idah to put Sa'd in the saddle, they did not say that Sa'd was better than the others and that he was more eligible to be the ruler. Rather, they said: "The people are under your protection, and none would dare against you."

Surely, the Emigrants of Quraysh too when they joined the Ansar, argued with the same tribal logic. They said that Quraysh occupied the central position among the Arabs vis-à-vis lineage and family. They further said, "Who can dispute the authority of Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny)? And we are his people and kinsfolk!!"

With the same logic spoke the one from the Ansar who said: "A ruler from us and a ruler from you," or the Emigrant who said: "We are the rulers and you are the ministers."

Likewise, the defence of 'Usayd Ibn Hudayr and those present of his tribe, the Aws, was tribal, as they feared the domination of the Khazraj over them, remembering the Bi'ath war among them, which was only two decades old. They argued: "By Allah! If the Khazraj ruled over you only once, they would always claim this superiority upon you, and they would never assign you any portion of it. Get up and pay allegiance to Abu Bakr."

At last, the Emigrants of Quraysh were victorious by the arrival of the Aslam tribe who thronged the streets of al-Madinah. They gave their allegiance to Abu Bakr, supporting the Emigrants of Quraysh against the Ansar. So, 'Umar was right to say, afterwards, that Abu Bakr's allegiance was a mistake.

Such was the truth of that event, notwithstanding the argument used.

Regarding what 'Umar said concerning the Consultative Committee (Shuraa), we shall study the same, with Allah's help, through our examination of the opinions of the followers of the Caliphate School, as follows:

Thirdly: The Opinions of the followers of the Caliphate School:

The opinions of the Caliphate School concerning the Caliphate and establishing it can be summarized hereunder:

1. The Caliphate may be established through:
 - a. The Consultative Committee (Shooraa).
 - b. The Allegiance
 - c. Following the example of the Companions, or.
 - d. By force and domination.
2. After giving him the allegiance, the Caliph is to be obeyed, even if he disobeys his Lord.

* * *

Having known the abovementioned terms, we can now easily discuss them one by one, as follows:

A. Discussing the Consultative Committee (Shooraa).

The first person to refer to the Shooraa and to apply it for the establishment of the Caliphate was 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab. Yet, he did not offer any evidence that the Imamate in Islam is established through consultation. But the later followers of the Caliphate School referred to two verses of the Holy Quran to prove the validity of appointing an Imam through consultation, as well as to the narrative that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to consult with his Companions about certain important matters, and to a quote from Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). We shall study hereunder their proofs in this respect, and then we shall examine the Consultative Committee (Shooraa) which was ordered by 'Umar.

Proving the Consultative Committee (Shooraaa) by Allah's Book and His Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah:

They argued:

- a. The verse: "... **And their affair is through mutual consultation.**" (Surah Shooraa (42):Verse 38)
- b. "... **And consult them in (your) affairs**" (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 159)

c. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to consult his Companions in the important matters.

First: Their arguing that the verse says: " **And their affair is through mutual consultation.**"

This part of the verse No. 38 of Surah al-Shooraa is followed by "**and who spend out of what we have given them.**" Both sentences refer to the acts of consultation and spending, which are not compulsory. Consultation, however, is recommended only in matters about which there is no particular decision from Allah and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). Allah, the Exalted, says:

"And it is not for a believing man and a believing woman to have any choice in their amr when Allah and His Messenger have decided an amr. And whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger, he certainly goes astray to a far extent." (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 36).

Later, we shall quote from Allah the High and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) about the Imamate that will put consultation out of question.

Second: Their arguing that the verse says: "... **And consult them in (your) affairs.**"

This verse is situated among a group of verses from Nos. 139 to 166, all of which concern the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) battles and how Allah the High had made him victorious. Some of them are addressed to the Muslims, the raiders of them in particular, and some of them are addressed to the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), especially the verse under discussion: "**Thus it was due to mercy from Allah that you were gentle to them. Had you been rough (and) hard-hearted, they would have dispersed from around you. Pardon them, therefore, and ask forgiveness for them and consult them in the affairs. So, when you have decided, then rely upon Allah, as Allah loves those who rely on (Him).**" (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 159).

It is obvious that the command to consult them was just a licence and kindness to them. It did not enjoin him to act according to their advice, as it, then, said: **If you have decided, then rely upon Allah.** It can also be understood that the recommended consultation was in regards to the battles, as this command to

consult concerned one of those battles of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), as shall be explained later.

Third: Their arguing that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) consulted his Companions. The Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) consultation with his Companions was only concerning his expeditons, as the Companion, Abu Hurayrah clearly said: "I have seen none consulting his companions more than the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). His consultations with his companions concerned war only."¹(1)

The most famous one of his consultations with them was that about Battle of Badr. The details are as follows:

a. The Battle of Badr

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) instructed his Companions to confront the Quraysh's trade caravan which was returning from Syria, led by Abu Sufyan. Some 313 persons prepared to set out with him to confiscate that trade caravan, but not to fight. Abu Sufyan was informed about this decision. So, he changed his course to another one away from the main road, and sent a message to Quraysh in Makkah for help. There came to him an army of one thousand well-prepared fighters. Thus, Abu Sufyan and the caravan were safe. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had but two choices: to peacefully retreat to al-Madinah, or to fight a well-equipped army, with his far smaller bunch of soldiers, both in number and preparedness.

The Details:

Ibn Hisham, in his *Sirah*, narrates:

"He (the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)) was informed concerning Quraysh and how they changed their course to protect their caravan. So, he consulted with the people and told them about Quraysh. Abu Bakr stood up

¹ Al-Maghaazi by al-Waqedi, edited by Dr. Mersden Johns, vol. 2, p. 580.

and talked, and talked well. Then ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab stood up and talked and talked well. Finally, al-Miqdad stood up (and talked)."¹(2)1

Then he relates what al-Miqdad and the Ansar said, but he does not relate what Abu Bakr and ‘Umar had said!

In Sahih Muslim it is stated like this:

"... Then Abu Bakr talked, but he (the Messenger – peace be on him and his family) turned away from him. Then ‘Umar talked, but he turned away from him. Then al-Miqdad stood up..."²(1)2

This is what is stated by Muslim, the author of the Sahih. He, too, did not relate what Abu Bakr said. Both of them did not complete the narration. But the complete story is stated in al-Maghaazi by al-Waqedi and in Imta‘ul Asma‘ by al-Miqrizi. Hereunder, we quote the former:

"‘Umar stood up and said: ‘O Messenger of Allah! It is, by Allah, Quraysh and its glory! By Allah, it was never humiliated ever since it was glorious! By Allah, it did not believe ever since it disbelieved! By Allah, it will never submit its glory. It will certainly fight you. So prepare for that and arrange for it.’ Then al-Miqdad Ibn ‘Amr stood up and said: ‘O Messenger of Allah, go forward to (fulfill) Allah’s command; we are with you. By Allah! We shall not say to you as Bani Israel said to their Prophet: ‘... **(O Moosa)! You and your Lord go and fight both of you, we will sit down here.**’. (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 24) But (we say) go you and your Lord and fight and we shall be fighting with you. By the One who sent you with the truth! If you were to take us to the Ghimad pools (to the south-west of Makkah, at five nights travel), we would surely go with you.’ The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) remarked, ‘*Good to him*’ and invoked goodness for him. Thereafter, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) continued: ‘*Advise me, O people!*’ addressing the Ansar. he (peace be on him and his family) thought that the Ansar would help him only at home, because their early condition was to protect him against what they used to protect themselves and their children. That is why he (peace be on him and his family) asked for their advice. At this, Sa’d Ibn Ma’adh stood up and said: ‘I shall answer

¹ Seerah al-Nabi (peace be on him and his progeny) by Ibn Hisham, vol. 2, p. 253.

² Sahih Muslim, Book of "al-Jihad wa al-Sirah" Chapter on "Ghazwaat-o-Badr," vol. 3, p.1403

for the Ansar, it seems that you mean us.’ ‘Yes,’ he (peace be on him and his family) said. So, he said: ‘Probably you have departed from an affair while you received a revelation on something else. We did believe in you, held you truthful and testified that whatever you brought was true. We gave you our promises and covenants to hear and obey. So, go ahead, O Prophet of Allah. By the One who sent you with the truth! Should you step into this sea and wade through it, we will wade in it with you, till no man remains from us. You may join relations with whosoever you wish and cut relations with whoever you wish. You may take from our wealth whatever you like and what you take of our wealth is more loved by us than what you leave. By the One in Whose hand is my soul! I have never tread upon this road, and I have no knowledge of it. We do not hate meeting our enemy tomorrow. We are indeed forbearers in war and truthful in fight. May Allah show you from us what would gladden you!’

Muhammad narrated unto us that al-Waqidi reported that he was told by Muhammad Ibn Salih quoting ‘Asim Ibn ‘Umar Ibn Qatadah, who quoted Mahmud Ibn Labid who said: Sa’d said to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family): ‘O Messenger of Allah! We have left behind a group of our people whom we do not love less than we love you nor do we love you more than we love them. They do have an inclination and intention for holy war. Had they believed, O Messenger of Allah, that you were going to face an enemy, they would not have stayed behind. But they thought it is just a returning caravan. We will build you an harbour to sit in, and arrange your camels for you. If Allah glorified us and gave us victory over our enemy, that would be what we like but if it was the other way round, you would ride your camels and catch whoever is after us.’

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) spoke well (of him) and said: ‘*Or Allah may ordain better than that, O Sa’d.*’

It is narrated: ‘After Sa’d had given his advice, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family) said: ‘*Go ahead, accompanied by Allah’s blessing, as Allah had promised me one of the two groups. By Allah, it is as if I am seeing the places where those people will be slaughtered.*’ He said: ‘Then the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) showed us their slaughtering places: This is the place of so-and-so, and that is the place of so-and-so. He did not leave any one of

them.' He (the narrator) said: 'So, the people knew that they were facing a fight, and that the caravan would slip away.' They hoped to be victorious, as the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had predicted."¹(1)

The consultation of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in this situation, was to know what they would do after Allah, the Exalted, had told him that they would fight and be victorious, and informed him about the places where those people would be killed. After that, they agreed to fight. He, therefore, did not consult with them in order to be benefitted by their opinion, but it was a kind of leniency in informing them about the escape of the caravan of Quraysh, and that the situation had changed from capturing trading loads to fighting the enemy, so that they may prepare themselves for it.

b. The Battle of Uhud

The aforementioned was the story of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) consultation with his Companions concerning the Battle of Badr. Hereunder, we relate the story of his consultation with his companions concerning the Battle of Uhud.

In this consultation, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) acted according to the advice of his companions, as is related in al-Waqedi's al-Maghaazi and in al-Miqrizi's Imta'ul Asma'² (1)²

They say: The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family) ascended the pulpit, praised Allah, thanked Him, and said: "*O people! I dreamt as if I was in a protective armour, and as if the sword, Dhulfiqar, broke its edge. I saw cows being slaughtered, and I saw as if I had behind me (on the saddle) a ram.*"

The people asked: "How do you interpret it, O Messenger of Allah?"

He (peace be on him and his family) said: "*As to the strong fort, it is al-Madinah, so, stay in it. As to my sword being broken at the edge, it is a calamity in myself.*

¹ . Al-Maghaazi by al-Waqedi, Oxford ed. vol.1, pp. 48 & 49; Imta'uul Asma' by al-Miqrizi, pp. 74 & 75.

² Al-Maghaazi, pp. 201-214; Imta'ul Asma', pp. 113-118.

As to the cows being killed, it is the casualties among my Companions. As to the ram behind me, it is the leader of the enemy whom we shall kill, Allah willing."

In another narration it is said: "... *As to the breaking of my sword, it is the death of one of my family.*" Then he said: "*Advise me.*" His own opinion was that they should not leave the town. He was backed, in his opinion, by 'Abdullah Ibn 'Ubayy and the heads of the Companions, both from the Emigrants and the Ansar. He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Stay in the town, placing the women and the children in the fortresses. If they could break into the town we would fight them in the lanes, which we know better, and they would be our arrows' targets from the forts and fortresses.*" They had already fortified the town by constructions till it had become like a fort. Some young men, who were not present at the Battle of Badr, but wished to fight the enemy in pursuit of martyrdom, said: "Take us out to our enemy." Other men, like Hamzah, Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah, al-Nu'man Ibn Malik Ibn Tha'labah and a group of the Ansar, said: "O Messenger of Allah! We fear that our enemy would think that we dislike going out to him, out of cowardice, to meet them, and this would make them more audacious against us. On the the day of Badr, you had only three hundred men, but Allah made you overcome them. Today we are greater in number. We longed for such a day and implored Allah for it. Now, Allah has sent it to us and in our vicinity." The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), however, disliked being pressurized them to such an extent.

Hamzah said: "By The One who revealed the Book to you, I will eat no food today before I whip them with my sword outside the town." He was fasting for the two days i.e. Friday and Saturday.

Then Malik Ibn Sinan (father of Abu Sa'id al-Khudri), talked, followed by al-Nu'man Ibn Malik Ibn Tha'labah, and 'Iyas Ibn Aws Ibn 'Atiq, about going out to fight. As the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) saw their persistence, he led the Friday prayers, preached them and ordered them to strive earnestly in holy war, and told them that victory will be theirs as long as they hold their ground. The people were glad to know that they were going out to their enemy, though many of them disliked it. Thereafter, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family) led the afternoon prayers while they were

mobilizing. Meanwhile, the people of al-‘Awali joined them. The women were sent to the fortresses. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) entered his house with Abu Bakr and ‘Umar, who helped him to put on his clothes and his turban. The people stood in a row from his room to the pulpit. Sa’d Ibn Ma’adh and ‘Usayd Ibn Hudayr came to the people and said to them: "You had said to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) what you said and forced him to go out, while the command descends upon him from the heaven. So, leave the affair to him, and obey his orders; when you see him inclined to something or has a liking to an opinion, you must obey him." As they were thus engaged, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came out of his room, clad in robes of war and armour, his waist tied with a belt of a sword’s cord, wearing his turban, and his sword hanging from his shoulder. The insisting ones said "O Messenger of Allah! We should not have opposed you. So, do whatever appears best to you." He said: *"I had called you to this, but you refused. When a Prophet wears his war apparel, he should not take it off until Allah judges between him and his enemies. Execute what I ordered you and carry it out. Go, protected by Allah, the victory is yours as long as you are patient."*

* * *

Probably the wisdom in the response of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to the pressure of his Companion to go out was because if he had refrained from accepting their suggestion, it would have badly affected them and created in them weakness and submission, instead of boldness and courage. As regards his not responding to them after that they had accepted his opinion, he himself told them the wisdom behind it.

Following is another example of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family) acting according to the suggestion of his companion. It is an incident that happened in the Battle of Khandaq (the Trench).

c. The Battle of Khandaq

Al-Waaqedi and al-Miqrizi narrated about the start of the Battle of Khandaq as follows:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) consulted them. He frequently used to consult them concerning his wars... Salman [al-Muhammadi] advised to dig a trench."

They also told of another consultation that took place around the end of the Battle of Khandaq. They said: "The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Companions remained besieged for several nights until it became too difficult for them. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) implored: *"O Allah! I ask you for the sake of your pledge and promise. O*

Allah! If You wish, You will not be worshipped." Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) sent to 'Uyaynah Ibn Hisn and al-Harith Ibn 'Awf - both chiefs of the Ghatafan tribe - offering them one-third of the fruits of the town, if they take their people and leave the place. They asked for half of the fruits. He (peace be on him and his progeny) refused to give more than one-third. They accepted and came with ten of their people until they got near. Paper and ink-pot were brought for 'Uthman Ibn 'Affan to write the peace pact. 'Abbaad Ibn Bishr was standing behind the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), wearing his armour. 'Usayd Ibn Hudayr, (seeing that) 'Uyaynah was stretching his legs, said: "O you, the eye of the ape ['Uyaynah = demunitined-eye], pull up your legs (i.e. sit straight). How could you stretch your legs in the presence of the Messenger of Allah. I would have pierced your side with the spear." Then he said: "O Messenger of Allah! May Allah bless you! If this affair is from the heaven, then go to it. But if it is other than that, by Allah, we shall give them nothing but the sword. When did you covet this from us?" The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) summoned Sa'd Ibn Ma'adh and Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah and secretly consulted them. They said: "If this affair was from the heaven, then go to it, and if it is not enjoined upon you but you are inclined towards it, we hear and obey. If an opinion is needed, then they shall have nothing from us except the sword." The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*I saw that the Arabs were unanimous against you, so I deemed it better to appease them and not to fight them.*" They both said: "O Messenger of Allah! By Allah, even if they could eat foxes (or monkeys or anything else), during the era of paganism through strife, they could have never coveted such a thing from us: to get a fruit, except either by purchase or through hospitality. Now, as Allah had bestowed you upon us, favoured us with you and guided us through you, how could we do such a disgraceful act? We shall never give them but the sword!" He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Tear the paper to pieces.*" Sa'd obliged, 'Uyaynah and al-Harith stood up. He (peace be on him and his progeny) said in a loud voice: "*Go back! The sword is between us.*"

This was the incident of the consultation of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) with his Companions in this Battle. It appears from the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) conversation that he wanted to

create a disunity among the enemy tribes, especially that at the end he raised his voice, saying: "*Go back! The sword is between us.*" He (peace be on him and his progeny) knew that the news about that would spread and reach Quraysh and stir dispute among them.

After that the two narrators said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered Na'im Ibn Mas'ud to do so [spread the news]. He did and was successful, as he could sow suspicion and distrust between Banu Qurayzah and Quraysh. That was one of the reasons for their defeat."¹(1)

In the light of what has been said concerning the consultations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), it is absolutely clear that they were not intended to have the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) learn from his Companions the right idea to put it to practice. Actually, the aim was sometimes to teach them, through the method of consultation, the right opinion which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) already knew, so that they may apply it.

This was the case of his consulting them in the Battle of Badr, as the result had already been related by Allah the Exalted to His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) that they would fight and be victorious against the Quraysh. After the consultations, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) prophesied them about the result and showed the places where their enemies would be killed. Thus, the consultation was aimed at directing the Muslims, through consultation, to what they ought to do, contrary to the method of the tyrannical kings who imposed their whims upon the people, by saying, "I the King of so and so place have issued my royal decree that...". The beginning of the verse clearly proves this. He the Exalted, said: "**Thus it was due to mercy from Allah that you were gentle to them. Had you been rough (and) hard-hearted, they would have dispersed from around you. Pardon them, therefore, and ask forgiveness for them and take counsel with them in the affairs...**" (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 159). Thus, in this instance, consultation is an evidence of leniency, as a sign of Allah's mercy, both of which are referred to early in verse. The aim of consultation can, sometimes, be leniency, in the above instance. In some other instances, the aim may be to educate the Muslims, as in the war of

¹ Al-Waaqedi's Maghaazi, vol. 2, pp. 477-480; Imtaa' al-Asmaa', pp. 235 & 236

‘Uhud. On that occasion, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), having accepted his Companions’ advice, and coming out wearing war armours, intending to march to ‘Uhud, they regretted their insistence from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to go out (to fight) and said, “O Messenger of Allah! It does not behove us to disagree with you. So do whatever comes to your mind.” To this, he (peace be on him and his progeny) retorted: *"I had called you to this but you refused. When a (divine) Prophet wears his war apparel, he cannot take it off till Allah judges between him and his enemies..."*

It seems from the conversation between the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Companions that had he (peace be on him and his progeny) not responded to their earnest desire to go out, it would have had a bad effect on them, causing them to become weak, irresolute and coward in wars; nevertheless, he accepted their advice, although inappropriate. But in the Battle of Khandaq, the consultation was a trick with which he successfully deceived the disbelievers.

B. Investigating the Allegiance as an Evidence

From our past discussions, we have come to know:

That allegiance is like a sale deal which is concluded by consent and free will, not by force and compulsion.

That there can be no allegiance in committing a sin.

That there can be no difference about what had been enjoined by Allah, and

That no allegiance should be given to a person who disobeys Allah.

We also know that the first allegiance after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was given to Abu Bakr. So, on its validity depended the authenticity of the ‘Umar’s allegiance, because it was taken from the people on the basis of the command of the Abu Bakr. Thereafter, on the (so-called) authenticity of the allegiance of the ‘Umar depended the authenticity of the allegiance of ‘Uthman because it was taken according to the command of ‘Umar that they should give their allegiance to one of the six Qarashis to whom Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Awf would give his allegiance, and to kill whoever refuses to accept it.

We also came to know that the allegiance of Abu Bakr was forcibly taken in the Saqifah of Banu Sa'idah, followed by the support of the Aslam tribe in the streets of Madinah. Thereafter, they brought fire to the house of Hazrat Fatimah (peace be on her) the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) because those who refrained from giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr took refuge in it. We also knew that the Banu Hashim did not give their allegiance to Abu Bakr as long as the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was alive, and that Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah was killed by the Jinn with two arrows, because he refused to give his allegiance to Abu Bakr.

This was the story of taking the allegiance in al-Madinah. As regards outside it, those who refused to give their allegiance to Abu Bakr, or refused to pay the poor-rate to his collectors, their fate was that their men would be killed, their women-folk captured and their properties plundered.

Such was the outcome of Malik Ibn Nuwayrah¹,⁽¹⁾ the agent of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his family in the Tamim tribe, as the army of Khalid Ibn al-Walid raided them at night. They took to arms. The army of Khalid said: "We are Muslims." The companions of Malik said: "We are Muslims (too)." "If you are really so, put down your arms," said the army of Khalid. They did, and performed the prayers together with Khalid's army²,⁽²⁾ Then they were taken to Khalid, who ordered Malik to be executed. Malik turned to his wife and said to Khalid: "This is the one who killed me." His wife was extremely beautiful. Khalid said: "No, Allah killed you for becoming an apostate." "I am a Muslim (not an apostate)", retorted Malik. After beheading him, Khalid ordered his head to be used as a stove stone. He married Malik's wife the same night (without even bothering for the iddah – the compulsory waiting period – as stipulated in Islamic law) while Malik's body had not yet been buried.³,⁽¹⁾³

Similar was the destiny of the Kindah tribes: Abu Bakr's agent, Ziyaad Ibn Labid al-Bayadi, took a she-camel from a young man of the Kindah tribe. The young man told him to take some other one, but he refused on the pretext that he had

¹ Look up his biography in al-Isaabah, vol. 3, p. 336 No. 7698.

² Al-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed., vol. 1, pp. 1927-82 and al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, Eu. ed., vol. 2, p. 131.

³ Look up Abu al-Fida's Tarikh, p. 158, Wafayaat al-A'yaan, Fawaat al-wafayaat and other reference books. The detailed story can be found in 'Abdullah Ibn Saba', vol. 1, pp. 185-191 by this author.

already branded it with the brand of charity.¹(2)4 The young man went to one of the chiefs of Kindah, named Harithah Ibn Suraaqah, and said to him: "O cousin! Ziyaad Ibn Labid has taken one of my she-camels and stamped it with the charity camels. I do like that one. Please try to talk to him to release it and take another one instead." Harithah came to Ziyaad and said to him: "It would be kind of you if you could return this young man's camel to him and took another one instead" Ziyaad said: "It has already been branded as charity." Words were exchanged between them. Finally, Harithah came to the camels of the charity and took out the wanted she-camel, and told the young man: "Take your she-camel. If anybody protested, I would break his nose with the sword," adding, "We had obeyed the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his life. Had a member of his household come over, we would have obeyed him, too. But the son of Abu Qahafah, by Allah, we owe him neither obedience nor allegiance," and he composed some poetry, including the following line:

We obeyed the Messenger of Allah as he was among us,

So I am astonished at those who obey Abu Bakr.

Al-Harith Ibn Mu'awiyah, one of the leaders of Kindah said: "You are calling (us) to obey a man to whom neither we nor you have any obligation."

Ziyaad said to him: "You are right, but we chose him for this affair."

Al-Harith said: "Tell me, why did you push his (viz. the Prophet's) family away from it, while they have more right to it than all people? Allah, the Exalted, says: **'... the relatives (on the maternal side) have greater claim to one another in the ordinance of Allah'** (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 6)

Ziyaad said: "The Emigrants and the Ansar knew better than you."

"No, by Allah!" said al-Harith, "You removed it from its people only because you envied them. It can never settle in my heart that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) left this world without appointing a guide for the people to follow. So, leave us, O man. You are not calling to an agreeable affair."

Ziyaad sent the charity camels to al-Madinah before him. Thereafter, he travelled to Madina and informed Abu Bakr about the matter. Abu Bakr supplied him with 4000 fighters. Ziyaad headed with them for Hadhramoot. On the way, he took the Kindah tribes by surprise, killing a number of them and capturing others, such as

¹ Futuh al-Buldaan: The Apostasy of Banu Wali'ah and al-Ash'ath Ibn Qays.

Banu Hind whom he attacked, killed a group of them and captured their women and children.

Then he came to Banu al-‘Aqil region of Kindah, unawares. When they saw the army, the women began to cry and there were clashes between the raiders and the men of the region for a while, but they were defeated, and Ziyaad captured their women and took their property.

In the heart of the night, he attacked, with his forces, the region of Banu Haajar of al-Kindah tribe. Two hundred men of them were killed, fifty were captured and the others ran away, while the women and the children were captured.

Then al-Ash‘ath Ibn Qays fought Ziyaad and besieged them in the town of Taym, and took back from him the women and the children and returned them to their families. Abu Bakr sent to al-Ash‘ath a conciliatory letter. But he said to the envoy: "Your friend, Abu Bakr, ascribes infidelity to us because we differed with him, but he does not ascribe infidelity to his friend (meaning Ziyaad) for killing my kinsfolk and cousins."

The envoy said: "Yes, Ash‘ath, he does ascribe infidelity to you because Allah, the Exalted, has called you infidels as you differed with the majority of the Muslims."

A slave of al-Ash‘ath’s cousins struck him with his sword and killed him. Al-Ash‘ath approved that but his companions were angry at it and most of them deserted him till there remained only some two thousand people with him. Ziyaad sent a letter informing Abu Bakr that his envoy had been killed and they were besieged, who consulted the Muslims on the issue. Abu Ayyub al-Ansari said: "They are numerous in number, and if they tried to mass their men, they could mobilize a great army. So, if you keep your troops away from them this year, you may hope to have them bring you their zakat next year willingly."

Abu Bakr said: "By Allah if they refused me a [camel’s] tying cord the Prophet had imposed upon them, I would fight them for it till they return aright." He wrote to ‘Ikrimah Ibn Abi Jahl to gather as many of the people of Makkah as he could, and of the people of other quarters on his way to join Ziyaad. ‘Ikrimah set out with two thousand fighters of Quraysh and their allies and set out to Ma’rib. The people of Daba, hearing about his advance, were enraged and said: "We shall engage them to prevent them from fighting our cousins of the Kindah tribe". They

dismissed Abu Bakr's agent from their town. Abu Bakr wrote to 'Ikrimah to march to them and severely punish them, and to send the captives to him. 'Ikrimah went to them, fought them and besieged them. So, they suggested peace and paying the zakat. 'Ikrimah refused, insisted on their surrender and they accepted. 'Ikrimah entered their fortress, killed their noble ones, captured their women and children, took their properties and sent the others to Abu Bakr, who intended to kill the men and distribute the women and the children, but 'Umar told him: "O Caliph of the Messenger of Allah, these people follow Islam.. They swear by Allah they have not turned apostates." So, Abu Bakr imprisoned them until he died and 'Umar, who succeeded him, released them.

'Ikrimah went to Ziyaad. Hearing the news, al-Ash'ath took refuge in the fortress of al-Najir, where he gathered his women and the women of his people. This news reached the other Kindah tribes who had quitted al-Ash'ath because of the killing of Abu Bakr's envoy. They blamed one another for leaving their cousins to be besieged. They mobilized their forces and moved to fight Ziyaad, who was worried. 'Ikrimah told him: "I suggest you stay here on your besige, while I go out to meet these people." Ziyaad said: "Well said. If Allah gave you victory over them, do not sheath your sword before extinguishing them all." "I will certainly do that if I can." 'Ikrimah said.

'Ikrimah went until he met the people of Kindah and there the battle had its ups and downs, while al-Ash'ath knew nothing of that and the blockade continued for a long time, until hunger and thirst compelled al-Ash'ath to ask for peace and amnesty for himself, his family and ten of his notable companions, in a letter to Ziyaad. Ziyaad sent the letter to 'Ikrimah, who informed the tribes of Kindah about it and showed them the letter, as a result of which the tribes stopped the fight and went away.

Ziyaad entered the fortress and started killing the captured fighters. A letter from Abu Bakr reached him, telling him to dipatch those who surrendered to al-Madinah. So, he chained the rest of them and dispatched them to al-Madinah.¹(1)1

¹ This story was summarized from "Futuh al-Buldaan by al-Balaadhuri, concerning the apostasy of Banu Wali'ah and al-Ash'ath Ibn Qays al-Kindi, pp. 122 & 123. Mu'jam al-Buldaan by al-Hamawi, under Hadhramoot. Al-Futuh by Ibn A'tam, vol.

Thus, Abu Bakr's caliphate was established; a caliphate which was described by 'Umar to be "a hurried and erroneous affair", and on which was based the succeeding caliphates of 'Umar and 'Uthman, since it was taken as an evidence to prove their argument.

C. Discussing the Companions' Acts as an Evidence

Taking the acts of the Companions as an evidence could be acceptable had they been regarded as a source of the Islamic legislation, like the Holy Quran and the Sunnah of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), or had there been such revelations as there were in favour of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), such as: **"Certainly you have in the Messenger of Allah an excellent example..."** (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 21) and: **"...and whatever the Messenger tells you, accept it, and from whatever he forbids you, keep away."** (Surah Hashr (59): Verse 7).

In the absence of such endorsements, the acts of the Companions cannot be an evidence against us. We do not know, however, whom we should follow from the companions since their deeds and words are contradictory, such as their different opinions about how the Caliphate should be established: Is it established by a single man's allegiance, such as when al-Abbas, the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) uncle, said to 'Ali (peace be on him): "Extend your hand to give you my allegiance, so will the people do"? or is it established according to 'Umar who said: "Abu Bakr's allegiance was an error"? or should we emulate Muawiyah when he drew his sword against the lawful Caliph, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)? We do not think that there would be any need for any further discussions. As to the argument depending on Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) statement in Nahj al-Balaaghah, we shall study the same now:

Discussing the Evidence taken from Nahj al-Balaaghah in Favour of the Consultation, the Allegiance and the Acts of the Companions

It is argued in favour of the Consultative Committee (Shooraa), the allegiance and acts of the Companions, depending on what al-Sharif al-Razi quoted from Imam

1, pp. 57 & 58. Look up 'Abdullah Ibn Saba' for complete details, vol. 2, pp. 393 - 410.

‘Ali’s (peace be on him) letter to Mu’awiyah, the contents of which are as follows:

"Those who had given their allegiance to Abu Bakr, ‘Umar and ‘Uthman have given it to me on the same grounds on which they had given it to them. So, those who were present had no right to choose, and those who were absent had no right to reject. But the consultation is for the Migrants and the Ansar. If they agreed on a man and took him as an Imam, it would get Allah’s pleasure. If anybody departed from their agreement through refutation or innovation, they would return him to where he departed. If he refused, they would fight him for following other than the course of the believers, and Allah would turn him to what he (himself) had turned to..."¹(1)

Imam (peace be on him and his progeny), in this letter, argued against Mu’awiyah by the evidence of the allegiance, the Consultative Committee (Shooraa) and the unanimous resolution of the Migrants and the Ansar, and thus, it seems that Imam Ali (peace be on him) approved the establishment of the Imamate that way.

The answer is that al-Sharif al-Razi some times used to select fragments of Imam’s (peace be on him) speeches and letters for their being top in eloquence, while ignoring the other aspects (like authenticity of chain of narrators and contents). This is one such instance. The complete text of the above letter is quoted by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim in his book “Siffīn”, :

“In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

My allegiance in al-Madinah obliges you in Syria because those who had given their allegiance to Abu Bakr, ‘Umar and ‘Uthman have given it to me on the same grounds on which they had given it to them. So, neither the present had the right to choose nor the absent the right to reject. But the consultation is for the Migrants and the Ansar. If they agreed on a man and took him as an Imam, it would please Allah. If anybody departed from their agreement through refutation or innovation, they would return him to where he departed from. If he refused they would fight him for following other than the course of the believers, and Allah would turn him to what he (himself) had turned to and enter him into Hell - and

¹ Nahjul Balagah and Ibn Abil Hadid’s commengtary, book VI of the Chapter "Selected letters of our master, Amirul Mu’minīn."

*how evil a destination it is. Talha and al-Zubair did give me their allegiances, but then they undid it. Their undoing was as their return. I fought them on that until truth came and Allah's command appeared, to which they were unwilling. So, join the Muslims in what they accepted. The best thing for you vis-à-vis me is safety lest you be exposed to calamity. So, if you resist, I will fight you, asking Allah's help. I have talked excessively about the murderers of 'Uthman. So, enter into that which the Muslims have entered into, then bring them to me for trial, and I shall judge them and judge you according to the Book of Allah. As to that which you want, it is but like deceiving an infant away from milk. By my life, if you look with your reason, not with your desire, you will find me the most innocent among Quraysh vis-a-vis 'Uthman's blood. Do not forget that you are¹ of the tulaqaa' who can neither become caliphs nor should be consulted. I have sent to you, and to others, Jarir Ibn 'Abdillah. He is of the people of faith and of the Migrants. So, give your allegiance, and there is no power except by Allah."*²(2)2

It is clear to us that Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), in this letter, uses the evidence which Mu'awiyah and his ilk had already used, as he tells him: *"My allegiance in al-Madinah, O Mu'awiyah, obliges you in Syria, as you were obliged by 'Uthman's allegiance when you were in Syria. Likewise my allegiance obliged others like you living outside al-Madinah, as they were obliged by 'Umar's allegiance in al-Madinah while they were in other places."*³

Thus, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) argued Mu'awiyah to be obliged by what he himself and his ilk had obliged themselves among the School of the Caliphs of that time. This is common among the reasoning people, as they use against their adversaries the very evidence they had already accepted.

Furthermore, Imam Ali (peace be on him) said: *"If they agreed on a man and took him as an Imam, it would please (Allah)."* In some copies it is: *"it would be a pleasure"*³(1)1, ie: It would be a pleasure to them", provided that they had given their allegiance of their own free will, not forcibly under the sword's blade. Yet,

¹ Tulaqaa' is the plural of taaliq, which denotes a prisoner of war who had been set free, as happened when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set free the people of Makkah instead of capturing them as prisoners of war after the conquest of the city.

² Siffin by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim, Cairo ed. 1382 H., p. 29.

³ Look up Nahj al-Balaaghah, printed in al-Istiqamah, Cairo. There (Allah) is put between two brackets, denoting that it was not stated in the manuscripts.

even if it is supposed that he did say: *It would please Allah*", we say: Yes, what had unanimously been accepted by the Migrants and the Ansar, including Imam 'Ali and his two sons, Hasan and Husain (peace be on them all), would please Allah.

Finally I say: Why did they take that saying from Nahj al-Balaaghah and forgot, or neglected, other sayings of Imam (peace be on him), also quoted by al-Sharif al-Razi in Nahj al-Balaaghah, such as his saying when he heard about the happenings in Saqîfah, after the death of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He (peace be on him) asked:

"*What did the Ansar say?*"

"They said: 'From us an Emir and from them an Emir,'" he was told.

He (peace be on him) questioned: "*Why did you not argue against them that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had recommended that the good ones of them [the Ansar] should be treated kindly, and the bad ones should be forgiven?*"

He (peace be on him) was asked: "What is there against them in that?"

"*Had the Emirate been in them, they would not have needed to be thus recommended,*" he (peace be on him) replied.

Then he (peace be on him) asked: "*What did Quraysh say?*"

"They argued that they were the tree of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)," they told him.

He (peace be on him) said: "*They argued with the tree, and squandered the fruit.*"¹(2)2

He (peace be on him) had also said: "*How astonishing! The Caliphate (merely) through Companionship is accepted, but through Companionship and kinship (both) is not accepted?!!*"²(3)3

Imam's (peace be on him) most comprehensive speech on this subject is that which is called al-Siqshiqiyyah (Sermon No. 3 in Nahj al-Balaaghah), in which he (peace be on him) complained: "...By Allah! The son of Abu Qahaafah [Abu Bakr] put it [the caliphate] on, while he certainly knew that my position in relation to it was like the position of the axis vis-à-vis the hand-mill. The waterfall

¹ By "the fruit" he meant the family of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

² Nahj al-Balaaghah, Maxim No. 185, edited by Muhammad Abu al-Fadl Ibrahîm.

(of knowledge) flows down from me and the bird (of intellect) cannot fly up to me, but I let a curtain against it [the caliphate] and turned away from it. I began to reflect whether I should assault with a cut-off hand or endure a blinding darkness where in the grown-up get old, the young become white-haired; and the believer toils till he meets his Lord. I found patience more proper. So, I forbore with a thorn in the eye and a bone in the throat, seeing my inheritance plundered till the first passed away, handing it over to so-and-so after him... How strange! During his lifetime he wished to be released from it¹(1)1, yet he confirmed it for the other after his death. Much did they both share of its udders, putting it in a rough circle, with thick wounding and coarse touching. Its errors are plenty and so are one's apologies. With it one is as riding an unruly camel: if one pulled its reins, its nostrils would be slit, and if one let it loose, he would perish. So, by Allah, the people got afflicted with recklessness, wickedness, infirmity and deviation.

Nevertheless, I forbore despite the length of time and the severity of the trial, till, passing away, he [‘Umar] put it up to a group and feigned that I was one of them. Good Heavens! What a consultative council it was!²(2)2 When was there any

¹ It is narrated that Abu Bakr, after the allegiance, said: "Discharge me, as I am not the best of you."

² The details of this case, on the most trusted authorities, have already been related. Shaykh Muhammad‘Abdoh, in his explanation of this, said: "Sa‘d was a cousin to ‘Abd al-Rahman, and both were of Banu Zuhrah. He had something against ‘Ali (may Allah honour his face) on the part of his maternal uncles, because his mother was Hamnah bint Sufyan Ibn Umayyah Ibn ‘Abd al-Shams. Moreover, ‘Ali was known as the killer of their valients. Abd al-Rahman was ‘Uthman’s brother-in-law, as his wife, Ummu Kulthum bint ‘Uqbah Ibn Abi Mi‘yat was ‘Uthman’s maternal sister. Talhah was inclined to ‘Uthman for certain relations between them, as stated by some narrators. For his inclination towards ‘Uthman, it suffices to mention his disinclination towards ‘Ali, as he was a Taymi, and there were between Banu Hashim and Banu Taym some grudges because of the post of the caliphate given to Abu Bakr. After the death of ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, they gathered, consulted and disagreed. Talhah supported ‘Uthman, while al-Zubair supported ‘Ali, and Sa‘ad supported Abd al-Rahman. ‘Umar had willed that the consultation should not take more than three days, such that when the fourth day came, they should have already chosen their Emir, as he had said: ‘Should there appear any disagreement be with the group supported by ‘Abd al-Rahman. Abd al-Rahman came to ‘Ali and told him: ‘You should give your word to act according to the Book of Allah, his Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) tradition and

doubt in me in respect of the first of them that I have been now regarded to this (group) of equals? But I kept flying low as they did so, and flew high as they did so. One of them was drifted by his hatred¹(1)1, the other tended to his brother-in-law²(2)2, and other reasons³(3)3, until the third of them⁴(4)4 leaped, blowing high his chest, out of his dung and trough, and with him rose his father's children [family] to devour Allah's treasury like a camel devouring spring vegetation, till his rope (of life) snapped and his deeds finished him off and his gluttony caused him to tumble down. Nothing was more surprising to me than the people, like the mane of the hyena, rushing to me from everywhere, such that the two Hasans [his two sons, Hasan and Husain – peace be on them both] were trampled upon, and my ribs (almost) broke. They crowded around me like the pen of the sheep..

Yet, when I shouldered the affair (of Caliphate), a group broke (their allegiance), another deviated, and others acted wrongfully, as if they had never heard the

the conducts of the two Caliphs after him.' Ali said: 'I hope to do and act according to my knowlege and ability.' Then he called 'Uthman and told him like that. He said: 'Yes,' 'Abd al-Rahman then raised his head to the ceiling of the mosque where they had gathered, and said: 'O Allah, hear and bear witness. I placed on 'Uthman's shoulder what was on my shoulder.' He then clapped his hand onto 'Uthman's and said: 'Peace be on you, O Chief of the faithfuls!', and paid his allegiance to him. It is said that Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) went out displeased. Al-Miqdad Ibn Aswad al-Du'ali said to Abd al-Rahman: 'By Allah, you had left 'Ali, who judges with truth and justice.' 'O Miqdad,' said Abd al-Rahman, 'I have tried my best for the Muslims.' Al-Miqdad retorted: 'By Allah, I am astonished by Quraysh! They have left away a man I know none to be better than him in judging with truth, and none to be more knowledgable.' Abd al-Rahman said: 'O Miqdad, I am afraid you are risking yourself into revolt, so, fear Allah!' Later, when many events took place in the days of 'Uthman by his relatives in respect to ruling the countries, and when the notable Companions were angry with him, it is narrated that 'Abd al-Rahman had been told. 'This is of your own doing.' He replied: 'I did not expect that from him, but I swear by Allah that I would never speak to him.' Abd al-Rahman died later while still avoiding 'Uthman. It was even said that he was visited by 'Uthman during his illness, but he turned his face away from 'Uthman to the wall. Allah knows better, the judgement is Allah's and He does what he wills."

¹ An allusion to Sa'd.

² An allusion to 'Abd al-Rahman

³ He refers to other purposes which he disliked mentioning. We have already mentioned some of them in our discusssion of the Consultative Committee (Shoora).

⁴ Referring to 'Uthman.

words of the Allah saying: "That abode in the Hereafter, We assign it for those who do not intend to exult themselves in the earth nor cause mischief, and the (good) result is for the pious ones." (Surah Qasas (28): Verse 83) Yes, they had heard it and comprehended it, but the world appeared beautiful in their eyes and its embellishment attracted them. By Him Who split the seed (to grow and created living beings, had it not been for the presence of those present, had it not been for the evidence of the existence of supporters and had it not been for the fact that Allah had taken the covenant from the scholars that they should not acquiesce in the satiety of the wrongdoer and in the starvation of the wrongdoer, I would have thrown its rein (the rule's) upon its shoulders, and made the last (ruler) drink from the cup of the first. Then you would find that this world of yours is less trivial to me than a goat's sneeze."

It is said that at that moment: "A man from Iraq stood up and handed him (peace be on him) a letter. He (peace be on him) took it and indulged in reading it. Ibn 'Abbas said to him: 'Will not you resume your speech whence you broke it?'

He said: '*O Ibn 'Abbas! Never! It was like the foaming of an angry camel that brayed, then calmed down.*'

Ibn 'Abbas reflected: 'I have never regretted anything more than regretting this speech which Amirul Mu'minîn (peace be on him) did not bring to where he wanted.'

They forgot, or tried to forget, all these speeches of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and clung to a saying which Imam 'Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) used as an argument against Mu'awiyah, because Mu'awiyah and his ilk did adhere to it.

D. Discussing the Evidence of the Establishment of the Caliphate by Force and Conquer

Whoever studies Islamic history will realize that the ruling caliphate, down to the Ottoman Caliphs, was based on compulsion. Only exceptionally it was otherwise, such as the rule of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him and his progeny). This is, however, a matter of fact, and we have no objection whatsoever.

But, as to their saying: "If somebody overcomes them by the sword and becomes a caliph and is called Amirul Mu'minîn, none who believed in Allah and in the last day would have the right to pass his night without recognizing him as an Imam,

whether he is righteous or a transgressor", I wonder what these eminent personalities were talking about: Is it Allah's shari'ah for the establishment of the rule in the Islamic community that they talk about, or is it the law of the jungle for a community of lions and tigers which they imply? Now, in order to excuse ourselves for resorting only to the sayings and beliefs of people of old times, as not being belived in by the contemporaries, and demand that we should "be in the present time of Islam",¹(1)I we reprint hereunder the photocopy of the cover of a book printed for the schools of a country in which is the Ka'bah, the Sacred House, and the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Mosque and Shrine. It reads thus:

The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia - Ministry of Education School Libraries

Facts About Amirul Mu'minîn Yazîd Ibn Mu'awiyah

The book praises Yazid and narrates hadith in his admiration. The same Yazid who attacked the Holy Ka'bah with catapults of fire-balls and declared the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) mosque and its environs to be unrestricted for three days, permitting his army to kill the men and outrage the modesty of women, the details of which will be related under "The Army of the Caliphate plunders the city of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny)" and under "The March of the Army of the Caliphate to Makkah".

Obeying the Tyrannical Imam Contradicts the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

We have mentioned, in the discussion of the obligatory obedience to the Imam according to the School of Caliphate, that they narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had prohibited revolting against the despotic ruler, even if he contradicts the Sunnah of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), and ordered that he should be obeyed (under all circumstances). The Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school, on the other hand, quotes the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), contradicting

¹ Al-Azhar Magazine, vol. 32, Baab al-Kutub Vol. 10, 1380 H. pp. 1150 & 1151, criticizing Abdullah Ibn Saba'.

the other School, such as the narrative narrated by Imam Husain (peace be on him) the grandson of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), quoting his grand father, who said: *"Whoever witnesses a despotic ruler, permitting Allah's prohibitions, breaking His pledge, acting contrary to the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), treating the servants of Allah with sins and transgression, (then this witness) does not try to change him (the despotic ruler) by deed or word, it would be a right upon Allah to make him (the witness) enter through the same entrance (of the tyrant)."*¹(1)

By comparing this and similar narratives with those narrated by the School of Caliphate, we realize that the narratives of the School of Caliphate had been fabricated and ascribed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), with the malafide intention of supporting the rulers of the Muslims, an activity that was rampant in the early days of the Bani Umayyah. They fabricated such narratives during the period of recording the hadiths, early in the second century of Hijri, in the books of traditions, in the so-called Sahih and Musnads, blindly accepting them to be true, practicing and explaining them and commenting on them. They were confirmed by the scholars, narrators, judges, orators, the Imams of Friday and congregational prayers and their ilk, who were on the payroll of the ruling courts, along ages and in different lands, ever since the Umayyad era in Syria, in Spain (then known as Andalus), then during the Abbasid era in Baghdad, the Ottomans in Turkey, the Mamlukes in Egypt, the Seljuks and the Ghaznavids in Iran and the Kurds in Syria. These narrators received from the rulers hefty bounties, elevated positions and huge amounts of wealth, supported by the groups of their followers.

¹ A part of the speech of the Imam Husain (peace be on him) addressing the army of Hurr Ibn Yazid al-Riqa'hi, look up al-Tabari's Tarikh, Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh and Khaarazmi's Maqalat

Consequently, the Muslims were divided into two schools: The School of the Caliphate, whose rulers were liberal with their gifts, positions, posts and wealth which they bestowed upon the advocates of the opinions of their School, while Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School, which resisted the spread of such opinions and narratives in support of the rulers and their ideologies, were at the receiving end of killings, imprisonment, dislodgement, pogroms and systemic burning of books and libraries through the centuries¹(1)1. Needless to mention, the purpose of these barbaric deeds was to keep the ideas that try to preserve the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), out of the community and conceal them from the Muslims.²(2)2

After all, what are the facts that reach unto us at in this era?

Conclusion

The trend which dominated the acts and words in Saqifah was tribal, both with the Migrants and the Ansar. Abu Bakr's allegiance on that day was - as 'Umar put it - an error.

'Umar, in suggesting the establishment of the caliphate by means of consultation, did not offer any evidence from the Book or the sunnah. He acted according to his own opinion. He opined that six persons, no more, were to appoint the master of the affair (i.e. the ruler) after him. He opined that the said concil should be of the Migrants, not of the Ansar. He opined that the nomination should be entrusted to none other than 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf, saying: "If two persons agreed on a man, and another two on another man, be with the group supported by 'Abd al-Rahman." He opined and said: "If 'Abd al-Rahman clapped one hand on the other, follow him."

So, those who took the opinion of 'Umar to go by the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as sources of Islamic legislation, would say that Imamate can be established by the consultation of six persons, such that five of them would give their allegiance to the sixth.

¹ The relevant details will be explained under "The Mongols' Attack on Islamic countries", in this book, Insha'allah.

² These will, insha'allah, be expanded upon in the following discussions.

As for the verse: "**..and their affair is a consultation among them..**", it denotes no more than the preference of consultation in a matter about which nothing had come from either Allah the High or His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) because whenever Allah wanted to order something, He would say: Allah ordained, ordered, enjoined, advised or commanded so and so, or any other expressions denoting obligation, whereas the said verse, addressed to the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) refers to the consultation about the battles with the intention of educating the Muslims, or for creating doubt and discord among the polytheists. It concerned in entirety the explanation of carrying out a religious precept and not to know a religious precept. Yet, they did not show how a consultation should be for appointing an Imam. We, however, do know how the consultation for giving the allegiance to 'Uthman had been carried out. So much for consultation.

As regards the allegiance, it cannot be obtained through compulsion and under the threat of the sword, nor is it concluded to commit an act of disobeying Allah, nor is it given to a person who disobeys Allah.

Concerning the conduct of the Companions, if these were to be regarded, like the Book and the Sunnah, a source of Islamic legislation, then it would be right to offer them as evidence. If they were not, then they could not be accepted as an evidence.

The speech of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) which had been presented as a proof, was, actually, a way of arguing against an opponent according to the proof which he himself acknowledged - a method much practised by rational people. However, the unanimity of the Companions, including Imam 'Ali, the Imam Hasan and the Imam Husain (peace be on them), means assent, as described by Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

As for their saying: "Whoever triumphed by the sword would be the Chief of the faithfuls and his obedience is a (religious) duty, notwithstanding his being righteous or a transgressor," it is the actuality followed by them, as is evident to the one who studies the history of the rulers (caliphs) in Islam.

This was a study of the opinions of the School of Caliphate and their evidences. As for the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School, we will study its opinions and evidences in the next discussion, with Allah's power.

Chapter Three

The Discussions of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School on Imamate

The Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) concern about appointing the rulers after him.

The Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) heir, vizier and successor after him.

The School of Caliphate tries hard to conceal the news of succession.

Studying the School of Caliphate's attempts to apply the texts of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah contrary to their objectives.

The spread of Saif's narratives from al-Tabari's Tarikh in the books of history and its cause.

Other texts received from the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning the rule after him.

The appointment of the successor for this nation resembles the successor for the people of Prophet Moosa (peace be on him).

The mastership and the possessors of authority in the Glorious Qur'an

Imam 'Ali and his offspring (peace be on them) are conveyers for the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

In the previous discussion, we stated the opinions of the School of Caliphate about Imamate and their proofs.

But the followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School say that the Imam after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) must be infallible, appointed by Allah and explicitly named by His Prophet. Their proof in this regard is Allah's saying to His friend Ibraheem (peace be on him):

"... Surely I am making you an Imam of the people. Ibraheem said: 'And of my offspring?' 'My covenant does not include the unjust,' said He" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 124)

Thus, the Imamate is a covenant from Allah the High informing His Prophet about the one to whom it was given, like his being informed about other commands and verdicts from Allah. This covenant is not given to the unjust. Whoever is not unjust to himself or to others is infallible.

Therefore, Imamate is an assignment from Allah, communicated by the Messenger, and necessitates infallibility. Both these conditions are fulfilled in the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), as will be explained.

Infallibility of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

Allah, the Exalted and Glorified, had communicated that the Ahl al-Bait, ie. Muhammad, 'Ali, Fatimah, Hasan and Husain (peace be on them all) were infallible, in the verse:

"Allah only wants to keep away the uncleanness from you, O Ahl al-Bait, and to purify you thoroughly." (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 33)

The Cause of the Revelation of this Verse and what the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) did on this Occasion

Abdullah Ibn Ja'far Ibn Abi Talib¹(1)1 narrates:

"Seeing divine mercy descend, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"Call for me! Call for me!"* Safiyyah²(2)2 said: "Whom, O Messenger of Allah?"

¹ Mustadrak al-Saheehain, vol. 3, p. 147: Abdullah Ibn Ja'far, Dhu al-Janaahayn (possessor of two wings), son of Abu Talib, the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) uncle. His mother was Asma' bint 'Umays of Khath'am. He was born in al-Habashah during his parents migration to that land. Thereafter, his father took him to Madinah. He was forbearing and generous and was called: "The ocean of generosity". He died in Madinah in the year 80 A.H., the year of jihat, ie. the year in which there was a great flood in the valley of Makkah that drifted the pilgrims and the camels with their loads. The authors of the sahihs quoted him for 25 hadiths. His biography is in Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 282.

² Safiyyah bint Hubayy Ibn Akhtab, the offspring of (Prophet) Haroon Ibn 'Imran of the Children of Israel. Her mother was Barrah bint al-Samaw'al of Banu Qurayzah. The wife of Kinanah Ibn al-Rabi' was from the Jews of Banu al-Nadhîr. Her husband was killed in the Battle of Khaibar. The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) chose her for himself and told her: *"If you accept Islam I will keep you for myself. But if you preferred Judaism, I will set you free and let you join your people."* She replied: "O Messenger of Allah! I liked Islam and believed in you before you invited me, and so I came to your place. I have no desire in Judaism nor have I among them a father or brother. You gave me the option to select between disbelief and Islam. Allah and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) are more beloved to me than to be free and return to my people." So, after the elapse of a widow's waiting period (iddah), the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) married her. She died in the year 52 A.H. She was quoted by the authors of the Sahihs for ten hadiths. Her biography is in Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 8, pp. 120-129, and in Jawaame' al-Seerah, pp. 2-5.

"My family," he said, "Ali, Fatimah¹, Hasan and Husain."

¹ Fatimah the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and her mother Khadijah, the mother of believers. Her biography, is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and al-'Isaabah, she was called "Umm Abiha", i.e. "Her father's mother".

The Prophet's progeny ceased except through her. The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) once said to her: "*Allah becomes angry if you are angry, and becomes pleased if you are pleased.*" This is also stated by al-Haakem in his al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 153, in Mizan al-E'tedaal, vol. 2, p. 77, in Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb, vol. 12, p. 441, in Sahih al-Bukhari, Chapter on "Fatimah's (peace be on her and her progeny) Merits", vol. 4, pp. 200, 201 & 205. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Fatimah is a part of me. Whoever angers her angers me*".

In another narrative, in Sahih al-Bukhari, in the Chapter on "Defending One's Household" of book "Al-Nikah", vol. 3, p. 177, in Sahih Muslim, al-Tirmidhi and Musnad-o-Ahmad, under Chapter on "Fatimah's (peace be on her and her progeny) Merits" vol. 4, pp. 41 & 328, and in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 153, it says: "*hurts me what hurts her*" or "*hurted her.*" The last to see the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) before he went on a travel was Fatimah (peace be on her and her progeny), and the first to see him on his return, as is stated in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, pp. 155 & 156, vol. 1, p. 489, Musnad-o-Ahmad and al-Baihaqi's Sunan.

In Sahih al-Bukhari, vol.2, p. 124, Chapter on "The Imposition of Khums", quoting 'A'ishah who said that Fatimah (peace be on her and her progeny) asked Abu Bakr after the death of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to give her what she had inherited from her father. Abu Bakr replied: "The Messenger of Allah said: 'We do not leave heritage, what we leave is charity.'" Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) got angry, and kept away from Abu Bakr, and remained to do so till her death. She lived after her father for six months.

In the same book, in the Chapter on the Battle of Khaibar, vol. 3, p. 38: "When she died, her husband buried her at night without informing Abu Bakr, and he performed the funeral prayers. When Fatimah was alive, people used to respect 'Ali a lot but after her death, 'Ali noticed a change in their attitudes towards him. So, he sought reconciliation with Abu Bakr..." This is also narrated by Muslim in his Sahih in the Book of Jihad, vol. 5, p. 154, and in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 9, and in Sunan al-Baihaqi, vol. 6, p. 30. In her biography in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, it is said: "...and she asked Asma' to wash her and not allow anybody to meet her. When she died, 'A'isha came but Asma' stopped her.

The Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) put his cloak over them, raised his hands and said: "*O Allah, these are my family; so, send your blessings on Muhammad and Muhammad's progeny.*" Allah, the Exalted and Almighty, revealed the verse: "**Allah only wants to keep away the uncleanness from you, O Ahl al-Bait, and purify you a thorough purification.**" (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 33).

In the narrative of 'A'ishah: The cloak was a designed black cover made of hair.¹(1)1

The author said: The place of her grave remains unknown till date. The authors of the Sahihs quoted 18 hadiths from her, as in Jawami' al-Seerah, p. 283. Hasanayn are Hasan and Husain, the two nephews of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and the sons of 'Ali and Fatimah. Hasan (peace be on him) was born on the 15th of Ramadan, in the third year after the Hijrah.

Al Husain (peace be on him) was born on the third of Shaban in the fourth year of Hijrah. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said about them: "*Hasan and Husain are the masters of the youths of the dwellers of Paradise, and their father is better than them.*" Look up Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, Chapter on "The Merits of the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)", Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 167 and other sources. Hasan (peace be on him) was given the allegiance after his father, in the year 40 A.H. He remained as caliph for more than six months; later, the higher interests of Islam compelled that he should come to terms with Mu'awiyah. When Mu'awiyah wanted to get the allegiance for his son, Yazid, he got Hasan (peace be on him) killed by poison, in 50 A.H. Look up Ahadith Ummul Mu'minin 'A'ishah, vol. 1, pp. 251-266.

In 60 A.H., Husain (peace be on him) refused to pay allegiance to Yazid, saying: "*Islam will be finished if the nation had a ruler like Yazid.*" Yazid's army martyred him in Karbala', on the 10th of the month of Muharram, in 61 A.H. Look up Al-Luhuf by Sayed Ibn Tawus (r.a.). The authors of the Sahihs quoted 13 hadiths from him, except al-Bukhari and Muslim. Husain (peace be on him) was quoted for 8 hadiths. Look up Jawami'us-sirah, pp. 284 & 286, and Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 168

¹ 'A'ishah is the daughter of Abu Bakr, Her mother was Ummu Ruman. She was born in the 4th year of Hijri after professing Islam by the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), she was married to him (peace be on him and his progeny) 18 months after Hijrah. She died in the year 57, 58 or 59 A.H. Abu Hurayrah performed her funeral prayers. The authors of the sahihs quoted her for 2210 hadiths. Refer to our book Ahadith 'A'ishah. Her narrative concerning the above mentioned Aayah al-Tathir [the Verse of Purification] is stated in Sahih Muslim, vol. 7, p. 130, Chapter on "The Merits of the Prophet's Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)",

The Companion, Waa'ilah Ibn al-Asqa', narrates that: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) asked 'Ali and Fatimah (peace be on them both) to sit facing him, and seated Hasan and Husain, each on one of his thighs..." as the narrative goes.¹(2)2

Umm al-Mu'minin, Umm Salamah, narrated: "This verse was revealed in my house: **Allah only wants to keep away the uncleanness from you...**, where there were seven in the house: Gabriel, Michael, 'Ali, Fatimah, Hasan, Husain (may Allah be pleased with them) and myself standing at the door of the house. I said: "O Messenger of Allah, am I not from Ahl al-Bait?" He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*You are on goodness, you are of the Prophet's wives.*"²(3)3

The cause of the revelation of the Verse of Purification (Aayah al-Tatheer) is further confirmed by the following:

'Abdullah Ibn 'Abbas.³(1)1

in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 147, in Ibn Jarir's exegesis of the said verse, in al-Suyuti's al-Durr al-Manthur, in the comentary on the verse of al-Mubaahalalah in the exegeses of al-Zamakhshari and al-Raazi, and in Sunan al-Baihaqi, vol. 2, p. 149.

¹ Waa'ilah Ibn al-Asqa' al-Laythi. He embraced Islam during the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) preparations for the Tabuk Expedition. It is said that he served the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) for three years. He died in the year 83 or 85 A.H. in Damascus or in Jerusalem. The authors of the Sahihs quoted him for 56 hadiths. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Seerah, p. 279. His narration concerning the Verse of Purification is in al-Baihaqi's Sunan, vol. 2, p. 152. Another narration from him is in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 107, in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 2, p. 416 & vol. 3, p. 147, in Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 167, in the exegeses of the verse by Ibn Jarir and al-Suyuti, and in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, p. 20.

² Ummu Salamah's narration is in al-Suyuti's exegesis of this verse, vol. 5, pp. 198 & 199. Another tradition is narrated in al-Tirmidhi's Sunan, vol. 13, p. 248, in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p. 306, in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, p. 29 & vol. 2, p. 297 and in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p. 297. Another narration is in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 2, p. 416 & vol. 3, p. 147, in al-Baihaqi's Sunan, vol. 2, p.150, in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 5, pp. 521 & 589, and in Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol.9, p. 126. Another is in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p. 292

³ The narrative of 'Abdullah Ibn 'Abbas is related in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 330, in al-Nesaa'i's Khasaa'is, p. 11, in al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 269, in Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 119 & 207 and in al-Durr al-Manthur, commenting on the

- b. 'Umar Ibn Abi Salamah,¹(2)2 the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) foster son.
- c. Abu Sa'id al-Khudri.²(3)3
- d. Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqaas.³(4)4
- e. Anas Ibn Maalik⁴(5)5 and others.⁵(6)6

This verse was also recited as an evidence by Hasan (peace be on him) in a speech,⁶(7)7

said verse.

¹ 'Umar Ibn Abi Salamah Ibn 'Abd al-Asad, Abu Hafs al-Makhzumi, the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) foster son. His mother was Umm Salamah. He was born in Habashah. He participated in the Battle of Jamal with 'Ali (peace be on him). 'Ali (peace be on him) appointed him as the governor of Bahrain and Persia. He died in 83 A.H. The authors of the Sahihs have quoted 12 narrations from him. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Sîrah, p. 284. His hadîth about the Verse of Purification is recorded in the book Fadhaael al-Khamsah, vol. 1, p.214, quoting from Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 2, p. 209.

² Abu Sa'id's narration is mentioned in his commentary on the said verse, quoted by Ibn Jarir and al-Suyuti in their Tarikh, in Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol. 10, p. 278, and in Majma' al-Zawa'id, vol. 9, pp. 167 & 168. His biography will come later.

³ Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqaas. His biography had already been mentioned. He refused to give his allegiance to 'Ali (peace be on him), but he also refused to abuse Ali (peace be on him) despite Mu'awiyah's insistence. He was poisoned by Mu'awiyah in trying to obtain the allegiance for Yazid. The authors of the Sahihs quoted him for 271 hadîths. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, in Sahih Muslim, vol. 7, p. 120, and in Ahaadîth Umm al-Mu'minîn 'A'ishah, vol. 1, p. 256, Beirut ed., 1405 A.H. His narration concerning the Verse of Purification is stated in al-Nesaa'i's Khasa'is, pp. 4 & 5, and in Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, pp. 171 & 172

⁴ Anas Ibn Malik's narration is stated in Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 248 and in Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 206

⁵ Such as Qataadah's commentary on the said verse as quoted by Ibn Jarir and al-Suyuti, and 'Atiyyah in his biography in 'Usd al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 413 and Ma'qil Ibn Sinan. See Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 248

and by ‘Ali Ibn Husain (peace be on them both) in Syria.¹(8)8

After the revelation of this verse, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) began, for several months, to come to the door of the house of ‘Ali and Fatimah (peace be on them both), to greet them and recite the said verse. Ibn Abbass said:

"For nine moths I used to see the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) come everyday to the door of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib, at the time of each prayer, and say:

‘As-Salamu ‘alaykum wa rahmatullahi wa barakatuh, Ahl al-Bait. Allah only wants... (till the end of the verse) It is time for the prayers. May Allah have mercy upon you’, five times a day."²(1)1

Abu al-Hamraa’ says: "I remember that for eight months the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) never missed once to come for every morning prayer to the door of ‘Ali, put his hand on the door’s hemistich and say: *Prayers! Allah only wants...*"³ (2)2

⁶ Look up Mustadrak al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 172, and Majma’ al-Zawa’id, vol. 9, pp. 146 & 172

¹ ‘Ali Ibn Husain (peace be on them both), his mother was the daughter of the Persian king, Yazdegird, as is stated in Chapter 10 of Rab’ al-Abraar, by al-Zamakhshari. Look up vol. 2 p. 44, photocopy in Amir al-Mu’minin Library in al-Najaf, No. 2059. Literature. She died on giving birth to him, and so he was taken care of by his step-mothers. Ali Ibn Husain (peace be on them both) married her after the martyrdom of his father (Oyoon-o-Akhbaar al-Reza (peace be on him) vol. 2, p. 128). It appears that her name was Ghazaalah. Ali Ibn Husain (peace be on them both) was martyred in the year 95 A.H. The authors of the Sahihis have narrated some traditions from him and his testimony of the Verse of Purification has come under the verse in Tafseer al-Tabari. His biography is available in Wafayaat al-A’yaan vol. 2, p. 429 and Tarikh al-Yaqoobi, vol. 2, p. 303

² Look up ad-Durrul Manthur for the narrative of Ibn ‘Abbas’s commentary on the said verse and the verse (20:132).

³ Abul Hamraa’, the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) servant. His name is Hilal Ibn al-Harith, or Ibn Zafar. The narrative and his biography are in al-Isti’aab, vol. 2, p. 598, in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 5, p. 174 and in Majma’ al-Zawaa’id, vol. 9, p. 168.

Abu Barzah said that he continued to perform the prayers with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) for seven months. On leaving his house, he used to come to the door of Fatimah's..."¹(3)3

Anas Ibn Malik said: "Six months"².(4)4 There are other narrators, too.

In the said verse, Allah informed about the infallibles during the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in particular. The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) himself pointed them out by spreading the cloak (*kisa'*) over them, and by reciting the said verse in the presence of the father's children, his companions, for several months, at their door.

This verse, together with what the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said and did by way of explaining it, suffice as a proof confirming the infallibility of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them).

Practically speaking, history records nothing against the Imams of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) to refute their infallibility, notwithstanding the fact that most Muslim historians belonged to the Caliphate school. They recorded in the books of the Islamic history things with which they intended to please the rulers along ages. Those rulers left no stone unturned in trying to extinguish the light of the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), so that the Muslims be inclined towards them and give them their allegiance. Consequently, they killed, imprisoned or dislodged many of them, especially at the hands of the Umayyads, who ordered the cursing of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) in the Friday prayers sermons delivered on the pulpits. They did not spare even the friends and the followers of the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them). They tortured and chastised whoever believed in their Imamate. Nevertheless, we cannot trace in the

¹ Abu Barzah al-Aslami. There is uncertainty about his name. He died in Basrah in the year 60 or 64 A.H. The authors of the Sahihs quoted 20 or 26 hadiths from him. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and Jawaame' al-Sirah pp. 280 & 283. His above hadith is in Majma' al-Zawa'id, vol. 9, p. 169 - He said: "seventeen months", but we think it is the copier's mistake.

² Anas's narrative is in Musnad Ahmad vol.3, p. 252, in al-Tayaalesi's, vol.7, p.274, Hadith No. 2509; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol.5, p. 521, and in the exegesis of the said verse by Ibn Jarir and Suyuti.

history even a single trivial fault that could be ascribed to any Imam of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them). This fact is proof enough of their being made infallible by Allah who **"purified them a thorough purification."**

So far, we have related the most important proof of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school confirming their infallibility.

Herunder, we relate some of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadîths about their Imamate, bearing in mind that concerning him Allah the High said: **"And he does not speak out of his whim. It is naught but revelation that is revealed."** (Surah Najm (53): Verses 3 & 4).

The Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Concern About Appointing the 'Ulul Amr After him

Before studying the texts quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning appointing the 'ulul amr after him, we shall first study the concern shown by the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) about it, as below:

The question of Imamate after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was an important affair which did not escape his attention and that of those around him. They actually used to continually think about it from the very beginning. We mentioned Bayharah of Banu 'Aamir Ibn Sa'sa'ah offering to accept Islam on the condition that the rulership should be theirs after the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) death. We also talked about Hudhah al-Hanafi demanding from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) a share of the governance.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) himself was also worried about his succession, planning for it ever since he proclaimed Islam on the very first day he got the allegiance to establish the Islamic community as narrated by al-Bukhari and Muslim in their sahihs, and-Nesaa'i and Ibn Maajah in their Sunan, Maalik in his al-Muwatta', Ahmad in his Musnad and many others. The following quotation is from Sahih al-Bukhari:

‘Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit said: "We gave our allegiance to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) that we shall listen to him and obey him (in ease and in hardship) in agreeable and disagreeable (conditions), and that we shall not dispute the ruler with its people..."¹(1)1

‘Ubaadah was one of the twelve leaders [nuqabaa] of the Ansar on the day of the greater bay‘ah al-‘aqabah,² (1)1 when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to a group of seventy odd Anṣār who gave him their allegiance: "*Select twelve of your leaders to supervise their own people.*" They did so. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) told these leaders: "*You're responsible for your people like the apostles of Jesus, son of Mary (peace be on him) were to him...*"³(2)2

‘Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit was one of those twelve leaders.

A part of the text of their allegiance given to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) included: "... we should not dispute the rule (succession) with its people."

The rule intended by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) - as in this authorised hadith in which he refers to taking the allegiance from 72 men and 2 women of the Ansar that they would not dispute the rule with its people - was that about which they disputed in the Saqifah of Banu Sa‘idah.⁴(3)3 Those

¹ . Sahih al-Bukhari, Book of "al-Ahkam", Chapter on "How people give their allegiance to the Imam", Hadith No. 1, vol. 4, p. 163. The words (in ease and in hardship) are from Sahih Muslim, Book off "al-Emaarah", Chapter on "Obeying the rulers not in a sin, and disobeying them in sinning", Hadiths Nos. 41 & 42. Al-Nesaa'i's Sunan, Book of Allegiance, Chapter on "Allegiance on the condition not to dispute the rule with its people." Ibn Maajah's Sunan, Book of Jihad, Chapter on Allegiance, Hadith No. 2866. Malik's Muwatta', Book of Jihad, Chapter on Incitement for the Jihad, Hadith No. 5; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, pp. 314, 316, 319 & 321, also Look up vol. 4, p. 411. The biography of 'Ubaadah is in "Siyar-o-A'laam al-Nubala'", vol. 2, p. 3 and Ibn 'Asaakir's Tahdhib, vol. 7, pp. 207-219.

² . 'Ubaadah's biography in al-Isti'aab, vol. 2, p. 412, and in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, pp. 106 & 107.

³ Al-Tabari, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 1221.

⁴ Look up the Ansar's tribal dispute with the Migrants, in the Chapter concerning al-Saqifah and Abu Bakr's allegiance, at the beginning of this book.

possessing authority (*ulul amr*) are those whom Allah has mentioned in the verse:
"... obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those possessing authority from among you."¹ (4)4 /(Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 59).

¹ The exegesis of this verse and the Messenger's hadiths concerning the same will come within the discussions of this book, Insha Allah.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not name his successor (*wali al-amr*) because he was not from the Ansar tribe and it was not wise to name him at that particular time. Probably, some of them were unable to tolerate it then. So, he took their allegiance on the condition that they would not dispute with him when he would nominate him for them later.

As a matter of fact, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did name his successor, who would be his heir and caliph, to a group smaller than that one, on the day when he (peace be on him and his progeny) for the first time invited his relatives to Islam, according to the narratives narrated by a group of the narrators of hadiths and biographers, such as: al-Tabari, Ibn 'Asaakir, Ibn al-Athir, Ibn Kathir, al-Muttaqi and others. Hereunder, we quote the narration related by al-Tabari, quoting 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both), who said¹(5)5:

"When the verse 'And warn your nearest relatives...' (Surah Shuaraa (26): Verse 214), was revealed, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called me and said: 'O 'Ali! Allah commanded me to warn my nearest relatives. I felt uneasy about it, knowing that if I informed them about this matter right away, I would see what I dislike. So, I kept silent about it, until Gabriel came to me and said: 'O Muhammad! If you do not carry it out, your Lord will chastise you.' So, prepare food with a leg of mutton on it, and fill up a jug of milk, then summon to me Banu 'Abdul Muttalib, so that I may talk to them and convey to them what I have been ordered to.'

I did as I was ordered. Thereafter, I invited them to him. They were some forty men, approximately, including his uncles: Abu Talib, Hamzah, al-Abbas and Abu Lahab. As they gathered there, he asked me to bring the food I had prepared for them. I brought the food and placed it before them. The Messenger of Allah

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed. vol. 3, pp. 1171-2; Ibn 'Asaakir, edited by al-Mahmudi, vol. 1 or the Imam's biography. Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 222. Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 3, p. 263. In Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 3, p. 39 (wherein some words are omitted and replaced by: "*he said so and so.*" Kanz al-'Ummaal by al-Muttaqi al-Hindi, vol. 15, pp. 100, 115, 116, and on p. 130, it is said: "*He will be my brother and companion, and your master after me.*" Al-Seerah al-Halabiyyah, pulished by al-Islamiyyah Library, Beirut, vol. 1, p. 285

(peace be on him and his progeny) took a piece of the meat, split it by his teeth and threw the pieces at different places of the plate and said: 'Help yourselves in the name of Allah.' They ate till they were more than satiated, while I could see only the places of hands. By Allah in whose hand is 'Ali's soul! Each one of them could eat alone what I had brought for them all. Then he said: 'Give them to drink.' I brought a jug of milk. They all drank from it until they were brimming (to their throats). By Allah! Each one of them used to alone drink the whole lot. As the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was about to talk to them, Abu Lahab hastened to say: 'How much your man has enchanted you!' They went away without the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) talking to them.

The next day he told me: 'O 'Ali! This man preceded me in speech, as you heard, so, they dispersed before I could talk to them. Prepare the food as you did (yesterday) and call them to me.'

'Ali said: I did (as ordered) and gathered them. He asked me to bring the food. I placed it near them. He repeated what he had done the day before. They ate until they were satiated. He said: 'Give them to drink.' I fetched the same jug of milk. They drank of it until their thirst was quenched. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) talked to them and said: 'O Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib! By Allah, I know no young man among the Arabs who brought to his people a better thing than what I have brought to you. I have brought to you the good of this world and the Hereafter, to which Allah ordered me to invite you. So, whoever supports me in this affair (of Prophethood) will be my brother, my heir and my successor among you.'

Everyone abstained from it. So, I - the youngest, the most rheume-eyed, the paunchiest of them and the thinnest legs of them all - said 'I, O Messenger of Allah, I will be your supporter in it.' He put his arm around my neck and said: 'This is my brother, heir and successor among you. So, listen to him and obey him.' They stood up laughing and mocked at Abu Talib, 'He orders you to listen to your son and obey him.'"

** * **

This invitation took place in the third year after the declaration of Prophethood of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). It was the first time in which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) announced his call to Islam, and in which he appointed his successor and introduced him to his near closest relatives. He did it here, but did not do it after ten years, when he took the allegiance from the Ansar for the establishment of the Islamic community, because the Imam was not from the Ansar tribes, and the construction of the community used to be based on tribal relations. So, it was not wise enough to take the allegiance from them for his successor who was not from the Ansar tribes. Therefore, he took the allegiance from them on the condition that they should not dispute the affair with him.

This time he named him to his nearest relatives through a conversation similar to his consultation with his Companions concerning the Battle of Badr. Although he did know the result of that battle, as he informed his companions after the consultation, and showed them the places where individual polytheists would be killed, nevertheless, he consulted with them, at the beginning, about what to do. Here too he did the same. Although he was aware of the result and that the one who would undertake to support him would be the Imam 'Ali. Nevertheless, he announced the condition of becoming his vizier, heir and successor on supporting him in the affair. When all of them refused to accept the offer, except his cousin, 'Ali, who hastened to accept, he put his arm around his cousin's neck and told them to obey him.

* * *

Hitherto, we realized how the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was concerned about the Imamate after him. He openly names him in an instance, then takes the allegiance not to dispute with him, in another, and, in a third instance, he refuses the covetousness of the avaricious.

In order to get a good picture of the concern of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about the one to come after him, we shall study hereunder what he (peace be on him and his progeny) used to do on his leaving the town for few days on his expeditions, and how he used to assign a caliph in his place during his absence.

The Successors of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) in al-Madinah

During his Expeditions

In the second year of the Hijrah

In the month of Safar of the second year of Hijrah, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was permitted to fight. Along with the Migrants, he (peace be on him and his progeny) attacked a caravan belonging to Quraysh. He arrived at Waddaan and al-Abwaa.¹(1)

1. He appointed Sa'd Ibn 'Ubadah, the chief of al-Khazraj, as his caliph, or successor, for fifteen nights during his absence from al-Madīnah.
2. During the Battle of Bawaat²(2), he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Sa'd Ibn Ma'adh, a chief of the Aws tribe of the Ansar, in the month of Rabi' al-Awwal.
3. During chasing Kurz Ibn Jabir al-Fihri, who had raided the suburbs of al-Madinah, he (peace be on him and his progeny) reached Safwan catching neither

¹ Waddaan is a village near al-Juhfah, at a distance of 6 miles from Abwaa', which is approximately 23 miles from Madinah. The Messenger's mother, Aamenah, is buried there. Mu'jam al-Buldaan

² Bawaat, a mountain of Juhaynah on the way to Syria. The distance between Bawaat and Madinah is eight posts, and the distance between one post and the other is 12 miles. Mu'jam al-Buldaan.

It seems that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in the above two Battels, cared for the tribal feelings of Ansar, by appointing his successors from them.

Kurz nor as-Sarh¹(3)3. During that, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed his servant, Zayd Ibn Haarith, as his successor.

4. In the battle called Dhul' Ashirah, he appointed Abu Salamah al-Makhzumi, as he set out, in the month of Jumaadaa al-'Oola or in Jumaadaa al-Thaaniyah, to raid one of Quraysh's caravans heading for Syria. He missed it. But on its return from Syria, the battle of Badr took place.²(1)

5. During the Battle of Badr, when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had to leave Madinah for 19 days, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Ibn 'Umm Maktum, who was blind.³(2)2

6. In the Qaynuqa' war, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Abu Lubabah al-Ansari al-Awsi as his successor.⁴(3)3

7. Once again he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Abu Lubaabah during al-Saweeq Battle. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had to chase Abu Sufyan, who had come, with 200 horsemen, to fulfill his oath to the effect that he would not use perfumes nor touch women before taking his revenge for his people who had been killed in the Battle of Badr. They

¹ This Battle also took place in the month of Rabi al-Awwal, after Bawaat. Safwaan is a valley near Badr. Kurz Ibn Jabir Ibn Hasal al-Fihri was killed on the day of conquering Makkah, when with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Look up Jamharah Ansaab al-Arab, by Ibn Hazm, concerning the lineage of Banu Muhaarib Ibn Fihri, and his biography in al-Isaabah

² Dhu al-Ashirah is a place near Yanbu', some nine "posts" from Madinah, as in al-Tanbih. Abu Salamah is 'Abdullah Ibn 'Abd al-Asad. His mother was Barrah, the Messenger's aunt, the daughter of 'Abd al-Muttalib. He migrated to Habashah, then to Madinah. He attended the Barah war. He was fatally wounded in the 'Uhud war and died in the month of Jumaadaa al-Aakherah, after three years of Hijrah. Look up his biography in 'Usud al-Ghaabah

³ The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) left Madinah on the 3rd of Ramadan. The fight took place on Friday, the 19th of the same month.

⁴ The biographers state that: When the Jews entered Madinah, they stayed in its southern part, but found it to be unhealthy. So, they moved to its higher places. Banu al-Nadhir dwelt in Bathan, while Banu Qurayzah dwelt in Mahzur, both are valleys going down from Harrah. Banu Nadir spread in the orchards and the fortresses. They stayed there until they were invaded by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and were driven out of those places.

Look up the entries: Bathan and Mahzur, in Mu'jam al-Buldaan. Abu Lubaabah is Bashir, or Rafa'ah, Ibn 'Abd al-Mundhir. He was more famous by his agnomen. He was one of the leaders in al-'Aqabah Allegiance. Look up the biographies of Bashir, Rafa'ah and Abu Lubaabah in 'Usud al-Ghaabah.

reached al-‘Urayd,¹(4)4 where they heard about the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) intention to meet them. In order to rid themselves of heavy loads, they started throwing away the bags of the al-Saweeq [wheat or baky flour]. Hence that battle was called al-Saweeq Battle.

In the Third Year of the Hijrah

8. In the Battle of Qarqarah al-Kudr, he (peace be on him and his progeny) put Ibn Umm Maktum in his place, and left on the 15th of Muharram, for Sulaim and Ghatafan – the two tribes of Qays ‘Ilaan - who were taken by surprise. He returned with the spoils without facing any resistance.²(1)5

9. He also put Ibn Umm Maktum in his place when he (peace be on him and his progeny) left the town, in the Battle of Faraan for ten days of the month of Jummada al-Akhirah. They dispersed and he (peace be on him and his progeny) encountered no difficulty.³(2)1

10. He (peace be on him and his progeny) put ‘Uthman Ibn ‘Affaan in his place during the Dhu Amar Battle in Najd, when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set out for Ghatafan [tribes]. They fled away, and he faced no difficulty. He was away from the town for ten days.

11. In ‘the Battle of Uhud, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Ibn ‘Umm Maktum. He fought the enemy at the foot of the ‘Uhud mountain, a mile from Madinah. He was absent only for a single day (and yet he appointed a caliph).

12. He (peace be on him and his progeny) also appointed Ibn Umm Maktum in his place during Hamra’ al-Asad Battle, ten miles away from Madinah. He (peace be on him and his progeny) set out for Abu Sufyan who was intending to attack the town but could neither get him nor his companions. He (peace be on him and his progeny) stayed there for three days and returned to Madinah.

In the Fourth Year of the Hijrah

¹ Al-‘Urayd is a valley near Madinah. Mu’jam al-Buldaan.

² Qarqarah al-Kudr is the region of Banu Salim, next to the "Iraqi" district towards Makkah, at a distance of eight days from Madinah. Mu’jam al-Buldaan.

³ Faraan, Banu Salim’s region, in al-Far’site of al-Hijaz. Mu’jam al-Buldaan and Lisaan al-‘Arab, in the root of Faaraan.

13. Ibn Umm Maktum was also appointed as the caliph of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the battle against Banu Nadhir, in al-Ghars region, where the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) besieged them for fifteen days then they were deported out of it.¹(3)2

14. In the third Battle of Badr, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed 'Abdullah Ibn Rawaahah al-Ansari for sixteen days. He stayed there for eight days because Abu Sufyan had warned that he would fight them the next year in Badr. Abu Sufyan left Makkah to 'Asafaan and returned to Makkah once again.²(4)3

In the Fifth Year of the Hijrah

15. In the Dhaat al-Riqaa' Battle, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed 'Uthman Ibn 'Affan in his place for fifteen nights. He left the town on the 10th of Muharram. The Arabs were frightened off to the mountains and the deep valleys.³(1)4

16. Ibn Umm Maktum was once again appointed as the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) successor in Doomah al-Jandal Battle, when he (peace be on him and his progeny) went after 'Ukaydir Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, the Christian, who used to attack the travellers and traders of Madinah. He fled and his people were dispersed, so, he found nobody there. He (peace be on him and his progeny) stayed for few days, then returned to Madinah. It was his first raids against the Romans.⁴(2)1

¹ The buildings of Banu Nadhir, the Jews, were in Be'r Ghars in Quba and its localities. Quba is a village two miles from Madinah. The name comes from the name of a well there. Mu'jam al-Buldaan.

² Abdullah Ibn Rawaahah al-Ansari al-Khazraji, was the leader of Banu al-Harith in Bay'ah al-'Aqabah. He participated in battles of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and was martyred with two other leaders in Mu'tah. His biography is in al-Isti'aab and 'Usd al-Ghaabah.

³ Dhaat al-Riqaa' is a mountain near al-Nakhil, next to al-Sa'd and al-Shaqrah, which is colourful, with red, black and white spots. Look up al-Mas'udi's al-Tanbih wa al-Eshraf on this Battle.

⁴ Doomah al-Jandal was a fortress built in al-Jandal in a space of land. It is at seven stages from Damascus, and at fifteen nights from Madinah. Look up Mu'jam al-Buldaan and al-Mas'udi's al-Tanbih wa al-Eshraf concerning the events of the fifth year of the Hijrah

17. In the battle of Banu al-Mustalaq, near the waters of al-Muraysi', he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed his servant Zayd Ibn Haarithah, for eighteen days. He (peace be on him and his progeny) left on the 2nd of Sha'baan.¹(3)2

18. In al-Khandaq Battle, he appointed Ibn Umm Maktum, while he was fighting the army of al-Ahzaab, next to the Khandaq [the trench] inside the town, in the month of Shawwaal or Dhulqi'dah.

19. He (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Abu Rahm al-Ghifari during his fight with Banu Qurayzah, at a day's distance from Madinah. He besieged them for fifteen days or more, as from seven days remaining from the month of Dhulqi'dah.²(4)3

In the sixth year of the Hijrah

20. He (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Ibn Umm Maktum during his battle with Banu Lihyaan of Hadhil, near 'Asafaan, for 14 nights. He returned without encountering any difficulty.³(5)4

21. He (peace be on him and his progeny) also appointed Ibn Umm Maktum in his place when he went out in Dhu Qarad Battle, at two nights' distance from Madinah. He was absent for five nights.⁴(1)5

22. In the battle of al-Hudaybiyyah, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Ibn Umm Maktum.⁵(2)6

¹ Maa' al-Muraysi' is a place on the way to al-Far', which is seven "posts" away from Madīnah.

² Abu Rahm is Kulthum Ibn Husain. He accepted Islam after the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) migration to Madinah. In the battle of 'Uhud, he received an arrow in his neck but was cured when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) applied saliva on his wound. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah.

³ Banu Lihyaan. Look up Ibn Hazm's Jamharatu Ansaab al-'Arab, Egypt Ed., 1382 A.H. pp. 196-198 for his lineage. 'Asafaan is situated between Makkah and Madinah. Its exact location is contentious. Mu'jam al-Buldaan.

⁴ . Dhu Qarad is on the way to Khaibar. ' Uyaynah Ibn Hisn al-Fazari had raided lufaaahah, while he was in al-Ghaabah, on a single "post, or a little more, from Madinah. He set out on Wednesday, the 3rd or 4th of Rabi' al-Awwal. He saved a part of it and returned to Madinah. Look up: al-Tanbih wal Eshraaf.

In the seventh year of the Hijrah

23. In the battle of Khaybar, eight "posts" from Madinah, he (peace be on him and his progeny) put Sibaa' Ibn 'Urfutah in his place. After conquering its fortresses by force and peacefully, he (peace be on him and his progeny) set forth to Waadi al-Quraa. He (peace be on him and his progeny) besieged them for days and conquered it by force. Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) made peace with the people of Tayma', eight stages from Syria. Waadi al-Quraa is between it and Madinah.¹(3)1

24. The same person was once again appointed by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) when he went for 'Umrah al-Qadaa'.²(4)2

In the Eighth year of the Hijrah

25. In the Battle of Makkah, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed Abu Rahm al-Ghifari in his place.

26. After the Battle of Makkah, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set off to Hawaazin to invade Hunayn, a valley near the valley of al-Majaz, at a distance of three nights from Makkah. In this Battle, Abu Rahm remained governor of Madinah.

27. In the Battle of Tabuk, he (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both). Tabuk is ninety farsakhs away from Madinah.

This was his last battle. If we count Khaybar and Waadi al-Quraa as two separate battles, they would totally make 28, otherwise there were 27 battles.

Concerning the names of those who were appointed by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as his successors during his absence from

⁵ The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set off for ' Umrah on Monday, the first of Zhul Qi' dah. But the polytheists prevented him from entering Makkah. So he (peace be on him and his progeny) stayed in al-Hudaybiyyah, some nine miles from Makkah. Later, there was a peace treaty between the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and Quraysh in which the elementary stipulation was that he should come the next year for the minor pilgrimage (Umrah).

¹ Siba' Ibn 'Urfutah al-Ghifari. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah

² The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set off on the 6th of Zhul Qi'dah.

Madinah, we referred to al-Tanbih wa al-Eshraaf by al-Mas'udi, in his records of the events of the second year up to the eighth year of the Hijrah. In some instances, he differs from the others in the names of the successors of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), but what he said about appointing 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) as his successor in Madinah during the Battle of Tabuk, was also repeated by the Imam of the Hanbalis in his Musnad, quoting Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas:

"When the Messenger of Allah set off for the Battle of Tabuk, he (peace be on him and his progeny) put 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) as his caliph in Madinah. 'Ali said: *'O Messenger of Allah! I do not like your going anywhere unless I be with you'*. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him: *'Will you not be content to be in the same position with me as AHaroon was to Moosa except that there will be no prophet after me?'*"

This is backed by what al-Bukhari narrates in his Sahih, Book of the Battles, Ch. on "the Battle of Tabuk" quoting Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas, too, as below:

"Allah's Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) set out for Tabuk, appointing 'Ali as his successor.

'Ali said: *'Do you want to leave me with children and womenfolk?'* The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: *'Are you not pleased that you are unto me like AHaroon was to Moosa except that there will be no prophet after me?'*"

Muslim, in his Sahih, also quotes Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas to have said:

"I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say to him, after appointing him to be his successor during his absence in some of his battles answering 'Ali who said: *'O Messenger of Allah, you left me with the children and women.'* The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him: *"Are you not pleased that you are to me like Haroon was to Moosa except that there will be no prophethood after me."*¹(1)

* * *

¹ Sahih Muslim, the book of "Merits of the Companions", Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib", Hadith 32. Look up the Musnad-o-Abi Dawud at-Tayaalisi, vol. 1, p. 29; Hilyah al-Awliya' by Abu Na'im vol. 7, pp. 195 & 196; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 173, 182, 184, 330 and vol. 4, p. 153; Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatib, vol. 11, p. 432; Al-Nassafi's Khasaa'is, pp. 8 & 16 and Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, vol. 3, Q 1, p. 15

Thus, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was never absent from Madinah, ever for a few days, on his expeditions without appointing somebody as his successor to whom the people may refer. Even in the Battle of 'Uhud, which took place at a single mile's distance from Madinah, he appointed a successor to take care of the people during his absence. In the Battle of Khandaq, which was just outside the town, where he himself was fighting near the trench, he did appoint for the people of Madinah someone to whom they may refer, because he was too engaged in the fight to attend to them.

So, if this was the practice of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his short absence from the town and during his battles outside and inside the town, what do you think he would do for his people after his final departure from this transient world after which he would not return? Could he leave them neglected without appointing any one for his nation to refer to?

These questions will be the topic of our studies in the following chapters, Allah willing.

**Texts by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) proving
the Appointment of his successors after him**

To begin with, we refer first to the appointment of the successors those possessing by the authority by the divine Prophets (peace be on them all) for their nations after them.

The Will (*wasiyyah*) in Ancient Times

Mas'udi¹ relates the continuous chain of the divine proofs and successors of the Prophets from Prophet Adam till the Seal of the Prophets (may Allah bless them all). For example, he says that Adam's successor was Hibatullah or Sheeth, which, in Hebrew, is Sheth [the third son of Adam]. Ibrahim's successor was Ismaeel (peace be on him); Yaqub's (peace be on him) successor was Joseph (peace be on him and his progeny); Moosa's successor was Yushaa, the son of Nun, son of Ephream son of Yusuf (peace be on them all), who was opposed by Saafura, the wife of Prophet Moosa (peace be on him), and Prophet Eesaa's successor was Sham'oon (peace be on him), and the successor of the Seal of the

¹ 'Ithbaat al-Wasiyyah by Mas'udi, al-Haydariyyah printing house, al-Najaf al-Ashraf, pp. 50-70. Mas'udi is Abu Hasan Ali Ibn Husain Mas'udi. His lineage reaches to the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) companion 'Abdullah Ibn Mas'ud. He died in the year 364 A.H. His biography is in Tabaqaat al-Shaafi'iyah, vol. 2, p. 307. It is said that he was a Mu'tazili in belief. Fawaat al-Wafayaat refers to this book, vol. 2, p. 45. Yaqut al-Hamawi, in his Mu'jam al-'Udabaa', vol. 13, p. 94, says: "he wrote al-Bayaan fi Asmaa al-'A'immah". In al-Mizan by Ibn Hajar, vol. 4, p. 224. It was also referred to as Kitab Ta'yeen al-Khalifah, while it is called 'Ithbat al-Wasiyyah in al-Dharri'ah and other books

Prophets, Hazrat Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) was 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) followed by eleven successors from his off spring. We shall hereunder relate about three of the above wasis:

a. Adam's Will to (his son) Sheeth

In this connection, al-Ya'qubi says: "When Adam was about to die, he conveyed his will to Sheeth."

Al-Tabari says: "Hibatullah (or Seth in Hebrew), to whom Adam willed...He (Adam) wrote his will. As per this writing, Sheeth was the successor of his father, Adam (peace be on him)"

Concerning Adam and his appointing Sheeth as his successor and his death, al-Mas'udi writes:

"Then Adam made a will to Sheeth, tied it well and kept its content, then death came to Adam..."

Ibn al-Athir says: "Sheeth means: Hibatullah [Allah's gift]; he was Adam's successor. When death came to Adam, he entrusted Sheeth."

Ibn Kathir, under the title: "Adam's death and his will to his son, Sheeth (peace be on him and his progeny) says: "Sheeth means Hibatullah. When death came to Adam he entrusted his son Sheeth."

b. The Episode of Yusha Ibn Noon, the successor of Prophet Moosa (peace be on him)

1. Yusha Ibn Noon in the Torah:

The Dictionary of the Holy Scripture, quoting the Old Testament on Yusha, says that Yusha, the son of Nun, was with Moosa on Mount Sinai, and so, he was not stained by worshipping the calf in the days of Haroon.

At the end of the 27th Chapter of the Book of Numbers of the Old Testament, the report of appointing him by Allah as Moosa's successor, is as in the following text:

Moosa prayed: "Lord! Source of all life, appoint, I pray, a man who can lead the people and can command them in battle, so that your community will not be like (a flock of) sheep without a shepherd."

The Lord said to Moosa: "Take Yusha son of Noon, a capable man, and place your hands on his head. Make him stand in front of Eleazar the priest and the whole community, and there, before them all, proclaim him as your successor. Give him some of your own authority, so that the whole of Israel will obey him. He will depend on Eleazar the priest, who will learn my will by using the Urim and Thummim. In this way Eleazar will direct Yusha and the whole community of Israel in all their affairs..." Moosa did as the Lord had commanded him. He made Yusha stand before Eleazar the priest and the whole community. As the Lord had commanded, Moosa put his hands on Yusha's head and proclaimed him as his successor."¹(1)

The details of his taking care of Banu Israel and his wars are stated in 23rd Book of the Chapter Yusha son of Noon

2. In the Glorious Qur'an:

The Glorious Qur'an refers to Yusha as Al-Yasa' in Surah al-An'aam, Verse: 86, and in Surah al-Saad, Verse: 48.

3. In the sources of Islamic Studies:

In al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 1, p. 46, it is stated:

"... When death came to Moosa, Allah – Mighty and Majestic be He – commanded him to make Yusha Ibn Noon enter in the Pomegranate Dome, to sanctify him, to put his hand on his body so as to transfer his blessing to him and to appoint him as his successor after him among the Children of Israel.

¹ Good News Bible, London, 1977.

Similarities between the successors of the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) and of Moosa (peace be on him)

Yusha Ibn Noon was with Moosa on Mount Sinai. He did not worship the calf. Allah ordered His Prophet, Moosa, to appoint him (Yusha) as his successor after him so that the congregation of the Lord may not be a herd without a shepherd.

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was with the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in Hira' cave; he never ever worshipped an idol. Allah ordered His Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), on his return from his farewell pilgrimage, to appoint him (Ali), in presence of the huge congregation as the leader for the people after him so that his nation may not be neglected. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) obeyed His order in Ghadir Khumm and introduced 'Ali (peace be on him) as his successor after him, as we shall mention later. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) spoke the truth when he said:

"Whatever befell the Bani Israel will befall my nation exactly and in toto..."

The sources of the above narration are stated in vol. 2 of our book, **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**.

c. The Episode of Sham'oon (Simon), the Successor of Prophet Eesa (peace be on him)

1. Simon in the Bible

The Dictionary of the Holy Scripture cites ten persons carrying the name of Simon, including Simon Peter, whose episode is stated in the tenth book of Mathew's Gospel, in which it is said:

"Jesus called his twelve disciples together and gave them the authority to drive out the evil spirits and to heal every disease and every sickness. These are the names of the twelve apostles: first Simon (called Peter)..."

In the Gospel of John (Book 21: Verses 15-18)¹(1)1, it is stated that

Jesus told John: "Take care of my sheep," meaning those who believed in him.

¹ Ibid. The new Testament, p. 146.

The Dictionary of the Holy Book says: "Jesus Christ appointed him to guide the church.

2. Simon in the sources of Islamic studies.

Al-Ya'qubi mentioned him as Sam'aan al-Safaa.

Al-Mas'udi, in vol. 1, p. 363, says: "Brumiyah killed Butrus. His Greek name is Sham'oon, and the Arabs call him: Sam'aan.

In Mu'jam al-Buldaan, under the root of '**The Monastery of Sam'aan**', it is said: "The Monastery of Sam'aan - near Damascus. Sam'aan after whose name this monastery was named was among the Christian greats. It is said that he is Sham'oon al-Safaa."

* * *

We have stated fragments of the episodes of these three successors as examples of the episodes of other successors of the divine Prophets (peace be on them) in ancient times.

The Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) was not an innovation among the divine Prophets (peace be on them) such that he would leave his people without appointing those in authority after him, whereas in actuality he had never left his small Islamic community in Madinah, for short periods, or even for an hour, without appointing somebody to take his place. So, how could the Seal of the Prophets and the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny) leave the Islamic communities forever without appointing his successors? He, actually, assigned them in different wordings and on different occasions, including naming his particular successor after him, and in many instances, he (peace be on him and his progeny) even mentioned all the Imams (peace be on them).

His traditions in which he particularly mentioned Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) are as follows:

The Messenger's Successor, Minister, Heir and Caliph

The Successor in the Messenger's Narrations

At the beginning of this chapter, we related the incident of warning Banu Hashim, and that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) pointed to 'Ali

Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both), in the presence of the chiefs of Banu Hashim, and said: *"This is my brother, successor and caliph among you; so, listen to him and obey."*

By this the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed his successor and caliph after him and ordered the people to obey him. Allah, the Exalted, said: "... **and whatever the Messenger has brought to you accept it**" (Surah Hashr (59): Verse 7).

Al-Tabarani, quoting Salman (al-Muhammadi), said: "I said: 'O Messenger of Allah! Every Prophet had a successor. Who is your successor?' He (peace be on him and his progeny) did not reply. Later, he (peace be on him and his progeny) saw me and called out to me. I hurried to him and said: 'At your service!' He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'Do you know who was the successor of Moosa?'* I said: 'Yes, Yusha, the son of Nun.'

'Why?' he asked. 'Because he was the most learned among them,' I replied.

'My successor, the one with whom I entrust my secrets, the best one I leave after me, who will fulfil my promises and repay my debts is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib', he said."¹(1)I

Abu Ayyub (al-Ansari) says that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to his daughter, Fatemah (peace be on her):

"Don't you know that Allah glanced at the people of the earth and chose your father from among them and sent him as a Prophet. Again, He glanced at them

¹ Al-Haythami, quoting al-Tabarani, narrated it in his al-Mu'jam al-Kabir, vol. 6, p.221, and in Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 113. Sibt Ibn al-Jawzi narrated it in his Tadhkerah Khawaas al-Ummah, Chapter on "Hadith al-Najwa", quoted from Kitab al-Fadaa'il by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, in the following wordings: "Anas said: 'We told Salman: 'Ask the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny): 'Who is your successor?' Salman asked the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He (peace be on him and his progeny) inquired: *'Who was the successor of Moosa the son of 'Imran?'* He said: 'Yusha the son of Nun.' He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'My successor, heir and the one who will fulfill my promises is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib.'*" Look up also al-Riyaad al-Nadira by Muhib al-Deen al-Tabari, vol. 2, p.178

*and chose your husband. He revealed to me and I married him (to you) and took him as a successor."*¹(1)1

Anas Ibn Malik is quoted to have said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) performed the ritual ablutions (*wudu*) followed by a two rak'at prayers and then said to me: '*The first person who enters upon you through this door is the Imam of the godly men, the master of the Muslims, the chief in religion and the seal of the successors...*' At that moment, 'Ali (peace be on him) entered. The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) asked me: '*Who was it, O Anas?*' 'It is 'Ali,' I said. He came to him happily and hugged him..." as the hadith goes.²(2)2

The Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) companion, Buraydah says: "The Prophet said: '*Every Prophet has a successor and a heir. 'Ali is my successor and heir.*'"³(3)3

Al-Baihaqi, in his *al-Mahaasin wal Masaawi'*, narrates what is summarized hereunder:

¹ Majma' al-Zawaa'id by al-Haythami, vol. 8, p. 253, and in vol. 9, p. 165, quoting 'Ali Ibn 'Ali al-Hilali, who said: "*My successor is the best of the successors, and the most loved by Allah and he is your husband (till the end of the narration).*" It is also in Muntakhab Kanz al-'Ummaal, in the margins of Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, p. 31, and in Kanz al-'Ummaal, "Book of Merits", Chapter 2, "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib", Hadith 1163, vol. 12, p. 204, and in the Mawsu'at Atraa' al-Hadith, quoting al-Mu'jam al-Kabir by al-Tabarani, vol. 4, p. 205, and Jam' al-Jawaami' by al-Suyuti, Hadith No. 4261. Abu Ayyub al-Ansari is Khalid Ibn Zayd al-Khazraji. He attended the Bay'ah al-'Aqabah and took part in all the battles of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He also participated in the Battles of al-Jamal, Siffin and al-Nahrawan with Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). He died near Constantinople in the year 50 or 51 A.H. ('Usud al-Ghaabah).

² Hilyah al-Awliya', vol. 1, p. 63. Ibn 'Asaakir's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 486, Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, Egypt, 1st ed., vol. 1, p. 450, and in Mawsu'at Atraa' al-Hadith 'An Ithaf al-Saadaat al-Muttaqin by al-Zubaydi, vol. 7, p. 46. Anas Ibn Malik is Abu Thumamah al-Khazraji. Al-Bukhari and Muslim quoted from him 2286 hadiths. The year of his death is disputed between the years 90 and 93 H. al-Isti'ab, 'Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah. His biography was stated earlier.

³ Ibn 'Asaakir's Tarikh-o-Dimashq, vol. 3, p. 5 and al-Riyaad al-Nadira, vol. 2, p. 178. Buraydah is Abu 'Abdillah Buraydah Ibn al-Haseeb Ibn 'Abdillah al-Aslami. He came to Madinah after the 'Uhud war but he participated with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his wars and later moved to Basrah where he built himself a house. Thereafter, he set off on a raid to Khurasan. He stayed in Marw and died there. 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 1, p. 175.

"Jibraeel (peace be on him) brought a gift from Allah for His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to present it to his cousin and successor, 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him)..."¹(1)4

The aforementioned were the □ hadhiths said by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in respect to the will.

The Will in the Books of the Previous Nations

Nasr Ibn Muzaahim, in his book *Waq'ah Siffin*, and al-Khatib in his *Tarikh-o-Baghdad*, narrates that - according to the former's text:

"On their way to Siffin, the army of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) felt thirsty in the desert. He (peace be on him) brought them to a rock and helped them in extracting it from its place, where they found water and quenched their thirst. A priest in a nearby monastery, hearing about this incident, said: This monastery had been built by that water, and it could not be found except by a Prophet or the successor of a Prophet."²(2)1

Another Narrative Reinforces the Previous Narrative

In *Waq'ah Siffin* by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim and al-Tarikh by Ibn Kathir, quoting the former:

"When 'Ali arrived in Raqqah at a place called Baleekh on the Euphrates river, a monk came down from his monastery and said to 'Ali (peace be on him): "We have a book which we have inherited from our ancestors. It was written by the companions of 'Isa the son of Maryam. Shall I show it to you?"

'Ali (peace be on him) said: "Yes, what is it?"

The priest said: In the name of Allah the Beneficent, the Merciful, Who ordained, among other ordinances, and decided, among other decisions, that He will raise among the illiterates a Messenger from among themselves, who will recite to them His verses, purify them, teach them the Book and Wisdom and show them the way of Allah. He is neither rough nor rude, neither boisterous nor retaliates evil with

¹ Al-Mahaasin wa al-Masaawi' by Muhammad Ibn Ibraheem al-Baihaqi (he lived prior to 320 A.H.) edited by Muhammad Abu al-Fadl Ibraheem, printed in Cairo in 1380 A.H., vol. 1, pp. 64 & 65.

² Waq'ah Siffin, printed by al-Madani in Cairo in 1382 A.H., p. 145. Al-Khatib's Tarikh, vol. 12, p. 305. We summarized our quotation from the former

evil, but pardons and forgives. His followers are those who thank Allah at every elevated place, each ascending and descending. Their tongues are humble with declaring the Oneness of Allah and His Greatness. Allah makes him victorious over whoever is against him. After his being received by Allah, his ummah will differ, then they will regather. They will remain so as Allah wills, then they will differ again. A man from his nation will pass by the shore of this Euphrates. He enjoins good, forbids evil and judges with the truth. He is never bribed in judgement. The world is to him less trivial than the ashes in a stormy day. Death is easier to him than drinking to a thirsty man. He fears Allah covertly and calls to Him overtly. He fears not the accusation of any accuser in the way of Allah. Whoever of this region catches up with this Prophet and believes in him, his reward will be My pleasure and Paradise. Whoever catches up with that good servant, let him help him because to be killed on his side is martyrdom."

Then he (the monk) said to him (Ali (peace be on him)): "I will accompany you and will never leave you so that what befalls you may befall me, too."

‘Ali (peace be on him) wept and said: *"Praise be to Allah who did not cause me to be forgotten by him. Praise be to Allah who mentioned me in the books of the good people."*

The priest went with him. It was said that he used to have his lunch and dinner with him until he was wounded in the Battle of Siffin. When the people wanted to bury the dead, ‘Ali (peace be on him) asked them to look for him. When they found him dead, he (peace be on him) performed his funeral prayers, buried him and said: *"This is one of us, Ahl al-Bait."* He (peace be on him) sought forgiveness (from Allah) for him several times."¹(1)

The Will in the Narrations of the Companions (*sahaabah*) and those who saw the Companions (*taabe'een*)

In Abu Dharr's speech

During ‘Uthman's caliphate, Abu Dharr once stood at the door of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) mosque and delivered a speech. He said: "... Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) was the inheritor of Adam's

¹ Siffin, pp. 147 & 148. Ibn Kathir, vol. 7, p.255

knowledge and what had been bestowed upon the (divine) Prophets. 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) is Muhammad's (peace be on him and his progeny) successor and the inheritor of his knowledge..."

This speech will come in full later when we refer to the tenth kind of concealment practised by the School of Caliphate, God willing.

The Will in al-Ashtar's Speech

When 'Ali (peace be on him) was being given the allegiance, Malik Ibn al-Harith al-Ashtar (may Allah be pleased with him) delivered a speech in which he said:

"O people, this is the successor of the successors, the inheritor of the Prophets' knowledge, who has faced great calamities, who has endured difficulties in a dignified way, whose faith was testified by the Book of Allah and who received (Allah's) satisfaction as per the testimony of His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). He is the one in whom virtues are perfect. Neither the ancient ones nor and the latter ones doubted his priority (in faith), knowledge and merits."¹(1)2

The Will in 'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i's Speech

Amirul Mu'minin 'Ali (peace be on him) delivered a speech to the people gathered in Kufah to set out for Siffin to fight Mu'awiyah. 'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i stood up and, addressing the Imam, said:

"O Amirul Mu'minin! I have not loved you nor given you my allegiance because of a kinship between us nor due to some monetary gain that I expect from you nor for an authority which may make me famous. But I love you for your fine characteristics; that you are the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) cousin, his successor, the father of the offspring remaining among us from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), the first to accept Islam and the one who has the greatest share in the holy war."² (2)1

¹ Al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 178

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p. 281. 'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i migrated to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) after the Hudaibiyyah Battle. He gave water to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), who invoked for him, saying: "*O Allah, let him enjoy his youth.*" So, he lived 80 years without the appearance of a single white hair in his beard. He participated in all the battles of 'Ali' (peace be on him). He was a friend of Hujr Ibn

The Will in Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr's Letter

Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr wrote a letter to Mu'awiyah, as below: "In the Name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful: From Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr to the aberrant son of Sakhr. Peace be upon the people of obedience to Allah, those who is submissive to the people of Allah's mastership. Surely Allah..chose and picked Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), selected him for His Revelation, entrusted him with His affair and sent him as a Messenger, confirming the Books before him and as a guide to religious laws. So, he (peace be on him and his progeny) invited (the people) to the path of his Lord with wisdom and good advice. The first person to respond and submit, to believe and agree, to embrace Islam and commit himself to Allah, was his brother and cousin, 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) who believed in him with the concealed unseen, preferred him to every bosom-friend, protected him from every fear and offered his life in every scary situation. So, he (Ali) fought his war and accepted his peace when he made peace. He never spared himself in times of crisis and instances of dread, such that he was known as unique in waging the holy war and none could match him in his deeds. But I see you (O Moaviya), as you are, trying to compete with his loftiness while you being you (i.e. lowly) but he is the prominent, the first to do every good, the first man to embrace Islam, the sincerest in his intentions, having the noblest offspring, the most honourable wife and the best of all people for a cousin...Nevertheless, you and your father cherish evil for Allah's religion, endeavour to extinguish His light, muster the masses to achieve this aim, spend money in this regard and take pledges from the tribes for it. Your father died upon

'Adi. To save his life from Ziyaad Ibn Abih (may Allah curse him), he left Kufah for Mosul, where he hid himself in a cave. Mu'awiyah ordered the governor of Mosul - 'Amr Ibn Hakam, son of Mu'awiyah's sister - to arrest and send 'Amr to him. But they found him dead because of a serpent's bite. His head was cut off and sent to Mu'awiyah. It was the first head in Islam to be carried from one place to another. Mu'awiyah had already imprisoned 'Amr's wife, Aamenah bint al-Sharid. He sent 'Amr's head to her and threw it in her lap. (For a moment), she was frightened. Then she kept the head in her lap, put her hand on its forehead, kissed its lips and said: "You have kept him away from me for long, then you returned him to me dead! Welcome to such a gift that would not discard nor would it be discarded." The incident happened in the year 50 A.H. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, pp. 100 & 101

this (i.e. enmity of Islam), and you are his heir in this. The evidence lies in the kind of parties taking refuge in you, including the heads of hypocrisy and dissension against the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while the evidence of 'Ali, besides his manifest virtue and old priority, is in his supporters who are mentioned in the Holy Qur'an for their merits and Allah has praised them, being of the migrants and the Ansar. They are squadrons and brigades around him, striking with their swords and shed their blood to protect him. They see virtue in following him and misery in opposing him. So, how could you, woe onto you - match yourself with 'Ali, the inheritor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his successor, the father of his progeny, the first of the people to follow him, the last to leave him, whom he used to inform about his secrets and share the affairs with him..."

Mu'awiyah replied him thus:

"From Mu'awiyah Ibn Abi Sufyan to the faultfinder against his father, Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr. Peace be upon the people who obey Allah. Your letter reached me. In it you mention what is Allah's of power and authority, and what Allah had bestowed upon His Prophet, together with words which you composed and put down, which weaken your opinion and rebuke your father. You mentioned the rights of Ibn Abi Talib, his old priorities, his kinship to the Prophet of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his protecting him on every occasion of fear and terror, and vindicating yourself by another's merits, not yours. So thank Allah who diverted the virtues from you and assigned them to another. We, and your father with us, used to, during the life of our Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), admit the rights of Ibn Abi Talib, and his distinguished virtues over us. Then Allah chose for his Prophet what He has with Him and fulfilled what He had promised him, manifested his call, made successful his proof and received him to Him. Your father and his Faruq (referring to Umar) were the first to rob him and oppose him (Ali). They conspired and coordinated on this. Thereafter, they invited him to themselves. But he lingered on and dawdled. So, they attempted hard against him and tried grave things against him. Thus, he gave his allegiance (involuntarily) and submitted to them, without sharing him in their affair nor

informing him of their secrets, until they both died and their affair ended. Then there came their third, 'Uthman Ibn 'Affan, after them..." etc, as the letter goes.

We related Mu'awiyah's reply because it admits what Muhammad Ibn Abu Bakr had mentioned.

The texts of both letters are stated by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim in his book *Waq'ah Siffin* and by al-Mas'udi in his *Muruj al-Dhahab*. They were referred to, also, by al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir in the events of the year 36 A.H.

Al-Tabari, quoting Yazid Ibn Zabyaan, records:

"Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr wrote to Mu'awiyah Ibn Abi Sufyan when he became the governor. They exchanged letters which I dislike to state, as they include matters which the ordinary people cannot bear to hear."

So, al-Tabari did not state in his massive historical encyclopedia the letters exchanged between Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr and Mu'awiyah, just because he did not find it wise to let ordinary people know about them, not because he doubted the authenticity of the narration. In this, he was followed by Ibn al-Athir, who also refrained from stating the texts of those letters in his historical encyclopedia called *al-Kaamil fi al-Tarikh*, citing the same pretext, saying: "I dislike to mention them as they contain what the public cannot bear to hear."¹(1)

¹ The letter and the answer are in *Waq'ah Siffin* by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim, pp. 118 & 119. *Tarikh al-Tabari*, Eu. ed. vol.1, p. 3248. *Tarikh Ibn al-Athir*, Eu ed. vol. 3, p. 108. *Muruj al-Dhahab* by al-Mas'udi, Beirut ed., 1385 A.H., vol. 3, p. 11. It adds that: "Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr wrote the letter to Mu'awiyah from Egypt, when Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) appointed him governor of Egypt. Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p. 284

The Will in ‘Amr Ibn al-Aas’s Letter

Al-Khaarazmi cites a letter from ‘Amr Ibn al-‘As to Mu‘awiyah, in which he wrote:

"... As regards that to which you invited me... and my assisting you in the falsehood, unsheathing the sword in the face of ‘Ali, the brother of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his successor, inheritor, the settler of his debts, the executor of his promises and the husband of his daughter..."¹(1)2

The Will in Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Speeches and Arguments

Al-Khaarazmi quotes a part of Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him and his progeny) speech in which he said: "... *I am the Messenger’s brother and his successor...*"²(2)3

Ibn Abi al-Hadid, quoting from a letter of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) which he sent to the people of Egypt, relates that the Imam wrote: "*Know that the Imam of guidance and the Imam of destruction cannot be equal, nor the successor of the Prophet and the enemy of the Prophet...*"³(3)1

Al-Ya‘qubi relates the argument of the Khawaarij against Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) alleging that he had lost the succession. In his reply, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) said:

"*As to your saying that I was the successor, but I lost it, Allah – Mighty and Majestic be He – says: ... and pilgrimage to the House (of Allah) is incumbent upon the people for whoever is able to make it, and whoever disbelieves, then Allah is surely is Needless of the worlds* (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 97). *Do you think that if no pilgrim went to the Bait, the Bait would be a disbeliever? The*

¹ Al-Khaarazmi’s Manaaqib, p. 125

² Ibid., p. 143

³ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 2, p. 28

*one who is able to go to pilgrimage but does not go is a disbeliever, and it is you who are the disbelievers because you left me, not I because I left you."*¹(4)²

The Will in the Speeches of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him)

In Sermon No. 189 of Nahj al-Balaaghah, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) said:

"O people! I have propagated among you the preachings of the Prophets (peace be on them) to their people and I conveyed to you what the successors conveyed to those who came after them."

In Sermon No. 88, he (peace be on him) said:

"... And why should not I wonder about the mistake of those groups, despite the diversity of their arguments for their religion, since they neither pursue the footsteps of a Prophet nor do they follow the act of a successor."

In Sermon No. 2, he (peace be on him) said:

"None from this nation can be compared with the progeny of Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) nor can the one upon whom their favour was bestowed be equal to them at all. They are the foundations of religion... For them are the peculiarities of the right of mastership and in them is the will and the inheritance."

Ibn Abi al-Hadid says: ‘Ali (peace be on him) delivered a speech in which he said: *"I am the servant of Allah and brother of His Messenger. None said it before me nor will it be said after me except by a liar. I inherited the Prophet of mercy, married the chief of the women of this nation and I am the seal of the successors."*²(1)³

The Will in the Speech of Imam Hasan (peace be on him)

¹ Al-Ya‘qubi’s Tarikh, vol. 2, pp. 192 & 193.

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 1st ed. Egypt, vol. 1, p. 208

After the death of his father, Imam Hasan (peace be on him) delivered a speech thus: "*I am Hasan Ibn 'Ali, the son of the Holy Prophet and the son of the successor...*".¹(2)1

The Will in the Shiite Consolation to Imam Husain (peace be on him and his progeny) on his Brother's death

When the Shiites in Kufah heard about the death of Imam Hasan (peace be on him), they gathered in the house of Sulaiman Ibn Surad and wrote a condoling letter to Imam Husain Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both). The letter read thus:

"In the Name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

To Husain Ibn 'Ali from his Shi'ah and his father's, Amirul Mu'minîn. Peace be upon you. We praise Allah through you, Who is the Only deity and there is no god except He.

We have received the news concerning the death of Hasan Ibn 'Ali – peace be on him the day he was born, the day he died and the day he will be resurrected alive.

... How grave the calamity which afflicted this nation in general, and you and the Shi'ah in particular, was through the demise of the son of the successor, the son of the Prophet's daughter, and..."²(3)2

Al-Mas'udi, in his Muruj al-Dhahab, says: "Ibn Abbas heard the news about the death of the Imam Hasan when he was in Syria. He said to Mu'awiyah:

'... and if we are afflicted by it, we had already been afflicted by that of the Master of the messengers, the Imam of the God-fearing and the Messenger of the Lord of the worlds, and after him by that of the master of the successors. May Allah compensate for the calamity...'"³(4)3

¹ This is quoted from al-Mustadrak by al-Haakem al-Neishaboori, vol. 3, p. 172. Look up Dhakha'ir al-'Uqba, p.138 and Ma'jma al-Zawaid by al-Haythami, vol. 9, p. 146 quoting al-Tabarani and others

² Al-Ya'qubi's al-Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 228.

³ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 2, p.430

The Will in the Speech of the Imam Husain (peace be on him)

On the 10th of the Muharram month, Imām Husain (peace be on him) delivered a speech, addressing the army of the Caliph Yazid while resting his arguments against them:

"... now think of my ancestors and see who I am. Then look into yourselves and blame your souls: Is it lawful to you to kill me and violate my sanctity? Am I not the son of the daughter of your Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), the son of his successor and cousin, who was the foremost in accepting Islam, the first to believe in Allah and in His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and in what he brought from his Lord? Is not Hamzah, the Chief of the Martyrs, my father's uncle? Is not Ja'far, the Martyr, the one who flies with two wings (in Paradise), my uncle?"¹(1)

Since Imam's description of his father, 'Ali (peace be on him) as being the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), was famous and well-known, just like the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) being his grandfather, Hamzah being the Chief of the Martyrs and his father's uncle, and Ja'far being the one with his two wings and his uncle, and that's why he (Imam Husain) mentioned them in his lineage and importantly, none of the addressees denied these facts.

'Abdullah Ibn 'Ali, the Uncle of the Abbaside Caliph, al-Saffaah, Argues the Will as a Proof

The Abbaside started their uprising against the Bani Umayyah (or Ummayides) under the pretext of supporting the progeny of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Thus, Abu Muslim was called as "The Emir of the Progeny of Muhammad".²(2) They used to support their argument against their opponents by the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning the right of his progeny to the Caliphate. But no sooner had they got

¹ Recorded by al-Tabari, Eu. ed., vol. 2, p. 329. Ibn al-Athir, Eu. ed., vol. 4, p. 52. Ibn Kathir stated it too in vol. 8, p. 179, but he omitted the Imam's (peace be on him) description of his father, and replaced it by saying "and 'Ali is my father," and then stated the rest

² Al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 352. Al-Tanbih wa al-Eshraaf by al-Mas'udi, p. 293. Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh, vol. 5, pp. 139, 142 & 194

the power in their hands, they turned their backs to the progeny of Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny).

Among those who used the Will as a proof was uncle of the first Abbaside Caliph. In this respect, Al-Dhahabi, quoting Abu 'Amr al-'Awza'i¹(3)3, chronicles, briefly:

"When 'Abdullah Ibn 'Ali, al-Saffah's uncle, came to Syria and killed the Bani Umayyah, he sent for me and said to me: 'Woe upon you! Does not the affair (of rulership) belongs to us as per religion?'

'How is that?' I asked.

'Did not the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) appoint 'Ali as his successor?'

'If he did,' I inquired, then why were the two arbitrators appointed?'

He kept silent in anger. I expected my head to be chopped off immediately. But he indicated with his hand: 'Take him out.' So, I left..." etc.

Al-'Awza'i, in denying 'Ali's successorship, used the same argument which was used by the Kharijites against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), and his reply should have been the same as given by Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to the Khaarijites, as has already been stated under the title: **The Will in the speech of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).**

Muhammad Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn Hasan Argued against the (Abbaside) Caliph al-Mansur with the Will

Al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir, in their record of the events of the year 145 H. in their historical books, say: "Muhammad Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn Hasan Ibn 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib revolted against the 'Abbaside Caliph Abu Ja'far al-Mansur, in Madinah, where the people gave him their allegiance. He wrote a detailed letter in answer to Abu Ja'far's, in which he stated his evidences proving his having more right to the Caliphate than al-Mansur. He said: "... and our father, 'Ali, was the successor and was the Imam, so, how could you inherit his mastership while his offspring is still alive?..."

¹ See his biography in Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, vol. 1, p.181 recording the events of the years 129 & 130 A.H.

Al-Mansur replied to him defying his other arguments but kept silent about this evidence. Al-Mansur's silence definitely implies that he admitted to its truthfulness.¹(1)1

The (Abbaside) Caliph al-Mahdi Rejects the Will Because of the Mention of the Successor (Ali (peace be on him)) in it

It is recorded in Tarikh al-Tabari as follows:

Abu al-Khattaab recounts, "When al-Qasem Ibn Mujaashe' al-Tameemi, an inhabitant of the village Baaraan in Marv province, was about to die, he willed to al-Mahdi and wrote, '**Allah witnessed that there is no god except Him and so did the angels and the possessors of knowledge, those who establish equity; there is no god except Him, the Mighty the Wise. Surely, the religion with Allah is Islam** (till the end of the verse)².' He continued writing, '...and al-Qasem Ibn Mujaashe' testifies to this and also testifies that Muhammad is His servant and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and that Ali Ibn Abi Taalib (peace be on them both) is the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and the inheritor of the Imamate after him'. The will was presented to al-Mahdi. When we reached to this part (i.e. the succession of Imam Ali (peace be on him)), he threw it away and did not even look at it."

The Caliph Harun al-Rashid Tells About What has reached to him from the Successors

In Al-Akhbar at-Tiwaal, quoting al-Asma'i³, it is recorded, the gist of which is as follows: "I visited al-Rashid. He sent for his two sons, Muhammad and 'Abdullah. When they came he seated them at his right and left sides and told me to ask them questions. Whatever I asked them about different branches of literature they answered correctly. He asked me: 'How do you see their education?'

¹ Al-Tabari, Eu. ed., vol. 3, p. 209. Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh, Egypt 1st ed., vol. 5, p. 199. Ibn Kathir, vol. 10, p. 85

² Surah Aale Imraan (3): Verses 18 & 19

³ Al-Asma'i – he was Abd al-Malik Ibn Qareeb (expired 216 A.H.). He was from Basrah, a litterateur and an expert in syntax. It is said that he had memorized twelve thousand war poems. His biography can be found in al-Kunaa wa al-Alqaab by Shaikh Abbas Qummi (r.a.).

‘O Amirul Mu‘minîn! I have never seen their like in intelligence and acumen.’ He, then, hugged them and could not stop his flowing tears. Asking them to leave, he said: ‘Just imagine them when their enmity and hatred against one another will be manifest, they will fight against each other and there will be so much bloodshed that many of the living people would wish they were dead.’

I inquired: ‘O Amirul mu‘minîn! Did the soothsayers predict these events on their birthdays or a fate foretold by the scholars about them?’

‘It is,’ he said, ‘known to the scholars, quoting the successors who quoted the Divine Prophets (peace be on them), concerning them.’

It is said that al-Ma‘mun, during his caliphate, used to say: ‘Al-Rashid had heard all about what had taken place between us from Musa Ibn Ja‘far Ibn Muhammad (peace be on them all).¹(1)1 It was he who told him all that.’”

* * *

The author says:

By “the successors” Haroon al-Rashid meant the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait: Musa and his father Ja‘far as-Sadiq and his grand father Muhammad al-Baqir, and his father’s grand father ‘Ali Ibn Husain then, then Hasan and Husain, and their father, ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them all); and by “the Prophets” he meant the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny). Therefore, the Caliph Harun al-Rashid did what no other Caliph had done, neither before him nor after him as has been reported by the historians who said:

“On his arrival in Makkah, he ascended the pulpit, delivered a speech, descended, entered the Holy Ka’bah, and sent for Muhammad and al-Ma‘mun (his sons). Then he dictated to Muhammad a letter of pledge. Muhammad wrote the letter. He made him to swear over it and took his covenants and promises. He did the same with al-Ma‘mun, and also took his covenants and promises.

Hereunder, is the text of the letter which was written by Muhammad in his own hand writing:

In the Name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

¹ Al-Akhbar at-Tiwal, Egypt, 1st ed., 1960, p. 389, by Abu Hanifah ad-Daynuri (d. 282 H.) and Muruj al-Dhahab by al-Mas‘udi, vol. 3, p. 351.

This is a letter by ‘Abdullah Harun, Amirul mu‘minîn, written by Muhammad Ibn Harun, in his full health and sanity, and on his own free will. Amirul mu‘minîn, Harun, assigned me to undertake the authority after him, and imposed my allegiance on all Muslims. He appointed my brother, ‘Abdullah Ibn Amirul Mu‘minîn, as successor, Caliph and guardian of all the affairs of the Muslims, after me, to my consent and submission, on my free will and without compulsion. He assigned him the government of Khurasan, including its borders, villages, troops, incomes, methods, posts, treasuries, charities, zakats and all its towns, during his life and after his death. I promise myself towards ‘Abdullah, my brother, to observe what he has been promised by Harun, Amirul mu‘minîn, in respect to the allegiance, succession, guardianship, Caliphate and all the affairs of the Muslims, after me..." (till the end of the letter).

After that al-Tabari narrates:

"They both wrote to Amirul mu‘minîn, inside Baitullah al-haram, in their own handwritings and in the presence of the members of Amirul mu‘minîn’s household who attended the Hajj, as well as his army chiefs, companions, judges and the door-men of the Ka‘bah, all of whom signed the letters as witnesses. Amirul mu‘minîn then ordered the doormen to hang two letters inside the Ka‘bah, Having finished doing so inside Baitullah al-Haram, in the Ka‘bah, Amirul mu‘minîn orderd his judges, who were witnesses and were present at the time of writing them both, to inform all the pilgrims who had come to perform the ‘Umrah and the Hajj, as well as the delegations from different regions, about what they had witnessed, concerning the two letters and the conditions, and to read the letters to them so that they may understand, comprehend, know, learn and convey them to their friends and the people of their town and countries. They did so and the two letters were read to them all in al-Bait al-Haram and then they went away. This became well known among them and their testimonies attested..."¹(1)

¹ Al-Ya‘qubi’s *Tarikh*, vol. 2, pp. 216-221. Al-Tabari states it in details in the events of the year 186 A. H., Eu. ed., vol. 3, pp. 654 & 655. It is briefly referred to by al-Mas‘udi in *Muruj al-Dhadab*, vol. 3, p. 353, Ibn al-Athir in *al-Kaamil*, Eu. ed. vol. 6, pp. 117 118, and Ibn Kathir in *al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah*, vol. 10, p. 187.

**Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) Known as the Prophet’s (peace be on him and
his progeny) Successor**

**In the Poems of the Companions, the Tabi‘in (i.e. those who saw the
Companions) and In the Lexicons**

In the Early Days of Islam

The epithet of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as “*al-Wasi*” (the Successor) was well-known to every body in the early days of Islam, such that it was stated in the books of literature.

In Lisan al-Arab, under the entry “*al-Wasi*”, it is stated: "And ‘Ali (peace be on him) was called Al-Wasi (the Successor)".

In Taaj al-‘Uroos: Al-Wasi on the scale of al-Ghani is the epithet of ‘Ali (peace be on him).

Al-Mubarrid’s statement in al-Kaamil fi al-Lughah will be come shortly.

It was also mentioned by the poets in their poems ever since the days of the Companions, like Hassaan Ibn Thaabit, the Holy Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) poet, who said after the his (peace be on him and his progeny) death in an eulogy addressed to ‘Ali (peace be on him):

May Allah reward you as reward is in His hand

O Aba al-Hasan, on our behalf, and who is like Abu al-Hasan

You protected the Messenger of Allah for our sake and his covenant

Was with you, so who is more deserving than you, who else, who else?

Are you not his brother and his successor in guidance?

Have you not more knowledge of the Book and the Sunnah than they have?

¹(1)1

Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar, in his al-Muwaffaqiyyaat, quotes a poet of Quraysh, praising ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Abbas:

***By Allah no human being spoke to the people, after the successor (wasi) ‘Ali, is
like Ibn ‘Abbas² (2)2***

¹ Al-Muwaffaqiyyaat by al-Zubair Ibn Bakkar, Baghdad, ed. pp. 574 & 575. Hassaan’s poem is stated by al-Ya’qubi in his Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 128 with different words, and in Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 1st ed., vol. 2, p. 15

Al-Walid Ibn 'Uqbah Ibn Abu Mu'ait, on the occasion of 'Uthman's murder, said:

The best of the people, after three, is the one who was killed by al-Tujaybi who came from Egypt.

In reply, al-Fadl Ibn 'Abbas, said, in a poem:

² Al-Muwaffaqiyyaat, p.575. Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, Egypt 1st ed., vol. 1, p. 201; al-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu.ed. vol.1, pp. 3064-5. Ibn al-Atheer's Tarikh, Eu.ed., vol. 3, p. 153, concerning elegiac poetry on 'Uthman. Al-Walid Ibn'Uqbah Ibn Abu Mu'ait Ibn Dhakwaan. Dhakwaan was a slave of 'Umayyah who adopted him and attributed his lineage to him. Al-Walid's mother, 'Urwa, was 'Uthman's mother. He was sent by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as confirmer, to Bani al-Mustalaq. As they came out to meet him, he, being afraid, returned to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and told him that they had renounced Islam and refused to pay the poor-rate but a verse was revealed to the effect that: **"O you who believe! If a transgressor comes to you with a news, beware lest you harm a people in ignorance, then repent later for what you have done."** (Surah Hujuraat (49): Verse 6). Consequently, the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) sent another person to them. They told him they were Muslims (and had not renounced Islam as reported falsely earlier). Yet, 'Uthman appointed him as governor of Kufah during his rule but as he drank wine and, while drunk' performed the congregational morning prayers in four units instead of two, 'Uthman was forced to depose him. We have related his biography, in detail, in our book Ahaadith 'A'ishah (The Narrations of 'A'ishah), the chapter on "The events of the era of the two sons-in-law". After 'Uthman, he lived in Raqqah, Syria and died there. His biography is in Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah.

Al-Fadl Ibn al-Abbas Ibn Abd al-Muttalib is the eldest son of al-Abbas. He participated with the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in the conquer of Makkah and the Battle of Hunayn, where he stood firm for him when others ran away. He also attended the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) ritual funeral bath and burial. He was martyred on the day of Maraj al-Safraa' or at Ajnaadeen, in Syria, both of which occurred circa 18 A.H. It is also said that he was martyred on the Day of al-Yarmuk.

His biography is in al-Ist'aaab, Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah. By "after three" he means: After the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr and 'Umar.

Al-Tujaybi, or al-Tujubi, is an affinity to the Midhhij tribe, used to live in a district in Egypt. Of them was 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Udays al-Balwi, who took part in the assassination of 'Uthman. The said poem refers to him. Of them was also Abd al-Rahman Ibn Muljam al-Muradi at-Tad'uli, the killer of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). His house was next to Ibn 'Udays's. Look up as-Sam'ani's Al-Ansaab for al-Tujaybi and al-Tad'uli, al-Ikmaal by Makula, for al-Tujaybi, vol. 1, p. 214 and for al-Tad'uli look up al-Lubaab fi Tahdhib al-Ansaab by Ibn al-Athir.

The Best of the people, after Muhammad, is the al-Wasi of the chosen Prophet to those who remember (Allah),

The first to perform the prayers, the brother to His Prophet,

And the first who killed the deviated ones in (the Battle of) Badr ¹ (3)1

Al-Nu'man Ibn 'Ajl'an, the poet of the Ansaar, in a poem composed after the death of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), said:

It was degrading to 'Ali, who deserves it [the caliphate],

O'Amr, that you may know not.

The successor (wasi) of the chosen Prophet and his cousin,

And the killer of the champions of the deviated and the infidels.

This was said in reply to 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas who vexed the Ansar in the events of al-Saqifah and when Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) backed the Ansar against the Muhajirs of Quraysh.²(1)2

Ibn Abil Hadid says: "Of the poetry said in the early days of Islam referring to 'Ali as the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), is that which was said by 'Abdullah Ibn Abi Sufyan Ibn al-Harth Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib:

Of us is 'Ali, the man of Khaybar,

And the man of Badr with flowing detachments,

The successor (wasi) of the chosen Prophet and his cousin.

So, who is like him and who is his match?

Abd al-Rahim Ibn Ju'ayl said:

By my life you have given your allegiance to the guardian

Of religion, the known chaste, the successful

¹

² He is an-Nu'man Ibn 'Ajl'an az-Zurqi al-Ansari (peace be on him and his progeny), the organ and the poet of the Ansar. 'Ali (peace be on him) appointed him as governor of Bahrayn.

His biography is in al-Ist'ab, printed in Haydarabad, 1/298, No. 1323. Usdul Ghabah, 5/26. al-Isaabah, 3/532. His lineage is in Jamharatu An-sabil 'Arab, pp. 327-328. al-Ishtqaq, p.461. The verses are quoted from al-Muwaffaqiyyat by az-Zubair Ibn Bakkar, pp.592-594, narrated by Ibn Abil Hadid in Sharh Nahjul Balaghah edited by Muhammad Abul fadl Ibraheem, 6/31.

'Ali, the chosen's successor (wasi) and his cousin

The first who performed the prayers, the pious and the God-fearing¹ (1)1

The Will in the Poems Recited about the Battle of the Camel (al-Jamal)² (2)2

Ibn Abi al-Hadid also says that Abu al-Haytham Ibn al-Tayyihaan, a Badri (i.e. the one who partook in the Battle of Badr), said:

Tell al-Zubair and tell Talhah that

It is we whose slogan is al-Ansar

It is we whose deeds Quraysh did see

On the Qulayb day, those disbelievers

We were our Prophet's dress and cover,

Ransoming him with souls and eyes.

The successor (wasi) is our Imam and guardian

The hidden has come out and the secrets are revealed

'Umar Ibn Harith al-Ansari, praising Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyah, in the Battle of the Camel, said:

The Prophet's namesake and resembling the successor

A man of Azd (tribe) on the Day of the Camel said:

This is 'Ali, he is the successor

His brother on the salvation Day is the Prophet,

Whose standard's colour is red,

Who said: This is the successor after me.

Remembered by the retainer, forgotten by the wretched

On the Day of the Camel, a young man of Dhubbah from the troops of 'A'ishah, came out (for combat), reciting:

We are Banu Dhubbah, enemies of 'Ali,

The one who is known of old as the successor

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 1, p. 27. look up al-Futuh by Ibn A'tham, printed in Hyderabad, 1288 A.H., vol. 2, p. 277, vol. 1, pp. 47-49.

² 2. Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, Futuh, vol. 2, p. 307

*The horseman of war in the Prophet's days
I am not blind to 'Ali's virtue
But I mourn (Uthman) Ibn 'Affan, the pious.
The master is avenging the master*

Sa'id Ibn Qays al-Hamdani, a member of 'Ali's army, on the Day of the Camel, said:

*Tell the successor (wasi) that the Qahtan (tribes) have come.
Let them come, the Hamdani (tribes) will ward them off.*

On the same day, Hujr Ibn 'Adi al-Kindi said:

*O our Lord, keep 'Ali safe for us.
Keep safe the blessed the pleasing to Allah,
The believer, the monotheist, the pious,
The unerring, the non-transgressor, the guide, the successful, the guided.
Protect him and preserve the Prophet in him
As he was his master and then approved him as a successor (wasi)*

Khuzayma Ibn Thabit, famous as Zu al-Shahaadatain (as his lone witness was equal to two witnesses due to the endorsement of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) for him, a Badri, said on the Day of the Camel:

*O the successor of the Prophet, the war
Has ousted the foes, and the women were set forth.
The affairs are set right for you except Syria
And in Syria will appear the surrender.
What they had seen suffices them, and it suffices
You as we are and as they are.*

On the Day of the Camel, he also addressed 'A'ishah thus:

*(He is) the successor of the Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny), not any else of his kinship (got this position)
And you were witness to what had happened.*

On the Day of the Camel, the son of al-Zubair addressed, followed by al-Hasan (peace be on him). In this regard, Amr Ibn Uhayhah recited the following poem:

*The beauty of goodness, O the one similar to his father,
You stood among us as an excellent speakers,
You delivered the sermon through which Allah distinguished
From your father, the people of defects
You removed the masks so the affair became clear
And you reformed those things that corrupt the heart
You are not like the son of Zubair, who stammers in speech
With lowered reins, a doubtful saying,
Allah has denied that he does what
The Son of the Successor (wasi) and the son of the chosen one does
Surely the person between the Prophet, for you is goodness,
And between the successor (wasi) without doubt*

Ibn Abi al-Hadid, after narrating these poems of which we have brought only some of them briefly, says: Abu Mekhnaf, Lut Ibn Yahya, has recorded these poems and eulogies in their entirety in his book Waq'ah al- Jamal.

Abu Mekhnaf is one of the narrators. He is from those who believed in Imamate by election (and not by divine appointment). He is not a Shia and is not regarded from their narrators.

Among the poetry of Siffin which refers to 'Ali (peace be on him) as the successor, was what Nasr Ibn Muzaahim Ibn Yasar al-Manqari, a narrator of traditions, stated in his book: Siffin.

The Will in the Poems at Siffin

Answering a letter from 'Ali (peace be on him) to Jarir Ibn 'Abdillah al-Bajali and al-Ash'ath Ibn Qays al-Kindi - both were 'Uthman's governors in the Iranian lands – Jarir replied to him with a poem which read as:

*'Ali's letter reached us in the land of the 'Ajam, we reject it not.
We did not disobey it when it came,
Nor did we slander nor blame,*

*We, faithfully, followed our religion,
The religion of the Prophet, the dispeller of the darkness
The trustee of the Lord and His argument,
The Justice of the creatures and the one to whom they fasten,
The Messenger of the King, and after him
Our Caliph, the Standing, the Support
I mean, 'Ali, the Prophet's successor (wasi)
We keep away from him the illegitimate ones of the nations ¹(1)1*

A letter from Imam (peace be on him) was answered in poetry by al-Ash'ath:

*The messenger, 'Ali's messenger, came to us.
And the Muslims were glad by his arrival
The messenger of the successor (wasi), the successor (wasi) of the Prophet
He has virtue and priority among the believers
As per the advice of Allah and the Mustafa
The Messenger of God, the Prophet, the Trustworthy,
He fights in the way of Allah, without exception,
All the rebels along with the deniers,
The minister of the Prophet and his son-in-law,
The sword of death for the oppressors*

When there was a dispute in Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) army concerning deposing al-Ash'ath from the leadership of his tribe and replacing him with someone else, al-Najashi recited the following odes:

*We accept what 'Ali accepts for us
Even at the cost of having the nose cut off.
The successor (wasi) of the Messenger of Allah, singled out of his folk,
And his inheriter after the noble uncles² (2)2*

¹ Siffin, pp. 15_18. Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 1, p. 247. Ibn A'tham's Futuh, vol. 2, p. 355.

² Siffin, p.137 Al-Najashi is Qays Ibn 'Amr, a poet during the time of paganism and Islam. Originally, he was from Najran of Yemen, lived in Kufah and died in the year 40 A.H. (al-Zarkali's al-A'laam).

From among the poems that have been recited on the Day of Siffin is the poem of al-Nadhr Ibn Ajlaan al-Ansari, which is as follows:

***I was an exception in Siffin,
By my life, the army of Siffin was negligent,
Till he said,
How can there be dissension while the successor (wasi) is our Imam
How is it possible, except through wandering and being left alone by Allah..
Leave Moaviah the rebel and follow
The religion of the successor (wasi), you all meet him fast ¹***

Hujr Ibn 'Adi al-Kindi recited the following verses:

***O Lord protect 'Ali for us,
Protect for us the cultured, the pure,
The believer, the Guide, with whom Allah is satisfied,
Make him guide of the nation and the guided one,
Neither erring in opinion nor stupid.
Protect him, O my Lord, as you protected the Prophet,
As he was his friend, then his chosen successor (wasi) after him² (3)I***

'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Dhua'ib al-Aslami said:

***Tell Mu'awiyah Ibn Harb:
Why don't you turn to the truth,
Remaining all the time prevented from good,
Warring against the one who abides by the Book?
Even if you remained safe for a single day***

¹ Siffin, p. 365

² Siffin, p.381. According to Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, he recited these verses in the Battle of al-Jamal. Hujr Ibn 'Adi al-Kindi was known as the good Hujr. He came to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), participated in the Battle of al-Qadisiyyah as well as the battles of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), and led his tribe, Kindah, during the Battle of Siffin. He, together with a group, were sent by Ziyaad to Mu'awiyah, who killed them near the Maraj 'Adhra (in Syria), in the year 51 A.H. Hujr said that he was the first Muslim who shouted "Allah-o-Akbar" in the conquest of Makkah.

*We would visit you with an army like mountains
Led by the successor (wasi) to you so that
He may stop your "barking" and doubting¹ (1)2*

Al-Mughirah Ibn al-Harith Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib said:

*O ruler of death! Be patient, don't be frightened
With the religion of Ibn Harb (Mo'awiyah), for surely the truth has become
manifest
Fight against those who rebel against you and inflict dangers upon you,
For surely, (divine) help in difficulties is only for those who are patient,
Cut the limbs to the extents of the swords and consider
In it is goodness, and hope from Allah, (satisfaction) and victory,
Be certain that whoever opposes you, he will get up in the morn
Get up in the morn as a wretched and his soul will be in loss
Among you is the successor (wasi) of the Messenger of Allah, your Leader
And his family, and the Book of Allah was spread among you
And don't fear deviation, there is no father for you,
Soon, the religion and piety will be protected for the one who is patient.²(2)3*

Al-Fadl Ibn al-'Abbas said:

*The successor (wasi) of the Messenger of Allah, other than his family,
And his fighter when a match is demanded (by the foe)³ (3)4*

Al-Mundhir Ibn Abu Hamisah al-Wadi'i said:

*He is not from us who is not your friend in the way of
Allah, O the owner of guardinship and wasiyyah⁴ (4)5*

¹ Siffin, p. 382. "Barking" refers to his name, Mu'awiyah, which is derived from the barking of dogs: a mu'awiyah is a bitch barking at the dogs.

² Ibid., p.385

Al-Mughirah is the brother of Abu Sufyan Ibn al-Harith, the poet. It is said that both are the same person and their biographies are in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Kunaa wa al-Alqaab

³ Siffin, p.416. Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 1st ed., vol. 1, p. 284. The details of this couplet after some time, Allah willing

⁴ Siffin, p.436. He was the fighter and the poet of Hamdan tribes. Wada'ah is a family of Hamdan, an offshoot of Ibn Durayd. In his biography in al-Isaabah, it is

The Will in Ibn Abbas's Letter

Concerning the Battle of Siffin, Ibn 'Abbas, answering Mu'awiyah's letter, wrote to him:

In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

Your letter reached me and I understood what was written in it. As to your blaming us for being quick in abusing the supporters of 'Uthman and the rule of Banu 'Umayyah, by my life, you had obtained what you needed of 'Uthman when he asked your help but you did not help him, until you have become what you are, while between you and him, in this respect, there is 'Uthman's maternal brother, al-Walid Ibn 'Uqbah. As to your tempting us with Taym and 'Adiy, Abu Bakr and 'Umar were better than 'Uthman, and still 'Uthman was better than you.

As to your saying that there remained of Quraysh no more than six men, so many are its men and how good those who remained are. The good ones have fought you, and we have been forsaken by those who forsook you.

As to your mentioning war, of us are left those who would make you forget what was before, and fear what would be after.

As to your saying that if the people had given me their allegiance, you would have hurried to obey me, but the people gave their allegiance to 'Ali, the brother of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his cousin, successor (wasi) and minister. He is better than me. But you have no right to it because you are a freed slave and the son of a freed slave, the head of the allies (comprising of Jews who fought against the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)) and the son of 'the eater of liver' (Of human beings). And peace (be on you)."

When Ibn 'Abbas's letter reached Mu'awiyah, he recited the following verses extempore:

I called Ibn Abbas to take a letter

An affair gifted to me by my letters

He went against my expectation while the incidents are abundant

stated that he was intelligent, was the first to make an arrow from a jade/work-horse other than the usual arrow made from other horses called eraab. When the news reached to Umar about this invention, he was amazed and remarked, 'Implement them as he demands'. Al-Isaabah, vol. 3, p. 478

*And it was not what struck me with my correspondences
 What he brought was not what he deserved
 I don't want to boil further the cauldrons
 Say to Ibn Abbas that I am seeing you scared
 Due to your ignorance of my forbearance you think that I am negligent
 I can express lightning and thunder as whenever I want as I
 Can do whatever worries you with my fingertips
 Siffin is my backyard I am not shy and I don't
 Flee from such threats of my killer*

Al-Fazl Ibn Abbas replied to him thus:

*Know, O son of Hind, I am certainly not negligent,
 You will never attain what you seek,
 Now, when you are defeated in the war, its fire,
 Upon you is to bend down on its knees due to fatigue*

Al-Mas'udi, in his Muruj al-Dhahab, records:

a. Those who mourned Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) after his martyrdom: One of Imam's (peace be on him) followers said:

*Be consoled, as you have many a consolation
 That remove from you the burning grief,
 As the death of the Prophet, the murder of the successor
 The killing of Husain and the poisoning of Hasan.*

b. The murder of Hujr Ibn 'Adi: It is said that the murderers of Hujr Ibn

'Adi, at the time of killing him, said to him:

"Amirul mu'minîn (Moaviyah) has orderd me to kill you, O you the head of deviation, the source of disbelief and rebellion and the lovers of Abu Turab ['Ali], and your companions, unless you give up your disbelief, curse your friend ['Ali] and renouce him".

Hujr and those with him said: "To endure the sharpness of the sword is easier for us than that to which you invite us. To meet Allah, His Prophet (peace be on him

and his progeny) and his successor (*wasi*) are far dearer to us than to enter Hell".¹(1)1

The Will in al-Ma'mun's poetry

The policy of rapprochement with the 'Alawis, adopted by the 'Abbaside caliph, al-Ma'mun, prompted him to choose Imam 'Ali al-Reza (peace be on him) as his crown prince. He also mentioned the will in his poetry. He said:

*Am I blamed for loving the successor (wasi), Abu al-Hasan,
To me this is one of this age's wonders² (1)2*

He also said:

*Of a sinful, choked with hatred against me,
As I approached the off spring of the successor (wasi)³ (2)3*

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) known as the successor (wasi) along Centuries

Al-Mubarrid, in his al-Kaamil, quotes some verses of Kumayt's poetry, in which he refers to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as "*The Successor*", as below:

*Al-Tujubi by killing the successor had
Intended the throne of the nation to be destroyed⁴ (3)4*

¹ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 2, p. 42 & vol. 3, p. 4

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, vol. 2, p. 22. Abu al-Hasan is Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

³ Al-Baihaqi's al-Mahasin wal Masawi' 1/105

⁴ Al-Tujubi is 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Muljam al-Muradi at-Tad'uli (may Allah curse him), the killer of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). This epithet was given to him because he used to live in Egypt in a district by that name. He migrated to al-Kufah. His biography had formerly been reported. Al-Kaamil by al-Mubarrid, printed by al-Ma'arif Library, Beirut, vol. 2, p. 151.

Al-Mubarrid is Abul ' Abbas Muhammad Ibn Yazid al-Azdi al-Simaali al-Basri. In his biography, al-Khatib al-Baghdadi says: "He was the master of the literateurs, an expert in Arabic literary sciences. Among his works is Al-Kaamil fi al-Lughah. He died in Baghdad in 285 A.H. His biography is in Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol. 3, p. 380 and in Kashf al-Zunoon under the root of al-Kaamil.

Al-Kumayt is Abu al-Mustahal Ibn Zayd al-Asadi from Kufah. He was an authority on Arabic literature, language, events and ancestry. He was reliable in his

So, Imam Ali (peace be on him) was well-known as the successor (*wasi*) of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), so much so that it became his inseparable epithet like his other epithet AbuTurab.

Al-Mubarrid evidenced his opinion that the Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was known as 'the successor' (*al-wasi*) by the poet Abul Aswad ad-Du'ali, who referred to 'Ali (peace be on him) thus, along with the bare epithets of al-Hamzah and al-'Abbas, as below:

***I love Muhammad immensely,
Abbas, Hamzah and the successor (wasi)¹ (1)1***

Al-Himyari said:

***I believe in what the successor (wasi) believed in,
On the Day of al-Nukhaylah when he killed those allowing (the haram²) (2)2***

He also said:

***Allah favoured them with Muhammad, Guided them, clad and fed them
Yet they set out to his successor (wasi) and friend
With evil deeds and made him taste bitterness³ (3)3***

The Imam of the Shafi'is, Muhammad Ibn Idris (d. 204 A.H.) said:

***If loving the wasi is "rejection"(rafdh)
Then I am the foremost rejecter among the people⁴ (4)4***

knowledge. His poems, al-Haashimiyyaat, were translated into German. He died in the year 126 A.H. Look up Al-Zarkali's A'laam vol. 6, p. 92

¹ Al-Kaamil' by al-Mubarrid, vol. 2, p. 152. Also stated by Abu al-Faraj in his Al-Aghaani in the biography of al-Himyari, Saasi ed., vol. 7, p. 10.

Abu al-Aswad is Zaalim Ibn 'Amr al-Du'ali, a jurist, a noble and a poet. He laid down the principles of Arabic grammar according to the directives of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and others followed suit. He was also the first one to put the vowels on the Holy Qur'an. He participated in the Battle of Siffin with Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). He died in Basrah in 69 A.H., al-A'laam by al-Zarkali, vol. 3, p. 34. Look up al-'Iqd al-Farid, Egypt ed., 1372 A.H., vol. 3, p. 211.

² Al-Kaamil, vol. 2, p. 175. The reason for reciting this poetry in detailed in al-Aghaani, Saasi ed. vol. 7, p. 21, "The Day of al-Kharibah" Al-Sayyid al-Himyari is Ismaaeel Ibn Muhammad. He was one of three brothers. He composed poetry concerning the era of Paganism and Islam. He was a favourite of the Abbaside emperors, al-Mansur and al-Mahdi. He died in 173 A.H. Look up al-A'laam by al-Zarkali, vol. 1, p. 320

³ Al-Aghaani, vol. 6, p. 9, "The Day of al-Kharibah" in the biography of al-Sayyid al-Himyari

Ibn Durayd said:

I adore the Prophet Muhammad and his successor (wasi)

And his two sons and daughter, the pure Batul¹ (5)5

In al-Mutanabbi's Diwan we read: Al-Mutanabbi was asked: "How is that you did not praise Amir al-Mu'minîn 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him)? he said:

I forsook the praise of the successor (wasi) deliberately

As (his) light was tall and all-pervasive

When a thing is independent, it stands by itself

Thus, the brightness of the sun eliminates falsehood.²(1)6

The last couple lines have become a proverb, as such:

When a thing is independent, it stands by itself

Thus, the brightness of the sun eliminates falsehood

Praising Abul Qasim Tahir Ibn Husain Ibn Tahir al-'Alawi, again in his Diwan, al-Mutanabbi said:

He is the son of the Messenger of Allah and the son of his successor (wasi),

And their like, I likened, after several experiences³ (2)1

Shaykh al-Islam al-Hamwini al-Juwayni (d. 722 A.H.) said:

The brother of Ahmad, the selected one, the chosen one of the Hashmites,

The father of the leaders, the blessed distinguished ones, the trusted ones,

The successor (wasi) of the leader of the Messengers, Muhammad,

'Ali, Amirul Mu'minîn, Abu al-Hasan⁴(3)2

⁴ . Diwan al-Shaff'i, p. 35, Beirut ed. 1403 A.H.

¹ Al-kuna wal alqab, 1/274, in the biography of Ibn Durayd. Batul: one of Fatimah's epithets

² Diwan Abut-Tayyin al-Mutanabbi (d. 468H.) Edited by Fredrick, p. 856, printed in Berlin, 1861.

³ Ibid., p. 333.

⁴ In the preface of his book Fara'idus-sebtayn, paper 2b, Ms photoed by the Central Library of Tehran University, No. 1690/1164. In this line he states the name, 'Ali, and the epithet, al-wasi.

He also said:

*The brother of the seal of the noble Messengers, Muhammad,
The Messenger of the God of the worlds, the purified,
'Ali the successor (wasi) of the chosen and his vizier,
Haydar, the father of the magnanimous noblemen¹ (4)3*

Muhammad Habib al-'Ubaydi (d. 1383 A.H.), the jurist of al-Mosul, composed a long poem during the Iraqi Revolution in 1920 A.D., when the British troops occupied the country, refuting Britain's allegation that it had the right to rule (wessayah) over Iraq and the Iraqis. He gave the title "the First Cry" to his poem, in which he said:

*O the West, you have indeed forged a lie,
As we know no successor (wasi) except the successor (wasi).
We swear by the Qur'an and the Bible,
We shall accept no guardianship of any group
Or blood will flow like floods.
After the successor (wasi), the father of Batul,
How can we accept the British as rulers (wasīs)?
O lovers of the noble progeny of the Prophet
Can Iraq be under the rule of the wretched ones
It (Iraq) is the inheritance of the progeny of the best of creatures
After the well-known Imams, can we be satisfied with the British Rule?*

In another couplet, he says:

*Be witness, O inhabitants of the earth and the zenith,
Indeed, the followers of the Successor (wasi) have refused (any other) rule*

In yet another poem, he uses the following expression:

*Indeed, we will have broken the covenant of the Prophet with us,
And would have committed a sin, a disgraceful and humiliating act,
If we accept the (British) rule and disobeyed,
Would not the successor (wasi) be angry with us*

¹ In the beginning of Fara'idus-Subtayn, 7b

If we accepted the British as rulers?

Neither you are from us nor are we from you

So why you want to rule over us?

O sons of London! You are neither Alavis

Nor Hashmites nor Qurashis

Certainly, you are neither Muslims nor Arabs,

From our nation nor from the East

So why you want to rule over us?

You are neither Jafaris nor Hanafis

You are neither Shaafeis nor Zaidis

The Shariah of Ahmad has brought us together

Which rejects the rule of the West

So why you want to rule over us?

The politics of division has tired us

And we have been guided to the same path

O enemy of ours, who has come to us in the garb of a friend,

You are between the ruler and a friend,

You are naught but a stranger and an alien

So why you want to rule over us?

The last hemistich being repeated as the standing phrase, or: "*So why you (the British) want to rule over us?*"¹(1)4 in another poem.

* * *

All that have been related about the successor (wasi) and the will (al-wasiyya) was popular among the School of Caliphate as from the first century till the 14th century of Hijri. Al-Zabby, from the army of Ayesha on the day of Jamal, said:

¹ Thawratul ' Ishr im fi Dhicrahal Khamsin, by Muhammad Ali Kamalud-Din, at-Tadamun press, 1971, pp.

We, the children of Zabba, are enemies of Ali

The one who is known among the ancient ones as the successor (wasi)

They called Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as the successor (*wasi*) and they also used to call him and the eleven Imams from his offspring as the successors, as the Abbaside caliph Harun al-Rashid had stated when foretelling the fights which were to take place between his two sons, al-Amîn and al-Ma‘mun.

They used to call Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as the successor (*wasi*) inadvertently, without contemplating its significance. But in states of awareness, they denied it in some instance, concealed it in other instances and distorted the meaning of the word in yet other instances. We shall study this phenomenon in our coming discussions, Allah Willing.

The School of Caliphate Exerts Great Efforts to Conceal or Change What was known about the Succession (*wasiyyah*)

The first whom we notice doing so (i.e. concealing the truth about the succession) was ‘A’ishah, according to the narratives quoted from her. Her denying the succession denotes, in fact, that Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was well-known as the successor (*wasi*) in her time, as shall be explained hereunder:

‘A’ishah’s Narration confirms that ‘Ali (peace be on him) was the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Successor

An evidence proving that Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was known among the companions as the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in addition to what had already be stated is the narrative quoted from ‘A’ishah, according to a tradition in Sahih Muslim, which was as follows:

"It was mentioned before ‘A’ishah that ‘Ali was the successor. She said: ‘When did he (peace be on him and his progeny) appoint him as his successor, since I was supporting him to my chest (or: my lap) when he demanded a basin, but he

leaned away. Then I felt him dead. So, when did he appoint him (Ali) as his successor?'¹(1)1"

* * *

‘A’ishah was in need of inciting the people to fight against Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) in the war named in history as Harb al-Jamal (The Battle of the Camel). Yet, we realize that the said argument did not take place by chance. It was, in fact, an opposition against her in respect to the Imam (peace be on him). Her attitude was in conformity with the historical reality, as well as with her other attitudes towards Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). In this connection Ibn Sa’d, quoting ‘A’ishah on the death sickness of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) says that she said:

"He went out leaning on two men, his feet drowing against the ground, between Ibn ‘Abbas (meaning al-Fadl) and another man". ‘Ubaydullah said: "I told Ibn ‘Abb’as about what she had said. He asked me: Do you know who the other man, whom ‘A’ishah did not name, was?"²(1)1 said. "No." Ibn ‘Abbas said: "He was ‘Ali! ‘A’ishah did not feel any liking for him!"

In another narration stated by Ahmad in his Musnad, vol. 3, p. 113, it is said:

A man, in the presence of ‘A’ishah, abused ‘Ali and ‘Ammar. She said: "As regards ‘Ali I say nothing to you about him. But about ‘Ammar, I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: "If he is given to choose one of two things, he will choose the more reasonable one."

Thus ‘A’ishah defended ‘Ammar against abuse, but kept silent when Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was abused.

¹ Sahih Muslim, al-Nawawi’s commentary, book of "al-Wasiyyah", vol. 11, p. 89. Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "al-Maghaazi", Chapter on the Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) illness, vol. 3, p. 65, and book of "Al-wasiyyah", Chapter on "al-Wasaaya"; "Fath al-Baari", vol. 6, p. 291; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, p. 32

² . Ibn Sa’d’s al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Beirut ed., vol. 2, p. 232. Al-Bukhari, in his Sahih, stated the same narration, Chapter on "The Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) illness and demise", vol. 3, p. 63. His words are: Ibn ‘Abbas asked: "Do you know who the other man, not named by ‘A’ishah, was?" I said: "No." Ibn ‘Abbas said: " He was Ali Ibn Talib". Thus, al-Bukhari omitted from the Hadith of Ibn ‘Abbas’s saying: "‘A’ishah did not feel any liking for him."

In a third hadith in the two Sahih of al-Bukhari and Muslim, we quote Muslim who in turn quotes ‘A’ishah as follows:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sent a man commanding a company. He used to recite: **‘Say: He, Allah, is one’** in leading the prayers for his men. When they returned, they told the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about it. He (peace be on him and his progeny) inquired: *"Ask him why did he do that?"* They asked him. He said: *"Because it is an attribute of the Beneficent, and I like to recite it."* The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *‘Tell him that Allah likes him.’*"¹(2)2

We wonder who this man whom ‘Allah liked, and whose name ‘A’ishah refrained from disclosing, could be? Were he her father Abu Bakr, ‘Umar or any other of her clique, like her cousin Talhah and the like, she would have instantly mentioned his name. We had looked into the sources of the School of Caliphate for the name of this man but to no avail. So, we had but to refer to the sources of Ahlul Bait (peace be on them) School, where we found the episode in the exegeses Majma’ul Bayaan and al-Burhan, commenting on Surah al-Ikhlaas, Chapter on "The meaning of **Say: He, Allah, is One**", which we quote from al-Tauheed by Shaykh Abu Ja’far Muhammad Ibn ‘Ali famous as al-Saduq (d. 381A.H.):

The companion ‘Imran Ibn Husain said: The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) sent a brigade under the leadership of ‘Ali (peace be on him). When they returned, he (peace be on him and his progeny) inquired from them (about their expedition). They said: *"Very good, but he (peace be on him) used to recite ‘Say: He, Allah, is One’ in every prayer."* He (peace be on him and his progeny) asked: *"Why did you do that?"* He (peace be on him) replied, *"Because of my love for (the Surah): Say: He, Allah, is One"*. The Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"As you like it, Allah, Mighty and Majestic be He, likes you too!"*²(1)1

¹ Sahih Muslim, book on "Salaah al-Musaafereen", Chapter on "The Merit of reciting (the Surah) **‘Say: Allah, He, is One’**"; Hadith No. 263, p. 557. Sahih al-Bukhari, book of "al-Tawhid", Chapter on "What has been said about the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) calling his ummah to regard the Oneness of Allah the Blessed and Exalted be He," vol. 4, p. 182.

² Majma’ al-Bayaan fi Tafseer al-Quran by al-Shaykh Abu ‘Ali Amin al-Din, al-Fadl Ibn Hasan al-Tabrisi (d. 548 A.H.), ed. Ahmad ‘Arif al-Zayn, al-‘Irfan press, Sidon,

The truthfulness of this narration can be proved by two authorized evidences:

- a. It is in Sahih al-Bukhari and other sources that ‘A’ishah, in her hadith, referred to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as "a man", as she did in this one.
- b. It is in Sahih al-Bukhari and elsewhere that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) told ‘Ali (peace be on him) that Allah liked him, as he told him in this narration: "Allah liked you."

‘A’ishah did not mention the name of ‘Ali (peace be on him) in her narration but referred to him as "a man". She, in fact, did not confine herself to that amount of roughness. She exceeded that, as we will relate some relevant examples.

‘A’ishah Expresses Delight at the martyrdom of ‘Ameerul Momineen Ali (peace be on him)

Concerning the assassination of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), Abul Faraj says: "When ‘A’ishah heard about the martyrdom of Imam ‘Ali, she fell in prostration"¹(2), i.e. by way of thanking Allah for the good tiding brought to her.

Al-Tabari, Abul Faraj, Ibn Sa’d and Ibn al-Athir said:

When ‘A’ishah heard about the death of ‘Ali, she recited:

She "put down the stick (of travel) and being away ended, As the traveller feels pleased at his coming back.

Then she asked: "Who killed him?" She was told: "A man from Murad."

upon that she said:

Though remote, yet his death is announced, By a boy with "no dust in his mouth" (lively).

Zainab, daughter of Umm al-Momineen ‘Umm Salamah said: "Is it about ‘Ali that you say so?"

"Remind me if I forget," retorted ‘A’ishah.²(1)

1387 A.H. p. 94, hadith 11. ‘Imran Ibn Husain Abu Najid al-Khuza’i. He accepted Islam in the year of the Battle of Khaibar. He was sent by ‘Umar to teach the people of Basrah religious instructions. He died in Basrah in 52 A.H. ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, pp. 137, 138.

¹ Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, Cairo ed., 1358 A.H. p. 43

² A-Tabari’s Tarikh, on the reason of killing of Amir al-Mu’mineen, in the events of the year 40 A.H., Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 3466. Ibn al-Athir, Eu. ed., vol. 3, p. 331, 1st ed., vol. 3, p. 157. Ibn Sa’d’s al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, vol. 3, p. 27. Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, p. 42, in which "na’aa hu ghulam" (a boy announced) is stated as "baghaa hu ghulam" (a boy sought), though it is "ma’a hu ghulam" in other sources.

A comparison between the Narrations of ‘Aishah’s and those of others

The aforementioned incident shows the attitude of ‘A’ishah towards Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). As to her saying: "When did he (peace be on him and his progeny) appoint him (Ali) as his successor?", or "He (peace be on him and his progeny) died on my chest, etc."¹(2), she was the only one saying so, while it is contradicted by the following narratives:

Ibn Sa’d, in al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Chapter on "Those who said that The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died in ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib’s (peace be on them both) lap," quotes ‘Ali (peace be on him) to have said: *"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in his illness, said: ‘Call my brother.’ ‘Ali was called in. He told him: ‘Come nearer.’ I went nearer. He leaned on me, and stayed so, talking to me in such a way that some of his spittle reached me. Then the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) got heavy in my lap..."*, as the narration goes.

‘Ali Ibn Husain (peace be on them both) is quoted to have said:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died while his head was in ‘Ali’s lap."

A-Sha’bi said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died while his head was in ‘Ali’s lap, and he (Ali) gave him the ritual bath...", as the hadith goes:

Ibn Abi Ghatafaan was quoted to have said:

"I asked Ibn ‘Abbas: ‘Did you see the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) die with his head in the lap of anybody?’ He said: ‘He died with his head on ‘Ali’s chest.’ I said: ‘But ‘Urwah told me that ‘A’ishah had said: ‘The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died leaning on my chest!, and it was he who washed him...'”, as the hadith goes.

Jabir Ibn ‘Abdillah al-Ansari was quoted to have said:

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, Book of "al-Wasaaya", Chapter one, vol. 2, p. 84, and Book of "al-Maghaazi", Chapter on "The Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) illness", vol. 3, p. 63; Sahih Muslim, Book of "al-Wasiyyah", Chapter 19; Ibn Maajah, Book of "Funerals", Chapter 64; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 6, pp. 32, 64, 77; al-Tabari, vol. 1, p. 1814

"During the rule of Umar, Ka'b al-Ahbaar rose on his feet while we were seated in the presence of 'Umar, Amirul Mu'minin and said: 'What was the last thing that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say?'

'Umar said: 'Ask 'Ali.' 'Where is he?' he asked. 'Here he is' he said. So, he asked him. 'Ali said: 'I supported him to my chest and he put his head on my shoulder and said: al-Salaah! al-Salaah!'

Ka'b said: 'That was the last covenant of all the Prophets, to that they were enjoined and upon that they were sent. Who gave him the ritual bath, O Amir al-Mu'mineen?' 'Umar said: "Ask 'Ali.' He asked him. He said: 'I gave him the ritual bath while al-'Abbas was sitting and 'Usamah and Shuqraan were taking turns in handing me water.'"¹(1)

Had the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died in the lap of 'A'ishah, or on her chest, as she claimed, 'Umar would have told Ka'b al-Ahbaar: "Ask 'Umm al-Mu'mineen 'A'ishah about the last of what the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said."

He would not have referred him to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

Stronger than all the previous narrations is that of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) wife who witnessed it herself, viz. 'Umm Salamah, who said: "By the One by whom I swear, 'Ali was the nearest of all people to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his last moments. We visited him in the morning and he was repeating: '*Has 'Ali come? Has 'Ali come?*' Fatimah said: '*May be you had sent him on an errand.*' Then 'Ali came, and I thought he might need him for something, so we left the room and sat outside the door" 'Umm Salamah added: "I was nearest to the door. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) indulged in whispering and talking to 'Ali, Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) died soon after; so, Ali was the last to see him."²(2)

¹ These five narrations are in Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Chapter on "Those who said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died in the lap of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib", Eu. ed., vol. 2, Q2, p.51.

² Al-Haakem's al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 183, confirmed that the said narration was authentic. It was also confirmed by al-Dhahabi in his Talkhees al-Mustadrak. It was also stated by Ibn 'Asaakir in the Chapter "He was the last who saw the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)" as part of the biography of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), vol. 3, pp. 14_17, based on diverse authorities. Ibn

According to ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Amr’s narrative:

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his illness said: ‘*Call my brother*’,... ‘Ali was called for him, and he (peace be on him and his progeny) covered him with his dress and leaned against him..."¹(3)3

Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) had also said concerning the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny): "*I have reclined you in your vaulted grave, that your soul flowed out while leaning on my breast. **We are from Allah and to Him shall we return.***"²(1)4

He (peace be on him) also said:

"*When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died, his head was on my chest, his soul flowed on my palm and I passed it over my face. I performed his ritual bath, assisted by the angels with the house and courtyard full of them, a group descending, another ascending. My ears continually heard their humming voices, as they invoked Allah’s blessing on him (peace be on him and his progeny), till we buried him in his grave.*"³(2)1

An Enquiry Concerning the Narrations of ‘A’ishah

‘A’ishah is the sole narrator of the tradition that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) died in her lap against all the narrations that contradict her quote. However, in all likelihood, she made this claim during the Battle of Jamal, that is, after the days (of rule) of the ‘Umar and ‘Uthman. The narrative, furthermore, is compatible with Mu‘awiyah’s era who had placed a blanket ban

Abi Shaybah’s al-Musannaf, vol. 6, p. 348. Majma’ al-Zawa’id, vol. 9, p. 112; Kanz al-Ummaal, 2nd ed., Book of "Merits", Chapter on "The merits of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib", Hadith 374, vol. 15, p. 128. Sibṭ Ibn al-Jawzi in his Tadhkirah Khawaass al-Ummah, Chapter on "Hadith of Whispering and the Will", quoting Ahmad Ibn Hanbal’s Kitab al-Fadaa’il.

¹ Kanz al-Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 6, p. 392. Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 359. Ibn ‘Asaakir’s Tarikh, in the biography of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), Beirut ed. 1395 A.H., vol. 2, p. 484

² Nahj al-Balaaghah, Sermon 202

³ Nahj al-Balaaghah, Sermon 197

on the narration of the merits of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and advocated the propagation of what was contrary to it.

Even if we assume that ‘A’ishah was truthful in saying that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) died on her chest, it cannot contradict the successively narrated hadiths that Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Was not there any other spare time for the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to convey his will to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him)? It can be gathered from many hadiths that they had plenty of time to talk together, as the hadith of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) – confirmed by the authors of the Sahihs and the Masaaneed – says:

*"I used to visit the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) twice: during the day and at night. If I arrived while he was performing his prayers, he would make a little cough..."*¹(3)²

In another narrative, he (peace be on him) said:

*"My position with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was such that no other creature enjoyed the like of it. I used to come to him every dawn and greet him till he would make a little cough..."*²(4)³ as the hadith goes.

Ibn ‘Asaakir, quoting Jabir, in his Tarikh, says:

"On the Day of al-Ta’if, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was seen whispering to ‘Ali for a long time. Some of his companions said: ‘Indeed, he has prolonged his secret talks with his cousin.’ He (peace be on him and his progeny) overheard it and said: *"It was not I who asked him for that, it was Allah Who wanted so."*

In another version of the narrative, it is said:

"He talked to him for a long time, while Abu Bakr and ‘Umar were looking on, as well as the people. Then he turned to us. The people said: ‘You took a long time

¹ Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, Book of "Manners", Chapter on "Getting permission", Hadith No. 3708. Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 80.

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 85 & 107. The details shall be related under the Chapter on the Sources of the Islamic Shari’ah according to Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School.

in your confidential talk today, O Messenger of Allah!’ He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: *‘I did not have a secret talk with him but Allah had.’*¹(1)

* * *

We are going to refer to similar narratives, quoted from other sources, in a chapter on the "Bearers of the Knowledge of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)," in the section concerning "The sources of the Islamic Shari‘ah according to Ahl al-Bait School (peace be on them)", in this book.

A Comparison between the Narrations of ‘A’ishah and that of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him)

‘A’ishah was the only one who related the news of the last hours of the life of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) that he demanded a basin to urinate, but he leaned down and died on her chest, or other similar words, to which her hadith (and others’, too), about the beginning of the revelation, can be added, and which is as follows:

“When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) received the first revelation of the verses of Surah ‘Iqra’ [‘Alaq – Chapter 96], which Jibraeel brought down from Allah, he (peace be on him and his progeny) suspected that Jibraeel was Satan wanting to play him around, and doubted that the glorious verses might be of the kind of the rhymed prose practised by the priests. But a Christian, Waraqah Ibn Nawfal, assured him that he was a Prophet receiving a revelation, like Moosa son of ‘Imran. Thus, he (peace be on him and his progeny) felt confident that he was a Prophet,”

as well as other similar hadiths of this School about the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

As we have already said in our preliminary discussions, such hadiths have created a particular image of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

¹ Both these hadiths are stated by Ibn ‘Asaakir in his biography of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), vol. 2, pp. 310 and 311. Ibn Kathir in his Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 356. In Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, 1st ed. in Egypt, vol. 2, p. 78, it is summarized thus: A’ishah entered while they were exchanging confidential talk. She said: "O ‘Ali! Mine is only one day out of nine days. Will you not leave me alone, O son of Abu Talib?"

for those who believe in them – an image which debases the status of the best of the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny) and brings it even lower than that of an ordinary person. Hence, the Saudi man (apparently knowledgeable) had the right to say that "Muhammad was a man like me, died."

But in Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) hadith about the beginning of the revelation, being the only witness present with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the Hera' cave, he heard moaning, which was explained by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to be the moaning of Satan who despaired of being worshipped.

In his hadith, he (peace be on him) also said that Allah had appointed the greatest of His angels to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), ever since he was an infant, so as to lead him, day and night, along the road of the most supreme conducts and morality.

In another hadith, about the death of Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), he (peace be on him) spoke of how he (peace be on him and his progeny) asked him to get nearer to him and started his confidential conversation, telling him his secrets and advices until Allah captured his soul¹(1)1, which flowed on his palm and he passed it on his face; thereafter, he gave him the ritual bath and clad him in the shrouds, assisted by the angels, while the courtyard was filled with them, a group descending and another ascending, and he was continually hearing their hymns of sending Allah's blessings on him (peace be on him and his progeny), until he buried him in his grave.

Such hadiths about the conduct of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) in Ahl al-Bait School have created a particular world-view for those who believe in them. Proximity among the Muslims cannot be achieved unless we study the narrations of the two groups comparatively, so as to get to the reality we are looking for. Only then can the Muslims have a mutual understanding, Allah willing!

¹ His hadith was confirmed by the hadith of Umm Salamah and others.

We once again stress that at the head of the things that must be comparatively studied are the narratives about the traditions of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), the history of his time and his companions.

Two contradictory Hadiths and Two Different Attitudes of ‘A’ishah

Ibn ‘Asaakir narrates that two women requested ‘A’ishah:

"O ‘Umm al-Mu‘mineen! Tell us about ‘Ali."

She replied: "What can I tell you about a man who put his hand on the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) whence his soul flowed into his hand and he passed it on his face. And they differed about his burial place, he said: ‘The place most loved by Allah is that in which His Prophet died.’"

One of them asked her: ‘Why did you, then, rise against him?’

She said: ‘It just happened. I wish I could redeem it with whatever is in the earth.’"¹(1)

This hadith of ‘A’ishah confirms that which was narrated by Im‘am ‘Ali (peace be on him) who said: "*The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died with his head on my chest, his soul flowed in my palm and I passed it on my face.*"

This contradicts her narration that he (peace be on him and his progeny) leaned on her chest.

Ibn ‘Asaakir also quoted ‘A’ishah to have said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was in her room and about to die. He said: ‘*Call in my beloved...*’ so, ‘Ali was called in. When he saw him, he opened his garb and made him enter it and kept hugging him till he (peace be on him and his progeny) died.”²(2)

This hadith of hers is in conformity with that which was narrated by Abdullah Ibn ‘Umar, saying: "The Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny), in his illness, said: ‘*Call in ‘Ali...*’", but it contradicts her narrations that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died while his head was on her chest, etc. The origin of these two contradictory hadiths and the cause behind them are

¹ Ibid.

² Ibn ‘Asaakir’s Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), vol. 3, p. 15

her different attitudes towards Imam Ali (peace be on him). Here is the explanation:

Two Different Attitudes towards Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him)

After the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr was given the allegiance. But Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), with a group of Banu Hashim, did not pay their allegiance to him and remained so for six months, according to ‘A’ishah’s hadith in this respect, i.e. until the death of Fatimah (peace be on her). Then, Imam (peace be on him) stayed out of social life until late in the days of ‘Uthman, when ‘A’ishah led the opposition, like Talha, al-Zubair and others, against the ruler, with the hope that her cousin, Talha, would succeed him. But, when ‘Uthman was killed and the people gave their allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), she waged a war against Ali (peace be on him) which came to be known as "The Battle of the Camel". She was defeated, was sent back to Madinah by Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and remained angry with him until his martyrdom. We have already related how she was delighted on hearing about his death. Mu‘awiyah got the rule and they both had a common enemy in Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) but later their relation soured on Mu‘awiyah’s killing of Hujr Ibn ‘Adi.

When Mu‘awiyah decided to get the allegiance for Yazid, her (‘A’ishah) brother, Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr, was one of the strongest opposers of giving allegiance to Yazid. Marwan, who was Mu‘awiyah’s agent ruling in al-Hijaz, delivered a speech in the Mosque of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), saying:

"Amirul Mu‘minin (Mu‘awiyah) has chosen for you, sparing no effort. He decided that his son, Yazid, should succeed him."

Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr stood up and said: "By Allah you are a liar and Mu‘awiyah is a liar too. You both did not choose for Muhammad’s (peace be on him and his progeny) ummah; rather, you want a Herculean rule (royal inheritance) - whenever one Hercules (king) dies, another succeeds him."

Marwan said: "He is the one against whom Allah said: **"And he who says to his parents: Fie on you!"**" (Surah Ahqaaf (46): Verse 17).

‘A’ishah heard all that from behind a curtain, she stood behind the curtain and said: ‘O Marwan ! O Marwan!’ The people listened and Marwan turned to her. She said: ‘Did you say to Abd al-Rahman that (a verse of) the Qur’an had been revealed against him? You, by Allah, are a liar! It was not against him, but against so-and-so, but you are a fragment of Allah’s curse.’” In another narration, she said: "By Allah, it is a lie which he says. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had cursed Marwan’s father while Marwan was still in his loins. Thus, Marwan is a fragment of the curse of Allah, Glorified and Almighty."¹(1)

Al-Bukhari related this hadith in his Sahih as follows:

"Marwan had been appointed as the governor of Hijaz by Mu‘awiyah. He delivered a sermon and mentioned Yazid Ibn Mu‘awiyah so that the people might take the oath of allegiance to him as the successor of his father (Mu‘awiyah). Then Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abu Bakr told him something whereupon Marwan ordered him to be arrested. But ‘Abdur-Rahman entered ‘A’ishah’s house, and they could not detain him. Marwan said: ‘It is he (‘Abd al-Rahman) about whom Allah revealed this verse: **And the one says to his parents: Fie on you! Do you hold out the promise to me...?**’ Hearing this, ‘A’ishah said from behind a veil: ‘Allah did not reveal any revelation about this except what was connected with the declaration of my innocence (of the slander).’"

As you see, al-Bukhari omitted ‘Abd al-Rahman’s saying: "...but you want it to become a royal inheritance...", and replaced it with "...told him something...". He also omitted ‘A’ishah’s hadith about Marwan, while Ibn Hajar related it in full in his commentary on Sahih al-Bukhari, named Fath al-Baari. In some other wordings: "But Allah cursed Marwan’s father while Marwan was still in his loins."²(2)

But al-Shaykh al-Bukhari did so because Mu‘awiyah and Yazid were so-called caliphs of Muslims and he did not like the common people to hear ‘Abd al-

¹ Ibn al-Athir’s Tarikh, vol. 3, p. 199, the events of the year 56 A.H.

² Fath al-Baari, vol. 10, pp. 197-198. The story is stated in detail by Abu al-Faraj in his al-Aghaani, vol. 16, p. 90-1. Look up the biography of al-Hakam Ibn Abi al-Aas, in al-Istiaab; Usud al-Ghaabah; al-‘Isaabah; al-Haakem’s al-Mustadrak alaa al-Saheehain, vol. 4, p. 481; Ibn Kathir’s Taarikh, vol. 8, p. 89; al-‘Tjaabah fi ma Istadrakahu ‘A’ishah’ alaa al-Sahaabah and in the biography of ‘Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr in Tarikh-o-Dimashq by Ibn ‘Asaakir

Rahman's opinion against them. (But the fact remains that) they did make the caliphate a Herculean rule, whenever a Hercules died another Hercules succeeded him.

He also omitted the narration of 'A'ishah against Marwan because Marwan became a ruler of the Muslims, and thus, he should not be abused. This policy had been followed by al-Bukhari as he omitted from any narration whatever was disparaging the caliphs and rulers. Yet, his book is regarded as the most authentic one by the School of Caliphate, next to the Book of Allah. He is regarded by them to be the Imam of the narrators of traditions.

* * *

As Marwan failed in getting the allegiance in Hijaz for Yazid, Mu'awiyah himself came to Hijaz for the Hajj and entered Madinah. Ibn 'Abd al-Birr, narrating about him, says:

"Mu'awiyah sat on the pulpit advocating the allegiance for Yazid. On this (Imam) Husain Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both), (Abdullah) Ibn al-Zubair and 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr, talked to him. 'Abd al-Rahman said: "Is it a Herculean Rule (that) whenever a Khosrau dies another Khosrau succeeds him? We, by Allah, would never do it." Mu'awiyah, later, sent for him one hundred thousand dirhams, as he refused to give his allegiance to Yazid. But 'Abd al-Rahman refrained from accepting them and sent them back to him and said: 'Am I to sell my religion for my (present) world?', left Madinah for Makkah, where he died before the allegiance for Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah was completed."¹(1)

Ibn 'Abd al-Birr continues:

"'Abd al-Rahman suddenly died in a place called "al-Habashi"²(2), approximately ten miles from Makkah and is buried there. It is said that he died in sleep. When his sister, 'A'ishah, ummul mu'minîn (may Allah be pleased with her) heard about his death, she left Madinah for Makkah with the intention of

¹ Look up the biography of 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr in al-Isti'ab, vol. 2, p. 393, 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 306, al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 400, and Shadharrah al-Dhahab on the event of the year 53 A.H. Almost the same is stated by al-Haakem in his al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 476.

² "al-Habashi" is a mountain to the south of Makkah, at a six miles distance, where 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr suddenly died. He was carried by the people to Makkah. 'A'ishah came from Madinah and recited an elegy on his grave.

performing Hajj, came to his grave, cried, recited an elegy and said: By Allah, had I attended your death I would have buried you where you died, and had I attended then, I would not have wept."¹(1)1

In al-Haakem's al-Mustadrak, it is stated that:

"He had a midday nap. When they wanted to awaken him they found him dead. But 'A'ishah felt suspected that he might have been harmed (i.e. poisoned) and in order to quickly get rid of him, he may have been buried alive."²(2)2

* * *

Had 'Abd al-Rahman remained alive, there could have been no allegiance for Yazid, owing to his uncompromising attitude against such an allegiance especially if backed 'A'ishah. But he died on the way to Makkah as Malik Ibn al-ashtar also died on his way to Egypt, poisoned at Mu'awiyah's order.³(3)3

Concealing the Virtues of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and Propagating to Abuse and Curse him and the reason for both these actions

We start first with giving the reason for cursing and abusing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and then relate the details about concealing his virtues, propagating to curse and abuse him.

Quraysh disliked that Both Prophethood and Caliphate be in the Banu Hashim

Al-Tabari relates two pieces of conversations that took place between the

'Umar (Ibn al-Khattaab) and Ibn 'Abbas. He narrates that Umar once said to Ibn 'Abbas:

"What prevented your people, Quraysh, from accepting your rule?"

¹ Look up the biography of 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr in al-Isti'aaab, in the margins of al-'Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 393.

² Al-Mustadrak by al-Haakem, vol. 3, p. 476, and also in Talkhees al-Mustadrak by al-Dhahabi, under the word "al-Habash" is mentioned.

³ Look up the Chapter "With Mu'awiyah" in our book Ahaadith 'Ummul mu'minin 'A'ishah.

"I do not know," said Ibn 'Abbas.

"I know." said 'Umar. "They dislike your rule over them."

"Why," asked Ibn 'Abbas, "since we are as a blessing for them?"

"Pardon!" said 'Umar. "They dislike to see both Prophethood and Caliphate gather in you as it could instill pride in you. Probably, you may say that Abu Bakr did that. No, by Allah! But Abu Bakr did what he thought to be most decisive..." as the hadith continues.

In the second dialogue 'Umar, according to Ibn 'Abbas, said:

"O Ibn 'Abbas! Do you know what prevented your people from accepting you (as rulers) after Muhammad (peace be on him and his family)?"

I, disliking to answer him, said: "If I do not know, Amirul Mu'minin (viz. Umar) will let me know."

'Umar said: "They hated to let you have both Prophethood and Caliphate lest you boast against your people. So, Quraysh chose for themselves correctly and successfully."

I said: "O Amirul Mu'minin! Permit me to talk and ward off your anger against me for my talk."

"Talk, O Ibn 'Abbas," assured 'Umar.

I said: "As to your saying, O Amirul Mu'minin, that Quraysh had chosen for themselves correctly and successfully, if Quraysh had chosen for themselves what Allah, the Glorified and Almighty, had chosen for them, they would have been right, unobjected and unenvied. As to your saying that they hated to let us have both Prophethood and Caliphate, Allah - the Glorified and Almighty - described hatred to a people and said: "**That is because they hated what Allah revealed, so He rendered their deeds null.**" [Surah Muhammad (peace be on him and his family)(47): Verse 9].

'Umar said: "Never, by Allah, O Ibn 'Abbas. I used to hear things about you I hated to agree with you about them lest your position might become low in my eyes."

I said: "What are they, O Amirul Mu'minin! If they were right, they should not lower my position in your eyes, and if they were false, a man like me had already removed falsehood from himself."

"I have heard that you say: "‘Umar said, "(The caliphate) was taken away from us because of envy and injustice."

I told him: "As to your saying, O Amirul Mu’minin, injustice it was obvious to both the ignorant and the wise. As to your saying: envy, it was Iblis who envied Adam, whose envied offspring we are."

‘Umar said: "Never! By Allah, your hearts, O Banu Hashim, refused but an envy that never fades away, and a hatred and fraud that never abates."

I said: "Easy! O Amirul Mu’minin! Do not attribute envy and fraud to the hearts of a group from whom Allah kept away uncleanness and purified them thoroughly, as the heart of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is one of Banu Hashim’s"

‘Umar said: "Leave me alone, O Ibn ‘Abbas!"

I said: "I will."

As I was getting ready to leave, he felt ashamed of me, and said:

"Stop! O Ibn ‘Abbas. By Allah I do care for you and am pleased with what pleases you."

I said: "O Amirul Mu’minin! You owe a right to me, as well as every Muslim. Whoever observes it, it will be his fortune, and whoever disregards it, it will be his misfortune."

Then I went away.¹(1)1

A study of the Two Narrations

In both the narrations, ‘Umar (as a Caliph) states that Quraysh tribe hated to see both Prophethood and Caliphate in the hands of Banu Hashim, as this would make them look down upon the others in Quraysh.

In the second narration, he said: "Quraysh chose for themselves correctly and successfully." Thus, Quraysh were looking for their own interest in worldly matters, not the interest of the Muslims in general. So, what difference does it make to the Muslims which tribe of Quraysh got the rule after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)?

¹ Al-Tabari in his *Tarîkh*, in stating ‘Umar’s conduct, concerning the events of the year 23 A.H., 1st ed., Egypt, Vol. 1, pp.30-32. In the Eu. ed. vol. 1, pp. 2768-72. The second dialogue is also stated in Ibn al-Athir’s *Tarîkh*, vol. 3, pp. 24-25.

In his approval of Quraysh's procedure he had no proof except saying that they chose for themselves with no other proof from Allah's Book or the Sunnah of His Prophet.

From Ibn 'Abbas's reply: "If Quraysh had chosen for themselves what Allah - the Glorified and Almighty – had chosen for them, they would have been right" we can infer two points:

First: Quraysh's choice was other than Allah's choice. He of course, meant 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both), as we shall state the verses and the narrations concerning the same presently.

Second: Quraysh had no right to choose other than what Allah the Almighty had chosen. By this, he refers to the following verse: "**And it is not for a believing man and a believing woman that they should have any choice in their matter when Allah and his Messenger have decided a matter, and whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger, he surely strays off a manifest straying.**" (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 36). He also greatly stresses the question that Quraysh hated seeing Prophethood and Caliphate gather in Banu Hashim, and said that Allah – the Glorified and Almighty – had described some people with hatred: "**That is because they hated what Allah revealed so He rendered their deeds null.**". The meaning of "**rendered their deeds null**", is explained in our book 'Aqaa'id al-Islam [The Beliefs of Islam].

Umar could not refute the claim of Ibn 'Abbas that Quraysh had chosen other than that chosen by Allah the Almighty. He could only counter him with what he had heard of him saying: "It was taken away from us because of envy and injustice". Ibn 'Abbas did not deny it but confirmed it by saying: "As to your saying: injustice, then it was obvious to both the ignorant and the wise."

By this, Ibn 'Abbas wanted to explain that to say that Banu Hashim were wronged by removing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) from the rule, was not a saying uttered only by Ibn 'Abbas, such that it could be said that it was he who uncovered the truth. Actually that fact was known to everybody, to the wise and prudent, as well as to the ignorant and the lowly.

Regarding his saying: "because of envy", he replied: "It was Iblis who envied Adam, whose envied offspring we are."

Perhaps Ibn ‘Abbas was referring to Allah’s saying: **"Surely Allah chose Adam and Noah and the offspring of Ibraheem and the offspring of ‘Imran, one being the offspring from the other, and Allah is Hearing, Knowing"** (Surah al-An‘aam (6): Verses 33&34) i.e. Banu Hashim are the offspring of the one whom Iblis envied because they had been chosen by Allah and the offspring follow in the footsteps of their ancestors.

At the end, Umar could bear no more of Ibn ‘Abb’as’s talk and was filled with anger, and thus, burst it out: "Never, by Allah, your hearts, O Banu H’ashim, refused but an envy that never fades away and a hatred and a fraud that never abate."

To this Ibn ‘Abbas replied: "Easy, O Amir al-Mu’mi’nin! Do not attribute envy and fraud to the hearts of a group from whom Allah has kept away uncleanness and purified them thoroughly, and the heart of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is one of Banu Hashim’s."

We refrain from explaining Umar’s word because they are too rude. But by his reply, Ibn ‘Abbas referred to Allah’s saying (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 33): **"Allah want to keep away uncleanness from you, O Ahl al-Bait, and to purify you thoroughly."** As Umar could not refute Ibn ‘Abbas’ words, he told him to leave him alone. Obeying Umar’s order, Ibn ‘Abbas was about to leave, when Umar showed leniency towards him and the issue was solved amicably. Nevertheless, Qurashite Caliphs, as well as the other people of Quraysh, remained hating to see the caliphate in the hands of Banu Hashim, as is dearly seen in the dialogue between Umar and Ibn ‘Abbas, after the death of the ruler of Hims. Umar said to Ibn ‘Abbas:

"O Ibn ‘Abbas! The ruler of Hims has died. He was a good man – and good men are few – and I hope you to be one of them. I feel something about you which I do not recognise in you. I am tired of it. What do you think of working (for us)?"

Ibn ‘Abbas said: "I would not until you tell me what is inside you."

Umar asked: "What do you want that for?"

"I want it," retorted he, "because if it was something which might worry me, I would have to be cautious about it as you do. But if I was innocent of it, I would know that I am not its man and I might accept your work, I seldom see you wanting something without being quick to it."

Umar said: "O Ibn 'Abbas! I was afraid that what is to come to me would come, with you still in your post, and then you would say, come to us, but I will not come to you rather than other than you...", as the narration continues.¹(1)

It seems that this conversation took place between them late in the days of 'Umar. During the last month of 'Umar's life there took place an incident which al-Bukhari relates as below:

Ibn 'Abbas said: "I was teaching some men of the Muhajir, among whom was 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf. While I was in his house in Mena and he was with 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab during his last pilgrimage, 'Abdur-Rahman came to me and said: "Would that you had seen the man who came today to Amirul Mu'minin, saying: 'O Amirul Mu'minin! What do you think about so-and-so who says: If 'Umar should die, I would give my allegiance to so-and-so person, as by Allah, the allegiance given to 'Abu Bakr was not but an error committed.'

'Umar became angry and said: 'I will, Allah willing, stand before the people tonight and warn them against those people who want to usurp their affairs.'

'Abd al-Rahman reports: 'I said: O Amir al-Mu'minin! Do not do that, for the season of Hajj gathers the riff-raff and the rubble, and it is they who will gather around you when you stand to address the people. I am afraid that you will get up and say something, and some people will spread your statement and they may not say what you had actually said and they do not understand its meaning, and may interpret it incorrectly. So, you should wait till you reach Madinah as it is the place of migration and the sunnah, where you can come in touch with the people of jurisprudence and of mobilities, and tell them what you may with confidence. The learned men would comprehend your statement and put it in its proper place.'

'Umar said: 'By Allah, I will, Allah willing, do this in my first staying in Madinah."

Ibn 'Abbas added: "We reached Madinah by the end of the month of Dhu al-Hijjah. On Friday, as the sun declined, we hurried to the mosque and found Sa'id Ibn Zayd Ibn 'Amr Ibn Nufayl sitting next to the corner of the pulpit. I sat close to him with my knee touching his. After a while, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab came in. On seeing him, I said to Sa'id Ibn Zayd Ibn 'Amr Ibn Nufayl: "Tonight, he will say

¹ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 2, pp. 321-2

things which he has never said since he was made a Caliph." Sa'id denied my statement and said: "What do you expect him to say that he has never said before?" 'Umar ascended the pulpit. When the announcer finished the call, he (Umar) stood up, praised Allah as He deserves and said:

'Now, I am going to tell you something which has been ordained for me to say. I do not know, perhaps the time of my death is in front of me. So, whoever understands and retains it, let him narrate it to the others wherever his mount takes him. But if somebody is afraid that he may not understand it, I don't allow anybody to attribute lies to me... I have been informed that a speaker amongst you says: By Allah, if 'Umar dies, I will give my allegiance to so-and-so person'. One should not deceive oneself by saying that the allegiance given to Abu Bakr was an error and it ended. Undoubtedly it was so but Allah warded off its evil, and there is none among you without consulting the other Muslims, neither that person, nor the one to whom the allegiance is given, are to be supported; rather, they both should be killed...' down to the end of his speech where he once again said: 'So, if any person gives his allegiance to somebody without consulting the other Muslims, both the giver of the allegiance and the one to whom allegiance is paid, should not be followed; rather, they should be killed.'

Now, who could thus so-and-so be? To whom the allegiance was intended to be given? And who could be the one who made the Caliph angry and made him deliver such a speech and talk as he did? Ibn Abil Hadid, a Shafi'i, disclosed, in some of his comments, their identities. He said:

"The man who said: 'By Allah, if 'Umar dies, I will give my allegiance to so-and-so person' was 'Ammar Ibn Yasir, who said: 'If 'Umar dies, I will give my allegiance to 'Ali'. This statement enraged 'Umar Ibn Khattaab to say what he said."¹(1)

Studying the Concept of the Sermon

It can be concluded from the Caliph's statement that he was afraid lest the affairs may get out of the hands of Quraysh after him, and that other Muslims of the companions and the Tabi'in may give their allegiance to the one whose guardianship was disliked by Quraysh viz. Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). Thus, he

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, Sermon 26

invented a method to block the way in the face of the others. So, he said: "Whoever gives his allegiance to any body among you without consulting the other Muslims, neither that person, nor the one to whom the allegiance was given, are to be supported, rather, both of them should be killed."

He (Umar) said this while he himself had come to rule the Muslims without consulting them, basing the legality of his rule on his being appointed by the Caliph Abu Bakr. By that, however, he strongly hold the rein of power in his hand. Some time later, when he was stabbed, he offered his plan, ordering that six persons of Quraysh were to chose one of them for the post of Caliphate, placing the task of nominating the Caliph in the hands of Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf, who put a condition for giving the allegiance: that the candidate should agree to act according to the Book of Allah, the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah and the conduct of the Shaykhayn [Abu Bakr and 'Umar]. This condition was accepted by 'Uthman but refused by 'Ali (peace be on him). They knew that Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) would not agree to regard the conduct of the Shaykhayn on the same footing with the Book of Allah and the Prophet's (peace be on him and progeny) traditions.

Early in this book, we found 'Umar telling Sa'id Ibn al-'As, an Umayyad that the one who was to succeed him would be one of his (Sa'id's) relatives. It was true as it was 'Uthman Ibn 'Affan, an Umayyad and a relative of Sa'id, who succeeded 'Umar.

We had also seen how Abu Bakr called 'Uthman and ordered him to write: "This is what Abu Bakr conveys to the Muslims...", then he fainted. 'Uthman went on writing: "I appoint 'Umar Ibn Khattaab as your caliph." When Abu Bakr came to conscious, he signed on what 'Uthman had written about appointing 'Umar, because it went with his intention. Concerning who would succeed 'Uthman' al-Ya'qubi says:

"Once 'Uthman was severely ill. He summoned Humraan Ibn Abaan, and wrote a covenant to his successor, leaving a blank to be filled with his name, then he filled it, in his own handwriting, the name of 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf, sealed it and sent it to 'Umm Habibah, the daughter of Abu Sufyan. Humraan opened it on his way and read it. He came to 'Abd al-Rahman and told him about it. 'Abd al-Rahman, burst out angrily: "I appointed him openly and he appoints me secretly!"

The news spread in Madinah. The Umayyads got angry. Uthman called Humraan, his servant, and ordered him to be whipped a hundred lashes and expelled him to Basrah, as he was the cause of enmity between him and ‘Abd al-Rahman, who sent his son to him with a message, saying: "I gave you my allegiance, while I had three merits superior to yours..." as the narrative goes.¹(1)1

It seems that it had been decided that ‘Abd al-Rahman should succeed ‘Uthman, but the former died before the latter, in the year 31 or 32 A.H., after which their enmity aggravated.²(2)2

There also were controversies between the ‘Umayyads, the ruling family of Quraysh, and other sections of Quraysh. ‘A’ishah headed her family and other opposing elements till the murder of ‘Uthman in his house in Madinah right under the eyes of the Migrants and the Ansar³(3)1

As a result, the Muslims became free from all their former allegiances that used to tie them. So, they, headed by the companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), hurried to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and offered him their allegiance.

On coming to power, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) abolished all the undue privileges granted to the Quraysh by the rulers before him; he regarded the chiefs of the Quraysh and other Muslims as equals, Arabs as well as non-Arabs, vis-à-vis dividing the treasury and their social status. But after four months of his rule, the Quraysh came together and waged the Battle of Jamal against him. His opponents included personalities like Marwan (who demanded avenging ‘Uthm|an’s blood), Talhah and Zubair (both of whom instigated ‘Uthm|an’s murder) gathered under the leadership of ‘A’ishah, (who had issued the edict of killing ‘Uthm|an). They assembled the Quraysh once again against Im|am ‘Ali (peace be on him) in Siffin. Both battles were waged under the pretext of avenging ‘Uthm|an’s death, a pretext on which they misled the Muslims outside Madinah, through their false narratives. After the arbitration in Siffin, the Kharijites rose against Im|am ‘Ali (peace be on him) in the Battle of Naharawaan. This was the reason for the repeated complaints

¹ Al-Ya’qubi’s Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 169.

² . Look up al-Awaa’il by Abu Hilal al-‘ Askari, Beirut, 1407 A.H., p.129, and Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, edited by Muhammad Abu al-Fadl Ibraheem, vol. 1, p. 159

³ Look up our book Ahadith-o-Umm al-Mu’minîn ‘A’ishah, Beirut, 1408 A.H., pp. 87-162.

of Im'am 'Ali (peace be on him) like the one mentioned in his letter to his brother, 'Aqil:

"... Leave Quraysh and their rush into misguidance, their galloping into disunity and their leaping over destruction. They have united to fight against me as they had unified to fight the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) before me. May Quraysh receive what they deserve for what they did to me and severed my kinship!..." (till the end of the letter).¹(1)2

He also mentions a dispute that took place between him and somebody. He says:

"Someone said to me: 'You are very eager for this affair (of rulership), aren't you?' I said: 'Rather, it is you, by Allah, who is more covetous, though further from it, while I am more eligible and closer... I have (only) demanded my right while you are intervening between me and my right and turning my face away from it.' As I, thus, knocked at his ears with the evidence, before the present crowd, he was stunned, not knowing how to reply to me!

O Allah, I seek your succour against Quraysh and those who assist them, as they have severed my kinship, diminished my high position, united in disputing me the affair which belonged to me. Thereafter, they said: 'It is right if you take it and it is right if you leave it.'²(2)1

In another sermon he said:

"O Allah! I seek your succour against Quraysh and those who assist them, as they denied my kinship, turned over my cup, united in disputing me a right to which I am more entitled than anyone else. And they said: 'It is right if you take it and it is right if you refuse it. So, bear it distressed, or die of grief.' I looked around, to see that I have none as a shield, defender or an assistant, except my household, So, I withheld them from death, and, thus, swallowed the pill though bitter, gulped down my spittle though chocking, and, by controlling my rage, I bore something more bitter than colocynth and more painful than the cut of the blades."³(3)2

At last, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was martyred by a Kharijite in the mosque's niche in Kufah. After the martyrdom of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), Mu'awiyah

¹ Nahj al-Balaaghah, Letter No. 36. al-Aghaani, vol. 15, p. 44

² Nahj al-Balaaghah Sermon 172

³ Nahjul Balaghah Sermon 212. Its first part is stated in al-Ghaaraat by Ibrahim Ibn Muhammad al-Thaqafi (exp. 283 A.H.), p.392.

seized power in the year 40 A.H. which they named as 'Aam al-Jama'ah, (the year of the congregation) while actually it was the year of the congregation of Quraysh. Mu'awiyah's rule lasted twenty years and he died in 60 A.H.

* * *

These were some aspects of the hatred of Quraysh for the rule of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). Another aspect of that hatred was their preventing the narration of the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), which is our next discussion, with Allah's permission.

Ban on Writing the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Traditions

'Abd Allah Ibn 'Amr Ibn al-'As narrates:

"I used to write down everything I heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) but Quraysh prevented me, saying: Do you write every thing you hear from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while the Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny) is but a human being, says things when angry and when contented?' So, I stopped, and related that to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He pointed to his mouth and said: *'Write down! By the One in whose hand is my soul, nothing comes out from it except the truth.'*¹(1)

Quraysh justified their prevention of recording the quotes of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) by saying that his angry narrations would be against somebody, and his content sayings would be in favour of someone else. Concerning the first part, the hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) would be regarded as a shortcoming. We do know that often the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) spoke of the arrogant ones of Quraysh and explained the Quranic verses revealed in their denunciation!

¹ Refer to Vol. 2 of this book for the sources of this narrative.

As for the second, the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadith would remain a text in favour of somebody in whose favour they do not like any content to be circulated.

Thus, they did not allow the writing down of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) will in the sickness which led to his death, when he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Let me write you a letter after which you will never go astray.*" To which, 'Umar retorted: "The Messenger is overcome by pain. You have the Book of Allah. The Book of Allah suffices us."

They asked: "What happened to him? Is he in a state of delirium?"¹(2)2

These bans and prohibitions were caused by their apprehension of the circulation of a text from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in favour of the one whose rule over them they so much hated, because Prophethood and Caliphate would have been in his house!

And it was because of this very hatred that 'Umar, during his rule, prevented the writing down of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) narrations and burned what the Companions had already recorded of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) teachings. The prohibition continued till the 'Umayyad ruler, 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz who revoked the ban. Other events also transpired, which are being mentioned in Vol. 2 of this book, in the Chapter called "Ban on the Writing down of the Narrations in the times of the Caliphs", as well as that what happened after the Four Caliphs, as will be related in succession, Allah willing!

The Politics of the Qurayshite Caliphate and all 'Umayyads:

a. During The Reign of Mu'awiyah

Al-Jaahiz explains the politics of the Qurayshite Caliphate in the days of Mu'awiyah, as related by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, which is summarized herunder:

¹ Refer to Vol. 2 of this book.

"Abu 'Uthman al-Jaahiz said: Mu'awiyah ordered the people in Iraq, Syria and elsewhere to abuse and renounce 'Ali (peace be on him). He announced this from the Islamic pulpits, which became a tradition in the Umayyad epoch, until it was abolished by 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz (may Allah be pleased with him).

Our Shaykh, Abu 'Uthman al-Jaahiz, stated that Mu'awiyah used to say at the end of his Friday sermon:

'O Allah! Abu Turab ['Ali] turned away from your religion, and turned (the people) away from your way. So, hail upon him your heavy curses, and torture him severely." He sent those words to the remotest regions. They continued to be uttered from atop the pulpits till the Caliphate of 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz."¹(1)1

At-Tabari²(1) records: "Mu'awiyah appointed al-Mughîrah Ibn Shu'bah as governor of Kufah in the year 41A.H. and instructed him thus: 'I wanted to tell you many things which I leave to your insight. But I do not leave advising you not to leave cursing 'Ali and abusing him, sending blessings on 'Uthm'an and asking forgiveness for him, maltreating 'Ali's companions and expelling them, and praising 'Uthman's followers and favouring them.'

al-Mughirah said to him: "I have tried and I have been tried. I worked for others before you, and nobody was displeased with me. You will try, then you will praise or scold'.'

Mu'awiyah said: "No, we will praise, insha'allah."

Ibn Abi al-Hadid, quoting al-Madaaeini's book al-Ahdath, narrates:

"Afrer 'Aamul Jama'ah, Mu'awiyah sent a letter to all his governors, which read as follows: 'NO obligation is born to anyone who narrates anything of the virtues

¹ Look up the commentary of Sermon No. 57 of Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, Egypt ed., 1378 A.H., vol. 1, p. 56, which is the source of what we shall relate hereunder. Abu 'Uthman al-Jaahiz is 'Amr Ibn Bahr al-Laythi al-Basri, the well-known grammarian and philologist. He was inclined to anti-'Alawism. He wrote, among other writings, a book called al-'Uthmaniyyah, which was refuted by Abu Ja'far al-Iskaafi (exp. 255 A.H.) in Basrah and al-Shaykh al-Mufid (exp. 413 A.H.) in Baghdad.

² On the events of the year 51 A.H., in his Tarikh, vol. 6, p. 108, and in Ibn al-Athir's Tarikh, vol. 3, p. 202.

of Abu Turab and his offspring...' The gravest calamity was, then, directed against the people of Kufah¹(2)3

He also said:

"Mu'awiyah wrote to all his agents, all over the land, not to accept the testimony of the followers of 'Ali and his offspring. He told them to look for the followers of 'Uthman and those who love him and narrate his virtues and merits, in order to honour, respect and favour them with gifts. He ordered them: Write to me what each one of them narrates, his name, his father's name and his tribe.' They duly obliged and narrated 'Uthman's virtues and merits excessively, in lieu of the generous presents, clothes, money, lands etc. which Mu'awiyah sent to the Arabs as well as the non-Arabs. This was expanded to cover every region and they vied with each other in that, so much so that none, who came to any of Mu'awiyah's governors, relating a virtue or merit of 'Uthman, would be turned away without his name being written down, honoured with gifts and his intercession was acceptable. This continued for a while. Thereafter, Mu'awiyah wrote to his agents that the (forged) narrations about 'Uthman had become abundant and should be spread everywhere. 'On receiving this letter, invite the people to tell about the virtues of the companions and the early Caliphs. Any narrative said in favour of Abu Turab, is to be contradicted by another narrative about the Companions, as this is more liked by me, more pleasing to me, more refuting to the proofs of Abu Turab's Shi'ahs and severer upon them than the virtues and merits of 'Uthman.' His letter was read to the people, and there came in numerous forged and baseless narrations about the virtues of the Companions. The commonality got used to them as they were even commended publicly on the pulpits. They were also practised by the teachers who taught them and their pupils, such that they learnt them by rote, narrated them and recited them like they recited the Holy Qur'an. They even taught them to their women, servants and slaves. This lasted for a long time, and, consequently, there appeared so many fabricated hadiths and false accusations, adopted by the jurists, the judges, the rulers...'2(1)1 as the narrative goes.

¹ Ibn Abi al-Hadid's commentary on Nahj al-Balaaghah, Sermon No. 57, vol. 3, pp. 15 & 16.

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah vol. 3, pp. 15-16. Ibn Abi al-Hadid relates both the narrations of al-Mada'eeni, who is Abu al-Husain 'Ali Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Abd Allah

Ibn 'Arafah, famous as Naftowayh, one of the great and well-known traditionalists, narrates in his Tarikh what is in harmony with the above-mentioned narrative. He says: "Most of the traditions about the Companions were forged during the days of Banu 'Umayyah by way of flattery and bootlicking, thinking that by doing so they could disgrace Banu Hashim."¹(2)2

Ibn Abi al-Hadid²(3)1, quoting Abu Ja'far al-Iskaafi, said:

"Mu'awiyah assigned a group of Companions and a group of Tabi'in to relate obnoxious narratives, defaming 'Ali (peace be on him) and renouncing him. He offered generous donations to promote such practices."

In this respect, a hadith was narrated, quoting the Companions who quoted 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas, as related by al-Bukhari³(1)2 and Muslim in their Sahihs, with uninterrupted narrators up to 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas, who said: "I heard the Messenger

(d. 315 A.H.). Ibn al-Nadim, in al-Fihrist, p. 115, says that al-Madaaeini wrote 25 books on "the events".

¹ Ibid., and Fajr al-Islam, p. 213. Naftowayh is Ibraheem Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Arafah al-Azdi. In his biography in Tarikh Baghdad, it is said: "He was a truthful man and the author of several books." Al-Mas'udi, reporting about the historians and narrators, writes about him in Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 1, p. 23: "The biography of Abu 'Abd Allah Naftowayh, is full of the grace of the books of the elite and of notes about the nobles. He was the best of his contemporaries in writing and the best in composing. He stated the names of his books in Hadiyyah al-'Aarifi p. 5. and said: He died in 323 A.H.

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 1, p. 358. al-Iskaafi from Iskaf near al-Nahrwaan between Baghdad and Waasit. Abu Ja'far al-Iskaafi in al-Iskaf entry in Mu'jam al-Buldaan. He was considered as a native of Baghdad and one of the scholastic Mu'tazilis (d. 204 A.H.). Ibn Hajar says about him: 'Muhammad Ibn 'Abd Allah al-Iskaafi was a scholastic Mu'tazili and one of their Imams. The Iskaafi sect was named after him He was a resident of Baghdad but originally he was from Samarqand [Uzbekistan]. Ibn al-Nadim said: 'He was amazing in knowledge, intelligence, chastity, nobility and honour. He attained a position none of his contemporaries ever attained. He was held in great esteem by al-Motasim (al-Abbasi). He had many arguments with al-Karaabisi and others. Died in 240 A.H. Lesaan al-Mizan, vol. 5, p. 221.

³ This hadith is stated in Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 4, p. 34, book of "al-Adab", Chapter on "Good kinship relations remain fresh by caring for them", through two channels, quoting 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas. Al-Bukhari, instead of saying: "Abu Talib", says: "Abu so-and-so".

of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say, openly, not covertly:¹(2)3 *'The family of Abu Talib are not my friends, as my friends are Allah and the good believers.'*"

In Sahih al-Bukhari after that, through another channel, also quoting 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas: "But they have a kinship bound to remain fresh (if) I attend to it." i.e. If I join in its kinship.

That was the narration of Ibn Abi al-Hadid, quoting Sahih al-Bukhari. But in its recent editions "the family of Abu Talib" is replaced by "the family of so-and-so."

Al-Tabari, quoting al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah, says that he lived in Kufah for seven years and some months, without leaving cursing 'Ali and abusing him, renouncing the killers of 'Uthman and cursing them, and asking blessings and mercy for him ('Uthman) and his companions. But al-Mughirah was diplomatic, sometimes being harsh and lenient at other times.

He also says that al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah, then the governor of Kufah representing Mu'awiyah, told Sa'sa'ah Ibn Ibn Sawhaan al-'Ubaydi: "I warn you that I must not hear you denouncing 'Uthman openly before the people, and I warn you against openly mentioning 'Ali's virtues. You cannot, however, be mentioning what I do not know of 'Ali's virtues; rather, I know them better. But this rule has appeared and we have but to announce his defects to the people, though, we leave out a lot of what we had been ordered not to, and declare what we have to by way of warding off these people and safeguarding ourselves. So, if you were to mention his virtues, then mention them among your companions, in your houses and secretly. To do it openly in the mosque would be something unbearable by the Caliph and he would never forgive us for it..." etc.

Al-Ya'qubi²(1) says what we relate in brief:

Hujr Ibn 'Adiy al-Kindi, 'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i and their companions were the followers of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib. On hearing al-Mughirah or others of

¹ This addition in al-Bukhari's second narration is from Ibn al-'Aas, where he also said: "The progeny of so-and-so". Sahih Muslim, vol. 1, p. 136 book of "Faith", Chapter on "Befriending the Believers and cutting-off relations with others (i.e. non-Muslims)."

² Al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, pp. 230-231.

Mu'awiyah's companions cursing 'Ali on the pulpits, they used to stand, refute their accusations and spoke about (the virtues of Ali – peace be on him).

When Ziyaad came to Kufah (as its governor), he sent the police commissioner to them (Ali's Shias), arrested a number of them and killed them, while 'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i with others fled to Mosul in Iraq. Ziyaad arrested Hujr Ibn 'Adi and thirteen of his companions, sent them to Mu'awiyah, writing to him that they refuted the people in cursing Abu Turab (Ali) and belittled the rulers, thereby, refraining from obeying his orders. He also sent some testimonies against them. When they reached Marj-e-'Adhraa', few miles from Damascus, Mu'awiyah ordered that they be stopped and be beheaded there. Some people interceded in favour of six of them, whom he released, and asked the others to denounce 'Ali and curse him: 'If you do so, we will set you free; but if you refuse, we will kill you.' 'By Allah, we will not do that,' they replied.

So, their graves were dug and their shrouds were brought in. They spent the night in prayers. In the morning, they were once again asked to censure 'Ali. They said: 'We befriend him and renounce whoever renounces him.' So, each one of them was taken by a man to be beheaded. Hujr said: "Let me perform Wudu' and the prayers. After finishing his prayers, he was killed, and his companions were beheaded one by one until the six of them, including Hujr, were killed. When it was the turn of 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Hasan al-'Anzi and Karim Ibn al-'Afif al-Khath'ami, they said: 'Dispatch us to Amir al-Mu'minin, and then we shall say of this man what he says.' They were sent to Mu'awiyah. When they came to Muawiyah, he asked al-Khath'ami: "What do you say of 'Ali?" "I say of him what you say,' he replied.

He once again asked him: 'Do you renounce 'Ali's religion?'

He kept silent. A cousin of him stood up and demanded his life from Mu'awiyah. Mu'awiyah ordered him to be imprisoned for a month, then released him on the condition that he should not go to Kufah.

As for al-'Anzi, Mu'awiyah asked him: 'O brother of Rabee'ah! What do say about 'Ali?' He said: 'I witness that he was of those who remembered Allah excessively, of those who commanded with truth, of those who judged with justice and of those who forgave the people.' Mu'awiyah asked him: 'What do you say

about 'Uthman?' He said: 'He was the first to open the door of injustice and close the doors of truth.'

Mu'awiyah said: "You have killed yourself."

"No," said he, 'it is you whom I killed.'

Mu'awiyah sent him to Ziyaad and wrote to him: "This al-'Anzi is the worst of those whom you sent to me. Punish him as he deserves and kill him in the worst (possible) way."

As he arrived, Ziyaad sent him to a place called Qassun-Natif, where he was buried alive¹(1).

Among other stories of Ziyaad Ibn Abih in this battle was that which happened between him and Saifi Ibn Fasil. When the latter was brought before him, Ziyaad screamed at him: "O enemy of Allah! What do you say of Abu Turab?"

"I do not know Abu Turab," he replied.

"How well you do know him!" said Ziyaad.

"I do not know him," replied Saifi. "Do you not know 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib?" shouted Ziyaad.

"Yes, I do," he said.

"That is him (i.e. Abu Turab)," said Ziyaad.

After heated arguments between them, Ziyaad ordered a stick to be fetched and asked him: "What do you say of 'Ali?"

The man said: "The best that I can say of a servant of Allah I will say it of Amirul Mu'minîn."

He (Ziyaad) said: "Beat him with the stick on the shoulder until he sticks to the ground." They did so until he stuck to the ground. Then he told them to stop and asked him: "Now, what do you say of 'Ali?"

He replied: "By Allah, if you kill me with razors and knives, I will say nothing but that which you heard from me."

Ziyaad said: "Curse him (Ali) or I will behead you!"

"Then, by Allah, you will do it before that, and then I will be happy and you will be miserable!" said the man.

¹ This episode was summarized from Abdullah Ibn Saba', 2/284_303. It is stated in detail in Ibn 'Asakir's Tarikh Dimashq and Tahdhibut-Tarikh

Ziyaad said: "Push him in the neck." Then he ordered him to be chained with iron fetters and be thrown in the prison. Later, he was killed with Hujr!

Ziyaad wrote to Mu'awiyah about two men of Hadhramout (Yemen) as being on 'Ali's religion. Mu'awiyah replied: "Kill whoever is on 'Ali's religion and opinion and mutilate his body." So he hanged them at the doors of their houses in Kufah¹(2)1

He also ordered him (Ziyaad) to bury al-Khath'ami - who praised 'Ali and defamed 'Uthman - alive, which he did.²(3)2

Ziyaad killed him with the event described by Al-Mas'udi and Ibn 'Asaakir. who said:

"He gathered the people of al-Kufah, who crowded the mosque, the square and the Castle. There he asked them to renounce 'Ali³(4)3

Al-Mas'udi says: "Ziyaad gathered the people in Kufa at the door of his castle, instigating them to curse 'Ali. Whoever refused to do so was killed. It is said he was afflicted with a plague on the spot, so he set them free."

'Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuza'i was among the dislodged and was later killed in that battle, as he escaped to the deserts. He was chased, found and beheaded. His head was sent to Mu'awiyah, who ordered it to be raised and roamed in the market, sent to his wife in the prison – who was held captive by Mu'awiyah - and thrown in her lap.⁴(1)4

This practice prevailed all over the Islamic world. It was further worsened and promoted by many other rulers, such as Busr Ibn Artat in Basrah and Ibn Shihaab in Rayy⁵(2)5. Their conducts were related by the historians. Thereafter, it became the conventional practice of the 'Umayyads, and 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib used to be cursed on the pulpits of the east and west, except in Sajistan where he was cursed

¹ Al-Muhbir, p. 479

² Look up the story of Hujr Ibn Adi in Abdulla Ibn Saba'

³ Ibn 'Asaakir, vol. 5, p. 421; al-Mas'udi's Ayyaam-o-Mu'awiyah, vol. 3, p. 30

⁴ Al-Ma'arif, by Ibn Qutaybah, vol. 7, p. 12. Al-Isti'aab, vol. 2, p. 517; Al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 526; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 8, p. 48. al-Muhbir, p. 490.

⁵ Al-Tabari, in the events of the year 41 A.H., vol. 6, p. 96; Ibn al-Athir, vol. 3, pp. 165 and 179, relating the rule of al-Mughirah in al-Kufah in "the Event of the year 41 A.H."

only once and they refused to obey the 'Umayyads. They even prohibited cursing anybody from their pulpits while he was cursed on the pulpits of Makkah and Madinah.¹(3)6

They used to curse 'Ali (peace be on him) from the pulpits in the presence of his offspring. The narratives in this regard are many. The following example is related by Ibn Hajar²(4)1, in Tathir al-Lisaan. He reports:

"'Umar ascended the pulpit and abused 'Ali; al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah did the same. Hasan was asked: 'Ascent the pulpit and refute them.' He declined, unless they gave him their word to confirm him if he said the truth, and to deny him if what he said was untrue. They gave him their word. So, he ascended the pulpit. After praising Allah and thanking him, he said: 'I give you oath on Allah, O 'Umar! O Mughirah! Do you not know that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had cursed the driver and the leader, one of them was so-and-so?' They said: 'We do.' He then said: 'O Mu'awiyah.³(1)2 Do you not know that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) cursed 'Amr a curse for every rhyme he said?' They said: 'By Allah, we do.'..." etc. (till the end of the narration).

As the people usually did not stay to hear the sermons because of its containing hadiths which they did not like to hear, they changed the tradition (*sunnah*) and started delivering the sermon before the prayers.

Ibn Hazm, in his al-Muhalla says: "The 'Umayyads brought in the innovation of delivering the sermon before the prayers excusing themselves that the people used to leave the place as soon as the prayers ended and that they do not stay to hear the sermon. For, they cursed 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (may Allah be pleased with him), So, the Muslims used to run away, and they had the right to do so."

Al-Ya'qubi, in his Tarikh (vol. 2, p. 223), says: "In this year (44 A.H.), Mu'awiyah made a stall in the mosque, brought the pulpit in the place of prayers

¹ . Summarized from Mu'jam al-Buldaan, 1st ed. Egypt, under "Sajistan" entry. It is a region of Iran.

² Tathir al-Lisan, p. 55, quoting the trusted authorities of the Sahih, except one of them who is disputed, but he was supported by al-Dhahabi who said: "He is trustworthy and cannot be refuted at all." Then he related the narration.

³ Edited by Ahmad Muhammad Shakir, vol. 5, pp. 85-86. Also look up al-'Umm, by al-Shaafi'i, vol. 1, p. 208

during the two Eids, delivered the sermon before the prayers and granted Fadak to Marwan Ibn al-Hakam to hurt the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)."

In Sahih al-Bukhari, Sahih Muslim and in other books it is related that Abu Sa'id al-Khudri said:¹(2)3

"I went out with Marwan - then the governor of al-Madinah - in (Eid) al-Adha or (Eid) al-Fitr. Arriving at the place of prayers, we saw the pulpit built by Kathir Ibn al-Sult. Marwan tried to ascend it before the prayers. I pulled his garment, but he managed to free it from me, ascended the pulpit and delivered a sermon before the prayers. I rebuked him: "By Allah! you have changed the Prophet's tradition (*the Sunnah*)."

He said: "O Abu Sa'id! What you had known before has gone away."

I retorted: "By Allah! What I knew was better than what I do not know." He said: "The people do not stay (to listen to the sermon) after the prayers so I have to deliver it before the prayers."

They were still not satisfied with that. They even ordered the Companions to do so. Sahih Muslim²(3)1 and other sources quote Sahl Ibn Sa'd as to have said:

"A man from the progeny of Marwan was appointed as governor of Madinah. He sent for Sahl Ibn Sa'id and ordered him to abuse 'Ali. Sahl refused. He told him: If you refuse, then say: ay Allah curse Abu Turab'. Sahl said: 'No title was dearer to 'Ali than the name of Abu Turab, and he was pleased to be called by it.' He said: 'What is his story? Why was he called Abu Turab?' He said: 'The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came to Fatimah's (peace be on her) house but 'Ali was not there. He asked her: '*Where is your cousin?...*' She replied: '*He is sleeping in the mosque.*' He (peace be on him and his progeny) came to where he (peace be on him) was lying down, his garment slipped off his flank [to the dusty ground]. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) started dusting it and calling him: '*Get up, O Abu Turab! Get up, O Abu Turab!*'" [turab = dust].

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 2, p. 111; Sahih Muslim, vol. 3, p. 20; Sunan-o-Abi Dawood, vol. 1, p. 178; Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, vol. 1, p. 386; Sunan al-Baihaqi, vol. 3, p. 297; Musnad-o-Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, vol. 3, pp. 10,20,54 and 92. In Musnad-o-Ahmad, the one who protested against Marwan is someone other than Abu Sa'id.

² Summarized from Sahih Muslim, vol. 7, p. 124. Chapter on "Ali's Merits". Al-Bukhari stated the distorted version in his Sahih, Chapter on "Ali's Merits".

‘Umar Ibn Sa’d Ibn Abi Waqqas reports:

"Mu‘awiyah asked Sa’d: ‘What prevented you from abusing Abu Turab?’ He said: ‘As long as I remember three words said by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to him, I will never abuse him. To have just a single one of them is dearer to me than red camels. I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say to him, having left him behind (in Madinah) in one of his battles and ‘Ali asking him: *‘You left me with the women and the boys!’* The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: *‘Are not you contented to be unto me as Haroon was to Moosa except that there will be no Prophet after me?’* On the day of Khaybar I heard him (the Messenger of Allah - (peace be on him and his progeny)) say: *‘I will give the banner to a man who loves Allah and His Messenger, and who is loved by Allah and His Messenger.’* So, we waited. He said: ‘Call ‘Ali.’ He was brought but was suffering from conjunctivitis. He (peace be on him and his progeny) applied his saliva in his eye and gave him the banner. Allah cured his eye instantly. And when the verse: **"Come, let us call our sons and your sons..."** (Surah Maaedah (3): Verse 61) was revealed, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called ‘Ali, Fatimah, Hasan and Husain (peace be on them all), and said: *"O Allah! These are my household!"*¹(1)2

Al-Mas‘udi, quoting al-Tabari, relates it as below:²(2)1

"When Mu‘awiyah went for Hajj, he went circumambulated (*tawaaqf*) the Ka‘bah together with Sa’d. Having finished that, Mu‘awiyah went to Dar al-Nadwah, and there he seated him with him on the same seat. He then began abusing ‘Ali and cursing him. Sa’d moved away and said: ‘You made me sit on your seat, then you began abusing ‘Ali! By Allah, if I had any one of ‘Ali’s merits it would have been more precious to me than...’ Thereafter, he related the hadith, with a slight

¹ Sahih Muslim, vol. 7, p. 120; Sahih al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 171; Al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, pp. 108 and 109, with the addition: "By Allah, Mu‘awiyah did not mention him even with a single word until he left the town." Al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 509; al-Khasaais by al-Nesaa’i, p. 15.

² Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p. 24, about Mu‘awiyah’s days. Then he related what Mu‘awiyah had said in the meeting. I am ashamed of letting my pen record it.

difference, and at the end he said: 'By Allah, I will never enter your house as long as I live.' Saying this, he left."

Ibn 'Abd Rabbih related the narration in brief in his accounts about Mu'awiyah, from al-'Iqd al-Farîd, and said:¹(1)2

"After the demise of Hasan Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both), Mu'awiyah went for Hajj, then to Madinah, where he wanted to curse 'Ali from the pulpit of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He was told that 'Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas was present and he would not agree to that. Send for him and ask him his opinion'. He (Muawiyah) sent for him and told him about his intention. He said to him: 'If you do so, I will certainly go out of the mosque, and will never return to it.' Mu'awiyah stopped that until Sa'd died. Afterwards, he started cursing 'Ali, and sent his agents to curse him from the pulpits, which they did. 'Umm Salamah, the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) wife, wrote to Mu'awiyah: 'You curse Allah and His Messenger from your pulpits, because you curse 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib and those who love him. I take Allah as witness that He loved him as well as His Messenger.' But he (Muawiyah) paid no heed to her."²(2)3

Ibn Abil Hadid says:

Abu 'Uthman al-Jaahiz also narrated that a group of the Umayyads told Mu'awiyah: "You got what you wanted, so why don't you stop cursing this man?" He said: "Never by Allah, Until the infant grows up on it, and the grown up gets old on it, and none may remember any of his merits!"³(3)4

Rearing the Syrians to Hate and Curse Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) since the Days of Mu'awiyah

Al-Thaqafi (Ibraheem Ibn Muhammad), in his book al-Ghaaraat, says: "'Umar Ibn Thabit used to travel to the Syrian villages, where he gathered the villagers and addressed them as follows: 'O people! 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib was a hypocrite. He wanted to cut the nerve of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the night of al-'Aqabah, so, curse him.' The people did as they were

¹ Al-'Iqd al-Farîd, vol. 3, p. 127.

² This was a summary from our book "The Hadiths of Umm al-Momineen A'ishah", Chapter "With Mu'awiyah", under the title "The Motives for Fabricating Traditions"

³ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, Sermon No. 57.

told. Thereafter, he would move to another village, where he would repeat this abominable act." This was during Mu'awiyah's reign.

The Incident of the Night of Al-'Aqabah (in brief)

On his return from the Battle of Tabuk, in the year of 9 A.H., the Prophet of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) passed by 'Aqabah Hurshi, on the cross-roads between Syria, Madinah and Makkah. At the foot of the 'Aqabah, there was a valley through which the trading caravans passed. He ordered the army to pass through the valley, while he himself went by al-'Aqabah by night. Some of the hypocrites plotted to kill him (peace be on him and his progeny) by cutting the nerve of his camel (as it would throw him off resulting in his death). But their conspiracy was thwarted by two Companions viz. 'Ammar Ibn Yasir and Hudhayfah al-Yamaani, who were with the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)¹. But the agent of Mu'awiyah ascribed this act to the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) cousin Ali (peace be on him).

Mu'awiyah's Motive in Doing What he Did

If the motive of Quraysh, generally, in maltreating Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was their dislike to see Prophethood and Caliphate gather in the hands of Banu Hashim, the motive of Mu'awiyah, a Qurayshi and an Umayyad, was, besides that, his particular hatred and malice towards Banu Hashim, as can be understood from the following narrative:

Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar quotes al-Mutrif Ibn al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah as to have narrated:

"I, together with my father, once called upon Mu'awiyah. My father began talking to him for a while, then turning to me he began praising Mu'awiyah and admiring his sagacity. One night, he came back showing no interest in having his dinner. He was sad. I waited for a while, thinking it might be some family issue. I asked: "What is the matter with you tonight? Why are you so sad?" He said: "Son! I have come from the most disbelieving and the vilest of men." "Who is it?" I inquired. He said: "I told him (Muawiyah) when we were alone: 'O Amirul Mu'minin! You

¹ Imtaa' al-Ismaa', p. 477; we have already indicated towards this incident and its sources on p. 138 of this book

have reached an age which requires you to show equity and spreading goodness. You are getting old. Why don't you tend towards your brothers of Banu Hashim and rejoin your kinship and relation with them, since, by Allah, they have today nothing that might frighten you? If you do, it will remain a memory after you and you will get its reward." He said: "Far from it! Far from it! What memory I expect to remain? The brother of Taym (Abu Bakr) ruled with equity and did what he did, than no sooner than he died, his memory died too, unless some body may say: Abu Bakr! Then, the brother of 'Adiy ('Umar) ruled and he strived and acted vigorously for ten years. Then no sooner he died, his memory died too, unless somebody may say: 'Umar! But the son of Abu Kabshah¹ viz. the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is called every day five times (I testify that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah), so what deed would remain? What memory could last, then, may you lose your father! No, by Allah, nothing but burying, burying (them)!"²(1)1

All these were due to Mu'awiyah's hatred and malice towards Banu Hashim...!

Why Did Mu'awiyah Hate the Banu Hashim?

In order to know the reasons behind Mu'awiyah's hatred to Banu Hashim, one may read the Chapter under the title "With Mu'awiyah." in our book "The Hadiths of Ummul Mu'minin 'A'ishah". There we referred, among other reasons, to the following:

Mu'awiyah had inherited that hatred from his mother, Hind, who chewed the liver of Hamzah, the uncle of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the Battle of Ohod, and made a necklace of his limbs, by way of venting her anger on Banu Hashim (as they had killed her father and brother in the Battle of Badr). After Mu'awiyah came his son, Yazid, who quenched the hatred of Abu Sufyan's family by killing the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his companions in Karbala', beheading them and

¹ The polytheists attributed the lineage of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to Abu Kabshah because the latter opposed the Quraish in idolatory and poets, and when the former too did the same, they called him as the son of Abu Kabshah – Majma' al-Bahrain.

² Al-Muwaffaqiyat, pp. 576_7. MurujudhDhahab, 2/545. Sharh Ibn Abil Hadid, 5/120. Quraysh used to call the Prophet(peace be on him and his progeny)Abu kabshah, mockingly.

taking their women and children as captives, as will be related later in this book. After Yazid came the Marwans of Banu Ummayyah.

Hereunder are examples of how the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) were treated after Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). We start with what (Abdullah) Ibn al-Zubair did during his rule:

Ibn al-Zubair's Politics

Ibn Abil Hadid, explaining Ibn al-Zubair's policy in his domain, said:

'Umar Ibn Shabbah, Ibn al-Kalbi, al-Waqidi and other biographers narrated that he (Ibn al-Zubair) did not send blessing on the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) for 40 Fridays during his claim of the Caliphate, saying: "Nothing prevents me from mentioning him except that some people may feel proud!"

It is also said:

According to the narrative of Muhammad Ibn Habib and Abu Mu'ammarr Ibn al-Muthanna: "He has a bad, small family, who would move their heads at remembering him."

It is also said: Sa'id Ibn Jubayr narrated that 'Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair said to 'Abdullah Ibn 'Abbas: "What is that which I hear about you?" "What is it?" asked he. "That you rebuke and condemn me," said Ibn al-Zubair. Ibn 'Abbas retorted: "I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *'How evil is a Muslim who is satiated while his neighbour is hungry!'*" Ibn al-Zubair said: "I have been concealing my hatred of you, Ahl al-Bait, for forty years..." as the hadith goes about Ibn 'Abbas's hinting at Ibn al-Zubair's avarice in his talk.

It is also said: 'Umar Ibn Shabbah, quoting Sa'id Ibn Jubayr, said: "'Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair delivered a speech in which he abused 'Ali (peace be on him). Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyah (d. 81A.H.) was informed about it. He came to him while he was still delivering his speech. A chair was put for him. He ran into his speech and said: 'O you Arabs! May your faces become ugly! Is 'Ali to be abused in your presence? 'Ali was Allah's hand against His enemies, a thunderbolt from Him, sent by Him upon the disbelievers and those who denied His right. He killed them for their disbelief, for which they abused and hated him, and intended for

him the sword and envy, while his cousin (peace be on him and his progeny) was still alive, not dead. When Allah took him to His side, offering him what He had, some men displayed their hatred and satisfied their grudge. Someone robbed his right, someone conspired to kill him, someone abused him and accused him falsely. So, if his offspring and the advocates of his claim had a rule to raise their bones and dig out their bodies, though, then, rotten away, after killing those who survived after them and humiliating them, Allah the Almighty, would have tortured them (their enemies) at our hands, disgraced them, made us triumphant over them and gratified us against them.

By Allah! None abuses 'Ali except a disbeliever who conceals his desire to abuse the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) but is afraid of revealing it. Thus, he turns to abuse 'Ali (peace be on him). As to those whom death over-stepped to prolong their age, they must have heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say to 'Ali: *'None will love you but a believer, and none will hate you but a hypocrite. "And those who do wrong will come to know what a (grave) destiny they will have.*'¹⁽¹⁾

Ibn Abil Hadid added: "'Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair hated 'Ali (peace be on him) and used to defame and slander him."²⁽²⁾

Al-Ya'qubi said:

"Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair launched a severe attack on Banu Hashim, showing animosity and hatred towards them to such an extent that he even stopped sending salutations on Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) in his speeches. Asked: 'Why did you stop sending blessings on the Prophet?' He said: 'He has bad offspring who would feel high and lift their heads on hearing it.'

Ibn al-Zubair tried to force Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyyah, 'Abdullah Ibn 'Abbas and twenty four of Banu Hashim to pay allegiance to him but they refused. So he

¹ Ibn Abi al-Hadid in his comment on Sermon No. 57 of Nahj al-Balaaghah. Al-Ya'qubi in his Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 262 with more details.

Ibn al-Zubair is 'Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair al-Asadi. He was given the allegiance as a caliph after the death of Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah in the year 64 A.H. in al-Hijaz and al-'Iraq. He remained in power until he was killed by al-Hajjaaj in 67 A.H.

² Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 1, p. 78

jailed them in the room of Zamzam. He took an oath on Allah except who there is no god that if they don't pay allegiance to him, he will burn them with fire.

Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyyah wrote to al-Mukhtar Ibn Abi 'Ubayd: 'In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful. From Muhammad Ibn 'Ali and on behalf of the Messenger's Ahl al-Bait, to al-Mukhtar Ibn Abi 'Ubayd, and through him to the Muslims. 'Abdullah Ibn al-Zubair has imprisoned us in the room of Zamzam, swearing by Allah except who there is no god, that we either we pay allegiance to him or he will shower fire on us. Please help us!'

Al-Mukhtar Ibn Abi 'Ubayd sent Abu 'Abdillah al-Jadali, with four thousand horsemen, to Makkah, where al-Jadali broke open the Zamzam room, and said to Muhammad Ibn 'Ali: 'Let me deal with Ibn al-Zubair.' He stopped him saying: 'I do not consider permissible to do with the one, who broke his relations, what he regarded as permissible to do with me.'¹(1)2

After Ibn al-Zubair

After the assassination of Ibn al-Zubair, the path was clear for the Umayyad caliphs of the Marwans, who continued following Mu'awiyah's policy which he used against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as follows:

b. The Reign of 'Abdul Malik and his Son

Ibn Abi al-Hadid, quoting al-Jaahiz, says:

"Abu 'Uthman [al-Jaahiz] said: "Abd al-Malik, with his knowledge, patience, level-headedness and inclination, was not the one from whom 'Ali's merits could be hidden. He understood that to curse Ali in public, in speeches and on the pulpit, would only turn against him as a defect, and show his weakness, because they all were of Banu 'Abd Munaf and of the same clan. Yet, he wanted to reinforce the rule, accentuate what the ancestors had done and to make the people believe that Banu Hashim had no right to rule, and their master, due to whom they felt honoured and about whom they were so proud, was insignificant and low, such that whoever claimed his kinship and argued in his favour as a proof, would become farther away and even more distant."

He also said:

¹ Al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 261.

"The biographers narrated that al-Walid Ibn 'Abdul Malik, during his caliphate, mentioned 'Ali (peace be on him) and said: 'May curse him of Allah (sic); he was a thief and the son of a thief.' The people were surprised at his being so ignorant of Arabic grammar that he committed such a silly mistake, and also at his ascribing theft to 'Ali (peace be on him). They said: 'We wonder which is more surprising!' Al-Walid was known to frequently commit grammatical mistakes."¹(1)1

In support of this defect in al-Walid, the biographers relate that Rauh Ibn Zinba' said: "One day, I went to Abd al-Malik and found him worried. He said: 'I have been thinking whom should I name to rule the Arabs, but I do not find anyone.' I said: 'How is it that you forget the fragrance and master of Quraysh, al-Walid?'" He said to me: 'O son of Zinba! None governs the Arabs except the one who speaks their language.' Hearing that, al-Walid rushed to the spot, gathered the grammarians, sat with them in a closed house for six months and came out more ignorant than before. 'Abd al-Malik said: 'By Allah, he has given his excuse!'"²(2)2

* * *

So far we have been relating parts of the effects of the policy of the Qurashite despots in the days of 'Abd al-Malik and his son, al-Walid. Other parts shall be studied through the deeds of al-Hajjaaj, their agent.

Some of Al-Hajjaaj's misdeeds in implementing the Quarashite Politics

Ibn Abi al-Hadid narrated some of what al-Hajjaaj had done in this respect. He said:

"Al-Hajjaaj, may Allah curse him, used to curse 'Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) and order others to curse him, too. One day, when he was riding through the town, a man stopped him and said to him: 'O Emir! My parents, unkindly,

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 1, pp. 58, 75, 85. 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Marwan became the ruler in the year 65 A.H. He died in 86 A.H.. After him his son, al-Walid, came to power.

² Al-Walid's biography in al-Dhahabi's Tarikh al-Islam, vol. 4, p. 65. Concerning Rauh Ibn Zinba', he said, in Biographies of the celebrated Nobles, 1st. ed., vol. 4, p. 251, that he was like a minister to Abd al-Malik (d. 84 A.H.)

named me 'Ali. Please change my name and give me what you can to sustain me, as I am poor.' He said: 'Because of your nice reasoning, I name you so-and-so, and appoint you to such-and-such post. Head for it.'"¹(3)¹

Al-Mas'udi in this respect says:

"Al-Hajjaaj once said to 'Abdullah Ibn Hani' - a man from Awd, a region in Yemen, and a nobleman among his people, and who attended with al-Hajjaaj all the events of his career, including the burning of the Ka'bah. He was one of al-Hajjaaj's men and followers: 'By Allah, we have not yet rewarded you properly.' Then he sent for Asma' Ibn Kharijah - a man of Fazarah - ordering him to marry his daughter to 'Abdullah Ibn Hani'. The man said: 'No, by Allah, I would not.' Al-Hajjaaj ordered whips to be brought in. The man said: 'I will marry him my daughter.' He did. Then al-Hajjaaj sent for Sa'id Ibn Qays al-Hamdani chief of the Yamaniyyah, and ordered him to marry Abdullah Ibn Hani' (to one of his daughters).' 'That man from Awd!' said Sa'id 'No, by Allah, I will not!' Al-Hajjaaj said (to his men): 'Fetch the sword.' The man said: 'Let me consult my family.' When he consulted them, they advised him: 'Marry your daughter with the man or this transgressor will kill you.' He obliged. Al-Hajjaaj said to 'Abdullah: 'O 'Abdullah! I married you to the daughter of the chief of Fazarah, and the daughter of the chief of Hamdan, the great man of Kahlan, though Awd is nothing.' 'Do not say like that, may Allah make the Emir better', said the man 'as we have merits which none of the Arabs have them.' 'What are they?' asked al-Hajjaaj. He said: Amirul Mu'minin 'Uthman was never abused in any of our meetings,' Abdullah said. 'That is, by Allah, a merit,' commented he. 'Seventy men of our people had attended Siffin, on Amirul Mu'minin Mu'awiyah's side, while only one man of our people attended it on Abu Turab's side, though, by Allah, I did not know him to be a bad man,' said 'Abdullah. 'This is a merit, too,' said he. 'None of us married a woman inclined to Abu Turab or of his followers,' said Abdullah. 'This a merit,' he said. 'No woman of us but vowed to give ten offerings if Husain was killed, and they did,' said Abdullah.' 'This is, by Allah, a merit,' said al-Hajjaaj. 'No man from us was asked to abuse and curse Abu Turab but he did it. And I add even his two sons, Hasan and Husain as well as their mother, Fatimah,' said Abdullah. 'This is, by Allah, a merit,' he

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 1, p. 75.

said. 'None of the Arabs is as handsome and good-looking as we are', said Abdullah. At this al-Hajjaaj laughed and said: 'O Abu Hani', this one you leave out.' As a matter of fact 'Abdullah was ugly, with a tight skin, pock-marked, hump-headed, with crooked mouth and acutely cross-eyed and of repulsive complexion'"¹(1)1

In the biography of 'Atiyyah Ibn Sa'd Ibn Junadah al-'Awfi, Ibn Sa'd relates in his al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, that:

"Al-Hajjaaj wrote to Muhammad Ibn al-Qasim al-Thaqafi, ordering him to summon 'Atiyyah: '... if he did not curse 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, whip him four hundred strikes and shave his head and beard.' He summoned 'Atiyyah and read al-Hajjaaj's letter to him, but he refused to curse 'Ali. Consequently he got four hundred strikes and his head and beard were shaved."²(2)2

* * *

Al-Hajjaaj's misdemeanours was emulated up by his brother, the ruler of Yemen, Muhammad Ibn Yusuf al-Thaqafi, during his rule over Yemen.

Al-Dhahabi, quoting Haajar al-Madari, narrated briefly, that 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib said: "What would you do if you were ordered to curse me?" I said: "Will it happen?" "Yes" he said. I asked him: "What should I do?" "Curse me," he said, "but do not renounce me."

So, Muhammad Ibn Yusuf ordered him to curse 'Ali. He said: " The Emir ordered me to curse 'Ali, So, curse him, may Allah curse him." Nobody noticed it except a man."³(1)3

¹ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p. 144.

² At-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 6, pp. 212-3. In the Eu. ed. vol. 2, p. 2494. Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 7, pp. 224-6. In Taqrib al-Tahdhib it is said that: "The Hadith of 'Atiyyah is mentioned by Al-Bukhari, Abu Dawud, Al-Tirmidhi and Ibn Maajah. 'Atiyyah died in 111 A.H. Muhammad Ibn al-Qasim al-Thaqafi was the leader of the army in Persia. In 92 A.H. al-Hajjaaj ordered him to conquer the province of Sind (of today's Pakistan). He did so, killed its king and occupied Karachi and Multan. When the Caliph Sulaiman came to power, he ordered the liquidation of the agents of al-Hajjaaj. Muhammad was imprisoned and was killed in 92 A.H.

³ Tarikh al-Islam by al-Dhahabi, vol. 4, pp. 51-2, in the biography of Muhammad Ibn Yusuf. Haajar is the son of Qays al-Hamdani al-Madari, of al-Madar mountain in Yemen. Ibn Haajar says of him: 'He was a Tabi'i and trustworthy. His hadith was quoted by Abu Dawud, an-Nesaa'i and Ibn Maajah. His biography is in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p. 215 and in Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 155

* * *

Thus continued the Qarashite Umayyad rule till the reign of 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz, who abolished the aforementioned approach, as we shall study hereunder:

c. The Reign of 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz

'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz reversed the policies of the Umayyads and stopped cursing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). The reason behind this reversal, according to Ibn Abi al-Hadid, was as follows:

"... As for 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz (may Allah be pleased with him), he said: 'As a young boy, I was taught the Qur'an by one of the sons of 'Utbah Ibn Mas'ud. One day, as I was playing with the boys and cursing 'Ali. He (my teacher) passed by and hearing us, showed dislike and entered the mosque. I left the boys and came to him for my lessons. When he saw me, he started performing his prayers, which he prolonged. I got the feeling that he was avoiding me. After finishing his prayers, he frowned at me. I said: 'What is the matter with you, O Shaykh?' He said: "Son! Are you going to curse 'Ali from now on?" 'Yes' I said. 'When did you know that Allah was displeased with the people of Badr after being pleased with them?' he asked. I said: 'Was 'Ali of those who participated in the Battle of Badr?' 'Woe upon you! Was the entire Battle of Badr anything without him?' he retorted. 'I will no longer do it,' I said. 'Do you swear by Allah you will not do it again?' he asked me eagerly. 'Yes,' I said, and I did not curse him after that.¹(1) Thereafter, I used to sit at the feet of the pulpit of the town where my father, then the Emir of the town, used to deliver his Friday sermons. He was eloquent and fluent in his sermons. But as he started to curse 'Ali (peace be on him), he would falter and stammer beyond expectation, a fact which astonished me. One day, I said to him: 'O father, you are the most eloquent and intelligent orator of the Arabs. So how is that, while you are so, I see you so stuttering when you come to curse this man?' He said: 'O my son! Had the Syrians and others who sit at the feet of our pulpit, known the virtues of this man as much as your father knows, none of them would have followed us.' His words deeply affected me and

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah, vol. 4, pp. 58-59. Ibn 'Asaakir in Tarikh-o-Dimishq, p. 131 on 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz's biography. 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz came to the power in 99 A.H. He was killed through poison in 101 A.H.

reinforced what my tutor had told me as a child. So, I pledged with Allah that if I have a part in this affair (i.e. caliphate), I will change it. Hence, when Allah favoured me with the caliphate I stopped this practice and replaced it with: "**Allah enjoins justice and kindness and giving charity to the relatives, and forbidding abomination, bad acts and transgression. He admonishes you that you may be mindful**". (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 55). I sent this to all parts of the country such that it became a tradition."¹(2)²

Kathir Ibn ‘Abd al-Rahman recited a poem praising ‘Umar (Ibn Abd al-Aziz) for stopping the abuse. He said:

*You ruled and did not abuse ‘Ali nor frightened an
Innocent not accepted the insult of a criminal.
You covered, by pardoning, the sins by that which You did,
that every Muslim was pleased² (3)¹*

On the same subject Al-Radi, Abul Hasan, said:

*O son of ‘Abd al-Aziz, if the eye was to weep for a man of Umayyads, it would weep for
you.
But I say you are good even if your people are no good.
You have cleared us of abuse and accusation.
If rewarding could be done, I would have rewarded you!*

But ‘Umar Ibn ‘Abdul ‘Aziz did not succeed in his attempt for two reasons:

First, because the Muslims got accustomed to cursing Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), thinking it to be a tradition which must not be neglected. Some people refused to stop it even during the time of ‘Umar Ibn ‘Abdu al-‘Aziz, such as the people of Harraan, as related by al-Hamawi and al-Mas‘udi who said:

"The people of Harraan (may Allah fight them) when the cursing of Abu Turab (i.e. ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib, may Allah be pleased with him) was stopped from the pulpits of Fridays, they refused to stop, saying that: ‘No prayer is accepted (by

¹ Both the narratives are briefly mentioned by Ibn al-Athir in his Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 16; al-Mas‘udi in Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p. 184; al-Ya‘qubi’s Tarikh, vol. 1, p. 305 and Ibn Abi al-Hadid in his comment on Sermon 59

² Al-Aghaani, vol. 9, p. 258 (Dar Publications) with minor variation in the narration

Allah) without cursing Abu Turab.' They, thus, continued it for a year until the appearance of al-Mashriq and the Musawwidah.¹(1)2

Second, The 'Umayyads caliphs after 'Umar Ibn 'Abdul 'Aziz revived that tradition, as we shall study presently.

d. During the Reign of Hisham Ibn Abd al-Malik

Ibn 'Asaakir reports in his biography of Junaadah Ibn 'Amr Ibn al-Junayd Ibn 'Abdur-Rahman al-Harri, a slave of Banu Ummaiyyah, says: "He quoted his grandfather, al-Junayd, who had said: 'I came from Hauraan to Damascus to receive my allowance. I performed the Friday prayers and went out from al-Darj gates. There, I saw an old man called Abu Shaybah, the story-teller, who used to tell stories to the people. He motivated us and we were motivated, and scared us and we cried. When he finished his talks, he said: 'Let us finish our gathering by cursing Abu Turab.' They cursed Abu Turab (peace be on him). I turned to a man on my right and asked: 'Who is Abu Turab?' He said: 'He is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his family) cousin, his daughter's husband, the first one to adopt Islam, and the father of Hasan and Husain (peace be on them both).' I said: 'What had happened to this story-teller?' Then I went to him, took him by his hair and began slapping him on the face and striking his head against the wall. He started yelling out, and the workers of the mosque hurried to us put my cloak on my neck and drove me until they brought me before Hisham Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, with Abu Shaybah before me, who was shouting:

'O Amir al-Mu'minîn! Your story-teller and that of your father and ancestors, was afflicted today by a grave thing.' 'Who did that to you?' asked the caliph. 'This man,' said he. Hisham turned to me while there were nobles with him and inquired: 'When did you come, O Aba Yahya?' 'Yesterday, on my way to Amir al-Mu'minîn. But as it was the time of the Friday prayers, I performed my prayers and left the mosque by al-Darj gate, where this old man was telling stories. I too sat down there. He recited and we heard. He aroused interest as well as, frightened. He prayed and we said, 'Amen'. At the end of his talks, he said: 'Let us finish our gathering by cursing Abu Turab.' I questioned who Abu Turab was, I

¹ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p. 245. Harraan is a town between al-Mosul (Iraq), Syria and Turkey - The town where Ibn Taymiyyah (d. 728 A.H.) the founder of the Salafiyyah sect, had graduated.

was told that he was ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib, the first Muslim, the cousin of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his family), the father of Hasan and Husain (peace be on them both) and the husband of the daughter of the Messenger of Allah. By Allah! O Amirul Mu’minîn, had he cursed anyone of your relatives as he did, I would have done to him what I did, So, how I could not be angry when the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his family) son-in-law, the husband of his daughter in being defamed?’ Hisham said: ‘How bad was his doing!’ Then he appointed me as governor of the Sind, telling some of his companions: ‘A man like him should not be kept in the vicinity lest he disturbs the peace in this country. Hence, I sent him to Sind’. He remained there till his death.”¹(1)

Concerning him, a poet said:

Generosity and Junaid departed together

So farewell to generosity and Junaid

This for you was an example of what the Umayyad despot, Hisham Ibn ‘Abd al-Malik did.

Following are the instances of what his agents did:

Khalid Ibn ‘Abd Allah al-Qasri

Al-Mubarrid, in his al-Kaamil, says that Khalid Ibn ‘Abd Allah al-Qasri was the ruler of Iraq during Hisham’s caliphate. He used to curse ‘Ali (peace be on him) from the pulpit, thus: "O Allah! Curse ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib Ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib Ibn Hashim, the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his family) son-in-law and the father of Hasan and Husain (peace be on them both)!” Then he used to turn to the people and ask them:

‘Did I use any agnomen?’²(2)

Khalid Ibn ‘Abd Allah al-Qasri’s mother was a Christian³(3). His full name was: Abu al-Haytham Khalid Ibn ‘Abd Allah al-Qasri. He generously spent the Public

¹ . Ibn Badran’s Tahdhib Tarikh Damishq, vol. 3, p. 410, in the biography of Junaadah Ibn ‘Amr Ibn al-Junayd, summarized by Ibn Manzur, vol. 6, pp. 177-178

² Al-Kaamil, Eu. ed., p. 414. Al-Mubarrid is Abu al-‘Abbas, Muhammad Ibn Yazid al-Azdi al-Thumali, a well-known grammarian of Basrah. He lived in Baghdad where he died in 285 A.H. His most famous books is al-Kaamil. Look up his biography in Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatîb al-Baghdadi

Treasury (*Bait al-Maal*) of the Muslims, spending it to gain worldly public praise. He was appointed as a governor of Makkah by the sons of Abd al-Malik, al-Walid, Sulaiman and Hisham, and was transferred by Hisham to Iraq as its governor.

Ibn 'Asaakir says in his biography:

"He brought water to Makkah and placed a basin near (the waters of) Zamzam, and delivered a speech in which he said: 'I brought you the desired water. It is not like the beetles water' (meaning the well of Zazam)'. He used to abuse 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib." Ibn 'Asaakir adds: "He said things which are not permissible to repeat" He further adds: "In one speech, he said: 'By Allah, if Amirul Mu'minin (Marwaani Caliph) orders me, I will pull it (i.e. Ka'bah) down stone by stone'." Khalid's fate was that the Caliph Hisham handed him over to Yusuf Ibn 'Umar, his governor in Iraq, where he was imprisoned and tortured to death, in the year 126 A.H.¹(1)3

Ibn Khallikaan reports: "Khalid built a church for his mother in his house."²(2)4

* * *

The Umayyads tried hard to keep the Muslims away from hearing any virtue about Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). They went to the extent of prohibiting people from naming their children 'Ali, as depicted in the following episode:

The Umayyads killed anyone named 'Ali

Ibn Hajar, in his biography of 'Ali Ibn Rabaah, chronicles, the gist of which is as follows: "The 'Umayyads used to kill any newborn child named 'Ali. Rabaah, on hearing this, said that his name was 'Ulayy (not Ali), used to get angry with (the name) 'Ali and troubled those who called him so." That is, he wanted to say: "My son's name is 'Ulayy." Ibn Hajar adds: "'Ali Ibn Rabaah said: 'I will not forgive whoever named me 'Ali. My name is 'Ulayy.'"³(3)1

* * *

³ At-Tabari's al-Fehrist, p. 163.

¹ Mukhtasar Tarikh Damishq by Ibn Manzur, vol. 7, pp. 369-384.

² Quoted from Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 10, p. 21. Parts of his story are in Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, pp. 120, 174, 179 & 280.

³ . 'Ali Ibn Rabaah al-Lakhami (d. 114 or 117 A.H.). Look up his biography in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 7, p. 319

It is clear from the following information about 'Umar Ibn Abd al-'Aziz and Hisham that the Umayyads cursed 'Ali (peace be on him) even though they knew his high position. In this respect, Ibn Abil Hadid reports:

"On his pilgrimage to Makkah, Hisham Ibn 'Abd al-Malik delivered a speech on the occasion. A man stood up and said to him: 'O Amir al-Mu'minin! On this day, the Caliphs recommended cursing Abu Turab.' 'Stop it!', he scolded him, 'We did not come here for that'"¹(1)2

The reason that prevented Hisham from cursing Im'am 'Ali (peace be on him) in his speech on the Day of 'Arafah was the same which caused 'Abd al-'Aziz to stammer in his speech in Madinah, as he told his son, 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz, as we have already related. He had told him: "O my son! Those who sit under our pulpit of the Syrian people and others of our soldiers and men, had they known of the virtues of this man as much as your father knows, none of them would have followed us (i.e. they would have followed the Ahle Bait (peace be on them))."

Thus, the policy of the Qurayshite 'Umayyad caliphate, in this respect, followed the early Qurashite caliphate after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

The effects of that policy in the Islamic community remained even after the 'Umayyads, such as what we are going to study during the 'Abbaside era, as follows:

During the Reign of the Abbasides

The Islamic nation, during the Abbaside era, retained the consequences of the previous policies of the Caliphs and their agents. Hereunder, we shall study three examples of three categories of the people during the 'Abbaside era:

First: The Scholars (Ulama)

¹ Sharh Nahjul Balaghah, 1/85.

Ibn Hajar, in his biography of Abu 'Uthman Hariz Ibn 'Uthman al-Humsi¹(2)1, says, the gist of which is as follows:

"He used to belittle 'Ali and abuse him. Ismaaeel Ibn 'Ayyash said: 'I accompanied Hariz Ibn 'Uthman from Egypt to Makkah. He abused 'Ali and cursed him.' He also reports: 'I heard Hariz Ibn 'Uthman say: 'The hadith which people relate about the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) telling 'Ali: '*You are to me as Haaroona was to Moosa*' is true, but the listener mis-heard it'. I asked: 'What was it?' He said: 'He (i.e. the Prophet) said: 'You are to me as Qaarun (Karah) was to Moosa!!!"

Al-Azdi said: "Hariz Ibn 'Uthman narrated that when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) wanted to mount a ride, 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib came and undid the strip of the saddle of the mule so that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) may fall off!!"

Yahya Ibn Salih²(1)2 was asked: "Why do not you write about Hariz?" He said: "What can I write about a man with whom I prayed for seven years but he never left the mosque before cursing 'Ali seventy times.."

Ibn Hayyaan³(2)3 said: "He used to curse 'Ali seventy times in the morning and seventy times in the evening."

Second: The Ruling Class

Ibn Hajar, in his biography of Nasr Ibn 'Ali, says: "When Nasr Ibn 'Ali related the narration of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, that he had taken the hands of Hasan and Husain and said: '*Whoever loves me, these two, their father and mother, will on the Resurrection*

¹ Hariz Ibn 'Uthman came to Baghdad in the time of the 'Abbaside Caliph al-Mahdi (d. 163 A.H.). In his biography of Hariz, Ibn Hajar, in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, pp. 237-240 and in Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 159, says: "He was trustworthy and reliable. He was accused of nasb i.e. hostility to 'Ali (peace be on him). His reports were quoted by Bukhari and others, except Muslim. Look up his biography in Ibn Badran's Tahdhib-o-Tarikh Ibn 'Asaakir, vol. 4, pp. 116-118

² Yahya Ibn Salih al-Wuhaazi al-Humsi (d. 222 A.H.). The author of the Sahihs and Sunna have quoted on his authority.

³ . Muhammad Ibn Hayyan Abu Hatim al-Basti (d. 354 A.H.). Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p. 349

Day be on the same level as mine', the Caliph al-Mutawakkil, ordered him to be whipped a hundred lashes but Ja'far Ibn 'Abd al-Wahid talked to him to forgive him and kept telling him that Nasr was a Sunni, etc. until the Caliph let him go."¹(3)4

Third: The Masses

Al-Dhahabi, in his biography of Ibn al-Saqqaa, in Tadhkirat al-Huffaaz reports:

"Al-Hafiz, the Imam and narrator of Wasit, Abu Muhammad, 'Abd Allah Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Uthman al-Wasiti, one day dictated the hadith of the bird, but they could not bear it, leapt on him, shoved him away and washed his place. He went home, was confined to it and stopped talking to the Wasitis. Hence, they have very few of his narrations."²(4)1

* * *

The ruler's injustice against the offspring of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) along centuries was not confined to the afore-mentioned examples of cursing or driving the people to curse them, renouncing them and banning the narration of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadith in their praise but included diverse kinds of torture and killing with the intention of exterminating them, as shall be referred to later on in this book, in respect of what happened to the progeny of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Karbala', and being killed at the hands of the Umayyad and the Abbaside rulers. Abu al-Faraj, in his book, Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, gives full details concerning their calamities. Sometimes, the Abbasides were more cruel to the Shiites than the Umayyads, examples of which will be related presently.

a. The Reign of al-Mansur

¹ Nasr Ibn 'Ali Ibn Sahbaan al-Azdi al-Jahzami (d. 250 or 251 A.H.). Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 10, p. 430

² Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, pp. 965-966. The Hadith of the bird is as follows: Once a grilled bird was presented to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and placed before him. He said: "*O Allah! Let him share with me this dish who is the one most loved by You from among your creatures.*" 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him) came in and ate with him. Look up the sources of this hadith in vol. 2, pp. 105-155 of the Chapter on "The biography of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)" in Tarikh-o-Damishq by Ibn 'Asaakir, edited by the learned researcher al-Mahmudi, Beirut ed. 1395 A.H.

Abul Faraj relates that al-Mansur asked Muhammad Ibn Ibraheem Ibn Hasan Ibn Hasan Ibn Abi Talib: "Is it you who is called al-Deebaaj al-Asfar [the Yellow silk]?" "Yes," he replied. The Caliph retorted: "By Allah, I will kill you in such a way that none else was ever killed by me before." Then he ordered an empty column to be built, put him into it alive and closed it by building it up.¹(1)2

b. During the Reign of Mutawakkil

Tabari, concerning the events of the year 236 A.H., says: "In this year Mutawakkil ordered the shrine of Imam Husain Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both) and the houses and buildings around it to be pulled down, levelled, ploughed, sown and irrigated. He prevented the people from visiting the shrine. So, the head of the police ordered it to be announced that: 'Whoever was seen near his [Husain's], grave after three days, will be sent to the Mutbiq.' So, the people refrained from going there and the place was ploughed and cultivated."²(2)1

Ibn al-Athir, in his Tarikh, concerning the events of the year 236 A.H. chronicles: "In this year, Mutawakkil ordered the tomb of (Imam) Husain Ibn 'Ali (peace be on him) to be pulled down as well as the houses and buildings around it, to sow and irrigate the place of the grave and the people to be prevented from visiting it. So, it was announced to the people: 'Whoever was found near his grave, after three days from now shall be imprisoned in al-Mutbiq.' The people ran away and stopped visiting his grave, which was destroyed and cultivated.

Mutawakkil hated 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him) and his family excessively. He used to kill them and to confiscate the property of whomever he heard him to love 'Ali and his progeny.. Among his drink - companions was 'Ubadah the transgender, who used to tie a pillow under his clothes and to bare his bold head and dance before al-Mutawakkil, while the singers sang: "Here comes the bald and paunchy Caliph of the Muslims' implying 'Ali (peace be on him),

¹ Al-Tabari, vol. 9, p. 198; Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, p. 200. Al-Mansur is Abu Ja'far 'Abd Allah Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali, the second of the 'Abbaside Caliphs. (d. 158 A.H.).

² Al-Tabari, vol. 3, p. 1407 in relating the events of the year 236 A.H. Al-Mutawakkil 'alaa Allah is Ja'far Ibn al-Mu'tasim Ibn Haaron al-Rashid. He came to rule in 232 A. H. and was killed in 247 A.H. Al-Mutbiq was his feared prison.

while al-Mutawakkil used to drink and laugh. Once he did that in the presence of Muntasir, who pointed to 'Abaadah threateningly. Scared, he stopped. Mutawakkil asked him, 'What's wrong with you? Why did you stop?' Muntasir stood up and said: 'O Amir al-Mu'minin! The one who was made fun of by this dog and laughed at by the people, is your own cousin, the head of your family and your pride. You may alone eat his flesh but do not feed this dog and his ilk.' Mutawakkil told the singers: 'Sing:

The youth is jealous for his cousin

The youth's head is in his mother's vulva.'

This was one of the reasons Muntasir regarded lawful to kill Mutawakkil.¹(1)2

Abul Faraj said²(2)3: "He (Mutawakkil) sent a man from among his companions called Dayzaj - a Jew who had adopted Islam - to the tomb of Husain and ordered him to plough the grave, level it with the earth and destroy all buildings surrounding it. He went and destroyed the surroundings of the grave and ploughed some 200 plants around it. When he came to the tomb, his men refused to touch it. So, he hired some Jews to plough it and water it all over. He established watchpoints around it with a mile in between, and ordered to bring to him whoever would come to visit the place."

Muhammad Ibn Husain al-Ashnani relates:

"A long time passed since my last visit to the grave because I was afraid. Once, I decided to take the risk. A perfume-seller helped me by accompanying me. We set off with the intention to visit (the grave). We took refuge during the day time and continued our journey at night, until we reached Qaaderiyyah. We left it in the heart of the night, passing through two check-posts whose guards were asleep. We came to the grave but were not sure about it. We began smelling the earth, creeping towards it until we came to where the box on the grave had been burnt and where water had flowed over it, causing the ground to give way into a trench-like hole. We fell on it and there we smelt such a scent which we had never

¹ Al-Kaamil fi al-Tarikh by Ibn al-Athir, 1st ed., Egypt, vol. 7, p. 18.

² Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, pp. 598-599.

before smelt like it. I asked the perfumer who was with me: 'What scent is this?' 'By Allah, I have never smelt any perfume like it before,' the man swore. We then bade the grave farewell and left, placing marks in different places around the grave.

After the assassination of Mutawakkil, we held a meeting with a group of the Taalibeen and the Shiites, and went to the grave. There, we found the marks and rebuilt the tomb as it was before."

He also reports: "He (Mutawakkil) appointed 'Umar Ibn al-Faraj al-Rukhkhaji as the governor of Madinah and Makkah. He prevented the descendants of Abu Talib from asking anything from the people, and prevented the people from being benevolent to them. Whenever he heard that somebody had helped anyone of them, he would inflict him with severe punishment and heavy fines, till the situation became such that a single shirt was used inturns by the women of the Taalibeen to perform their prayers, which they used stitch with patches, sitting in their closets, naked and bare-headed. When Mutawakkil was killed and Muntasir came to power, he was kind to them, helped them and distributed money among them. He acted contrary to his father in all his situations and ways, by way of decrying him and supporting his own deeds.¹(1)

So far we have been relating some consequences of the policies of the Qurashite Caliphate against the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) through the centuries. We shall study other consequences after observing the conclusions of our past discussion.

Conclusion: Quraysh disliked to see both the positions, Prophethood and Caliphate, in the hands of Banu Hashim. They prevented, much as they could, the recording of the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his life, so that no text could be recorded that confirmed the right to caliphate of the person they disliked to see ruling from among the Banu Hashim, after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). They did that also to prevent the spread of the hadiths which disgraced their own kinsfolk from the Quraish, kept them away from the rule and spread the virtues of their competitors, Banu Hashim in particular, and the Ansar in general.

¹ Maqaatil al-Taalibeen, p. 599

The same reasons made them prevent the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from dictating his will in the last hour of his life - the will concerning which he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*With which you will never go astray*" - fearing that he (peace be on him and his progeny) may dictate a text in favour of the one to rule after him from the Banu Hashim whom they disliked and in order to seize both Prophethood and Caliphate.

For these very reasons, the Companion, 'Umar, and the Qarashite Muhajirs who supported him, tried hard to force the allegiance for the Qurayshite of Taym, Abu Bakr, after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

For the same reasons, Abu Bakr handed the caliphate over to his companion, the Qurayshite 'Adawi, 'Umar, through the Qurayshite 'Uthman.¹(1)1

For the same reasons, the Caliph 'Umar prevented the writing down and the spreading of the hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and burnt whatever had been already written by the Companions, and imprisoned in Madinah those who disagreed with him and spread the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadiths, outside Madinah, in the country.²(2)2

For the same reasons 'Umar used, when appointing his agents, to see them (to the door) and tell them: "Strip the Qur'an (from hadiths) and stop quoting Muhammad, and I am your partner."³(3)3

For the same reasons, the two caliphs, Abu Bakr and 'Umar, did not give anyone from the Banu Hashim a post in the army during the conquest period, even in the conquered countries.⁴(4)4

For the same reasons, the Caliph 'Umar planned with 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn 'Awf to put 'Uthman the Qurayshite of Banu 'Umayyah, in the saddle (of caliphate), in a Qurayshite Council."⁵(5)1

¹ The details have already been related early in this book.

² Look up the details in Vol. 2 of this book.

³ Al-Tabari's Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 19, concerning 'Umar's conduct during the events of the year 30 A.H.

⁴ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 2, pp. 321-322. This is confirmed by the third Caliph, who also put none of Banu Hashim in any post

⁵ The details have already been related.

For the same reasons, ‘Uthman stripped the Holy Qur’an from the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) hadiths, multiplied and distributed its copies among the Islamic countries, and ordered all other copies of the Holy Qur’an written down by the Companions, together with it the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) exegesis on it, to be burnt. In this regard, he ordered ‘Abd Allah Ibn Mas‘ud – who opposed him in respect of burning the Holy Qur’an – to be brought from Kufah to Madinah, had him whipped and stopped giving him his allowance from the Public Treasury.¹(6)2

The Companion, Abu Dharr, was expelled from Madinah to Rabadhah by ‘Uthman because he continued to publicly narrate the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).²(1)3

He wrote in his will to hand over the caliphate to ‘Abd al-Rahman, the Qurayshite, the Zahri, in an illness of nose-bleeding.³(2)4

But when ‘Abd al-Raman died before ‘Uthman, who was murdered before being able to appoint someone from the Qurashite to the rule, the Muslims became free to choose whom they liked, and thus they rushed to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), offering him their allegiance. In their forefront of these people were the chiefs of the Quraysh and the Companions, after they had lost the chance of seizing the initiative (for themselves). Nevertheless, after four months, Quraysh gathered up their forces and waged a war against Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), under the leadership of ‘A’ishah, Talhah and Zubair, with the hope of snatching the rule from Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).⁴(3)5. Again, they kindled the war of Siffin against him for the same reason. In order to prepare public opinion outside Madinah for those two wars, they spread the false propaganda that it was Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) who killed the Caliph ‘Uthman and usurped the rule⁵(4)6. As the Muslims outside Madinah used to take the teachings of their religion and

¹ Look up the discussion "Uthman’s Day" in the Chapter "The History of the Qur’an", in our book *The Glorious Qur’an and the narratives of the two Schools*. As to the narrative about Ibn Mas‘ud, look up our book *Ahadith Umm al-Mu’minin ‘A’ishah*, Chapter "In the Days of the two Sons-in-Law".

² Look up Vol. 2 of this book.

³ The sources have already been mentioned

⁴ Look up al-Jamal narrative in *Ahadith Umm al-Mu’minin ‘A’ishah*, Chapter "In the Days of the two Sons-in-law".

⁵ Look up al-Tabari, Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Kathir in their *Tarikhs* on the Battle of Siffin.

the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Ahl al-Bait and Companions from the nearest Companions and rulers of Quraysh, their men and allies, and, with the exception of the Holy Qur'an, they knew nothing of Islam and of the conducts of its people, except what was related to them by the so-called rulers. As they had no other way of information, their sources of information, viz. the Quraysh, could easily mislead them and give them an obscure vision of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). The situation was aggravated by the raising on spears of the Holy Qur'an by Mu'awiyah's army, when they felt too weak to carry on the fight in the Battle of Siffin. By doing so, they called Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and his army to resort to the Holy Qur'an as arbitrator, through two arbitrators. When the "reciters" in Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) army and their followers insisted on accepting the arbitration, the Umayyad Companion of Quraysh, 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas, deceived the Companion Abu Musa al-Ash'ari in the process of arbitration, and when the news of the deception spread among the people, the situation become too hard and unbearable for a group of the "reciters" of the town of Kufah who had accepted the arbitration. They accused the Muslims, in general, of disbelief, and revolted against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and fought against him in al-Nahrawan where they were vanquished. But later, one of them assassinated Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) in his prayer-niche (while he was praying) in the Mosque of Kufah¹(1). These events obscured the vision of the Muslims outside Madinah to such an extent that they could not get a correct picture of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), and had to accept whatever falsities and fabrications were spread about Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

On the other hand, the Quraysh's dislike for seeing anyone of Banu Hashim as ruler - a dislike which was, in fact, directed to the Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) since there was no other candidate among Banu Hashim for the government - was changed, after the two battles which Quraysh waged against Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), to enmity and hatred, which became, afterwards, the basis of Quraysh's rule, over the Muslims, as was manifest in the Umayyad's rule to which we shall refer presently.

¹ Look up al-Tabari, Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Kathir in their reports about the Battles of Siffin and al-Nahrawan.

The Hostility of the Umayyads to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and its Consequences

First: When Mu‘awiyah came to power, he based his policy on two foundations:

1. Handing the caliphate over to his son, Yazid, whereas it had been the policy of the former caliphs to keep it among the Quraysh, as per their slogan: "Expand it among Quraysh, it will further expand."¹(2)1
2. The policy of hostility to the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) in particular.

We do not think that history has any parallel of an enmity like that of Mu‘awiyah to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) personally, in addition to his enmity to Banu Hashim as a whole. That was why he built his rule on slandering them and fabricating lies against them and forging merits for others, and spreading them among the people all over the land. He ordered that Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) be cursed in every gathering, especially in Friday sermons in mosques, from the farthest end of the Islamic East to the farthest end of the Islamic West. He vowed not to stop it until the new generation gets used to it and the old dies upon it. He killed whoever opposed it, not even sparing many learned Muslims. Yet, he was exceeded by his son, Yazid, who killed the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Karbala’, beheaded them, captured their women and children and paraded them, with the heads on the spears, from town to town. The practices of the Umayyad Caliphs from Abu Sufyan’s offspring ended with Yazid and the rule was handed over to Banu Marwan of the Umayyads.

The Policy of the Marwani Caliphates of Umayyad

The Caliphs of Marwan followed Mu‘awiyah’s policy in keeping the rule within their family, as well as, in respect of cursing Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and reviling him, until ‘Umar Ibn ‘Abdul Aziz came to power. He ordered his agents

¹ I do not recollect, for the time being, where I had read this slogan which was raised by the Quraysh after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), but their practice to bring different tribes of Quraysh to power is but a proof of that.

to stop cursing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). But the people had been accustomed to that.

Some of them even took it to be a compulsory religious duty, without which the Friday prayers would not be accepted, as was the case with the people of Harraan who said: "No prayers without cursing Abu Turab!" The rule of Umar Ibn Abd al-'Aziz did not last for more than two years and a few months¹(1)2, as he was poisoned by his relatives²(2)3, and the Umayyads returned to their former custom of cursing Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), until the Abbasides came to rule after them. Their policy was as follows:

The Policy of the Abbaside Caliphs

Among the Abbasides were many who exceeded the Umayyads in killing the Messenger's descendants and degrading their position among the Muslims. Among these were Abu Ja'far al-Mansur, Harun ar-Rashid and al-Mutawakkil, and among them were also those who acted differently and were inclined to Ahl al-Bait.³(3)1

Nevertheless, the people had been brought up for ninety years of the Umayyads caliphate⁴(4)2 according to what Mu'awiyah had planned to bring them up on renouncing, cursing and slandering Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). The aftermath of Umayyad education was transferred to the Abbaside age. Among the scholars of that time was Abu Uthman Hariz Ibn 'Uthman (d. 162 A.H.) who used to curse Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) seventy times in the morning and seventy times in the evening, and forged traditions against him (peace be on him) and spread and circulated them in Baghdad and other capitals of Islamic countries.

¹ Muruj al-Dhahab by al-Mas'udi vol. 3, p. 35, and elsewhere.

² Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 9, p. 209

³ Such as al-Nasir le Deen Allah who was of the followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) school. Of his relics I saw, in Saamarra', in the Imams' musalla and al-Mahdi's Mosque called "The Ghaybah", some Wooden writings engraved on a platform higher than a metre from the ground. It states the names of the twelve Imams and that it had been constructed at the order of the Caliph al-Nasir le Deen Allah.

⁴ Muruj al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p. 235

Yet, there were, however, people like the people of Waasit, whose learned man and narrator, ‘Abd Allah Ibn Muhammad Ibn ‘Uthman (d. 371 A.H.), ventured to dictate "the hadith of the bird", (for which he was made to stand up, and his seat was washed and rinsed, and he had to stay at home afterwards). This was because he narrated a hadith in favour of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).

* * *

The matter was not confined to the events and persons we mentioned nor was it confined to those ages alone. It, actually, extended to other eras and down to the our times. But we confined ourselves to relating examples of the rulers’ efforts, along centuries, to conceal all information about Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), to intensify hating and disparaging them so that the people may not be inclined towards them. In reality, they wanted recoil from them, as otherwise their own rule would collapse and the rule of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) would replace theirs. The policy of the Quraishite Caliphate (whether Umayyads, Abbasides, non-Umayyads and non-Abbasides, and whether leaders or subjects) towards Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), produced ten kinds of concealments and distortions by the School of Caliphate, in respect of the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and in the information about his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and Companions. These shall be studied in the next discussion.

**Ten Kinds of Concealment and Distortion
of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)
and of the News about the Conduct of his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and
Companions**

**A Study of what the School of Caliphate did to the Texts
of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which
were Contrary to their Goals**

To begin with, we give an example of what the School of Caliphate did to the texts which were against its inclinations, especially the texts which described Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as the successor in the narrations of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Companions.

The Companions narrated numerous authentic and reliable narratives that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*‘Ali is my successor, minister and heir.*" Others added: "*and successor.*" Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was known by the title “Successor” (*wasi*) among his other titles so much so that it almost became like a proper name exclusively referring to him, as none else had ever been known by it, as well as his other agnomen, Abu Turab, which was given to him by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), which also was also exclusively for him. Thereafter, the Companions, their followers and the later poets used to refer to him as “the successor” (*wasi*), as did the ‘Scholars of the Book’, who told the people about it.

The Denial of the Successorship

As the well-known title, Successor, of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was contrary to the policy and aim of the School of Caliphate, it tried to counter it by denying it altogether and concealing the texts which confirmed its entity.

‘A’ishah, started a strong propaganda campaign against the famous title of Imam ‘Ali as Successor by denying it. Then, the said School continued its campaign against this fame in different ways, along centuries.

The most important action of the Khulafa School in this respect was the concealment of the texts which referred to the succession, and it was a tremendously grave thing that it did to the texts which did not suit its policy towards the successor, etc. This fact is obvious to the persistent researcher. Examples of the concealments practised by the School of Caliphate fall within the

following ten kinds we are going to explain according to their importance in concealing the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny):

- a. The omission of a part of a narration from the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and replacing it with an ambiguous word or phrase.
- b. The complete omission of a hadith concerning the Companions' conducts, yet without denying the omission.
- c. The interpretation of the meaning of a hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)
- d. The omission of parts of the Companions' hadith without mentioning the omission.
- e. The omission of a complete hadith from the Messenger's Sunnah without admitting the omission.
- f. The prohibition of writing down the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).
- g. The weakening of the narratives and the narrators of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as well as the writings which criticized the rulers.
- h. The burning of libraries and books.
- i. The omission or the distortion of parts of statements concerning the Companions' conducts.
- j. The replacement of the original narratives by fabricated ones concerning the narratives of the Messenger's Sunnah and his Companions's conduct.

a. Omission of a part of a hadith from the Tradition of the word Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and replacing it with an ambiguous or phrase.

This was a kind of a mission practised by the School of Caliphate, in which they used to omit a part of a hadith from the Sunnah of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and replace it with an ambiguous word, such as that done by al-Tabari and Ibn Kathir to the narrative concerning the invitation of Banu Hashim

by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in compliance with Allah's order in the verse: "**And warn your nearest relatives**" (Surah Shuaraa (26): Verse 214). They omitted from the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) saying: "... *and my successor and caliph among you*", and replaced it by "... *and my so and so among you*".

A similar concealment was done by Bukhari in his Sahih concerning the conduct of the companions as in the episode of 'Abd al-Rahman, which has been mentioned earlier. He omitted what 'Abd al-Rahman said to Marwan, and replaced it by: "'Abd al-Rahman said something." So, he changed 'Abd al-Rahman's words with an ambiguous word. Moreover, he omitted what was narrated by 'A'ishah, quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), concerning the hadith about al-Hakam, Marwan's father.

A further example of this kind of concealment is what was done to the narrative about the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) consultation with his Companions about the Battle of Badr and his Companions' replies to him. Concerning this, Ibn Hisham and al-Tabari report: "... He (peace be on him and his progeny) was informed that Quraysh had come to protect their caravan. He consulted with the people and informed them about Quraysh's decision. Abu Bakr al-Siddiq stood up and talked and talked well. Then, 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab stood up and talked and talked well. Then al-Meqdad Ibn 'Amr stood up and said: 'O Messenger of Allah! Go ahead with what Allah has enjoined you to do and we are with you. By Allah we shall not say to you like what Banu Israel had said to Moosa: '**... go you and your lord and fight you both, we are sitting here.**' (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 24) But, go you and your lord and fight you both and we shall fight beside you...'. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him good and invoked for him good. The answer of Sa'd Ibn Ma'adh al-Ansari was: 'Go ahead, O Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), with what you have decided upon, and we are with you. By the One who sent you with the truth! If you ask us to wade into this sea, we will do it with you and none of us will remain behind...' The

Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was pleased with what Sa'ad said, and it energized him."

We wonder what the answers of the two Companions, Abu Bakr and 'Umar were to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Why were their talks omitted and replaced by the ambiguous phrase: "and he said well"? If they were "well", why, then, were they omitted, whereas what al-Miqdad of the Emigrants and Sa'd Ibn Ma'adh of the Ansar had said was not omitted? By referring to Sahih Muslim, we read his narration that when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) heard about Abu Sufyan's coming, he consulted with his Companions. Then he adds that: "Abu Bakr talked but (the Messenger) turned away from him. Then 'Umar talked but he (peace be on him and his progeny) turned away him...(till the end of the narration). Please, why did the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) turn away from the two Companions when they had talked well? On researching, we find in al-Waqidi and al-Meqrizi that the two had said as follows:

The former says: "'Umar said: O Messenger of Allah! It is Quraysh and its glory. By Allah! It was never humiliated ever since it was glorified. By Allah! It never believed ever since it disbelieved. By Allah! It will never give up its glory. It will most certainly fight you. So, get ready for it, and make the preparations..."¹(1)

It is noted from the narrative of Ibn Hisham, al-Tabari and Muslim that the Companion 'Umar talked after the Companion Abu Bakr, and al-Tabari and Ibn Hisham described the speeches of both of them as to be "well", while in Muslim's narrative we notice him say that the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) turned away from Abu Bakr, from 'Umar, then we realize that their speeches were alike. When al-Waqidi and al-Meqrizi relate 'Umar's speech and conceal that of Abu Bakr, 'Umar's speech is disclosed for us too through that of Abu Bakr.

Since relating the speeches of the two Companions could offend some people, those speeches were omitted from the narrative of al-Tabari, Ibn Hisham and Muslim. Thus, due to such concealments, their books have been placed at the top of the trustworthy and reliable ones. Sahih al-Bukhari which states nothing about this narrative, ambiguous or not, became distinguished for being the most authorised and trusted of all books of hadith!

¹ The sources of this narrative have already been mentioned.

* * *

Both al-Tabari and Ibn Kathir replaced that part of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadith in which he referred to 'Ali (peace be on him) as "*my successor and my caliph*", by "*my so and so*" because such words would draw the attention of the public to Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) right to rule, a fact whose popularity was not wanted (by them).

Al-Bukhari changed 'Abd al-Rahman's words to "something", because his actual words could have disparaged the Caliphs, Mu'awiyah, Yazid and Marwan, and would have drawn the attention of the public to what they ought not.

The replies of Abu Bakr and 'Umar to the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) were changed in Ibn Hisham's Seerah and al-Tabari's Tarikh, and were omitted from the narrative of Sahih Muslim, because they did not speak well for the Caliphs Abu Bakr and 'Umar. All of them omitted a part of the narrative and obscured it.

Such concealment has been frequently resorted to by the scholars of the Caliphate School.

b. The Complete Omission of a hadith concerning the Companion's Conducts, yet without denying the Omission

Another kind of concealment was what it did to the letters exchanged between Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr and Mu'awiyah. In the book Siffin by Nasr Ibn Muzaahim (d. 212 A.H.), and in Muruj al-Dhahab by al-Mas'udi (d. 346 A.H.), we read the full text of the letter of Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr sent to Mu'awiyah, in which the merits of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), including his being the successor of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), were stated. Mu'awiyah, in his reply, admitted to those merits. Both letters included things whose dissemination would not have adorned the Caliphs. Al-Tabari (d. 310 A.H.) omitted both the letters and their replies, although he did mention them. He excused himself by saying that "the public cannot bear to hear what was written in them". That is, he had concealed the facts from the people.

Later, Ibn al-Athir (d. 630 A.H.) did the same, using exactly the same excuse.

After both of them came Ibn Kathir, who referred to the letter of Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr in his encyclopedic Tarikh¹(1)1, describing it to be "rude".

By saying: "The public cannot bear to hear what was written in them", al-Tabari and Ibn al-Athir meant to say that the people, after hearing what was written in them, would not continue to keep their belief in the Caliphs.

Such concealment i.e. omitting the entire narrative and just referring to it was rare by the scholars of the Caliphate School.

c. Interpreting the meaning of a hadith of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Among the kinds of concealment practised by the Caliphate School was the interpretation of a narrative, as had been done by al-Dhahabi²(1)2 in his biography of al-Nesaa'i. When Nesaai was asked to relate Mu'awiyah's merits, he retorted: 'What shall I mention (in Muawiyah's excellence)? (Shall I mention) the hadith which says: *'May Allah never fill his stomach!'*?' Trying to interpret this, al-Dhahabi (d. 748 A.H.) says: "I say: Perhaps, this is a merit for Mu'awiyah as the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'O Allah! Whomever I cursed or reviled, let it be a zakat for him and a mercy upon him!!'"

As you see, al-Dhahabi said: "Perhaps", but Ibn Kathir (d. 774 A.H.), came after him to say: "Mu'awiyah benefited by this invocation in his world as well as his hereafter."

These are his exact words³(2)3 used in the said narrative about Mu'awiyah in Sahih Muslim, Chapter on "Whomever the Prophet cursed or reviled, Allah makes it for him a zakat and purification "as in the book "Benevolence and bestowal", quoting Ibn 'Abbas as to have said: "I was playing with the boys when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came. I hid myself behind a door. He passed by me a step and said: *'Go, call Mu'awiyah.'* I went, came back and informed him: *'He is eating.'* He again told me to call Mu'awiyah. I went and

¹ Al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah, vol. 7, p. 314. We have already mentioned the two letters and our comment on them, and on what al-Tabari had done before.

² Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, pp. 698-701.

³ Al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah, vol. 8, p. 119

came back and told him: 'He is eating.' He said: '*May Allah not fill his stomach!*'"¹(3)1, according to the words used by (Sahih) Muslim.

This hadith is stated by Ibn Kathir in his Tarikh. He added to it: "He wrote down the revelation", after the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) saying: "*Go call Mu'awiyah*". The following is the text of Ibn Kathir: "Ibn 'Abbas said: 'I was playing with the boys when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) came. I said (to myself): 'He must have come for me.' I hid behind a door, he came towards me, passed me by a step or two, and said: '*Go call Mu'awiyah*.' - He (Mu'awiyah) was the writer of the revelation – I went and called him. I was told that he was eating. I came back to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and told him: 'He is eating.' He said: '*Go call him*.' I went to him once again. I was told: 'He is eating.' I informed him (peace be on him and his progeny) accordingly. The third time, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: '*May Allah never satisfy his stomach!*' Ibn 'Abbas said: 'Thereafter, he was never satiated.' Mu'awiyah benefited by this invocation in his world and in his hereafter. As for the world²(1)2, when he became the ruler of Syria, he used to eat seven times a day in a bowl with plenty of meat and onion. He would have seven meals a day with too much of meat, fruits and sweets, and yet he would say: 'By Allah! I am not satisfied, but I am only tired (of eating).' It was indeed a blessing to have such a stomach, desired by all kings!! As to his hereafter, Muslim (the author of Sahih) joined this hadith to the hadith which was narrated by al-Bukhari and others, quoting several sources of the Companions, that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said: '*O Allah! I am but a human. So, whoever I reviled, whipped or cursed, without he deserving it, make it an atonement and favour that would please him in the Day of Resurrection.*' Muslim put together the former hadith and this one and made a merit for Mu'awiyah out of it, He stated none except that."³(2)3 – Unquote Ibn Kathir.

By that he meant to say that the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) invocation against Mu'awiyah was actually in his favour in this world and in the Hereafter. Regarding this world, he stated the merit of excessive eating by the

¹ Sahih Muslim, the book of "Al-Birr wa al-Silah", Hadith No. 96 p. 2010.

² From here to the end is added by Ibn Kathir.

³ Al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah, vol. 8, p. 119

Kings. Regarding the Hereafter, he depended upon the narrations (falsely) ascribed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) that he used to curse the believers – we seek refuge in Allah - and then ask Allah to regard it a purification. Muslim, by closing his chapter with this hadith, proved divine satisfaction and divine proximity for Mu‘awiyah on the Day of Resurrection.

In this way, they used to interpret the traditions and narratives, which vilified the authorities, caliphs and governors, as praise and approval for them.

We must contemplate here their narration that the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) used to curse the believers (we seek refuge in Allah)!

A look at their on the One Traditions cursed by the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny)

They narrated, as in Sahih Muslim, chapter on "Those who were cursed by the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)", that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "O Allah! I ask You a promise in which You will not disappoint me. As I am a human, whoever I hurt, revile, curse or whip, make it for him as prayers, poor-rate and the pleasure of bringing him within your vicinity in the Day of Resurrection."

I feel, while writing these words, as if daggers are being stabbed in the

heart, because of the horrible things ascribed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)! They narrate this hadith, whereas Allah, the Exalted and Glorified, says: "**And you are of a subline behaviour** (Surah Qalam (68): Verse 4). This hadith must be studied under the tenth kind of the concealments: The replacement of the original narratives by fabricated ones because they were ascribed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), countering the true successive narrations of all Muslims in respect of the behaviour of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as far as his highly refined and generous morals are concerned. But those false narratives had been ascribed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in order to conceal the aforementioned narrative of 'A'ishah who said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had cursed al-Hakam Ibn Abu al-'Aas, father of the Umayyad Caliph, Marwan, as well as the successive hadiths quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) against Caliph Mu'awiyah, the hadiths which Ibn Kathir interpreted as a praise for him. Those narrations have been discussed in our books *Ahaadith Umm al-Mu'minin 'A'ishah*, vol. 2, and *Athar al-'A'imma fi 'Ihya' al-Sunnah*, vol. 3. So, there is no need to repeat them here.

* * *

A Return to The Beginning

We come back to the discussion of interpreting the meaning of a narrative as a kind of concealment:

Among this kind, we will discuss¹ the narrative about Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas who warded off the punishment of drinking wine for Abu Mihjan, and the attempts of Ibn Fathun and Ibn Haajar to interpret Sa'd's saying to Abu Mihjan: "By Allah! We will not whip you for (drinking) wine." We will also discuss the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) fixing the number of the Imams who come after him as successors, to be twelve, and how they were perplexed on realizing that it did not comply except with the actual twelve Imams (peace be on them) from the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) offspring. We shall see how each one of the scholars had interpreted the

¹ In discussing the spread of Saif's hadiths, in the tenth kind of concealments.

hadith to refer to other than the twelve Imams of the Messenger's offspring, so much so that they displeased and refuted one another.

Of this kind of concealment is what has been done by al-Tabarani to the following hadith, as stated in Majma' al-Zawaa'id :¹ (2)1

Salman said: "I said: 'O Messenger of Allah! Every Prophet had a successor. Who is your successor?' He (peace be on him and his progeny) kept silent. Some time later, he (peace be on him and his progeny) saw me and called out to me: '*O Salman!*' I hurried to him and said: 'Here I am.' He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: '*Do you know who was Moosa's successor?*' I said: 'Yes, Yusha' Ibn Nūn.' '*Why?*' he asked. 'Because he was the most learned among them,' I replied. '*Then,*' he (peace be on him and his progeny) informed, '*my successor, the place of my secrets and the best one I leave behind me to fulfill my promises and settle my debts is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib.*'" Al-Tabarani relates this narrative and adds: "By '*my successor*', he (peace be on him and his progeny) meant that he had asked him to look after his family, not the caliphate."

This is what al-Haythami quoted from al-Tabarani in Majma' al-Zawa'id.

A Study of the Prophetic Hadith and of al-Tabarani's Interpretation

In order to know whether al-Tabarani was right in his interpretation of the noble hadith, we shall study three aspects of the hadith: One who questions and the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) wisdom in his answer.

The questioner was Salman, of Persian origin. He was neither from Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib nor a relative of the Messenger's wives nor was he one of his sons-in-law so as to care whom the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) appointed to look after his family. He had been accompanying the Christian monks and the learned, before adopting Islam at the hands of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). From them, he learnt the knowledge of the past people and the episodes of their Prophets and successors. Hence, he asked the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny): "Who is your successor?" He was asking about the Prophet's successor to look after his religion. He asked about his heir apparent, who would rule his nation. He was not telling him that: "Since every

¹ Mujma' al-Zawa'id, vol. 9, pp. 113-114

head of a family usually assigns a heir for his family after him, so who is yours?" that one may think he was asking about his successor in his family.

As regards the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) delayed answer, it must be noted that this was his habit. As in important matters, he (peace be on him and his progeny) used to wait for Allah's order. He did the same in Madinah waiting for His order concerning the change in Qiblah to the Ka'bah; although he did know it to be his qiblah but he waited until the verse: "**Indeed, We see the turning of your face to heaven, so We shall surely turn you to a qiblah which you will like.**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 144). The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was aware of the competition among the Arabs vis-à-vis the power (to rule), as has already been stated.¹(1)

The small Islamic community in Madinah, which the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had begun to build, was unable to tolerate the news about giving the post of a guardianship and succession to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Hence, his delaying his answer to Salman, until he was ordered to answer, and only then he called out to Salman and prepared him to hear his answer, by asking him about Moosa's successor, although he knew that Salman knew who he was, as he had obtained the knowledge about the people of the Book. When he answered that Moosa' successor was Yusha Ibn Nūn, the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) asked him: "*Why?*" When Salman replied: "Because he was, the most learned among them", he (peace be on him and his progeny) informed him: "*My successor... is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib.*"

The wisdom in the Messenger's answer in this way was:

First: The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) referred to Yusha as an example because he was the most famous successor of a Prophet, and because Moosa son of 'Imran (peace be on them both) had appointed him as his successor. He led Banu Israel through wars, as Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) did after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) during his Caliphate.

Second: He asked him about the reason for Yusha to be (Prophet) Moosa's successor, to which Salman answered that because he was the most learned among them.

¹ In the Chapter concerning the terms of the Imamate and Caliphate discussion.

Through this conversation, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) explained that ‘Ali was his successor not because he was his cousin nor because he defended Islam with utmost bravery in the Messenger’s wars but because he was the most learned man among them i.e. he (peace be on him and his progeny) informed the criterion of the Imam for being the successor, the guardian, of Islam and Muslims. He asserted this point by saying: "... *the place of my secrets, the best one I leave behind me...*" These words had also been interpreted by al-Tabarani to mean: "The The best one I leave behind me to look after my family." This was the interpretation of al-Tabarani of a hadith in which he found no point of weakness and the like.

Another Confusion in Interpreting the Meaning of Successor

Ibn Abi al-Hadid, a Shafi‘i, explaining the meaning of succession (*al-wasiyyah*), as expressed in Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) words: "*None in the Islamic nation can be compared with the progeny of Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny)...They were the foundations of religion... They possessed the characteristic for having the right to guardianship, and in them was the succession and heritage*", says: "As to the succession, we have no doubt that ‘Ali (peace be on him) was the Messenger’s successor, even though the obstinate ones among us denied it. By succession, we do not say that it meant assigning him to the caliphate but there are other matters, if noticed, would be more sublime and more honourable!" Unquote Ibn Abi al-Hadid.

To him, we reply:

Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) did not say: "I have the right to the guardianship, the succession and the heritage, that one may interpret it to mean having the right to the guardianship and succession over the family of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)". He actually said: "*The progeny of Muhammad are the foundations of religion...and in them is the succession...*" Imam (peace be on him) confirmed these characteristics, including the succession, for the progeny of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). It is meaningless to say that the family of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had the right of the succession over the family of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). Imam Ali (peace be on him) confirmed succession for the family of the

Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), who himself was one of its members, together with the other eleven Imams (peace be on them) of his offspring over the entire nation. This confused the Shafi‘i scholar in interpreting the succession, and, at the same time, he could not repeat the interpretation of al-Tabarani. He could only say: "By succession, we do not say that it meant assigning him the caliphate, but there are other matters..." What were those other matters which you – O confused scholar – could not mention in the interpretation of the hadith?

In short, in this kind of concealment, the scholars interpreted the narration of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his hadiths, conduct and the conduct of his offspring and companions, which were contrary to the interests of the authorities ruling over the Muslims, such as the caliphs and their agents in a way to suit those interests. They converted the narrations, which disparaged the rulers, into hadiths in their praise and in support of their interests.

d. Omitting parts of the Companions’ sayings without mentioning the omission:

Another kind of concealment practised by the School of Caliphate was to omit a part of a narrative without mentioning the omission, as they did to a poem composed by an Ansari Companion, al-Nu‘man Ibn ‘Ajlaan, which was fully recorded by Zubair Ibn Bakkaar, in his record of Saqifah and the arguments and quarrels that took place between the Emigrants and the Ansar, including what ‘Amr Ibn al-‘Aas said against them. As a reply to him, al-Nu‘man composed a poem in which he hailed the participations of the Ansar in the battles of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) against Quraysh, then their housing the Emigrants of Quraysh, sharing their own properties with them and finally, mentioning Saqifah, he says:

And you said that Sa’d’s appointment is not permissible and you appointed

Ateeq Ibn Uthman the other name for Abu Bakr

Abu Bakr is worthy of it the best successor (to the Prophet)

Surely Ali was the one worthiest to the affair (of Caliphate)

It was an insult to Ali while he was

So deserving of it that O Sa’d you cannot even understand

He called towards guidance with the help of Allah
And restrained from indecency, rebellion and disliked things
The successor of the Prophet Mustafa and his cousin
The killer of the heroes of deviation and disbelief
He, all praise is for Allah, guides from deviation
And opens the ears that have become heavy due to deafness
The lone confidante of the Messenger of Allah in the cave
And his truthful companion since times ancient

Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr, in his biography of al-Nu‘man Ibn ‘Ajlaa n al-Isti‘ab, recorded the poem in full, omitting only two lines in which the poet says that ‘Ali (peace be on him):

He, with Allah’s help, invites to guidance,
And forbids aboMenation, injustice and evil,
The wasi of the Chosen Prophet and his cousin,
The killer of the champions of astraying and disbelief.

He omitted these two lines, because they were in the praise of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and kept the lines praising Abu Bakr.

Ibn al-Athir, who came after him, in the biography of al-Nu‘man, in his ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, said: "In his poetry, he mentioned the days of the Ansar and the caliphate after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)." He then registers the first lines of the poem, omitting the lines describing the dispute that happened about the caliphate, as well as the two lines in praise of ‘Ali (peace be on him) and which refer to his being the successor of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

Then, after him, came Ibn Hajar and said, in his biography of al-Nu'man: "He used to boast of his people." Thereafter, he related lines of the above poem in which he boasted of the days of the Ansar, leaving out the lines talking about the caliphate.

Thus, as time passed, the scholars (of the opponents) continued to omit from their narration what they did not like, and, consequently, we were driven farther from understanding the historical reality.

It is noted that al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar (d. 256 A.H.), by some carelessness on his part, recorded in his book, al-Muwaffaqiyyaat, the full details of the disputes that happened about the caliphate after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and the speeches and poetry related to the occasion, including the poem said by an-Nu'man Ibn 'Ajlaan with the two lines in which the merits of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) were mentioned, especially his being the successor of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Noticing them, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463 A.H.), omitted them from his book al-Istee'aab.

Later came Ibn al-Athir (d. 638 A.H.), and, noticing that it was not suitable to mention anything about the disputes on the caliphate, omitted from the poem whatever was related to the caliphate. He just stated that the poet "refers to the caliphate", and omitted the lines about Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

Afterwards, Ibn Hajar (d. 852 A.H.) omitted it all and did not say that the poem had mentioned the caliphate in any way.

So, the farther the time, the more the omission of what deemed unsuitable to the School of Caliphate.

* * *

By looking once again at what had been said in the discussion of succession, at what is coming in the discussions of the kinds of the concealments and at what was concealed about the succession, it would become obvious that the spread of the news that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had appointed 'Ali (peace be on him) as his successor, displeased the School of Caliphate, and thus, they omitted from the news and the poem the relevant parts without saying that they had omitted anything. Such concealment was more practised by the Caliphate School than the other kinds, whether in respect of the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his

sunnah or the conduct of the Companions. It would prolong the discussion to cite further examples regarding the events of the sunnah, other than the succession.

e. The Omission of a Complete Hadith from the Messenger's Sunnah without Admitting the Omission.

Ibn Hisham¹(1)1, according to al-Bakkaa'i, quoted from Ibn Is'haaq's Seerah the narratives about the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and by way of explaining his method, he stated that he: "Left out parts of what Ibn Is'haaq had recorded in his book... and things unbecoming of the hadith, and other things which, if mentioned, would offend the people..."

Among the things which were omitted by Ibn Hisham from Ibn Is'haaq's Seerah (which could offend the people) was the narrative concerning the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) inviting Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib complying with Allah's revelation: "**And warn your nearest relatives**" (Surah Shuaraa (26): Verse 214). Al-Tabari, in his Tarikh, quoting Ibn Is'haaq, that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in his meeting with Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib, said:

¹ Ibn Hisham: Abu Muhammad 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Hisham al-Himyari. Ibn Khallikan said about him: "He collected the Seerah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from the records of expeditions and the Seerah by Ibn Is'haaq, and filtered them..." Al-Suyuti, in his Bughyah al-Wu'aat, p. 315, says: "He filtered the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Seerah, which he heard from Ziyaad al-Bakka'i, Ibn T'shaaq's friend, and purged them..." By "filtered" and "purged", they meant to say that he omitted from the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Seerah, narrated by Ibn Is'haaq, what had been contrary to the interests of the ruling authorities. He died in Egypt in 213 A.H. Al-Bakkaa'i is Ziyaad Ibn 'Abd Allah Ibn Tufayl al-Bakkaa'i al-'Amiri (d. 183 A.H.).

Ibn Is'haaq is Abu 'Abd Allah or Abu Bakr Muhammad Ibn Is'haaq Ibn Yasaar, a Muttalibi in inclination.

He wrote the Seerah at the demand of the Abbaside Caliph, Abu Ja'far al-Mansur, for his son, the Caliph al-Mahdi. He died in 151, 152 or 154 A.H.

These biographies have been quoted from the Preface written by Muhammad Husain Haykal for Seerah of Ibn Hisham, printed in Cairo in 135 A.H. We referred to this edition for quoting other texts of the Seerah.

"... 'So, whoever supports me in this affair (of Prophethood), will be my brother, my successor and my caliph among you?' They all recoiled from it. 'Ali Ibn Abi Taib (peace be on him) said: 'I, O Prophet of Allah, will be your vizier in it.' He held me ('Ali) by the neck and said: 'This is my brother, my successor and my caliph among you, so, listen to him and obey him.' The narrator reports: The group stood up laughing and told Abu Talib (mockingly): 'He orders you to listen to your son and obey him.'"¹(2)1

Ibn Hisham omitted this narrative and many others which he thought may offend the supporters of caliphate.²(1)2 Ibn Is'haaq's Seerah was neglected because it contained narratives which they regarded unsuitable to be publicized, and thus, it became very rare³(2)3, and Ibn Hisham's Seerah became famous and authentic among the people.

Al-Tabari recognised the importance of this text vis-à-vis the right of Imam Ali (peace be on him) after having stated it in his Tarikh. So, he redressed in his exegesis (Tafseer) what he neglected in his Tarikh: He stated the narrative, with the same authority, in commenting on the verse: "**And warn your nearest relatives**", and then said: "*Whoever will support me in this affair (of Prophethood) will be my brother and so on and so forth...*" Then he said: "*This is my brother and so and so; hence, listen to him and obey him.*" He recorded: The group stood up laughing and told Abu Talib..." (till the end of the report).⁴(3)1

The same was done by Ibn Kathir in his Tarikh⁵ (4)4 and in his commentary on the verse.

This is what we call omitting a part of the narrative and using obscure wordings in place of the omitted.

More than that was done by Muhammad Husain Haykal, who stated the said narrative in page 104 of his book Hayat Muhammad (Life of Muhammad), first edition. His text is: "*Whoever of you will support me in this affair (of Prophethood) will be my brother, my successor and my caliph among you.*"

¹ A summary from al-Tabari's Tarikh, 1st ed., Egypt, vol. 2, pp. 216-217.

² Some of these are stated in the manuscript of our book 'The History of Hadith'

³ Parts of Ibn Is'haaq's Seerah were printed in a-Riba'at, Morocco, in 396 A.H.

⁴ Al-Tabari's Exegesis, 1st ed., 1323-1330 A.H. vol. 19, pp. 72-75.

⁵ al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah, vol. 3, p. 40

But he omitted it from the second edition of his book printed in 1354 A.H., p. 139.¹(5)1

This kind of concealment, i.e. omitting the narrative completely without referring to the omission, is frequently practised by the scholars of the School of Caliphate.

f. The Prohibition of Writing Down the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

One of the important kinds of concealing the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) by the School of Caliphate was prohibiting the recording of traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). It started during the life of the Prophet himself. Quraysh prohibited ‘Abd Allah Ibn ‘Amr Ibn al-‘Aas from writing the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and told him: "You write whatever you hear from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while he is merely a human being, talks when angry and when content." Quraysh, here, were of the Emigrants and the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). These were the very people who prevented the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from dictating his will at his last hour (and accused him of being in a state of delirium). After seizing power, they prohibited the recording of narrations of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). This ban continued till the time of ‘Umar Ibn ‘Abd al-Aziz, who lifted it and permitted the recording of the hadiths of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). We shall discuss the prohibition of writing the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) hadiths in the second volume of this book, under the discussion of the sources of the Islamic Shari‘ah according to the two Schools. As regards preventing the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) from writing his will, we had referred to it while discussing the event of Saqifah.’

Only Allah knows how many narrations of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) about the succession have been forgotten among other forgotten traditions of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), caused by not recording them in the past centuries.

¹ Look up al-Ghadir by the most learned scholar, al-Amini (r.a.), printed in Tehran, 1372 A.H, vol. 2, pp. 88-289.

To this kind of concealment can be added the following two narratives:

First: The narrative about what happened between the Ansar, Mu'awiyah and 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas, as narrated by the author of al-Aghaani, the gist of which is as follows:

Delegations of the Ansar came to meet Mu'awiyah Ibn Abi Sufyan. His gatekeeper, Sa'd Abu Durrah came out to them. They told him to get Mu'awiyah's permission for the Ansar to visit him. He went in to Mu'awiyah, while 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas was with him. "The Ansar want to see you," said he. 'Amr said: "What title is this which they use as their lineage, O Amir al-Mu'minîn? Let them return to their own descent." ["I fear it may turn repulsive", Mu'awiyah said]. He said: "It is a mere word which you utter, but if it is implemented, it will expose and debase them, or else the title will be their own affair." He told him: "Let in the offspring of 'Amr Ibn 'Aamir." The doorkeeper told them so, and there came in all the offspring of 'Amr Ibn 'Aamir, except the Ansar. Mu'awiyah disapprovingly looked at 'Amr. 'Amr said: "You went too far." He turned to the doorkeeper and told him: "Let those who are from the Aws and the Khazraj come in." He went and told them so, but none entered. He said: "Let whoever is from the Ansar come in." He did, and they came in, preceded by al-Nu'man Ibn Bashir, who, addressing Sa'd, recited:

O Sa'd, do not repeat the call as we have no title to respond to other than al-Ansar, A title chosen by Allah for our people.

What a heavy title it was on the disbelievers!

Those who were killed of you in the Badr (battle), On al-Qalib Day, are the fuel of the Fire! Then he went out angrily. But Mu'awiyah sent after him, appeased him and fulfilled his needs and the needs of those who were with him.

Mu'awiyah said to 'Amr: "We had no need for that!"¹ (1)

Here, we realize that the ruling class tried to prevent the spread of al-Ansar title which was a Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), since it praised the Yemeni Ansar who were not of the caliphate clique. The link which connects all the abovementioned instances is the endeavor of the authorities to prevent the spread of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), as a rancor against their opponents.

¹ Al-Aghaani, Sasi ed. vol.14, pp. 120-122. Beirut ed. vol. 16, pp. 13 & 17.

Second: That which he also narrated, on the authority of Ibn Shihaab, who said: "Khalid Ibn 'Abd Allah al-Qasri told me: 'Write down the lineages.' So I started with the lineage of Mudar. [I worked upon it for days, then I came to him. He asked: 'What did you do?' I said: 'I started with the lineage of Mudar] but I have not finished yet.' 'Cut it', he said, 'May Allah cut it with their roots! Write down the tradition.' 'But that would include some tradition about 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib'. I said and asked, 'Would you like me to write them down, too?' He replied, 'No, only if you saw him at the bottom of Hell!'"¹(2)2

It is noted that the ruling authority prevented every reference to 'Ali's (peace be on him) name except when it defamed him, let alone writing down the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) sunnah in which he (peace be on him and his progeny) declares Ali to be his immediate successor!

The caliphs/rulers prohibited the spread of the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). The fate of those who opposed them, narrated or wrote what contradicted their desires, through the centuries, was death or serious injury, examples of which will follow presently, Allah willing.

g. Declaring as Weak the Narratives and the Narrators of the Sunnah and Writings of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which reduced the authority of the rulers, occasionally even killing those who opposed (this attempt)

It is not possible for a researcher to count the acts of the so-called scholars in declaring as weak narrators and books that criticized the rulers, as well as the narratives, which criticized the positions of the Caliph, the governor or the Emir.

¹ Al-Aghaani, Sasi ed. vol. 19, p. 59. Beirut ed. vol. 22, p. 23. Ibn Shihaab is Muhammad Ibn Mas'ud al-Qarashi al-Zohri. His traditions were quoted by all the authors of the Sahihs, (d. 125 A.H.), Taqrib al-Tahdhib, vol. 2, p. 207. Khalid Ibn 'Abd Allah was appointed by al-Walid as governor of Makkah in 89 A.H., and by Hisham Ibn Abd al-Malik as governor of al-'Iraqayn i.e. al-Basrah and al-Kufah, in 105 A.H. He was deposed by him (Hisham) in 120 A.H. and killed by the new governor of Iraq. He was vilified in respect of his lineage and religion. Look up his biography in al-Aghaani and Ibn 'Asakir's Tahdhib al-Tarikh, vol. 5., pp. 67-80 and elsewhere

In certain occasions the mobs killed the scholars opposing this trend. To avoid prolonging the discussion of this kind of concealment, we shall be content with relating only four of its examples.

1. Disparaging whoever mentioned the succession:

The gist of Ibn Kathir's opinion is as follows:

"As regards what many ignorant and deluded Shiite and stupid narrators say that he [the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny)] had willed 'Ali to be his Khalifah, it is a lie, a slander and a fabrication, which led to the grave error of accusing the Companions of treason and collaboration after him on neglecting the fulfilment of his will..." He adds: "Regarding the stories being related by some common narrators and others in the markets and other places, concerning giving the will to 'Ali in manners and morals... are but a delirium and baseless. They are of the fabrications of some despicable ignoramuses. They cannot be trusted nor believed in, except by the stupid and desperate people."¹(1)

Thus spoke Ibn Kathir with such intense nervousness due to the impact of this difficulty. Now, let us see by whom the ignorant Shiite and the stupid narrators were misled (in the view of Ibn Kathir). They were as follows:

First: The Companions:

1. Imam 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him), the Emigrant.
2. Salman the Muhammadi (the Persian)
3. Abu Ayyub al-Ansari
4. Abu Sa'id al-Khudri al-Ansari
5. Ans Ibn Maalik al-Ansari
6. Buraydah Ibn al-Haseeb al-Aslami, the Emigrant.
7. 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas al-Qurashi.
8. Abu Dharr al-Ghifari.
9. Imam Hasan, the elder grandson of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).
10. Imam Husain, the martyr, the younger grandson of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)
11. Hassaan Ibn Thaabit al-Ansari

¹ Al-Bidaayah wa al-Nihaayah, vol. 7, p. 226.

12. Al-Fadl Ibn al-Abbas Ibn Abd al-Muttalib.
13. Al-Nu‘man Ibn ‘Ajlaan al-Ansari.
14. ‘Abd Allah Ibn Abi Sufyan al-Harth Ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib.
15. Abu al-Haytham Ibn al-Tayyihaan al-Ansari
16. Sa‘id Ibn Qays al-Ansari
17. Hujr Ibn ‘Adi al-Kindi
18. Khuzaymah Ibn Thabit (famous as) Dhu al-Shahaadatayn
19. ‘Amr Ibn al-Hamiq al-Khuzaa‘ i
20. Abd Allah Ibn Abbas.
21. Al-Mughirah Ibn al-Haarith Ibn ‘Abd al-Muttalib.
22. Al-Ash‘ath Ibn Qays al-Kindi, a staunch opponent of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).

Second: The Tabi‘in:

1. Jarir Ibn ‘Abd Allah al-Bajali.
2. Al-Najashi, the poet, Qays Ibn ‘Amr.
3. Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr (the son of the first Caliph).
4. Al-Mundhir Ibn Abi Hamidah al-Wadi‘i.
5. ‘Abd al-Rahman Ibn Ju‘ayl.
6. al-Nadr Ibn ‘Ajlaan.
7. Maalik al-Ashter.
8. ‘Umar Ibn Harithah al-Ansari.
9. ‘Abd al-Rahman Ibn Dhu‘ayb al-Aslami.

Third: The rulers of the Caliphate School and their Imams:

1. The Emir ‘Ali Ibn ‘Abd Allah, the uncle of the Abbaside Caliph, the Saffaah [the blood-shedder].
2. The Abbaside Caliph, Harun al-Rashid.
3. The Abbaside Caliph, al-Ma‘mun.
4. The Imam of the Shafeis Muhammad Ibn Idris ash-Shafei.

Fourth: The writers who recorded the hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about the succession:

1. The Imam of the Hanbalis, Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (d. 241A.H.), in his book *Manaqib-o-‘Ali* (‘Ali’s Merits).
2. Al-Daynuri (or al-Diyanuri) (d. 282 A.H.) in his *al-Akhbaar al-Tiwaal*.
3. The master of the historians, al-Tabari Muhammad Ibn Jarir (d. 310 A.H.).
4. Al-Baihaqi (who lived before 320 A.H.) in his *al-Mahaasin wa al-Masaawi*’.
5. The master of the narrators, al-Tabaraani Sulaiman Ibn Ayyub (d. 360 A.H.) in his lexicons.
6. Abu Na‘im al-Isbahaani (or Isfahaani) (d. 430 A.H.) in his *Hilyah al-Awliyya*’.
7. Al-Hafiz Ibn ‘Asaakir al-Shafei (d. 571 A.H.) in his *Tarikh-o-Madinah Demishq*.
8. Ibn al-Athir (d. 630 A.H.) in his *Tarikh*.
9. Ibn Abi al-Hadid, a Shafei (d. 656 A.H.) in his *Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah*.
10. Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi (d. 975 A.H.) in his *Kanz al-‘Ummaal*.

These are ‘the ignorant Shiite and stupid narrators’, as Ibn al-Athir calls them, and says that they were misled by the narratives about the succession, which they narrated and recorded in their books, as well as many other Companions and Tabi‘in, who were misled and used to argue by it in their poetry and speeches, and had been quoted by persons like:

1. Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar in his *al-Muwaffaqqiyyaat*.
2. Al-Tabari in his *Tarikh*.
3. Ibn al-Athir in his *Tarikh*.
4. Al-Khatib al-Baghdadi in his *Tarikh-o-Baghdad*.
5. Al-Mas‘udi, a Shafei, in his *Muruj al-Dhahab*.
6. The celebrated narrator, al-Hakem al-Nesaaboori, in his *al-Mustadrak*.
7. Al-Dhahabi in his *Tadhkirah al-Huffaz*.

and others.

Ibn Kathir concealed all of what had already been recorded. He also concealed much more than that what was available to the scholars of that time, and which were lost because of their strict secrecy and concealment from the public. He also masked them and revealed nothing of them in his historical encyclopedia. Furthermore, he concealed them by defaming the narrators, the narratives and the

books which recorded them, and ridiculed those who argued by them, so that none may believe in them if one happened to read them in any book, describing them as "ignorant and deluded Shiite and stupid narrators".

This kind of concealment was frequently practised by the so-called scholars of the School of Caliphate.

2. Contesting the Narrators of Hadiths:

Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr quoted al-Sha’bi, who said of al-Harith al-Hamdani that: "Al-Harith, who was one of the liars, told me..." Commenting on that, Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr said: "No lie had been heard from al-Harith but he (al-Sha’bi) disapproved him (al-Harith) because he loved ‘Ali excessively and consider Ali as superior to others. Thus, al-Sha’bi called him a liar and Allah knows better if he was because he (Sha’bi) regarded Abu Bakr as superior, whom he considered to be the first person to accept Islam."¹(1) End of Ibn ‘Abd al-Barr’s words.

3. Contesting the celebrated Narrators of Hadiths

In the School of Caliphate, they sometimes disparaged the vested Imams of the hadiths who related hadiths contrary to their inclinations. This happened to al-Haakem al-Shafei, as related by al-Dhahabi in his biography.²(2)2

Hereunder is it’s summary:

The great Hafiz, the Imam of the Narrators, Abu ‘Abd Allah, Muhammad Ibn ‘Abd Allah Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hamdawayh al-Naysaburi, known as Ibn al-Bay‘, born in 312 A.H. and died in 405 A.H. He searched for □ hadiths as a young boy, travelled to Iraq, went to the Hajj, journeyed through Khurasan and "behind the river". He listened to some two thousand Shaykhs. His writings amounted to some five hundred books, among them is *Fadha’il al-Shafi’i*. It was said that the celebrated narrators of hadiths remembered his days, and that the Imams of his time preferred him to themselves, observed the position of his virtues and recognized his assured respect.

¹ Jaami’ Bayan il-’Ilm, Chapter on "The ‘Ulema Judging One Another", vol. 2, p. 189

² Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, pp. 1039-1045.

Al-Dhahabi said: "Al-Haakem, asked about '*the hadith of the bird*', said: 'It is incorrect, as otherwise there could be none more meritorious than 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).'"

He also said: "Then al-Haakem changed his mind and recorded '*The hadith of the bird*' in his al-Mustadrak."

Al-Dhahabi, quoting the opinion of the scholars about al-Mustadrak, said: "It contained hadiths which he claimed to be according to the conditions of al-Bukhari and Muslim, including '*the hadith of the bird*' and '*Whomever I am his master, 'Ali is his master too*'. He was denied by men of hadiths and they did not pay attention to what he said."

Al-Dhahabi said: "As regards '*the hadith of the bird*', it is narrated through many channels, which I composed in a book. On the whole, the collection necessitates that the said hadith must have an origin. As to the hadith: '*Whomever I am his master, 'Ali is his master too*' it comes also from authentic channels. I also recorded it in a special book."

The author says:

Regarding the hadith: " *Whomever I am his master, 'Ali is his master too...*", we will discuss it among the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) direct words in favour of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), Allah willing.

As to '*the hadith of the bird*', according to the Companion Anas (Ibn Malik) and other Companions, it is as follows: "A grilled bird was offered to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). He invoked Allah to send to him the one most loved by Him of His creatures (i.e. after the Prophet himself) to eat with him. At this juncture, 'Ali came and ate with him." Now, as this hadith explicitly states that the most meritorious man, after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), was 'Ali (peace be on him), they denied al-Haakem and others to relate this hadith. We did not record it in the chapter of the texts, because we do not intend to relate the merits of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) much as we intend to relate the plain texts about the right to rule of the progeny of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

Al-Dhahabi praised al-Haakem, the Shafi'i, as being well-versed in the science of narrations according to the School of Caliphate. But as he related, in his al-Mustadrak, hadiths in favour of 'Ali (peace be on him) and in defaming

Mu'awiyah, they refuted him and quoted al-Dhahabi's words against him: "He was trusted in hadiths, (but) a wretched Rafidi." and : "He showed to be a Sunni in considering Abu Bakr and others to Ali and in the caliphate, but was deviated from Mu'awiyah and his family (meaning Yazid), demonstrating it without excuse."

Thereafter, commenting on this, al-Dhahabi said:

"As regarding his deviation from the opponents of 'Ali, it is obvious. But concerning the Shaykhayn [Abu Bakr and 'Umar], he looked at them with esteem and respected them. So, he is a Shiite, not a Rafidi. I wish he did not write his al-Mustadrak, as he debased his virtues by his bad procedure." End of al-Dhahabi's words.

The Imam of Narators in the Caliphate School has an example in the Imam of the Shafi'i sect, Muhammad Ibn Idris (d. 204 A.H.), who was also accused of being a Rafidi, according to al-Baihaqi's narrative. The Shafi'i, in this respect, recited:

They said: "You became a rafidi." I said: "No, That is not my religion, nor is it my belief,

But I befriended, undoubtedly,

The best Imam and the best guide.

If loving the successor (Ali) is to be a rafidi¹ (1)I

Then I am the foremost rafidi among the people!

He also said:

If loving the offspring of Muhammad is rafid

Then let the Thaqalayn testify that I am a rafidi

It seems, however, that he was forced to sometimes resort to concealment, as he once said:

Still you are to be concealed, as, like

A dumb, I cannot answer the questioners. I conceal my love, my clear love,

So that you may be safe from the slanders, and I, too.²(2)2

¹ Al-Shafei's collection of poems, Beirut, 1403 A.H. Al-Nasaa'ih al-Kaafiyah le man Yatawallaa Mu'awiyah by Muhammad Ibn Yahya al-'Alawi (d. 1350 A.H.). Ibn Hajar, in al-Sawa'iq al-Muhriqah, p. 131, changed "*al-was'*" to "*al-wall'*"- a change which can also be regarded among the kinds of the concealment practised by the School of Caliphate

² This is the gist of what is stated by al-Haythami (d. 974 A.H.) in his al-Sawaa'iq, 2nd ed., Egypt, 1375 A.H., p.131, together with al-Baihaqi's words and all details,

But his concealment was to no avail, as he was, nevertheless, accused of being a Rafidi, similar to the scholars who do not conceal their opinions of what is in the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Companions. Most of the Shafi'i scholars of the Caliphate School do not conceal the hadiths unlike the scholars of the other sects of that School and thus they are accused of being Rafidis * * *

In this chapter, we noticed diverse kinds of denial, from degrading the narrators up to accusing them of Shiism or being Rafidis, resulting in downgrading the reverence of the narrative. Denial is an easy method available to the denier in his argument, in which case it would be difficult to prove the truth. The denier can easily reject a narrative to be weak, false or invalid, while the truthful will have to offer successive proofs. Of course, this is a moral killing of the narrators. Sometimes, it would lead to real (physical) murder if the narrator said something contrary to the interest of the Caliphate School, Hereunder, we relate an example of what happened to an author of a Sahih belonging to the Caliphate School:

4. Al-Nesaa'i, one of the authors of a Sahih, and the Story of his Lynching

We quote the story of his murder from two historians: Al-Dhahabi and Ibn Khallekaan. We relate the gist of what they said in his biography:¹(1)1 "Al-Hafiz [= the one who knows the Qur'an by heart], the Imam, Shaykh al-Islam, Abu 'Abd al-Rahman Ahmad Ibn Shu'ayb al-Nesaa'i, was the Imam of his contemporaries in narrating the hadiths. He wrote the Sunan al-Nesaa'i. He was unique in knowledge and high authorization. He settled in Egypt. He would fast on alternative days and strived in worship at nights. He accompanied the ruler of Egypt in his war, yet avoided his company and eating much. Late in his years, he travelled for Hajj. In Damascus, he wrote a book al-Khasa'is about the virtues of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (may Allah be pleased with him) and Ahl al-Bait (peace be upon them). Most of his narratives in this book were taken from Ahmad Ibn Hanbal. But they denied this fact. On this he says: 'I entered Damascus where a

with the line "*If loving...*" and two other lines, which were also stated by Ibn al-Sabbaagh al-Maaliki al-Makki (d. 855 A.H.) in his book al-Fusul al-Muhimmah, according to the author of al-Kunaa wa al-Alqaab, in the biography of al-Shafi'i.

¹ Tadhkerah al-Huffaaz, p. 698; Wafayaat al-A'yaan of Ibn Khallekaan, vol.1, p. 59.

lot of people were diverted against 'Ali. So, I wrote al-Khasa'is, hoping that Allah would guide them by the book.' They asked: 'Will you write about Mu'awiyah's virtues?', he replied: 'What shall I write, the hadith of: O Allah! Do not let his stomach be satiated?' The questioner kept silent. Once again asked about Mu'awiyah and what has come of his virtues, he said: 'Is he not satisfied with being equal (to Ali) that he wants to be preferred?' They kept pushing him in his testicles, pounded him out of the mosque and carried him to al-Ramlah."

Al-Haafiz Abu Na'im said: "He died because of that pounding while he was beign transported."

A-Daarqutni said: "He was tested in Damascus and attained martyrdom, in the year 303 A.H."

* * *

Al-Nesaa'i was not the only one to be tortured and killed for the sake of spreading the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Another one was the Companion, Abu Dharr whose story will be related later within the discussions of concealing the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and the murder of many scholars, the biography of some of them are related by the 'Allamah al-Amini, in his book Shuhadaa' al-Fadhilah [The Martyrs of Virtue].

Such being the case, who could be so daring as to openly narrate the texts received from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) relating the virtues of his progeny, let alone the texts concerning their right to rule. Had not Ibn Kathir the right - since he had to appease those who demanded the scholars to tell the virtues of Mu'awiyah - to interpret what defamed Mu'awiyah as a virtue for him in this world and in the Hereafter!?

How could the Tradition of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) be easily propagated under such intimidating and hostile conditions?!

* * *

We have related the fates of some of those who contradicted the Caliphate School, by narrating such hadiths of the Traditions of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) which did not serve the interest of the Caliphs. We shall now relate

the fate of the books which included such hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) that were contrary to the policy of that School.

h. The Burning of Libraries and Books

Another kind of concealment practised by the Caliphate School was the burning of the books which contained parts of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be upon and his progeny) traditions and hadiths which that School did not like to be propagated. This trend was started by 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, as will be related when we come to the discussions of the Caliphate School about the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah.

Ibn Sa'd, in his *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, says: "The hadiths became much in the days of 'Umar. He asked the people to bring them to him. When they did, he ordered them to be burnt."

Al-Zubair Ibn Bakkaar narrates¹(1): "Sulaiman Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, a crown prince, passed through Madinah on his way to the Hajj. There, he asked Aban Ibn 'Uthman to write down the Tradition of the Prophet (peace be upon and his progeny) and his battle. Aban told him: 'I have them. I had received them, corrected, from someone whom I trust.' He ordered ten persons to copy them. They wrote them on parchment and sent them to him. When he looked in them he found that the two allegiances of the Ansar in al-'Aqabah, and the Ansar in the Battle of Badr, were mentioned. Sulaiman said: 'I did not think those people to be of such virtues. It is either my folk (meaning the Umayyad Caliphs) had belittled them or they were not as shown here.' Aban Ibn 'Uthman said: 'O Emir! What they did to the wronged martyr (meaning the Caliph 'Uthman) of deserting him, should not prevent us from telling the truth. They were as we had described in our book.' Sulaiman said: 'What need is there for me to copy that and send it to Amirul Mu'minin (his father, 'Abd al-Malik), who may disapprove of it?' Thus, he ordered the book to be burnt. Returning home, he told his father about what had happened. 'Abd al-Malik said: 'What would you do with a book in which no virtue of us is mentioned, while it informs the people of Syria about things which we do not want them to know.' 'That is why I ordered what had been copied to be

¹ Al-Muwaffaqayyat, pp. 332-333.

burnt, until I ask the advice of Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).' He (the king) approved of what he (the crown prince) did."

* * *

Thus, the Muslim rulers and their crown princes ordered the books of the Traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to be burnt so that the people must not know what was contrary to the interests of the rulers. They did more than that when they burnt complete libraries containing the books of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which did not go with their interests, as will be related hereunder:

The Burning of an Islamic Library in Baghdad

In the biography of Saabur Ibn Ardashir, with reference to the events of the year 416 A.H., Ibn Kathir writes:

"He was benevolent, sound thinking and nothing could keep him from performing the prayers on hearing the call for prayers (*adhaan*). He established a 'Knowledge House' in 381 A. H. as a public endowment, to which he brought numerous books and assigned a large yield as endowment to cover its expenditure. It lasted for seventy years, when it was burnt down at the hands of Tughrul in 450 A.H. It was situated in Bayn al-Surayn locality.

Al-Hamawi, describing Bayn al-Surayn in his *Mu'jam al-Buldaan*, says: "Bayn al-Surayn is the name of a large quarter of Karkh [Baghdad], where there was a library endowed by Bahaa' al-Dawlah's minister. There was no library in the world with better books, as all of them were in the hand writings of the authorized Imams (peace be on them) and their original manuscripts (handwritten). But they were among those that were burnt down, on the arrival of Tughrul Bek, the first of the Seljuks, in Baghdad."

Ibn Kathir, in his biography of Shaykh Abu Ja'far al-Tusi, in the events of the year 460 A.H., also wrote: "His house in al-Karkh and his books were burnt down in 448 A.H."

Worst than that befell the libraries of the Fatimid Caliphs in Egypt, as al-Miqrizi¹(1) (d. 848 A.H.) wrote about the libraries which were in the castles of the Fatimids. Concerning one of these libraries he writes:

¹ Khutat al-Miqrizi, vol. 2, pp. 254-255.

"It was one of the world's wonders, as it is said that in all the Islamic countries there was no greater library than that which was in the castle in Cairo. It is also said that it contained one million and six-hundred thousand books'." Earlier he had said: "Their leather-covers were taken by their slaves and maids in order to make their footwear, and their papers were burnt thinking that they were from the Palace of the Sultan, and they must contain the talks of the Orientals which were contrary to their factions. That was besides what had been drowned, damaged or carried away to other countries. that which had not been burnt was under heaps of dust such that they became the like of hills whose relics are still there in regions called 'the hills of the books.'"

* * *

The library of Karkh was established by a minister of the Buwayids' who was a follower of the Ahl al-Bait School. When the Seljuks, the followers of the Caliphate School, came to power, they burnt that library, as well as the library of al-Shaykh al-Tusi in Karkh. Worse than that was done to the libraries of the Fatimid Caliphs in Egypt when Salaah al-Din (al-Ayyubi) conquered it.

I wonder how much of the traditions of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had been '*concealed*' because of burning books and libraries not belonging to the followers of the School of Caliphate? How many correct and successive hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning his progeny, including his hadiths about the succession (*wasiyyah*), had been lost because of this kind of concealment? Allah alone knows the answer! Still more important than what has already been said of the kinds of concealments of the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was the perverting of his tradition and the conduct of the Companions, as shall be explained in the following two examples:

i. The Omission or Distortion of Parts of Statements concerning the Companions' conducts:

Among the kinds of concealments in the practice of the Caliphate School was the omission or distortion of statements, as Ibn Kathir did in his *Tarikh* to a sermon delivered by Imam Husain (peace be on him) This sermon was stated in al-Tabari's *Tarikh* and in Ibn al-Athir's *Tarikh*, in its actual text, as follows:

*"Tell my lineage and see who I am, then turn to yourselves and blame yourselves: Is it permissible for you to kill me and violate my sanctity? Am I not the grandson of your Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), the son of his successor, his cousin, the first believer in Allah and in what was brought by His Messenger from his Lord? Is not Hamzah, the Chief of the Martyrs, my father's uncle? Is not Ja'far the Flying, the one endowed with two wings, my uncle?..."*¹(1)1

Ibn Kathir, in his *Tarikh*, changed this and said that the Imam Husain (peace be on him) had said: *"Turn to yourselves and question yourselves: is it proper for you to fight someone like me, the grandson of your Prophet, as there is no grandson of a prophet on the earth except me, and 'Ali is my father and Ja'far, with the two wings, is my uncle and Hamzah, the Master of the Martyrs, is my father's uncle?"*²(2)2

As you see, Ibn Kathir omitted 'his successor (*wasi*)' from Imam's (peace be on him) speech because to mention it would - as we had said - draw the attention of the public to the right of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and the two grandsons of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to the rule - a fact which would offend the authority of the time if it was made known. He, furthermore, distorted the speech. This was another kind of concealment practised by the Khulafa School. A similar distortion can be seen in the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), to which we shall presently refer while explaining the tenth kind of concealments:

j. Replacement of Original Narratives by Fabricated Ones

Among the concealments practised by the School of Caliphate was the replacement of the true and original hadiths with fabricated ones and spreading them. Here is an example:

¹ Al-Tabari's *Tarikh*, Eu. ed., vol. 2, p. 329; Ibn al-Athir's *Tarikh*, Eu. ed. vol. 4, p. 52 (1st Egyptian ed., vol. 4, p. 25)

² Ibn Kathir, vol. 7, p. 179

Al-Tabari, narrating the story of Abu Dharr in his Tarikh, says: "And in this year, I mean the year thirty of Hijri, there happened that which was said about Abu Dharr and Mu'awiyah, and sending him from Syria to Madinah. The reasons were said to be many, which I dislike to relate many of them. As to those who had excused Mu'awiyah for what he did, they mentioned a story written to me by al-Sariy that Shu'ayb was informed by Saif.." etc. Followed by Ibn al-Athir, with respect to the events of the year 30 A.H. He said: "And in this year there happened what was said about Abu Dharr and sending him by Mu'awiyah from Syria to Madinah. Many reasons were said to have caused that, including being abused by Mu'awiyah and threatened to be killed, then sending him to al-Madinah from Syria, without a bedding on his mount, and then expelling him from Madinah in such a disgraceful way which is improper to retell..."

Who was this Saif whose story about Abu Dharr was quoted by al-Tabari and used as an excuse for Mu'awiyah? What was his narration?

He was Saif Ibn 'Umar al-Tamim (d. 170 A.H.). He related narratives about the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), al-Saqifah, Abu Bakr's allegiance, al-Riddah Battles, the conquests and the Battle of Jamal.

Introducing him, the scholar said: "He is weak, his narratives are negligible, worthless, as he was a liar, used to fabricate hadiths and is accused of atheism."¹(1)

The Type of His Information and Narratives

In his narratives, he created more than one hundred and fifty fabricated Companions for the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny). Detailed studies about ninety-three of them have been given in our book **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**, vols. 1 & 2. Twenty nine of them Saif said to be of his tribe, Tamim, and he ascribed to them many false news about the conquests, many miracles and much of poetry and hadiths, despite the fact that Allah, Glorified and most High, had neither created such persons nor any of their news.

¹ . These are parts of what had been said about him by scholars like: Yahya Ibn Mu'in (d. 233 A.H.), Abu Dawud (d.275 A.H.), al-Nesaa'i, the author of a Sahih (d. 303 A.H.), Ibn Abi Haatim al-Razi (d. 327 A.H.), Ibn Hayyaan (d. 354 A.H.) and al-Haakem (d. 405 A.H.). For details of their views on Saif and the sources of his biography, refer to our book **Abdullah Ibn Saba'** vol. 1.

It was Saif who created them all, as he had created tens of other narrators whom he used to quote. We had published in the two volumes of our book '**Abdullah Ibn Saba**' and **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**, studies about some seventy of these narrators. We tried, as much as we could to trace the sources of Saif's narratives. We noted that one of them – whom he named as Muhammad Ibn Sawaad Ibn Nuwayrah – had 216 narrations, while from others he quoted very few narratives or merely a lone narration.

Furthermore, he created poets for the Arabs, leaders for the Persians and Romans, and lands in the Islamic and other countries. He changed the years of historical events, as well as names of the persons in the Islamic history. He strived to spread his fabricated narrations among the Muslims. He also invented wars and conquests which never happened and referred to hundreds of thousands of those whom the Muslims had supposedly killed in these imaginary battles. In his fabrications and inventions, he tried to stress that Islam spread by the sword. The falsity of these allegations had been proved in the beginning of our book '**Abdullah Ibn Saba**'.

Saif's fabrications polluted more than seventy reference books¹(1) of hadiths, history, literature and other sources of the Islamic studies in the School of Caliphate, covering the period from the time of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till Mu'awiyah's rule. The one who quoted from him extensively was al-Tabari in his al-Tarikh. He particularly quoted from him the following²(2):

- a. The army's traversing on the sea-waters from the shore to Daarain, a distance covered by the ships in a day and a night, as if moving on soft sand, with a layer of water just touching the camels' feet.
- b. The talking of the cows to Aasim Ibn 'Amr at-Tamîmi, the fictitious Companion, in eloquent Arabic, in the battle of al-Qadisiyyah; and when Bukair

¹ The titles of most of these reference books are stated in the first volume of our book "A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions".

² Look up the details about the conquests of Darîn, al-Qadisiyyah, as-Suways and Bahrsîr, and the comparative study of Saif's hadiths with the true ones, in the book One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions, Vol. 1, together with the biographies of ' Afif Ibn al-Mundhir, 'Asim Ibn 'Amr and al-Aswad Ibn Qutbah, the Companions invented by Saif Ibn 'Umar at-Tamimi from among his own tribe.

- told his horse, Atlaal, to cross a stream: "Jump, O Atlaal!" and the horse replied, explicitly: "I'll jump, (I swear) by Surah al-Baqarah!" Thus, it swore and jumped!
- c. The Jinn reciting poetry on the occasion of the conquest of Al-Qadisiyyah, and applauding the firm standing of the Tamîm tribe during the battle!
 - d. The conquest of al-Soos with Dajjal kicking its door and yelling: "Open, O hyena!"
 - e. The talking of the angels through the tongue of al-Aswad Ibn Qutbah at-Tamîmi during the conquest of Behrsîr (near Baghdad).

Through al-Tabari's *Tarîkh*, Saif's lies spread into the tomes of Muslim history which have been written ever since his time till our present days, as shall be referred to presently.

The Reason Behind the Spread of Saif's narrations from Al-Tabari's *Tarîkh* into the Books of History

In the Preface of his *al-Tarîkh al-Kaamil*, Ibn al-Athir says:

"I have collected in this book of mine what had not been collected in a single book. I began with *al-Tarîkh al-Kabir* (actually it was *Tarikh al-Umam wa al-Muluk*), composed by Imam Abu Ja'far al-Tabari, because it is the one trusted by all, and in case of dispute, it is relied upon as a decider...Having finished with it, I took another of the well-known histories, read it and added to it what it lacked, from al-Tabari's... except about what had happened among the Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as I added nothing to what Abu Ja'far had narrated, save if an explanation, or an addition of a name of a person, was needed, or such narratives which would defame none. However, I did not copy except from the said histories and the famous books, whose authors are known to be truthful in what they had narrated and to be correct in what they wrote down..."¹(1)

Having finished relating the news about the Companions in al-Riddah events, conquests and riots, Ibn Kathir said:

"That was the summary of what had been stated by Ibn Jarir al-Tabari (may Allah have mercy upon him), quoting the well-versed experts in this respect, (including)

¹ Ibn al-Athir's *Tarîkh*, Egypt ed., 1348 A.H., vol. 1, p. 5.

none of what had been related by the sectarians of the Shiite and others, of the invented hadiths against the Companions, and of the fabricated narratives which they relate as they are."¹(2)2

Ibn Khaldun said:

"This is the last talk about the Islamic caliphate and the apostasies, conquests and wars which took place, and then the congruence and aggregation that happened, of which I related their important once and collections, summarized from the books of Muhammad Ibn Jarir al-Tabari and his al-Tarikh al-Kabir, since it is the most trusted (book) we have ever seen in this field, and the farthest from defaming and suspecting the notables of the 'Ummah, and the good and equitable Companions and Tabi'in."²(3)3

A Contemplating Look into the Reason for the Most Celebrated Scholars to Choose Saif's Hadiths about Early Islam

Al-Tabari, in relating for example, about Abu Dharr, the poverty-stricken Companion, and Mu'awiyah, the Emir, says:

I dislike to relate many of them (the reasons). As to those who excused Mu'awiyah for what he did, they mention a story... narrated by Saif."

Ibn al-Athir said:

"... including being abused by Mu'awiya and threatened to be killed, then sending him to Madinah from Syria on a camel without a bedding, and then expelling him from Madinah in such a disgraceful way that is improper to relate..." Then he stated Saif's story and described them also as excusers.

The two great scholars left the narratives other than Saif's for not being dependable, but for not having in them the required excuse for the ruling authority, which they found it in those who excused Mu'awiyah, the Emir, and 'Uthman, the Caliph viz. Saif, the atheist, and the chain of his invented narrators. Hence, al-Tabari stuffed his al-Tarikh al-Kabir with Saif's narrations. For the same reason, Ibn al-Athir quoted Saif's hadith from al-Tabari. Ibn Kathir did the

¹ Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 246.

² Ib Khaldun's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 457.

same, and, at the end of his statement on the Battle of al-Jamal, of the events of the year 36 A.H., quoting Saif's narratives about the events offer the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till the Battle of al-Jamal, says:

"That was the summary of what had been stated by Ibn Jarir al-Tabari (may Allah have mercy upon him), quoting the well-versed experts in this respect...". By the "well-versed experts" he meant those from whom Ibn Jarir al-Tabari took his narratives viz. Saif, the atheist, and his invented narrators.

The most erudite, Ibn Khaldun, was more unambiguous in telling why they had chosen Saif's hadiths spread across al-Tabari's Tarikh, concerning the caliphate, i.e. giving the allegiance to the caliphs, al-Riddah [i.e. the wars against the apostates], the conquests and the aggregation i.e. on giving the Allegiance to Mu'awiyah, He said:

"... since it is the most trusted (book) we have seen in this regard, and the best one far from defaming and suspecting the notables of the 'ummah..."

So, Saif's hadiths in al-Tabari's Tarikh, about those events, were more trusted by them because they were "far from defaming and suspecting the notables of the ummah, i.e. the Companions and the Tabi'in", who were the caliphs, their agents and relatives.

Here is another evidence that it was regarded disgraceful to state something which might incur criticism upon these notables. It is evidenced in the narrative about Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqaas' attempt to ward the punishment off Abu Mihjan, and to find an excuse for the Emir, Sa'd:

Abu Mihjan al-Thaqafi – as stated in his biography in al-Isti'ab, 'Usud al-Ghaabah and al-Isaabah – was addicted to wine. He had been punished by the Caliph 'Umar seven times for the same reason, and banished from Madinah. He joined Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqaas in al-Qadisiyyah war, where he chained him for drinking wine, but Sa'd's wife released him, He had remarkable stands in the war, for which reason Sa'd cancelled punishing him, and said: "By Allah, we will never whip you for (drinking) wine," to which Abu Mihjan replied: "Then I will never drink it."

This was the story of Sa'd's warding off punishment from Abu Mihjan. Regarding this, Ibn Haajar, in Abu Mihjan's biography in his book *al-Isaabah*, quoting from Ibn Fathun's (d. 519 A.H.) book *Annotation on al-Isti'ab* by Abu 'Umar Ibn Abd al-Barr, said:

"Ibn Fathun blamed Abu 'Umar for what he had narrated of Abu Mihjan's story that he indulged in drinking wine..." Then he said: "Ibn Fathun denounced the narration that Sa'd had dropped the punishment against him, and said: 'This cannot be expected from Sa'd.' Then he added: 'But it had a good point', but he did not say what it was. It was as if, by saying that he would not whip him for (drinking) wine, he intended a condition in himself: i.e. if it was proved that he drank it, but Allah helped him to repent, and he did not return to it..."¹(1)

* * *

In this way the followers of the School of Caliphate searched for what might have removed criticism of the notables: the Caliphs, the rulers and their relatives, i.e. the former caliphs, till Mu'awiyah, Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah, Marwan Ibn al-Hakam and their agents whom they regarded as the notables, or the notable Companions and Tabi'in. So, since Saif, the atheist, knew which side of the bread is buttered, he concocted narrations in compliance with the desires of all classes of the Caliphate School along the ages. He coated his narrations with the point of defending the caliphs and their relatives, to repel criticism from them and to spread their merits.

Under this thick cover, he could conceal his objective of distorting Islam, hurting it, spreading superstitions and debasing Islamic beliefs. He could also broadcast among the people that Islam had spread by "the edge of the sword."

Saif, as an atheist, attained all his objectives through his fabrications, as shown below:

As examples of his spreading superstitions and defaming Islamic beliefs, we mention his news about al-Aswad al-'Ansi who claimed Prophethood, and the news about a secret conversation between Khusro and the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the presence of Allah.

The Story of al-'Ansi in Saif's Narratives

¹ *Al-Isaabah*, vol. 4, pp. 173-175

Al-Tabari quoted from Saif several narratives about the story of al-Aswad al-'Ansi¹, the gist of which we relate hereunder:

When al-Aswad claimed Prophethood, he conquered Yemen, killed its king, Shahr Ibn Badhan, married his wife, appointed Qays Ibn 'Abd Yaghuth as commander of the army and put Fayruz and Dadhawayh in charge of the "sons" – the sons of the Persians in Yemen –, the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) wrote to them to fight al-Aswad either in direct engagement or to assassinate him. They agreed to assassinate him. His Satan informed him about this. He sent for Qays and said to him: "O Qays! What does the angel say?" "What does he say?" inquired Qays. "He says:", replied al-Aswad, 'You turned to Qays and were generous to him and he became very close to you and like you in might, he tended as your enemy tends, coveting your kingdom, and intending treason.' He says: 'O Aswad! O Aswad! What a shame! What a shame! Pick off his peak [head], and take from Qays his upper part, or else he will rob you or will take your peak.'" Qays swore and lied and said: "By Dhu al-Khimar!²(2)2 You are greater and more glorious in my eyes to think of a plot against you!" Al-Aswad said: "How rude you are! Do you accuse the angel of being a liar? But I know now that you regret what he had said against you." That is, what his Satan, whom he called the angel, had accused him of.

Saif adds: "Qays went out and informed his group of what had happened between him and al-Aswad. They plotted to carry out what they had agreed upon concerning killing him. Al-Aswad summoned Qays once again and said to him: 'Did not I tell you the truth while you lied to me? He says (meaning his Satan whom he called the angel): 'What a shame! What a shame! If you do not cut from Qays his hand, he will cut off your upper part.' Qays said: 'It is not right that I should kill you, while you are the Messenger of Allah. So, issue your order against me as you like. I have no fear and I would not be frightened! Kill me! As the (final) death is easier to me than the many deaths which I am threatened with every day.'"

¹ Related to 'Anas Ibn Midhhij, a family related to Zayd Ibn Kahlan Ibn Saba'. Look up their biography in Ibn Hazm's *Ansaab al-Arab* p. 381.

² The epithet of al-Aswad was Dhu al-Khimaar [the one with the veil] or Dhu al-Hinaar [the one with the ass].

Saif goes on: "He pitied him and let him go! Thereafter, al-Aswad ordered a hundred sacrifices of cows and camels to be brought. He drew a line and they were stationed behind it. He went and slaughtered them all, without tying them, and yet none of them crossed the line. Then he let them roam until they fell dead.'" Quoting the narrator, Saif adds: "I have never seen anything more brutal more horrifying than that!"

Saif continues: "They conspired with his wife to assassinate him by night. When they entered upon him, Fayruz went near him, but his Satan warned him about Fayruz and woke him up. As he was late in getting up, the Satan talked through his tongue, while he was still fast asleep, but looking at Fayruz, he said: 'What is there between us?' So, Fayruz knocked his neck and killed him:"

He said: "Then the others came in to cut off his head. His Satan moved him violently such that they could not control him. So, two of them sat on his back and the woman seized his hair. He started roaring, but the other cut off his head, at which he moaned such as had never been heard from any bull before. The guards hurried to the door, asking: 'What was that?' The woman replied: "The Prophet is receiving revelation.' Then he died..." etc. as it goes.

* * *

This narrative was quoted from Saif by al-Tabari and al-Dhahabi, in their *Tarîkhs*, then it was quoted from al-Tabari by Ibn al-Athir, Ibn Kathir and Ibn Khaldun, except that the last mention has brought it in brief.

A Study of the Narrative about al-Aswad al-'Ansi

A. The narrators of the narrative:

Saif narrated this episode in eleven narrations, quoting four narrators of his own invention. They are:

1. Sahl Ibn Yusuf al-Khazraji al-Sulami.
2. 'Ubayd Ibn Sakhr al-Khazraji al-Sulami.
3. Al-Mustanîr Ibn Yazid al-Nakha'i.
4. 'Urwa Ibn Ghuzayyah al-Duthaini.

These were imagined by Saif, the atheist. Allah did not create these narrators; they were the creations of Saif Ibn 'Umar for his narratives.

B. A Study of the text of the narrative:

The concocted narratives of Saif concerning al-Aswad al-'Ansi have been compared with the true ones, and we have explained his fabrication of narratives and narrators, in our book vis-à-vis this narration in the second volume of our book 'Abdullah Ibn Saba'.

Khusru's Secret Conversation with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Saif narrated the story of Yazdigerd's journey to Khurasan after the Jaloolaa' event. He said: "Yazdigerd Ibn Shahriyar Ibn Khusru, the Emperor of Persia, set off, after the defeat of the people of Jaloola', for Rayy. He used to sleep inside his litter on his moving camel in a non-stop journey. They reached a shallow river while he was asleep in his litter. They woke him up so that he may be aware during the camel's wading the river. But he scolded them and said: "What a bad thing you did! Had you left me alone I could have known the duration of this 'ummah. I saw (in my sleep) that I and Muhammad had confidential talks in the presence of Allah, Who said to him: "Conquer them for a hundred years." "Give me more," said he. "A hundred and ten", said He. "more," said he, "A hundred and twenty," said He. "for you..." said he, but you woke me up. Had you left me alone I could have known the duration of this ummah..."¹(1)

A Study of the Aforementioned Narrative

A. The Narrators of the Narrative:

Saif narrated this fanciful story about the confidential conversation with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the presence of Allah, quoting his following concocted narrators:

1. Muhammad, whom he imagined to be Muhammad Ibn Abdillah Ibn Sawaad Ibn Nuwayrah.
2. Al-Muhallab, whom he took to be Ibn 'Uqbah al-Asadi.

¹ For the sources refer to the first of the preliminary discussions of the first volume of A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions

3. 'Amr, one of two invented persons by Saif: One 'Amr Ibn Rayyan, and the other: 'Amr Ibn Rufail. For details, refer to the first volumes of '**Abdullah Ibn Saba**' and '**A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**.'

B. The Text of the Narrative:

The text of this narrative has been discussed in the first volume of **A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**, where we proved its falsity. So, repetition over here is futile.

What was Saif's aim in fabricating these two narratives?

Saif claimed that al-Aswad, who declared himself a Prophet, used to tell Qays about his intentions every time, saying: "The angel said so and so!" The angel who informed was his Satan! Al-Aswad, the pseudo-Prophet, demonstrated an astonishing miracle by drawing a line beyond which he stationed a hundred heads of cows and camels, then he slew them all without tying them, and left them to themselves, but none of them crossed the line, and they roamed about till they dropped dead. The narrator expressed his astonishment at that! In the other narrative he said: "Khusru saw in his dream that he met Allah and the Messenger in a tripartite conference..."

Does not the first legend denote that the Prophet of the Muslims had claimed Prophethood, and the one he called "the angel" was telling him about the unseen, and performing miracles?

Al-Aswad al-'Ansi also claimed Prophethood, and the one he called "the angel" told him the unseen and he too performed miracles. This atheist spread that legend in order to cast doubts in the minds of the Muslims.

By the second legend, the atheist intended to mock at Allah and His Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) of the Muslims by gathering them in a meeting with their enemy, Yazdigerd, the Emperor of Persia, in a dream!

Unfortunately, renowned scholars quoted Saif's superstitious myths and filled their books of the Islamic history with such fabrications to such an extent that these legends became a part of the sources for Islamic studies. They also spread in the books of the Islamic history the allegation of Saif, the atheist, that Islam could not spread except by the edge of the sword, as follows:

His Allegation that Islam spread by the Sword and Shedding Blood

By the narratives invented by Saif about the Riddah wars and the conquests, he circulated that Islam spread in the world by the sword and through blood-shed. Concerning the Riddha wars, he invented the following pack of lies and exaggerations:

Saif's Exaggerations and lies about ar-Riddah wars

By way of preparing for what he wanted to say of exaggerations about the Riddah wars, Saif began relating short narratives which at-Tabari quoted in his report about the Riddah wars. Saif said: "The earth disbelieved and burnt a blaze, and the Arabs, every tribe of them, their upper and lower classes, turned away from the religion, except (the tribes of) Quraysh and Thaqif." Then he reported about apostasy in (the tribe of) Ghatafan, and Hawazin's refusal to pay the poor-rate, the masses of Tayy and Asad (tribes) gathering around Tulayhah and the apostasy of the upper class of Banu Salīm, "and similarly other people everywhere... The letters of the Prophet's leaders from every wherehere came in telling about the revolt of the tribes, their upper and lower classes."

This information was quoted by Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Khaldun in their Tarīkhs, as well as Ibn Kathir who reported its contents, saying, in his Tarīkh:¹(1)1

"The Arabs turned away from the religion at the death of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), except the people of the two mosques, Makkah and Madinah." Then, in his inventions about the Riddah wars, Saif stressed that the apostates were returned to Islam by the edge of the sword, according to the allegation of this atheist in his narratives. Among such narratives is what he called the war of al-Akhaabith, as follows:

The Apostasy of the people of 'Ak and of the Ash'arayn, and the Story of Tahir, the foster-son of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Saif's Narratives

Saif said: "The first to turn away from Islam in Tihamah, on hearing the news of the Messenger's demise, were the people of 'Ak and al-Ash'arayn, who gathered

¹ Al-Bidayatu wa al-Nehayah, vol. 6, p. 312.

at al-A‘laab (the road to the coast). Tahir wrote about that to Abu Bakr, and set off to them with Masruq al-‘Akki until they met and there was a fight in which they were defeated by Allah and were killed such that the roads stank with the smell of their corpses. Their killing was a great victory.

Abu Bakr wrote back to Tahir (befor receiving his news about the victory): "I received your letter informing me about your setting off with Masruq and his people to al-Akhaabith (the malignant) at the A‘laab. You did right. So, be quick in striking them and do not be lenient with them, and stay in the A‘laab until you receive my instructions." Thus, those groups and their allies were ever since called al-Akhaabith, and the road too was called the Road of al-Akhaabith. Tahir Ibn Abu Halah said some poetry on the occasoin, while he camped on that road with Masruq in ‘Ak, waiting for Abu Bakr’s orders.

* * *

Saif based the news about the apostasy of the people of ‘Ak and al-Ash‘arayn on his imagined Tahir Ibn Abu Halah. But who is this Tahir Ibn Abi Halah?

Tahir in Saif’s Hadiths

Saif imagined a person named Tahir Ibn Halah at-Tamîmi to be the son of Umm al-Mu‘minîn Khadîjah, the foster-son of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his agent in his life. He narrated his news as to have happened during Abu Bakr’s days concerning demolishing the apostates of al-‘Ak and al-Ash‘arayn. From Saif’s hadiths, the authors of al-Isaabah, Mu‘jam al-Sahaabah, Usud al-Ghaabah, Tajrîd Asmaa ‘al-Sahaabah, al-Isti‘aab and others, recorded his biography among the Companions and considered him to be one. His biography was also recorded in Mu‘jam al-Shu‘ara’ and Siyar A‘laam al-Nubala’. His story was stated in the Tarîkhs of al-Tabari, Ibn al-Athir, Ibn Kathir, Ibn Khaldun and Mirkhaand.

Consequently, Sharafuddin relied upon these reference books and mentioned the name of Tahir among the names of Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) followers in his book al-Fusul al-Muhimmah.

The geographical dictionaries, like Mu‘jam al-Buldaan by al-Hamawi and Maraasid al-Ittilaa‘ by ‘Abd al-Mu‘min, trusting Saif’s news, entered al-A‘laab and al-Akhaabith as geographical places.

Discussing the Narrative

Saif related the news about Tahir in five of his narrations, ascribing them to five narrators created by him: Suhayl, quoting his father Yusuf as-Sulami, ‘Ubayd Ibn Sakhr Ibn Ludhan, Jarir Ibn Yazid al-Ju‘fi and Abu ‘Amr‘ Talhah’s servant.

There was no such thing as the apostasy of al-‘Ak and al-Ash‘arayn! Nor had Allah created any land named al-A‘laab or al-Akhaabith!

Nor was there any companion, a foster-son of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), through Khadijah, named Tahir Ibn Abi Halah!

Nor was there any war to extinguish the apostates of al-‘Ak and al-Ash‘arayn, as imagined by Saif.

Nor were there such narrators from whom he quoted his hadiths about Tahir, the apostasy of the al-‘Ak and al-Ash‘arayn and al-Akhaabith!

Saif had invented the apostasy, its war, the lands, the poetry, Abu Bakr’s letter, the Companion and the narrators, through all of which he achieved his aim of circulating the idea that the people had turned away from Islam after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in general – except Quraysh and Thaqif – and thus the Muslims waged a devastating war against them. We had discussed all these narratives and their sources in our biography of the so-called Tahir Ibn Abu Halah, in the first volume of our book **A Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**.

That was one of the many wars against the apostates which Saif invented. Other Riddah wars of his invention were those which he called: Tay Riddah, Umm Zamal Riddah, the Riddah of the peoples of ‘Oman and al-Muhrah, the first and the second Riddahs of Yemen.

He invented the apostasy of these tribes, their localities, their wars, as well as other Riddah wars which he claimed to have happened during the rule of Abu Bakr, all of which were naught but a pack of lies. He also lied in stating the number of the casualties in those battles. He invented fabulous events that blackened the bright face of Islamic history. He did the same to the news of the

conquests, as he mentioned battles, killings and destruction by Islamic armies which never existed in history, such as the following events:

The Conquest of Olais and Destroying the Town of Amgheesheya

Al-Tabari, quoting Saif concerning Olais and Amgheesheya in the victories over the masses of Iraq, said, in respect to Olais:

"They fought intensely, while the idolators felt stronger and tougher as they expected to be reinforced by Bahman Jaadhawayh. So, they stood firm against the Muslims, whose destiny had already been ordained by Allah. The Muslims' onslaught was severe. Khalid said: 'O Allah! I vow not to spare any one of them until I let their river flow with their blood, if you grant us their shoulders!' So, Allah exposed them to the Muslims and granted them their shoulders. Khalid ordered his announcer to announce to the people: 'Take prisoner! Take prisoner! Do not kill anybody unless he refuses to surrender.' So, the horsemen brought them in groups of captives, driven out to the river, where they were beheaded in the river. This lasted for a day and a night. The next day and the day after they were chased until they reached the twin rivers along all sides of Olais, where they were beheaded. Al-Qa'qa' and others told him:

'Even if you kill all the people of the earth, their blood will not flow. The blood will only be diluted, since blood is ordained not to flow and the earth is ordained not to dry it. By flooding the blood with water you will be fulfilling your vow.' The water, which had been blocked from the river, was released, and it flew with the blood. It was thus called '*The Blood River*' till this day. Others among them Bashir Ibn Khasaasiyyah said that they were informed that as the earth dried up the blood of the sons of Adam, it was ordered not to dry the blood, and blood was ordered not to flow much."

He said: "There were mills on the river. They worked with blood-diluted water, for three days, preparing the bread for an army of twenty-eight thousand, or more."

As regards destroying the town of Amgheesheya, he said:

"Having finished with the Battle of Olais, Khalid set out to Amgheesheya in a hurry because its people had quit the battle and fled into the plantations. Khalid ordered the town and whatever in its vicinity to be destroyed. It was a town like

al-Hirah, and an advanced guard for Olais. The spoils that they got here was unprecedented."

Saif had fabricated all these narratives, with all their details and narrators. Let us cast a look at what he invented in these two narratives.

A Glance at Saif's Narrative Concerning Olais and Amgheesheya

Saif said:

"In the Battle of Olais, Khalid promised to make their river flow with their blood. Having triumphed over them, he changed the flow of the water from the river, and ordered the scattered remnants of the Persian army and the peasants to be captured and brought to him in droves. He assigned men to behead them on the river. This continued for a day and a night, but the blood dried up. Al-Qa'qa' (a Companion invented by Saif) and others told him: 'If you kill the people of the earth, their blood will not flow. Pour water on the blood to fulfill your vow.' He returned the current of the water into its river bed and it flowed red like pure blood. Therefore, it was called the Blood River till this day." Then he said: "Khalid went to Amgheesheya, where everything was within its vicinity. Their casualties amounted to seventy-thousand in number."

* * *

As regards the town of Amgheesheya, which was invented by Saif, together with its surroundings and the report about destroying it, there were similar ones in history, destroyed by tyrants like Hulaku and Chenghiz Khan, as well as the killing of the prisoners of war. But Saif ascribed to Khalid what was unprecedented in the annals of wars, i.e. running the river with their blood, which thenceforth was called the Blood River till this date, as claimed by him.

Saif further invented pieces of news about battles he named al-Thaani, al-Madhaarr, al-Maqar, Fam-o-Furaat Baadquli and al-Masikh, and the killing of the idolators in such a way that their bodies piled up in the air, like slaughtered sheep. Then, there were the battles of al-Zamil and al-Faraad, and the killing of one hundred thousand Romans.

Those battles, and many others, had been invented by Saif. They made their way into the books of history, written by al-Tabari, Ibn al-Athir, Ibn Kathir, Ibn Khaldun and others, while there was no truth even in a single one of them. We have discussed them and their transmitting authorities in our book '**Abdullah Ibn Saba**', vol. 2.

So, with such concocted right, are not the opponents of Islam right in claiming that Islam spread through the sword?

Is there any doubt, then, about Saif's evil objective of fabricating such narrations against Islam? What motive can Saif have behind so much intrigues and fabrications, if not merely his atheism, for which he was notorious among the scholars?

Now, can it be that all those lies and slanders were hidden from the Imam of the historians, al-Tabari, their erudite Ibn al-Athir, their prolific Ibn Kathir, their philosopher Ibn Khaldun and tens of others, like Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Ibn 'Asaakir, al-Dhahabi and Ibn Hajar?

Of course not! It was they only who accused him of lying and of being an atheist! Particularly al-Tabari, Ibn al-Athir and Ibn Khaldun, who said in their Tarikhs, on relating the events of the Battle of Dhaat al-Salaasil, that what Saif had related about that battle was different from what the historians knew from it!

Such being the case, what was that which prompted them to quote his narratives exceptionally, although they knew him to be a liar and an atheist? It was only because Saif had decorated his falsities with a frame of spreading the merits of the ruling Companions. This prompted these so-called scholars to exert their best efforts to spread them among the people, despite their knowledge of their being a pack of lies! For example, in relating the events of conquering Iraq, he spread his fabrications under the title of "The Merits of Khalid Ibn al-Walid." He alleged that Abu Bakr, after the Battle of Olais and destroying the town of Amgheesheya, said: "O People of Quraysh! Your lion passed over the lion and overcame him! Are the women incapable of producing the like of Khalid?"

He, further, adorned his fabrications about the Riddah wars with a frame of the merits of the Caliph Abu Bakr. He did the same with what he fabricated about the conquests of Syria and Iran in the days of 'Umar, the riots in the days of 'Uthman and the Battle of al-Jamal in the days of 'Ali. He adorned all these events with the

merits of the people in power, defending them against all criticism. Thus, Saif's narratives circulated and his lies spread, while the true ones were forgotten or neglected. Yet, generally speaking, there was in what Saif fabricated and forged no virtue for the Companions; rather, they defamed and depeccated them.

Actually, I cannot understand how was it concealed for these historians that there were no merits for Khalid in his bringing tens of thousands of human beings and slaughtering them at the river so as to flow it with their blood! Nor was there any merit in destroying the town of Amgheesheya nor its like, except according to the opinion of the atheists in life which, they say, is the prison of light, and effort should be exerted to demolish the life in order to deliver the light from its prison.¹(1)

At any rate, this evil commodity called Saif could be spread only because he painted it with the merits of the notables. The narrators, who were keen on spreading virtues of the rulers and defending them, drove them to publish what appeared to be a virtue of theirs, whereas actually it was not so.

Even worse than that was that Saif did not suffice himself with fabricating narratives which appeared as merits for the influential Companions, and infusing them with what he desired in order to ruin Islam, but he invented for the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) Companions whom Allah never created. He ascribed to them whatever he liked of miracles, conquests, poetry and merits! In fact, he knew that these historians would cling to whatever was regarded as a merit, whatever it may be, ascribed to the ruling class. He, therefore, invented and fabricated whatever he wanted, to destroy Islam, depending on those inclinations in the narrators, and in order to fool the Muslims. They did not, however, disappoint Saif, as they went on circulating his fabrications for some thirteen odd centuries.

* * *

So far we have been showing examples of Saif's inventions as a means of defying Islam through decorating them with merits ascribed to the Companions and the Tabi'in of the ruling class. Hereunder, we study other examples which had been put within the frame of solving the centuries-old problem of the Caliphate School:

¹ Look up our discussion of atheism and the atheists in the preliminary studies in **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**.

**The Imam 'Ali's fame as the Successor was a Dilemma
for the Caliphate School through Centuries**

We had formerly realized how the theological battle went on between the two Schools vis-à-vis the word **succession** (*al-wasiyyah*) along seven hundred years, from the life of ‘A’ishah till the age of Ibn Kathir. That was because this word positively denoted the intention of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in all his texts, to confirm the right of his progeny to rule, starting with Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and ending with the twelfth Imam al-Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance). Among those texts is Hadith al-Ghadir, the hadith which says that ‘Ali was the Wali al-Amr and the Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) heir after him, and other such hadiths. The Caliphate School used to interpret those texts to denote bestowing an honour and virtue on the progeny of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while the scholars of other heavenly religions, by using the epithet of "Successor" of the Seal of the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), they only meant his executor, guardian.

The supporters of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny), in their speeches used to refer to the succession as an evidence to prove the right of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) to rule. Among these supporters were Abu Dharr during ‘Uthman’s days, Malik al-Ashtar on the day of giving the allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr in his letter to Mu‘awiyah, the Emigrants and al-Ansar in their poetry about al-Jamal and Siffin wars, Imam Hasan (peace be on him) in his speech of allegiance, and Imam Husain (peace be on him) in his speech addressing the army of the caliphate in Karbala’. All of them referred to the succession as an evidence connected to all other texts in their favour. So, by announcing the succession, they meant to say that it covered all other texts in support of ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) right to rule.

The uprisings of the ‘Alwais’ claiming the right to rule did not end by the martyrdom of Imam Husain (peace be on him). Their revolutions against the Caliphate lasted till the age of the Abbassides. What bothered the School of the Caliphate most was the fame of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) as being the successor of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny), since it came at the top of the evidences presented by the ‘Alawi claimants, as it was regarded, as we said before, an irrefutable text by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and

his progeny) confirming the right of Imam ‘Ali and his offspring (peace be on them) to the rule.

Later, when Ma‘mun al-Abbasi tried to calm down the uprisings of the ‘Alawis, he pretended to accept the succession as a proof and announced Imam al-Reza (peace be on him) as his Crown Prince, as a result of which the Alawis everywhere calmed down. He, then brought them to his capital, where he could get rid of their heads by poisoning them. Thus, he overcame them (through deceit).

So, Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him) fame as the successor was a real problem and enigma for the School of Caliphate for several centuries. But how could Saif resolve that problem?

Saif tries to resolve the Problem of the Caliphate School

We have already said how the School of Caliphate tried to conceal narrations that mentioned the succession by deleting, distorting, disparaging the narrators and those who argued by it and justifying the irrefutable texts about the succession. But none of them could catch up with Saif’s resolution of that difficult problem, by changing the facts to their contrary through his concocted narratives in this respect:

A. Al-Tabari, concerning the events of the year 35 A.H., relates the following narrative:

Yazid al-Faq‘asi, quoting ‘Atiyyah, quoting Saif, said: "Abdullah Ibn Saba’ was a Jew from San‘a’ [Yemen]. His mother was a black woman. He accepted Islam during the rule of ‘Uthman. Thereafter, he travelled through the Islamic countries, trying to divert the Muslims [from their religion]. He started from al-Hijaz, to Basrah, to Kufah and finally to Syria. He could find no way with the people of Syria. They drove him out, so he went to Egypt where he lived among them. He talked to them and said: ‘I wonder how someone alleges that Jesus would return, then denies the return of Muhammad, while Allah the Glorified and Almighty says: **He Who has made the Qur’an binding on you will return you to an appointment place.** So, Muhammad is more entitled to return than Jesus.’ It was accepted from him, and he contrived the return, which became a topic of their discussions. Then he told them: ‘There had been a thousand Prophets, and each

one of them had a successor, and ‘Ali was Muhammad’s successor.’ Then he told them: ‘Muhammad was the Seal of the Prophets, and ‘Ali is the Seal of the successors.’ He further said: ‘Who can be more unjust than the one who does not accept the succession of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and jumps upon the Messenger’s successor and governs the ummah?’ Then he said: "Uthman took it without any right, and here is the Messenger’s successor. So uphold this matter and promote it. Start with defaming your rulers and proclaim enjoining good and prohibiting evil, so that you may win the people over, and invite them to this affair.’

He sent out his propagandists and corresponded with the corrupt in the countries. They, too, responded to him and secretly advocated their own opinion, and started bidding good and forbidding evil. and sent letters to all countries uncovering the defects of their rulers, and received from their friends similar letters, and the people of each country wrote to the people of another country about what they did, so that those would read them in their country and these would read them in their country, until they included Madinah and spread it all over the land, aiming at other than what they display, and hiding what they did not manifest. The people of each country would say: ‘We are safe from that which afflicted those people.’ But the people of Madinah received information about that from all countries. They said: "We are safe from what the people are in." Muhammad and Talhah gathered them in this place.

They came to ‘Uthman and said: ‘O Amir al-Mu’minin! Did it come to you from the people what came to us?’ ‘No, by Allah, nothing came to me but safety,’ he said. ‘It did come to us’, they said and told him about what had come to them. He said: ‘You are my partners and the witnesses of the believers. Advise me.’ ‘We advise you to send men whom you trust to the countries to bring back to you their news,’ they advised him. He summoned Muhammad Ibn Salamah and sent him to Kufah, and ‘Usamah Ibn Zayd to Basrah, and ‘Ammar Ibn Yasir to Egypt, and ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Umar to Syria, and he dispersed other men, too. All of them returned before ‘Ammar.

They said: ‘O people! We found nothing wrong, nor did the notables and the common Muslims find anything wrong. They all said that the affair belongs to the Muslims, and their rulers are just to them and take care of their affairs.’ The

people waited for ‘Ammar whom they thought to be too late, and they believed him to be killed. But there surprised them a letter from ‘Abdullah Ibn Sa’d Ibn Abi Sarh telling them that Ammar had been attracted by the people of Egypt who were inclined to him, among them were ‘Abdullah the son of a black (woman), Khalid Ibn Muljam, Sudan Ibn Hamran and Kinaanah Ibn Bishr."

B. Al-Dhahabi¹(1)1, in his reference to the events of the year 35 A.H., relates the following two narratives:

First: "Saif Ibn ‘Umar, quoting ‘Atiyyah, quoting Yazid Ibn al-Faq‘asi, said: ‘When the son of the black (woman) arrived in Egypt, he stayed once with Kinaanah Ibn Bishr, and once with Saudaan Ibn Humraan. Thereafter, he settled with al-Ghaafeqi who told him he was wrong and talked to him. Khalid Ibn Muljam, ‘Abdullah Ibn Razîn and their like took him around. He talked to the people, but they did not respond to the succession..." as the lengthy hadith goes.

Second: He then relates his report about Ammar (al-Yaasir) in Egypt. He says: Saif, quoting Mabashshir and Sahl Ibn Yusuf, quoting Muhammad Ibn Sa’d Ibn Abi Waqqaas, said: ‘Ammar Ibn Yasir came from Egypt, while my father was inquiring about him. When he heard of his arrival, he sent me to fetch him. He came with me wearing a filthy turban and a fur garment. As he entered, Sa’d said to him: "Woe on you, O Aba al-Yaqzaan! You had been among us a man of good repute, so what is this which I hear about your efforts to corrupt the Muslims and to incite (them) against Amir al-Mu’minîn? Do you have intellect or not?’ Ammar got angry and took off his turban and said: ‘I took off ‘Uthman as I took off this turban of mine.’ Sa’d said: ‘We are Allah’s and to Him we are returning! Woe unto you! You are getting old, your bones are weak and your years are ending! You have taken the noose of Islam off your neck and stepped out of the religion naked!’ ‘Ammar left angrily, murmuring to himself: ‘I take refuge with Allah from Sa’d’s trial!’ Sa’d said: ‘Indeed, it is they who fell in trial! O Allah! Elevate ‘Uthman’s position near You through his forgiveness and forbearance,’. ‘Ammar went out. Sa’d turned to me crying so hard that his tears drenched his beard, and said: ‘Who is that who is safe from the trial! O my son, let not what

¹ Tarikh al-Islam, vol. 2, pp. 122-128

you have heard come out of you, as it is a trust. I dislike to see the people clinging to that and talk it over. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said: *'Truth is with 'Ammar unless he is overcome by old age diseases.'* He is at that stage now'.

Among those who rebelled against 'Uthman was Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr. Asked about what caused Muhammad to be against him, Salim Ibn 'Abdillah said: 'Anger and greed, while he had a position in Islam, but some people induced him and he got covetous. He was privileged but he had no right to it; so 'Uthman took it from him."

C. Al-Tabari¹(1)1, reporting the events of the year 30 A.H., refers to Abu Dharr's affair and says:

"Saif, quoting 'Atiyyah, quoting Yazid al-Faq'asi, said: 'When the son of the black (woman) arrived in Syria, he met Abu Dharr and said to him: 'O Aba Dharr! Are you not surprised at Mu'awiyah saying: 'Wealth is Allah's! Everything is Allah's. It seems that he wants to keep it away from the Muslims and to efface their names.' Abu Dharr asked him: 'What makes you say that the wealth of the Muslims belongs to Allah?' 'May Allah have mercy upon you, O Aba Dharr!' said he, 'are we not the servants of Allah, and the wealth, the creatures and the affair all belong to him?' Abu Dharr said: 'Do not say it.' 'I would not say it is Allah's he said, 'but I would say it is the Muslim's wealth.' Thereafter, the son of the black (woman) came to Abu al-Dardaa' who asked him: 'Who are you? By Allah! I think you are a Jew!' He then came to 'Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit, who came to him and brought him to Mu'awiyah and said: 'By Allah! He is the one who instigated Abu Dharr against you.' Abu Dharr went around in Syria calling out to the people: 'O you the wealthy! Be beneficent to the poor! Warn those who treasure gold and silver, and do not spend them in the way of Allah, of blazing rods with which their foreheads, flanks and backs would be branded.' He went on repeating that until the poor got fond of what he used to say, and forced it upon the rich, to such an extent that the rich complained (to Mu'awiyah) of what they were getting at the hands of the people. So, Mu'awiyah wrote to 'Uthman that Abu Dharr was causing difficulty for him and that he did so and so. 'Uthman

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed. vol. 1, pp. 2858-2859.

wrote back to him: 'Mutiny is pushing out its nose and eye, so there remains nothing but to tackle it, without scraping the wound. Prepare Abu Dharr and send him to me with a guide, and provide him and be kind to him. Hold back the people and yourself as much as you can. You will be strong as long as you stick to firmness.' He sent Abu Dharr with a guide. When he reached Madinah and saw that the buildings had reached al-Sal', said: 'I warn the people of Madinah of a devastating raid and an unforgettable war'. He was brought to 'Uthman who asked him: 'O Aba Dharr! Why do the people of Syria complain of your sharp tongue?' He told him that they must not say Allah's wealth, and the rich must not compile wealth. He said: 'O Aba Dharr! I have to perform what I have to, and take what the citizens have to give, and I am not to impose asceticism upon them, nor to invite them to strife and economy.' 'Do you, then, allow me to leave?' asked Abu Dharr, 'as Madinah is not a place for me?' 'But you will replace it by a worse one,' said 'Uthman. 'The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered me to leave it when the buildings reach al-Sal', ' explained Abu Dharr. 'Do as he ordered you,' 'Uthman said. So, he left Madinah for Rabdhah, where he settled down, and build a mosque. 'Uthman sent him a herd of camels, two slaves and asked him not to leave the town so as not to return an Arab (of the dessert). He agreed."

A Study of Saif's Narratives Concerning the Mischiefs

These narratives had been invented by Saif by way of defending the 'Umayyads Caliphs: 'Uthman, Mu'awiyah, Marwan, and the rulers: al-Walid, Sa'd Ibn Abi Sarh and other Umayyads notables. His fabricated stories about these troubles circulated and spread in the sources of Islamic studies, as had been proved in the first volume of our book '**Abdullah Ibn Saba**'. The true reports about those trials are stated in a chapter under the title "**In The Eras of the Two Sons-in-law**" and in the chapter under the title "**With Mu'awiyah**" of our book **Ahadith Umm al-Mu'minîn 'A'ishah**, vol. 1.

Hereunder, we will refer to examples of the kinds of fabrications and distortions in Saif's former narratives.

The Inventions and Distortions in Saif's Former Narratives

First: Examples of Inventions in the said narratives

a. Saif invented the narrators: 'Atiyyah, Mubashshir, Sahl Ibn Yusuf and Yazid al-Faq'asi.

As regards 'Atiyyah, Saif imagined him to be the son of Bilal Ibn Abu Bilal, Hilal al-Dhabbi. He created for him a son by the name al-Sa'b. Then he ascribed to them the narration of some of his fabricated narratives: sometimes the son quotes his father and sometimes quotes others. We had discussed them and counted the narratives which Saif quoted from them in our book **Invented Narrators**, and we made a comparison between the narratives ascribed to them by Saif, in our biography of the invented Companion, al-Qa'qa', in our book **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**, vol. 1, and the story of al-'Ala' al-Hadhrami, in our book **'Abdullah Ibn Saba'**, vol. 1.

Sahl Ibn Yusuf was imagined by Saif to be Sahl Ibn Yusuf Ibn Sahl Ibn Malik al-Ansari, their biography and the number of the narratives Saif quoted from them are related in our book **Invented Narrators**, and their narratives are studied in our biography of al-Qa'qa' in **One Hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions**.

Mubashshir is imagined by him to be: Mubashshir Ibn Fudhail. We studied him and his narrative quoted by Saif in the report on al-Saqifah in our book **Abdullah Ibn Saba'**, vol. 1.

As for Yazid al-Faq'asi, we found no mention of him in the books of hadith, biographies, history, literature, lineage, classes, etc., except the five narratives from Saif in al-Tabari's *Tarikh* and a single narrative from him in al-Dhahabi's *Tarikh al-Islam*, as if Allah had created him just for Saif to quote from him. Hence, we regarded him to be one of Saif's invented narrators.

b. Saif invented al-Ghaafeqi and others within the texts of the said narratives. We give up counting his fabrications and proving their falsity, as otherwise our discussion will be unnecessarily prolonged.

The following stories had been invented by Saif within the aforementioned narratives:

1. The story of ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba’ in those unrests. To find out their being fabricated, it suffices to compare them with the true narratives which we related in the two chapters **"In the Age of the Two Sons-in-law"** and **"With Mu‘awiyah"** of our book **Ahadith Umm al-Mu‘minîn ‘A’ishah**, vol. 1.

2. Among those fabricated narratives are those which allege that the two Companions, ‘Ammar and Abu Dharr, had followed ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba’ - whom he fancied to be a Jew from Yemen - as well as other Companions and Tabi‘în, whom he also said to have followed ‘Abdulla Ibn Saba’, hence his calling them all as Saba’is.

3. He invented that the Caliph ‘Uthman had sent men to different countries to investigate into the complaints he used to receive. He named them as follows: Muhammad Ibn Maslamah to Kufah, ‘Usamah Ibn Zayd to Basrah, ‘Ammar Ibn Yasir to Egypt and ‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Umar to Syria, all of whom came back with the news that the people were contented with their rulers. Only ‘Ammar Ibn Yasir did not come back, as he followed ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba’, the Jew, and stayed in the land of Egypt, spreading mischief.

Saif had concocted those reports with all their details. But nothing of them appeared in the writings of any of the historians other than Saif. The true narrative is that which we mentioned in our book **Ahadîth Umm al-Mu‘minîn ‘A’ishah**, quoting Ansaab al-Ashraaf by al-Balaadhari.

4. He fabricated Abu Dharr’s story with Mu‘awiyah and distorted it. The true story is related in **Ahadîth Umm al-Mu‘minîn ‘A’ishah**.

5. He further fabricated other events, such as the correspondence which he imagined to have been exchanged between the Caliph ‘Uthman and his agents, and so on.

Second: Examples of distorting the former narratives:

a. Changing the names:

He changed the name of Abd al-Rahman Ibn Muljam, the killer of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), and the name of ‘Abdullah Ibn Wahab al-Saba’i, one of the heads of the Kharijites in the Battle of Nahrawan, calling them Khalid Ibn Muljam and ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba’, as it has been proved in our book **Abdullah Ibn Saba’** vol. 2, under the chapter named "Distortion".

b. Distortion of the narratives:

He distorted the narrative about ‘Ubaadah Ibn al-Saamit. Its true version is related in the chapter "With Mu‘awiyah" of our book **Ahadith Ummul Mu‘minin ‘A’ishah**.

He also distorted the narrative about the belief in "The Return" (al-Raj’ah), saying that it was invented by Ibn Saba’. It is a time-consuming discussion to look into its proofs in the Book and the Sunnah. We shall relate only the following narrative:

When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) died, the Companion, Abu Bakr, was in as-Sanah. The Companion, ‘Umar said: "Some men of the hypocrites allege that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) has died. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) did not die but he has gone to his Lord as did Moosa, the son of Imran, who disappeared from his people for forty nights, then returned after that he had been said to have died. By Allah! The Messenger of Allah will certainly return."¹(1)

He distorted the narrative concerning the succession and ascribing it to Ibn Saba’, the Jew. We had already discussed it in detail. He distorted the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) hadith about ‘Ammar: "The truth is with ‘Ammar unless he is overcome by old age blues", and that Sa’d said: "‘Ammar is old and senile, while the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had said about him, as follows:

¹ Look up the details in the chapter on the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in our book **Abdullah Ibn Saba’**, vol. 1.

On the authority of ‘Abdullah Ibn Mas‘ud, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*When the people differ, the son of Sumayyah will be with the truth.*"¹(1)2

Ibn Sa‘d in his al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra²(2)3 says: "Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), in an elegy celebrating ‘Ammar, said: “*Ammar was with the truth, and the truth was with him. ‘Ammar turned with the truth wherever it turned.*”"

Saif Ibn ‘Umar distorted those hadiths in respect of ‘Ammar and added to them: "... unless he is overcome by old age distraction."

Another hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about ‘Ammar is that which is related by Ibn Hisham in respect of the building of the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) mosque. It goes that someone objected to ‘Ammar. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*What have they against ‘Ammar? He invites them to Paradise while they invite him to Hell! ‘Ammar is the skin between my eyes and my nose. So, if any one offends the man that much, he would be sparing nothing, so, avoid him.*" This hadith was related by Ibn Hisham, but he did not mention the name of the man who objected ‘Ammar. But Abu Dharr, according to the Sharh of Seerah of Ibn Hisham, said that he was ‘Uthman Ibn ‘Affan. Look up the details in **Ahadith Umm al-Mu‘minin ‘A’ishah**, chapter on "**In the age of the two sons-in-law**".

Concerning Abu Dharr, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said:

"*Neither the sky shaded nor the earth carried a man more truthful in his utterances than Abu Dharr!*"³(3)4

¹ Al-Dhahabi’s Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 179 and Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 270.

² Beirut ed., vol. 3, p. 262.

³ Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, the Preface, Chapter 11, hadith 156. Sunan al-Tirmidhi, the Book of Merits, Chapter on Abu Dharr’s merits (may Allah be pleased with him). Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 2, pp. 163, 175, 223, vol. 5, pp. 351, 356, vol. 6, p. 442. Ibn Sa’d’s al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, Eu. ed. vol. 4/Q1/p. 168

Comparing Saif's Narrative with Others' on the Unrests

Al-Dhahabi, in his *Tarikh*, relating the news about the disturbances in 'Uthman's rule, says:

Al-Zuhri reports: "'Uthman came to power and ruled for six years without incurring peoples' discontent, and was more loved than 'Umar, because 'Umar was harsh upon them. So, when 'Uthman came to power, he showed leniency and generosity. Gradually, he began to care less for their affairs and to depend more on his relatives and kinsmen during his six years. He ordered the Khums coming from Egypt or Africa to be given to Marwan. He perferred his relatives with the wealth, his pretext being Allah's order to be kind to one's relatives. He accumulated wealth and borrowed from the Public Treasury, saying:

'Abu Bakr and 'Umar left their shares in it, so, I took it and distributed it among my relatives.' The people disliked him for this act.

I said: 'Among other things which the people disliked him was his deposing

'Umayr Ibn Sa'd from the rule of Homs, although he was a good and pious man and mobilized Syria for Mu'awiyah. Also, his deposing 'Amr Ibn al-'Aas from the rule of Egypt and replacing him by Ibn Abi al-Sarh, deposing Abu Musa al-Ash'ari from Basrah and replacing him by 'Abdullah Ibn Umar, and deposing al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah¹(1)1 from al-Kufah and replacing him by Sa'id Ibn al-'Aas.'

He also said: "'Uthman called a number of the Companions including 'Ammar and said: 'I am asking you a question and I would like you to tell me the truth. I adjure you by Allah to tell me: Did the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) prefer Quraysh to other people and Banu Hashim to other members of Quraysh? 'They kept silent. He said: 'Were I to have the keys of Paradise I would have given them to Banu 'Umayyah so that they might enter it.'"²(2)2

* * *

Space constrains does not permit us to relate what the Umayyads governors and Emirs had done with the six years referred to by the historians, in Egypt, Syria, Kufah, Basrah and Madinah, and what had happened between them and the pious

¹ . In the text: "al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah is a mistake. He deposed Sa'd Ibn Waqqaas.

² The writer says: "Yet, practically he did have the keys of the Public Treasury of the Muslims!"

Companions and Tabi'in. It will suffice, however, to relate how they treated Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him), in particular.

Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in Mena During the Hajj

Abu Kathir, quoting his father, said: "I came to Abu Dharr near the Middle Jamrah, where people were sitting around him asking him religious questions. A man came up to him and said: 'Have you not been forbidden answering religious questions?' He raised his head to him and said? 'Are you spying on me? Even if you put the sword on this - pointing to his neck - and I thought I could retell a word I had heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) before you finish me off, I would say it.'"¹(1)

Al-Bukhari summarized this narrative in his Sahih: 'Abu Dharr said: 'If you put the sword on this - pointing to his neck I thought I could effect a word I had heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) before you finish me off, I would do it.'"²(2)

Ibn Hajar, in his Fath al-Baari fi Sharh Sahih al-Bukhari, says: "The man who talked to him was of Quraysh, and the one who had forbidden him was 'Uthman (may Allah be pleased with him)."³(3)

He added: "'A word' denotes few as well as many. He meant to say that he would convey the word, in any case, and would not be forbidden, even if he incurred death upon himself." The end of the narrative related by the commentator on Sahih al-Bukhari and his explanation of Abu Dharr's talk to the effect that he would convey whatever he had heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), even if it is a single word, and that he would not refrain from conveying it even under the threat of being beheaded.

Al-Dhahabi, in Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, says:

¹ Sunan al-Daaremi, vol. 1, p. 137; Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, p. 354

² Sahih al-Bukhari, Book of Knowledge, Chapter on "Knowing before saying and acting", vol. 1, p./16.

4. Ibid. vol.1, p. 18.

³ Ibid. vol. 1, pp. 170-171.

"... A young man of Quraysh standing before him said: 'Did not Amir al-Mu'minîn (Uthman) prohibit you from answering religious question? ..." as the hadith goes on.¹(4)4

Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in Baitullah al-Haraam

Al-Haakem, in his al-Mustadrak²(5)5, quoting Hansh al-Kinani³(6)6, says: "I heard Abu Dharr say, while holding to the latch of the door of Ka'bah: 'O people! Whoever knows me, knows me. Whoever does not know me, (then he should know that) I am Abu Dharr. I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) says: *'The parable of my progeny is liked that of (Prophet) Noah's ark: whoever boards it will be safe, and whoever stays back will be drowned.'*"

Al-Haakem added: "This is an authentic hadith as per Muslim's condition (of authenticity of narration)."

Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Mosque and elsewhere

Al-Ya'qubi, in his Tarikh⁴(7)1, recorded in detail Abu Dharr's (may Allah be pleased with him) story with the ruling authority and says:

"Uthman was informed that Abu Dharr used to sit in the mosque of the Messenger, and the people used to gather around him. He then related what included his rejection, and that he (once) stood at the door of the mosque and said: 'O people! Whoever knows me, knows me. Whoever does not know me, then he should know that I am Abu Dharr al-Ghifari, Jundub Ibn Junadah from Rabadha: Allah chose Adam and Noah and the descendants of Ibrahim and the descendants of Imran above (all) worlds - They are descendants one of another, and Allah is All-Hearing, All-Knowing. Muhammad is the choice of Noah. The descendants are from Ibraheem, the scions are from Ismaeel and the guiding offspring are of Muhammad. It is the honour of their honourables. They deserved superiority

¹ In al-Isaabah, Hansh is a man of Ghifar.

² Vol. 2, p. 343.

³ Vol. 2, p. 171.

⁴

among the people. They are among us like a lofty heaven, like the covered Ka'bah, or like the ordained Qiblah, or like the high sun, or like the moving moon, or like the guiding stars, or like the olive tree whose oil throws light and whose foam is blessed.

Muhammad inherited the knowledge of Adam and that with which the Prophets were merited. 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib is the successor of Muhammad and the inheritor of his knowledge. O you, the perplexed nation after their Prophet! If you put forth those whom Allah had put forth and push back those whom Allah had pushed back, you would have eaten from above your heads and from beneath your feet; and the friend of Allah would not have complained, no duty imposed by Allah would go astray and no two persons would differ about Allah's ordinances, unless you would find the relevant answer with them (derived) from Allah's Book and the traditions of His Prophet. But now as you did what you did, you deserve to taste the bitter results of your affair. **And those who do injustice will soon come to know what a (grave) destiny they will have.'**"

Then al-Ya'qubi added:

"'Uthman was also informed that Abu Dharr was abusing him and relating the changes he made in the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and of Abu Bakr and 'Umar. So, he externed him to Mu'awiyah in Syria, where he started going to the mosque and repeating what he used to say in Madinah. This audience began to increase and his hearers became so numerous..." etc.

Al-Ya'qubi further said what is summarized hereunder:

"Mu'awiyah wrote to 'Uthman: 'You have corrupted Syria against yourself by (sending) Abu Dharr.' He wrote him back: 'Send him back on a padless camel-saddle to me.' Abu Dharr arrived in Madinah with his thigh-flesh peeled off. There an argument took place between him and 'Uthman that resulted in Abu Dharr being exiled to Rabadhah. A similar issue had transpired between Walid, the ruler of Kufah, and Ibn Mas'ud, who was brought to the Caliph in Madinah. He, then, ordered him to be stricken to the ground, and he fell dead. He did the same with 'Ammar."¹(1)

¹ Look up Ahaadith 'A'ishah for further details

A Summary of the Disturbances in ‘Uthman’s Later Days

The Caliph ‘Uthman gave free hand to his agents of Banu Ummayyah to do whatever they liked with the Muslims and their wealth. Whenever the Muslims complained to the Caliph against the injustices of his agents, he would not pay heed to their grievances. So, they rebelled against him, and Banu Taym joined the opposition, hoping to get the Caliphate for Talhah. The Zubairs did the same in the interest of Zubair, while the other Ansars and most of the Companions except the said tribes and Banu ‘Ummayyah, were supporting Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). At last, the rebels killed ‘Uthman without anybody coming to his rescue, neither the Ansar nor anyone else. Thereafter, the Emigrants and the Ansar gathered around Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and paid allegiance to him, and Talhah and Zubair had no option but to comply with the popular view, and were the first of the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Companions to give their allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny). But when Imam (peace be on him) distributed the public treasury equitably, the distinguished class, headed by Talhah and Zubair, became furious. They held a meeting with Ayesah in Makkah. Then, garnering the support of Banu ‘Ummayyah, they claimed revenge for ‘Uthman’s murder. They set out to Basrah, conquered it and prepared an army to fight Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). Imam (peace be on him) marched and met them outside Basrah. Ayesah rode a camel and led the army in fighting the soldiers of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). After suffering heavy casualties, the rebels surrendered to Imam (peace be on him) who issued an amnesty and let them go.

That was a summary of the disturbances during ‘Uthman’s days, giving the allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) and "the Battle of the Camel" in Basrah. For detailed information, refer to our book **Ahaadith ‘A’ishah**.

The Conclusion of the Comparative Discussion of Saif’s Fabricated Narratives and the True Ones

Saif narrated that a Jew from San’a’ of Yemen, named ‘Abdullah Ibn Saba’ the son of a black maid, pretended to adopt Islam during ‘Uthman’s rule. He toured the Islamic cities and towns, such as: Madinah, Syria, Kufah and Egypt, propagating the idea that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his

progeny) will return after his demise, that 'Ali was his successor and that 'Uthman had usurped the right of the successor; therefore, he must be removed from the way of returning the right to its people.

A number of the pious Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) believed in him, such as: Abu Dharr, 'Ammar, Hujr Ibn 'Adiy and tens of others like them, whom he called "The Saba'ite", alleging that Ibn Saba', the Jew, had taught them to practise bidding good and forbidding evil, and to write about the defects of their rulers so as to stir the people against them. They did so. Yet, 'Ammar was said to be raving according to the Messenger's hadith, as well as Abu Dharr. The Saba'ite Companions and Tabi'in obeyed Ibn Saba's instructions and brought the people to Madinah, killed 'Uthman in his house and gave their allegiance to 'Ali. Talhah, Zubair and 'A'isha set off to Basrah demanding 'Uthman's blood (i.e. revenge). They were followed by Imam 'Ali (peace be on him); they met outside Basrah, where they talked about peace and decided upon it. But the Saba'ite¹ feared their resulting fate. So, they infiltrated both the armies and started throwing arrows on both sides, and thus incited the two armies to war, without anybody from both sides noticing their trick. None of them and of their leaders recognized who were the throwers of the arrows, despite the fact that they penetrated their ranks.

Saif said: "In this way the war started and ended with the victory of the army of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)."

He narrated those reports in hundreds of fabricated narratives, quoting concocted narrators, including those whose names he mentioned in the aforementioned narratives. We have already related the relevant true narratives. It was not hidden from knowledgeable scholars like Tabari, Ibn Athir, Ibn 'Asaakir, Ibn Kathir, Ibn Khuldun and others, that Saif Ibn 'Umar was accused of atheism, and noted biographers had unanimously described him as a liar and unreliable. Yet, it is even noted that they spread his narrations (re: our book '**Abdullah Ibn Saba'**). Likewise, the true narratives were also not hidden from them but they concealed the true narratives because the public, they thought, could not bear to hear them. If

¹ The Saba'ite, in Saif's narratives, are: 'Ammar, Hujr Ibn 'Adiy, Sa'sa'ah Ibn Sawhaan, Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr, Malik al-Ashtar and the like. Look up '**Abdullah Ibn Saba'**', vol. 2, Chapter "The Truth about Ibn Saba' and the Saba'ite."

only they were satisfied with just concealing the true narratives in this respect, as they did with many other reports, without replacing the true reports with the false ones, refraining from spreading the fabricated narratives among the people, though aware of their falsity. In fact, they did know the falsity of what Saif had ascribed to ‘Ammar, Abu Dharr, Ibn Mas’ud, Hujr Ibn ‘Adiy and tens of other companions and Tabi’în, by falsely alleging that they had followed a Jew, who had ordered them to spread mischief among the Muslims and to instigate disruption and killings in their ranks, unaware of what they were doing! May the intellects of those who believed in those falsities be effaced! How could they believe that ‘Uthman did not notice – as Saif says – this Jew and his mischief-mongering? How was that ‘Ammar and Abu Dharr did not ask Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) about what this Jew was saying concerning his being the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) successor? How was that the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him) foster son, Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr, did not ask ‘Ali about the truthfulness of the allegation of this Jew?

I wonder how could they believe in such lies! I don’t claim that the scholars did believe in Saif. Nay, they did know the falsity of what Saif’s concoctions and fabrications. My amazement is how could the masses believe in such tales! The scholars who spread Saif’s lies were aware of them being a pack of lies but they did so because the atheist had painted them with the paint of defending the ruling authorities who were criticised on certain procedures, such as Khalid’s killing of Malik Ibn Nuwayrah and marrying his wife the same night, the accusations against al-Mughirah Ibn Shu’bah during his rule in Basrah, Sa’d Ibn Abi Waqqas’ waiving the punishments of Abu Mihjan and Walid for drinking wine. Saif Ibn ‘Umar settled all the faults for the criticised ones and for the Caliphs, rulers and their relatives. Thus, these so-called great scholars did not care in propagating what this atheist fabricated against the pious and poor Companions, such as Ibn Mas’ud, Abu Dharr and ‘Ammar under the pretext of defending the ruling class. The important thing to them was to conceal what disgraced the Caliphs, the rulers and their relatives in the eyes of the public. By spreading Saif’s lies, they attained their goals and, simultaneously, helped Saif to attain his objective of defaming the pious Companions of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and spreading false rumours in Islamic history, motivated by his atheism.

Referring to the causes of killing ‘Uthman, Tabari said: "We avoided mentioning many of them for reasons that urged us to avoid them"¹(1)2. It seems that what urged him to conceal the truth was his desire to conceal such narratives that defamed the authority of the caliphate in the eyes of the commonality. We had already quoted him saying: "... those which the common people cannot bear."

In other words, in this kind of concealment, they distort the hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his traditions, the traditions of his household and companions and their true news, and replaced them with fabricated ones, as Saif did, instigated by his atheism. The scholars circulated the fabrications instead of the true narratives, knowing them to be false, just because they could defend the ruling authorities, the caliphs, their relatives, the rulers and the Emirs through these fabrications!

This kind of concealment is not few in number among the scholars of the Caliphate School.

Conclusion

It is noted that the scholars of the Caliphate School have unanimously decided on concealing every news criticizing the authorities of the early days of Islam, as well as their agents and relatives, on the pretext that they were Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and that it was erroneous to disclose the causes of their criticism. But they did not hesitate in publishing and propagating fabricated narratives that defamed the righteous, poor Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), such as ‘Ammar, Abu Dharr and Ibn Mas‘ud.

To defend the authorities, they were used to either hide the entire narrative, or to omit from it the part which would incur criticism against the authorities, stating only that part which incurred no criticism on them. In other instances, they substituted a vague word or phrase for the unwanted part of the narrative such that no clear meaning could be understood from it, or the narrative may sometimes be distorted in different ways to the extent of turning a pious and dutiful person into an unjust and foolish man, and an unjust and foolish person into a pious and a dutiful one. That is, they turned a thing into its opposite, and the others hastened

¹ Al-Tabari's Tarīkh, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 2980

to spread it that distorted or invented narrative among the Islamic communities, after adding their endorsement to it, concealing the true narrative which might have subjected the rulers to abuse. Likewise, they hastened to collaborate in weakening the narrative which embarrassed the authorities, and in defaming its narrator and the author of the book who quoted it. Thus, they used diverse weakening, ridiculing and defamatory methods. When they found no way to do that, they interpreted the narrative in such a way to protect the interests of the authorities, changing the criticism directed to them into their praises and compliments.

They even respected whoever practised this method, and promoted them according to the extent of their adherence to the said method, by endorsing his narration and describing his reports to be true and his book to be trustworthy; as much as they kept to the wanted method, they propagated them and remembered them with great esteem and respect. Thus, Ibn Hisham's *Sîrah* was celebrated and highly trusted by the Caliphate School and its followers because it was in conformity with what was agreed upon, while Ibn Is'hâq's *Sîrah* was neglected because it did not toe the lines desired by them. So, it was discarded and nobody studied or copied it and, consequently, it was lost, because it did not keep to the method acceptable to them, while Ibn Hisham took all his *Seerah*'s material from Ibn Is'hâq's, omitting "what offends the people to hear", to use Ibn Hisham's own expression.

Likewise Tabari's *Tarîkh* became one of the most trusted and distinguished sources of Islamic history, and its author, Tabari, became the Imam of the historians at the Caliphate School, because, by following the said style, spread Saif's narratives which he knew to be false and contrary to the truth and the historical reality of the time of the Companions, i.e. the early caliphs. Then, the scholars crowded on quoting from Tabari's *Tarîkh* and spreading them in the sources of Islamic studies, neglecting the true narratives until they were forgotten and lost to the Islamic communities:

Consequently, Bukhari became the Imam of the narrators in the Caliphate School, and his *Sahih* was regarded the most trusted book after the Book of Allah, and the true hadiths, if not stated in the *Sahihs* of Bukhari and Muslim, became untrustworthy and unreliable.

The Origin of Differences of Narratives in Islamic Sources

If we look once again into our former discussions, and the discussions to come concerning the caliphs' actions according to their own opinions, in vol. 2 of this book, we will recognize the origin of the differences in the narratives of the sources of Islamic studies. There, we find narrations forged in compliance with the policies and interests of the ruling authorities, to counteract the true narratives that were contrary to their policies and interests. Thus, we will have a constant for distinguishing a strong and authentic hadith from a weak and unreliable one. For example, the weak hadith is of the contradictory hadiths in Sahih Bukhari about weeping over the dead, complying with the policy of the ruling authority who prohibited weeping over the dead, ascribing that prohibition to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), while the strong hadith is contrary to that, like the hadith of Umm al-Mu'minîn 'A'ishah and others who talked of the permissibility of weeping over the dead and that it was from the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) (to weep over the dead). Other weak hadiths are the two contradictory ones narrated by Umm al-Mu'minîn 'A'ishah concerning who was with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his last hours in life, as, in the weak hadith, she said: "Who could be with him when he fainted and died on my chest?", and in the strong hadith she said that Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his last hours, because the first hadith coincided with the desires of the rulers, while the second one was contrary to their policy.

This is the invariable criterion by which one can distinguish between the weak and the strong hadiths about the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and the conduct of his companions and their Tabi'in, and the former Prophets, and the judgements which the caliphs issued according to their own opinions, and the like.

The Conclusion of the Discussions and the Truth

The pursuing researcher notices that the criterion for distinguishing right from wrong in the Caliphate School is the interest of the authorities. Every narrative or

news which criticizes or defames them, is to be regarded as weak, incorrect and invalid, and each book, narrator or writer who relates such narratives is weak, dubious and accused of diverse defects. If the narrative or the news was narrated by somebody whom they could not defame nor the author of the book, they would, in such cases, interpret the hadith according to their own whim. On the other hand, every author or narrator who related the merits of the authorities, discarding the news criticizing them, would be regarded as trustworthy and truthful, and if he could defend them in what he wrote or narrated, he would be the most truthful, honest and trusted, and his narratives would be propagated and quoted in several books and publications. Through this wide door, Saif, the atheist, contaminated the hadiths and conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) with whatever his atheism dictated to him. For the same reason, his narratives have been quoted by more than seventy sources of the Islamic studies for nearly thirteen centuries.

Saif Ibn 'Umar interpolated in the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) all that he invented of hadiths and conducts. We have studied these in chapters like: "The Envoys of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)", "The agents of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)" and "The foster-son of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)" in our book **One hundred and Fifty Fabricated Companions** and in our book **Invented Narrators**. We have already explained how Saif distorted the hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning 'Ammar.

That was our opinion of Saif and his like, such as: Abul Hasan al-Bakri, the author of al-Anwar, who inserted legendary hadiths in the book Sirah al-Nabi al-Mukhtar (peace be on him and his progeny) and his other books; and Ka'b al-Ahbaar who inserted the Israeli narratives in Islamic literature. We had analysed them and their effects, in the series of **The Role of Imams (peace be on them) in the Revival of Religion**. Such was our estimation of them.

As regards Sahih al-Bukhari, Ibn Hisham and his Seerah, al-Tabari and his Tarikh and other similar scholars, whose methods we have already discussed, we regard them differently. It is true that they are blamed for part of their practice, yet they did state in their books much of the true and correct Traditions of the Messenger

of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning both his conduct and hadiths, which we trust and reproduce, as is the habit of the scholars of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School in respect of the one whom they found to have mistaken in his scholarly work, as, although in this case they severely criticize his method, yet, at the same time, they respect and exalt him, and quote from him what is trustworthy. This, in fact, is the significance of not imitating the past scholars, neither in the jurist precepts nor in taking cognizance of the hadiths. The scholars of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School regard weak a weak hadith, be it in al-Kafi or in Sahih al-Bukhari, and take the true hadith from both of them. Al-Majlisi, the great, (d. 1111 A.H.), commenting on al-Kafi in his book called Mir'at al-'Oqool, warned against thousands of weak hadiths in the chapters of al-Kafi, which is the most famous book of hadiths in Ahl al-Bait (peace be on him) School. This methodology of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on him) School is different from the approach of the Caliphate School, who regard Sahih al-Bukhari just like the Book of Allah, believing that it contains not a single incorrect narrative. Even worse: They accept the truthfulness of everything stated in the Sahih al-Bukhari and Muslim concerning the traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) even if it is not found in the Book of Allah, but it is hard for them to accept a true tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) if it is not recorded in the two Sahih of al-Bukhari and Muslim, as well as the other four books, all of which together are called the Six Sahih. Yet, there were many other narrators of hadiths in the Caliphate School, who wrote Sahih, Musnads, Sunans, Musannafs, Zawa'id, etc. such as:

The Sahih of Ibn Khuzaymah (d. 311 A.H.),

The Sahih of Ibn Habbaan (d. 354 A.H.),

The Sahih received from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) compiled by al-Hafiz Abu 'Ali Ibn al-Sakan (d. 353 A.H.),

Musnad of al-Tayaalisi (d. 204 A.H.), **Musnad** of Ahmad Ibn Hanbal (d. 241 A.H.), Sunan of al-Baihaqi (d. 458 A.H.),

Sunan of Abu Bakr al-Shafi'i (d. 347 A.H.),

The three Dictionaries of al-Tabaraani (d. 360 A.H.),

The Musannaf of 'Abd al-Razzaq al-San'ani (d. 211 A.H.),

The Musannaf of Ibn Abi Shaybah (d. 235 A.H.),

Majma‘ al-Zawaa'id of al-Haythami (d. 807 A.H.),

Al-Mustadrak of al-Haakem (d. 405 A.H.), and tens of recent encyclopedias by the modern scholars and compilers.

Concerning the conducts of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and the Companions, as well as the Conquests, many books had been written by authors like:

Khalifah Ibn Khayyat (d. 245 A.H.) who wrote *al-Tabaqaat wa al-Tarikh*,

Al-Balaadhuri (d. 279 A.H.) who wrote *Futuh al-Buldaan* and *Ansaab al-Ashraf*,

Al-Mas'udi (d. 345 A.H.) who wrote *al-Tanbih wa al-Ishraaf* and *Muruj al-Dhahab*,

Al-Waaqedi (d. 207 A.H.) who wrote *Al-Maghaazi*,

Ibn Sa'd (d. 230 A.H.) who wrote *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, and tens of other revered books by other authors.

Why did the Six Sahih's attract such attention while the other books of hadith were completely neglected, and of the books of al-Maghaazi (the Messenger's military expeditions) and *Sirah*, Ibn Hisham's *Sirah*, and of the books of history, al-Tabari's *Tarikh*, were the only trusted books, neglecting all other books?

Briefly: The scholars of the Caliphate School are blamed on their scholarly works for two reasons:

First: They concealed the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) traditions: conduct and hadith, those parts that were contrary to the policy of the ruling authorities along centuries. The concealments covered the conducts of the past Prophets (peace be on them), the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his progeny (peace be on them) and companions, as well as the Islamic beliefs and the exegesis of the Holy Qur'an, as seen in the comments of al-Tabari and Ibn Kathir on the verse : "**And warn your near relatives**", as they concealed: "... *and my heir and my successor*" in respect of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), by replacing them with "*so and so*". They did the same to the text displaying the tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in respect of the Islamic precepts which did not coincide with the Caliph' opinions, as shall be explained in discussing the sources of the Islamic shari'ah in the Khulafa School, in vol. 2 of this book, Allah willing.

Second: As the Muslims are on the verge of a general renaissance, it does not behove them to remain imitating the four Imams of jurist sects, nor confine themselves to follow-up the authors of the Six Sahih in respect of regarding a hadith as weak or strong, especially al-Bukhari and Muslim, as well as regarding the Islamic precepts, which were issued by the caliphs according to their own opinions in defiance of the texts of the Traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in compliance with the interests of their time. They ought to search for reliable and authentic traditions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), to uncover what had been concealed from them in accordance with the policies of the caliphs during the past centuries, and then to unite their efforts to uphold the call for the unification of the Muslims through acting according to the Book of Allah and the true traditions of His Messenger(peace be on him and his progeny) - the traditions which are unanimously accepted. This goal is not a hard task to attain to, should Allah bestow His kindness on the Muslims.

Once Again the Succession (*wasiyyah*)

As the texts indicating the right of Imam ‘Ali and his sons (peace be on them) to the rule after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) are the most important cause for criticizing those who seized it, the scholars of the Caliphate School spared no effort to conceal those texts, especially the search of the People of the Book (*Ahl al-Kitaab*), after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), for his successor, and their opinions about him, such as the two monks who met Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) on his way to Siffin. Such news had been recorded by the scholars of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School in their books¹(1)1, or like the narration of the two Jews who came, during Abu Bakr’s time, asking about the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) successor. The people pointed to Abu Bakr. Failing to answer their questions, he sent for Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), who came and answered their questions. They proclaimed: "You are the successor of the Seal of the Prophets!" They adopted Islam instantly.

¹ For more details refer to Behar al-Anwaar, 2nd ed. Tehran, vol. 10, pp. 10-50.

Another narration about two other men of the people of the Book came to ‘Umar, during his rule, and there took place a similar scene between them, ‘Umar and ‘Ali (peace be on him), as the one mentioned above in the time of Abu Bakr.

We have already related the narration about Ka‘b al-Ahbaar who asked the Caliph ‘Umar about things that concerned the conduct of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), but ‘Umar referred him to ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both). Such referrals with the people of the Book, who, as a result, adopted Islam were frequent and occurred till recent times. Ibn Kathir, in his *Tarikh*¹(1)2, after quoting the Torah to the effect that Allah gave Ibraheem the good-tiding that he was to have a son, Ismaaeel, who will be augmented, and from his descendents He will bring up twelve great men. He also quoted Ibn Taymiyyah who said: "They are the subject of the good tiding referred to in the hadith of Jabir Ibn Samurah. The Hour of Resurrection will not come before their coming."

Commenting on this he said: "Many of the Jews, who had the honour of adopting Islam, had mistakenly thought that they were the ones advocated by the Rafidites, and, thus, followed them."

We wonder what was the story of the many of the Jews who had been honoured by Islam and followed the Rafidites?

The scholars adopted al-Tabari's pretext: "The common people cannot bear to hear them", and, consequently, they entirely dropped the stories of the people of the Book who adopted Islam and followed the Rafidites.

The Number of Dropped News, Narratives and Texts

By comparing the narratives of Ibn Kathir in his *Tarikh* about the ahaadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning the Kharijites whom Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) fought in the Battle of Naharwan, which covered seventeen pages of his book, and the scanty narratives of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which remained in the books, concerning the Battles of Jamal and Siffin, which include some of Imam ‘Ali's (peace be on him) merits, we shall realize the great loss incurred by the concealment of the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) narrations from the Muslim masses. They preserved the narratives which were

¹ Vol. 6, p. 250

related to the Kharijites who revolted against Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him), because their revolt continued against the authorities after Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) too. The spreading of those narratives was in the interest of the authorities. So, they narrated them in all the books of hadith and are preserved till date.

Among the hadiths of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which were contrary to the policy of the Caliphate School, and which they tried to conceal, were those hadiths of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) about ‘Ali (peace be on him) being his successor. They did the same in respect of the poetry and the prose said by the Companions in praise of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). We have already discussed how ‘A’ishah denied the succession. We have also seen how:

- a. A group had omitted from the texts parts containing any reference to the succession, without mentioning the omission, as they did to the poem of al-Nu‘man Ibn ‘Ajlan al-Ansari.
- b. They omitted a part of the hadith and replaced it with a vague expression, as was done by Tabari and Ibn Kathir in their interpretation of the phrase: "*my heir and my successor*" in the hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).
- c. Some others omitted the word "*succession*" from the hadith and distorted it, as Ibn Kathir did with the speech of Imam Husain (peace be on him).
- d. Others entirely omitted the narrative which contained the word succession, with only a hint at it, as was done by Tabari, Ibn Athir and Ibn Kathir in the letter of Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr.
- e. Some others omitted the whole narrative containing the word succession, without any indication of the omission, as Ibn Hisham did in respect of the narrative of the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) invitation of Banu Hashim, because it included his reference to ‘Ali as "*my heir and my successor among you*".
- f. Some of them misinterpreted the implication of the word "*succession*", as Tabaraani did to the hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), and Ibn Abi al-Hadid to the speech of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).

g. Some of them reported those narratives in their books unaware, then they omitted them, or replaced them with some vague expressions, in their other books, as Tabari did in his Tarîkh and Tafsîr.

h. Others related them in the first edition of their books, then they omitted them in their second edition, as did Muhammad Husain Haykal in his book Hayaat-o-Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny).

Surviving Texts from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) Concerning his Progeny's Right to Rule

It was our intention to state the texts received from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in relation to the right of the Imams (peace be on them) from his progeny. In this regard, we had to present the aforementioned discussions in order to show that the said hadiths quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in their favour, had been subjected to different concealments as mentioned before because they were contradicting the policy of the caliphs along centuries, and of which only very few have survived in the books of the Caliphate School because the scholars inadvertently wrote them down in their books, and we had been helped by Allah the Almighty to find them out and relate them hereunder, besides what has already been related:

Nominating the Successor in Different Terms

In discussing the Islamic terminology, and defining the terms successor and succession, we said that the successor was either denoted by the term succession and its derivatives, as when a testator says to his successor: "my will to you is to do such and such things after me," or by words indicating the meaning of the will, as when the testator tells the executor of his will: "I ask you to do such and such things", or telling the others that he had entrusted, or assigned so-and-so to do so and so. We also said that all those terms and their ilk denote that the testator entrusted somebody with what was important to him. This was the case with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in nominating his successor after him.

Another term used in this respect was the word “*minister*”, regarding the expression: The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) took his cousin as his minister, which is explained as follows:

The Minister of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

a. In the Glorious Qur’an, explained by the Messenger’s Sunnah: Later on, we will refer to the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) saying to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him): *"Are you not satisfied that you are unto me as Haroon was to Moosa except that there will be no prophet after me?"*

Allah the Almighty had referred to the position of Haroon in relation to Moosa, when Moosa asked his Lord: **"And appoint for me a minister from my family, Haroon, my brother; strengthen my back with him."**(Surah Taha (20): Verses 29-31)

In response to his demand, Allah the Almighty responded:

"We did give Moosa the Book and appointed with him his brother, Haroon, as a vizier." (Surah Furqan (25): Verse 35).

b. When did the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) take ‘Ali (peace be on him) as his vizier?

It was on the day in which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) invited Banu ‘Abd al-Muttalib and asked: *"Who will assist me in this affair (of Prophethood)?"* From them, only Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) offered to assist him (in his mission). Thus, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) took him as his minister.

Asma’ bint ‘Umayy said: "I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *"O Allah! Appoint for me a minister from my family"*. He (peace be on him and his progeny) invoked his Lord, further: *"O Allah! I pray as my brother Moosa prayed: O Allah! Appoint for me a minister from my family, my brother ‘Ali; strengthen my back with him."*¹(1)

Suyuti, commenting on the verse: **"And appoint for me a minister from my family"**, says: "When this verse was revealed, the Messenger of Allah (peace be

¹ Al-Riyaad al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p. 163, quoting al-Manaaqib by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal

on him and his progeny) invoked his Lord: *'O Allah! Strengthen my back with my brother, 'Ali'*, and he was granted his demand."

Ibn 'Umar narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to 'Ali, *"You are my brother and my minister, you will repay my debts and fulfill my promises..."* as the hadith goes in praise of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him).

By saying: *"You are to me as Haroon was to Moosa, except that there will be no prophet after me"*, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) confirmed for Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) all that Haroon (peace be on him) had from Moosa (peace be on him), except Prophethood, at the head of which was his being a minister to Prophet Moosa (peace be on him). The relevant sources will be referred to later, Allah willing.

In Nahj al-Balaaghah¹, it is stated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him and): *"But you are my minister."*

In the poem ascribed to al-Ash'ath, in his reply to a letter from Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to him: *"The minister of the Prophet and his son-in-law..."*

It is quite clear from the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) saying to his cousin: *"You are my brother and my minister, will repay my debts and fulfill my promises"*, that he had appointed him as his successor after him.

Similarly his describing him as: *"my caliph"*, as below:

The Caliph of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

Under the chapter "The Battle of Tabuk" in Sahih al-Bukhari, as has formerly been related in respect of those whom the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had appointed as his successors in Madinah when he used to set out for an expedition that: *"The Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny) set out for Tabuk, appointing 'Ali (peace be on him) as his successor (in Madinah). Ali (peace be on him) said: 'Do you want to leave me with the children and the women?'*" The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

¹ Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 121; Kanz al-'Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 6, p. 155, quoting Tabaraani.

replied: *'Are you not content that you are unto me as Haroon was to Moosa, except that there will be no prophet after me?'*" The Noble Qur'an, in this respect, says: "... **And Moosa said to his brother, Haroon: 'Be my caliph among my people, and do good...'**" (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 142).

In the text of one of the two hadiths narrated by Ahmad Ibn Hanbal in his Musnad¹(1)1, concerning the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) invitation to Banu 'Abd al-Muttalib, he states that the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) words, included: "*and my caliph*".

* * *

Those were what we could relate, in this quick discussion, concerning the successor, the minister and the caliph. Hereunder are some other texts after the concealment of the Caliphate School.

Among them is the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) statement about his cousin to the effect that he would be the Master of the Muslims after him, as below:

The Master of the Muslims after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

In several instances, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) explicitly stated that 'Ali (peace be on him) was the **master of the affairs** (*wali al-amr*) of the Muslims, as in the following narrations:

First: The Hadith of the Complaint

Ahmad in his Musnad - as well as al-Nesaa'i in his al-Khasaa'is, al-Haakem in his al-Mustadrak and elsewhere - said that Buraydah said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) dispatched two missions to Yemen, one headed by 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) and the other by Khalid Ibn Walid and instructed them: *'If you meet, 'Ali will be (the chief) on the people, and if you separated, each one of you would be (the chief) on his brigade.'* He (the narrator) said: 'We encountered Banu Zayd of Yemen and fought them. The Muslims triumphed over the idolators. We killed their fighters and took their women and

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 111

children as captives. ‘Ali (peace be on him) chose a woman of the captives for himself. Khalid Ibn Walid sent with me a letter to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) informing him about the incident. When I came to the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) I handed the letter, which was read to him. I noticed anger on the face of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). I said: ‘O Messenger of Allah! This is a place for refuge! You sent me with a man and ordered me to obey him. I did what I was sent for.’ The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) reprimanded me: ‘*Do not disparage ‘Ali! He is from me and I am from him. He is your master after me. He is from me and I from him. He is your master after me.*’”¹(1)

In another version: "I said: ‘O Messenger of Allah! By our companionship, extend your hand to give you the allegiance of Islam anew.’ I did not leave before giving him my allegiance on Islam.”²(2)

Tirmidhi in his Sahih – as well as in the Musnads of Ahmad and Tayaalisi and in other sources – quoting ‘Imran Ibn Husain, said: "Four Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) resolved, in the Battle of Tabuk, to complain against ‘Ali to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as we see him. When they came to him, one of them said: ‘O Messenger of Allah! Do you believe that ‘Ali did so and so?’ The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) turned away from him.

The second, third and fourth man repeated what the first had said. Each time the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) turned away from the complainant. Thereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: ‘*What do you want from*

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, p. 356; Al-Nesaa’i’s Khasaa’is, p. 24, with a slight difference. Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 110, with difference in wording. Majma’ al-Zawa’id, vol. 9, p. 127; Kanz al-Ummaal, vol. 12, p. 207, summarized from Ibn Abi Shaybah, and in its vol. 12, p. 210, quoting al-Daylami. Al-Manaawi’s Kunooz al-Haqa’iq, p. 186.

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, pp. 350, 358 and 361; Majma’ al-Zawaa’id, vol. 9, p. 128 quoting Tabaraani in al-Awsat, in which the text is: "*Of whomever I am his master, this ‘Ali is his master too.*".

'Ali? What do you want from 'Ali? What do you want from 'Ali? 'Ali is from me and I am from him. He is the master of every believer after me.'"¹(3)3

A Second Complaint

In 'Usud al-Ghaabah - as well as Majma' al-Zawaa'id and other sources - it is recorded: Wahab Ibn Hamzah reports: "I accompanied 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) from Madinah to Makkah. I noticed things in him which I disliked. I said: 'I will complain to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) against you on my return.' On my arrival, I met the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and said: 'I saw such things in 'Ali.' He (peace be on him and his progeny) scolded me: *'Do not say so as he is more entitled to you [all] than anyone else after me.'*"²(1)1

The Time of the Complaint

Historians and biographers mention two expeditions of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to Yemen, while we believe them to be three, which we shall prove, if Allah wills, under the title '**Ijtihad**'. Anyways, the last took place in the tenth year of Hijrah, as Imam Ali (peace be on him) joined the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the Farewell Pilgrimage (famous as al-Hajjah al-Weda'), on the eighth of Dhu al-Hijjah. The complaints concerned his expeditions to Yemen. If they had been presented in twice, the first of them must have taken place in Madinah before the tenth year of the Hijrah, and the second must have taken place in Makkah, after the arrival of Imam's (peace be on him) companions, before the 8th of Dhu al-Hijjah, as they had arrived in Makkah before the start of the Hajj rites.

Consequently, some of the scholars were mistaken in saying that the incident of Ghadir-e-Khumm had taken place due to that complaint because that event took place in al-Juhfah after the completion of the Hajj rites attended by the masses of

¹ Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 165, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib". Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 437; Musnad al-Tayaalisi, vol. 3, p. 111, Hadith 829. Al-Haakem's al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 110; al-Nesaa'i's Khasaa'is, pp. 16 and 19. Abu Na'im's Hilyah, vol. 6, p. 294; al-Riyaadh al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p. 171; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 12, p. 207 and vol. 15, p. 125

² 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 5, p. 92; Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 159

the Muslims, while the conversation between the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and the complainants must have taken place in a private session and at the very time they were lodging the complaint.

As for the second complaint, the very text says that it had taken place after their return to al-Madinah.

Second: Other Undated texts

Ibn Abbas said:

"Surely, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said to 'Ali (peace be on him): *'You are the master of every faithful after me.'*"¹(2)2

Ali (peace be on him) reports that the Holy Prophet told him, "*Surely, you are the master of the believers after me.*"

Celebrating the Appointment of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as a Master-Designate after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Successor upon Islam and Muslims

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) celebrated massively on the occasion of the appointment of his heir and his successor on Islam and Muslims, after him. Here is what al-Haakem al-Haskaani narrated in this regard:

Ibn Abbas and Jabir said: "Allah commanded Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) to appoint 'Ali for the people and tell them about his mastership. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was afraid lest they accused him of favouring his cousin and thus, defame him and defy his order. But Allah the Almighty revealed to him: **'O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord. If you do it not, then you will not have conveyed his message. Allah will protect you from the people..'** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 67). So, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) announced his mastership on the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm."²(1)1

¹ At-Tayalisi's Musnad, 11/360 hadith, 2752. Ar-Riyadun-Nadira, 2/203

² Al-Haakem al-Hasakani is al-Hafiz 'Ubaydullah Ibn ' Abdullah Ibn Ahmad, the shoemaker, a Hanafite of Naysabur. He was a knowledgeable of the fourth and

It is narrated that Ziyaad Ibn al-Mundhir (more famous with his agnomen Abu al-Jaarood) used to report:

"Once, I was with Abu Ja'far Muhammad Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both); as he was addressing the people, a man from Basrah - named 'Uthman al-A'shaa, who used to narrate on the authority of al-Hasan al-Basri – stood up and said: 'O son of the Messenger of Allah! May Allah make me your ransom! Hasan tells us that this verse: **O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord...**' was revealed about a man but would not tell who he was. He (peace be on him) replied: *'He could tell you who he was if he so desired, but he is afraid. Jibraeel descended to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)... and said: 'Allah commands you to make known to your nation their master (the same way) as you informed them about their prayers, poor-rate, fasting and Hajj so as to force them to accept the proof on all that.'* The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *'O my Lord! My people have only recently parted with paganism; they are accustomed to rivalry and pride and there is none from them but that he wants to take revenge on this master (wali). I am afraid (i.e. of their denial).'*' Allah, then revealed to him: **'O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord. If you do it not, then you will not have conveyed His message (i.e. not conveyed it at all). Allah will protect you from the people.'** After that Allah assured him of His protection and threatened him, he (peace be on him and his progeny) took 'Ali's hand..."¹(1)

Al-Haakem al-Haskaani narrated:

"Ibn 'Abbas, in the narration of Ascension (haid al-Mi'raj), said: 'Allah, Glorified be His Name, said to His Prophet, among other things: *'I did not send any Prophet unless I appointed for him a minister. You are a messenger of Allah and your minister is 'Ali'*'.

Ibn Abbas added: 'The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) disliked to talk to the people about it, as their paganism was not far from them...

fifth century Hijri (exp. 405 A.H.). His biography is in Tadhkirah al-Huffaaz, Indian ed., vol. 4, p. 390, and Egypt ed., vol. 3, p. 1200 at the end of the 14th generation. We referred to his book Shawaahid al-Tanzil le Qawaa'id al-Tafsil on the verses revealed in favour of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), edited by Muhammad Baqir al-Mahmudi, Beirut, 1393 A.H. The said hadith is in vol. 1, p.192, No. 249

¹ Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, p. 191. Look up al-Waahidi's comment on the verse in his Asbaab al-Nuzul, and Abu Na'im's Nuzul al-Qur'an.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) forbore until it was the eighteenth (of the month of Zilhajj) when Allah revealed to him: **O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you...** So, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *‘O people! Allah has sent me to you with a message and I felt uneasy about it fearing that you will accuse me (of nepotism) and deny it, until my Lord blamed me for it and revealed a threat to me...’*¹(2)2

Both al-Haskaani and Ibn ‘Asaakir, quoting Abu Hurayrah, report:

"Allah, the Glorified, revealed: **‘O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you (concerning ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib). If you do it not, then you will not have conveyed His message..’**² (3)3

Abu Hurayrah wanted to say that it referred to what had been revealed in respect of ‘Ali (peace be on him).

Al-Haskaani, quoting ‘Abdullah Ibn Abi Awfa, who said:

"I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) on the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm, reciting the verse: **‘O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you...’**; thereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) raised his hands till the whiteness of his armpit was visible, and said: *‘Of whosoever I am his master, this Ali is his master...’*³(4)4

Waaahidi in Asbaab al-Nuzul and Suyuti in al-Durr al-Manthur, quoting Abu Sa‘id al-Khudri, said:

"The verse: **‘O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord...’** had been revealed in favour of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib."⁴(1)1

¹ Al-Haskaani’s Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, pp. 192-193. On p. 189, only the descent of the verse is discussed.

² Al-Haskaani’s Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, p.187, and narrated by Ibn ‘Asaakir in his biography of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him and his progeny), in Tarikh-o-Dimashq, through many authorities, hadith No. 452.

³ Al-Haskaani, vol. 1, p. 190. ‘Abdullah Ibn Abi Awfa is ‘Alqamah Ibn Khalid al-Harith al-Aslami. A Companion who participated in the incident of al-Hudaybiyyah and lived after the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). He died in the year 86 or 87 A.H. He was the last of the Companions to die in Kufah. His hadith was quoted by all the authors of the Sahihs. His biography is in Taqrib al-Tahdeeb, vol. 1, p. 402 and in ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 121.

⁴ . Asbaab al-Nuzul, p. 135; al-Durr al-Manthur , vol. 2, p.298. It seems to be the same hadith No. 244 in Shawaahid al-Tanzil. Look up Fath al-Qadeer, vol. 2, p. 57,

In Suyuti's exegesis, it is reported that Ibn Mas'ud said: "In the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), we used to recite: '**O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you** (*that 'Ali is the master of the faithful*). **If you do it not, then you will not have conveyed His message..**'¹

(2)2

Ibn Mas'ud implied that in the life of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), they used to read it as so in their exegesis of the verse. This verse was revealed in Ghadir-e-Khumm. Here are the details:

The Event of Ghadir Khumm

During the return of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from the Farewell Pilgrimage (al-Hajjah al-Wedaa)²(3)3, on the 18th Dhu al-Hijjah³(4)4, the verse: '**O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you...**'⁴ was revealed.(5)5 So, he (peace be on him and his progeny) dismounted in Ghadir-e-Khumm near Juhfah⁵(6)6, a junction of roads going to Madinah, Egypt and Syria⁶(7)7. He stopped there until those who were behind joined him, and those who had gone a head returned to where he was⁷(8)8. He (peace be on him and his progeny) prevented his companions from resting under some trees dispersed in the wide river-bed and ordered to sweep away the thorns from under them⁸(9)9.

and al-Naysaburi's exegesis, vol. 6, p. 194. Waahidi is Abu al-Hasan 'Ali Ibn Ahmad al-Wahidi al-Naysaburi (d. 468 A.H). We quoted from his book Asbaab al-Nuzul, Beirut ed.

¹ Al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 2, p. 298 published in 1395 A.H.

² Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 105 & 163-165 from which we quoted this part of the discussion.

³ Narrated by al-Haakem al-Haskaani, vol. 1, pp. 192-193

⁴ The references have already been mentioned.

⁵ Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 163-165; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, pp. 209-213

⁶ Al-Juhfa as described in Mu'jam al-Buldaan

⁷ Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 213.

⁸ Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 105 and nearly the same in Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 209

Thereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) called for a congregational prayers.¹(2)11 He went to them² (the trees) where the garment was spread on a tree to shade the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from the (scorching) sun³(3)1. He (peace be on him and his progeny) performed the noon prayers.⁴(4)2 and stood to deliver a sermon. He (peace be on him and his progeny) thanked Allah and praised Him, reminded the people, admonished them and said whatever Allah willed him to say; finally, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"I am about to be summoned and will respond. I will be questioned and so will you. So, what would you say?"* They said: "We will testify that you did convey (the message) and advised well. May Allah reward you best!"

"Do you not testify", he asked them, "that there is no god but Allah, and that Muhammad is His servant and messenger, and that Paradise is true and that Hell is true?" "Yes," they said, "we do testify." He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"O Allah! Be a Witness!"* Then, he asked: *"Do you hear?"* "Yes," they said. *"O people!"* He said: *"I am going ahead and you will follow me at the Pond (of Kauthar), whose width is the distance between (the cities of) Busraa⁵(5)3 and San'aa'; in it are silver goblets equal to the number of the stars. I am going to question you about the two precious things (thaqalayn). So, be careful how you treat them after me."* Somebody asked, screaming: "What are the Thaqalayn, O Messenger of Allah?" He (peace be on him and his progeny) answered: *"The Book of Allah - one end of which is in the hand of Allah and the other end is in your hands; so, adhere to it you will not go astray nor stumble - and my progeny, my Ahl al-Bait. I have been informed by (Allah) the Subtle, the Aware, that these two will not separate until they come to me at the Pond (of Kauthar). I asked it for them from my Lord. So, do not go ahead of them lest you perish nor lag behind*

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 281; Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, Chapter on "Ali's Merits". Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, pp. 209-210.

² Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp.163-165

³ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 372; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 212

⁴ Ibid., vol. 4, p. 281; Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, Chapter on "Ali's merits". Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 212.

⁵ Busraa was the name of two villages: one near Damascus and the other near Baghdad.

them lest you perish; do not teach them as they are more learned than you"¹(6)⁴ Then he said: "Do you not know that I am more entitled to the faithful than they are to themselves?" "Yes," said they, "O Messenger of Allah."²(7)⁵ He said: "Do you not know (or testify) that I am more entitled to every faithful than he is to himself?" "Yes, O Messenger of Allah," they said³(1)⁶ Then he took 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib by his upper arm and raised it so high that the people could see the whiteness of their armpits⁴(2)⁷, and said: 'O people! Allah is my mawla and I am you mawla⁵(3)¹. Whoever I am his mawla, 'Ali is his mawla⁶(4)², too O Allah be friend who befriends him, be hostile to who is hostile to him⁷(5)³, assist who assists him, desert who deserts him⁸(6)⁴, love whoever loves him and hate whoever hates him⁹(7)⁵.' Then he said: 'O Allah! Be witness!¹⁰(8)⁶' Then, they both, the Messenger of Allah and 'Ali, did not part until the following verse was revealed: *'This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favour upon you and have chosen for you Islam as a religion.'* (5: 3).

¹ Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 162-163 and 165. Some of its wordings are used by al-Haakem, vol. 3, pp. 109-110; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 209

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 118-119, vol. 4, p. 281; Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, vol. 1, p. 43, Hadith 116. In Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, pp. 281, 368, 370 & 372, and Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 209; Ibn Kathir in vol. 5, p. 210 states: "*Am I not more entitled to every man than he is to himself?*"

³ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, pp. 281, 368, 370 & 372; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, pp. 209 and 212.

⁴ Al-Haakem al-Haskaani, in vol. 1, p. 190, says: "He raised his hands so much that the whiteness of his armpits could be seen.

⁵ Ibid., vol. 1, p. 191; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 209, narrates: "*and I am the master of every faithful.*"

⁶ As stated in all the sources we have referred to so far concerning all the relevant hadiths.

⁷ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 118 & 119, vol. 4, pp. 281, 370, 372, 373, vol. 5, pp. 347 and 370; Al-Haakem's al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 109; Ibn Maajah's Sunan, Chapter on 'Ali's merits; al-Haakem al-Haskaani, vol.1, pp. 190 & 191; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, pp. 209 & 210-213, who, in vol.5, p. 209, says: "I said to Zayd: 'Did you hear it from the Messenger of Allah?' He said: 'There remained none under the trees but that he saw with his eyes and heard with his ears.' Ibn Kathir added: 'Our teacher Abu 'Abd Allah al-Dhahabi, said: This hadith is true."

⁸ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol.1, pp. 118 & 119; Majma' al-Zawa'id, vol.9, pp. 104, 105 and 107; Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, p. 193; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, pp. 210-211

⁹ Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, p. 191; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol.5, p. 210

¹⁰ Ibid., vol.1, p. 190

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) proclaimed: “*Allah is Greatest for perfecting the religion, for completing the favour, for Allah’s being pleased with my mission and for (granting) ‘Ali the mastership.*”¹(9)7

In Tarikh al-Ya‘qubi, in the Chapter on ‘What was revealed of the Qur‘an in Madinah’, it is stated: "The last verse which was revealed to him was: ‘**This day have I perfected...**’, which is a true and proved narrative. It was revealed on the same day of the appointment of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (may Allah’s blessing be upon him) in Ghadir-e-Khumm."²(1)8

Later, meeting him, ‘Umar said to him: "Blessed are you, O son of Abu Talib! You have become by day and night, the master of every faithful, man and woman."³(2)9

In another narration, he said:

"Congratulations, congratulations to you, O son of Abu Talib!"⁴(3)10

Imam’s (peace be on him) Coronation

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had a turban called al-Sahaab [the cloud]. He placed this turban on ‘Ali’s head⁵(4)1. It was black in colour⁶(5)2, and the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) used to wear it on certain occasions⁷(6)3 like the day of the Conquest of Makkah. Concerning the occasion of ‘Ali’s coronation on the Day of Ghadir, there are reports, such as the following:

‘Abd al-A‘la Ibn ‘Adi al-Bahrani said:

¹ It was narrated by al-Haakem al-Haskaani, quoting Abu Sa‘id al-Khudri, vol.1, pp.157-158, hadith 211 and 212. He also quoted Abu Hurayrah on p.158, hadith 213 and in Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 214, in brief.

² Tarikh al-Ya‘qubi, vol. 2, p. 43.

³ Shawaahed al-Tanzeel, vol. 1, pp. 157-158

⁴

Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 281, Chapter of “Ali’s Merits”; al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 169; with slight variation in Tarikh Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 210

⁵ Ibn al-Qayyim’s Zaad al-Ma‘ad, Chapter on "His clothes", in the margin written by al-Zarqani on al-Mawaahib al-Ladunniyyah, vol. 1, p.121

⁶ The colour of the said turban was mentioned in Abdullah Ibn Bishr’s narrative, and in Imam’s narration

⁷ Look up hadith books. Al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 289; ‘Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 114

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called 'Ali on the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm and turbaned him, sending its end over his back."¹(7)4

'Ali (peace be on him) reports: "*The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) turbaned me on the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm with a black turban, letting its wisp on my shoulder.*"²(8)5

Quoting him, Baihaqi in Sunan, and Tayaalisi in Musnad, said: "*The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) turbaned me on the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm and let it down my back. Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'Allah, the Glorified, provided me, in the battles of Badr and Hunayn, with angels wearing this turban...' then he added: 'The turban is a distinguisher between the Muslims and the Idolators'...*"³(9)6

¹ Al-Riyaadh al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p. 289; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol.3, p. 114.

² Al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 274 quoting Baghwi.

³ Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 20, p.45; Tayaalisi's Musnad, vol.1, p. 23 and Baihaqi's Sunan, vol. 10, p. 14

‘Ali (peace be on him) was quoted to have said that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) had turbaned him with his hands, and let the tail of the turban loose down his back and front, and that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him: *"Turn back"*. He turned back. Then he said to him: *"Turn round."* He turned round. He turned round. He then turned to his Companions and said: *"Such are the crowns of the angels."*¹(1)7

Ibn ‘Abbas is quoted to have said: When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) turbaned ‘Ali with ‘the cloud’, he said to him: *‘O Ali! Turbans are the crowns of the Arabs’...*²(2)8

‘Abdullah Ibn Bishr said:

On the day of Ghadir-e-Khumm, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) sent for ‘Ali, turbaned him, let it down between his shoulders, and said: *‘Such was that Allah, the Glorified, provided me, on the day of the Battle of Hunayn, with turbaned angels, who let them down. It was to distinguish between the Muslims and the idolators’...*³(3)1

The Adjuration

‘Ali (peace be on him) gathered the people in the public square of the Kufah Mosque⁴(4)2 and said to them:

*"I appeal to every Muslim man, who heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say what he said in Ghadir-e-Khumm, to stand up"*⁵(5)3 but

¹ Ibid.

² Ibid., quoting al-Daylami

³ Quoted from Ibn Tawus in Amaan al-Akhtaar except that it is in the biography of ‘Abdullah Ibn Bishr in al-Isaabah, vol. 2, p. 274

⁴ Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 211. No. 4566, without using the name: Ghadir-e-Khumm.

⁵ Narrated by Abu al-Tufail, ‘Aamir, or ‘Amr Ibn Waa’elah al-Laythi. He was born in the year of the Battle of ‘Uhud. He saw the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) and lived till the year 110 A.H. He was the last of the Companions. All the authors of the Sahihs have quoted on his authority. Al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 389. His narrative was quoted by Ahmad in his Musnad confirmed through three authorities:

a. Quoting Abu al-Tufayl on the authority of Zayd Ibn Arqam.

b. Quoting Sa’id Ibn Wahb al-Hamdani al-Janwani, a trusted Kufan, died in the year 75 or 76 A.H. His biography is in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, quoted briefly by Ahmad in Musnad, vol. 5, p. 366.

only the one who had himself seen him."¹(6)4 Thirty persons stood up (in another narration: many persons stood up)²(1)5. 'Abd al-Rahman said: "Twelve of those who participated in the battle of Badr stood up. It is as if I am looking at one of them."³ They saw him raise 'Ali's hand, and say to the people: '*Do you know that I am having more authority on the believers than they have upon themselves?*' They said: 'Yes, O Messenger of Allah!⁴(3)7' He (peace be on him and his progeny) then said: '*Of whoever I am his master, this Ali is his master too. O Allah! Accept him as your slave who takes him (Ali) as his master, be enemy to whoever takes him as an enemy*⁵(4)8, *help him whoever helps him (Ali) and forsake him whoever forsakes him (Ali)*⁶(5)9'. 'Abd al-Rahman said: "They all stood up except three. He (peace be on him) cursed them and they were afflicted by his curse."⁷(6)1.

Abu al-Tufayl said: "I left (the place) with something in my heart. I met Zayd Ibn Arqam. I said to him: 'I heard 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) say so and so.' He said: 'What is disagreeable to you in it? Even I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say it to him.'⁸(7)2

In a narration it is said: "Thirty persons stood up."⁹(8)3

c. Quoting Zayd Ibn Yathî al-Hamdani al-Kufi, trustworthy, lived through paganism and Islam, a second-generation narrator. Look up his biography in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol.1, p. 277.

¹ As narrated by ' Abd al-Rahman Ibn Abi Layla al-Ansari al-Madani al-Kufi, trustworthy of the second-generation; quoted by all the authors of the Sahihs. He died in the year 80 A.H. approximately. His biography is in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 1, p. 496. The above narrative is quoted from Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p.119, hadith 964.

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 370, quoting the hadith of Abu al-Tufayl. Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 212.

³ Abd al-Rahman's hadith is in Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 961 and vol. 5, p. 370, also in Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 211

⁴ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 118 and vol. 4, p. 370. Ibn Kathir vol. 5, p. 211. Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 105.

⁵ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 118-119, vol. 4, p. 372 and vol. 5, p. 370. Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 211.

⁶ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 118; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 5, p. 212

⁷ Ibid. vol. 1, p. 119, hadith No. 964.

⁸ Ibid., vol. 4, p. 370

⁹ Ibid. Al-Rîyaad al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p. 162; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 212

Another narration says: "A group of the Ansar came to 'Ali in the square and greeted him, saying: 'Peace be upon you, our master!' He (peace be on him) said: '*How is it that I am your master whereas you are Arabs?*' They said: 'We heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), on the day of Khumm, say: '*Of whomever I am his master, this (Ali) is his master (too).*' The narrator said: 'As they left, I followed them and asked who they were. I was told they were of the Ansar; among them was Abu Ayyub (Ansari)."

In another narration: "He ('Ali) asked them: '*Who are you?*' They said: '(We are) your slaves, O Amir al-Mu'minîn.'¹(9)4

How Similar was the Appointment of the Successor in this nation to the Appointment of the Successor in the Nation of Prophet Moosa'!

Concerning the appointment of successor to (Prophet) Moosa the son of 'Imran (peace be on them both), we read in the Old Testament (Torah), the gist of which is as follows: "*The Lord told Moosa. 'Take Yusha, the son of Nun, a man with spirit. Put your hand over him, and make him stand before the whole group, and instruct him before their eyes, and bestow from your dignity upon him, so that all the children of Israel obey him; according to his order they go in and according to his order, they go out.'* Moosa did what the Lord told him to do. He took Yusha, made him stand before all the groups, put his hand over him and instructed as the Lord said..."

In the Glorious Qur'an, after revealing to the Seal of Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) about Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) what Allah wanted to reveal, we read: "**O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord. If you do it not, then you will not have conveyed His Message. And Allah will protect you from the people....**" We, then noted that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered the pilgrims to gather in Ghadir-e-Khumm, asking those who had gone to come back, and waiting for those who were still behind. Thereafter, he took the hand of 'Ali (peace be on him) and raised him before all the people, exceeding seventy thousand in number, and,

¹ Ibid., vol. 5, p./419; Ibn Kathir, vol. 5, p. 212

addressing them all, says: "*Do not you testify that I am having more authority upon the faithful than they have upon themselves?*" When they all affirmed: "Yes", he bestowed from his dignity upon Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), by declaring: "*Of whoever I am his master, this 'Ali is his master (too). O Allah! Take him as a slave who takes Ali as his master and be enemy of the one who bears enmity against Ali...*"

* * *

The aforementioned texts were a part of the Prophetic Sunnah concerning nominating the Imam of the ummah and the master of the affairs after him (peace be on him and his progeny). Hereunder, we relate what is stated in the Book of Allah regarding this subject:

Mastership and the Masters of Affairs in the Glorious Qur'an

a. 'Ali's Mastership in the Glorious Qur'an

The said hadiths confirmed Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) mastership over the believers after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). This was exactly what was meant by the verse: "Your master is only Allah, His Messenger and those who believe, who perform the prayers and pay the poor-rate while kneeling (during the prayers)." (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 55).

The claim is supported by the following narratives:

Tafseer al-Tabari, Waahidi's Asbaab al-Nuzul, Haakem al-Haskaani's Shawaahid al-Tanzil, al-Balaadhuri's Ansaab al-Ashraaf and other sources¹ relate,

¹ Tabari, vol. 6, p. 186; Waahidi, pp. 133 & 136. Al-Haskaani, vol. 1, pp. 161-164 relates five narratives from Ibn 'Abbas, and on pp. 165-166, two narratives from Anas Ibn Malik, and six other narratives on pp. 167-169, and in Ansaab al-Ashraaf, hadith No. 151 of the biography of Imam (peace be on him), vol. 1, p. 225, and al-Naysaaburi's Gharaa'ib al-Qur'an in Tabari's margins, vol. 6, pp. 167-168. Suyuti related several such narratives in his exegesis, vol. 2, pp. 293-296. He also said in Lubaab al-Nuqul fi Asbaab al-Nuzul, pp.90-91, after relating the narratives, "All these testimonies strengthen each other."

quoting Ibn ‘Abbas, Abu Dharr, Anas Ibn Malik, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) and others, a narrative which is summarized as follows:

A Muslim destitute entered the Messenger of Allah’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Mosque and begged.¹ (1)2 ‘Ali (peace be on him) was in genuflection in his recommended prayers. The beggar’s heartbreaking words touched Imam’s (peace be on him) feelings. So, he (peace be on him) beckoned him with his right hand behind his back. He had a red Yemenite-agate ring which he used to wear on his finger during the prayers. He pointed to the beggar to take it. The beggar took it, prayed for him and went away. Before anybody could leave the mosque, Gabriel (peace be on him) descended with the verse: **"Your master is only Allah..."**² (2)3 For this occasion, Hassaan Ibn Thabit recited a poem, which had the following lines:

*O Abul Hasan! May my self and soul
And that of every slow and quick in faith be your ransom!
It was you who gave (charity), while kneeling,
May the souls of the people be your ransom, you, the best of kneelers! Allah has
revealed in your (favour) the best of mastership
And registered it in the firmest of Laws³ (3)1*

Objections on the Verse’s Indication

Some people object that the context of the said narratives refer to the verse: **"... and those who believe, who perform the salat and pay the zakat while kneeling,"** where all terms are used in plural, while Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was one person. So, how can plural tense be used for a single person?

The author says: Whoever objects so has erred because what is not allowed is the use of the singular to denote a plural, whereas the other way round, it is allowed and is common in colloquial Arabic. Examples of such usages are plenty in the Glorious Qur’an, such as the expression in Surah al-Munafiqeen: **"In the Name of**

¹ This is gathered from the narration of Anas who said: "The Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) came to the mosque for the noon prayers. There he saw ‘ Ali (peace be on him) kneeling." A similar narrative was related by Ibn ‘ Abbas and both are quoted in Shawaahid al-Tanzil, vol. 1, pp. 163-164.

² Up to here was a summary based on the narrative related in Shawaahid al-Tanzil.

³ Quoted from Kifaayah al-Taalib, Chapter 61, p. 228. Other sources of the hadith are in Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 7, p. 357

Allah, the Beneficient, the Merciful. When the hypocrites come to you, they say: We bear witness that you are most surely Allah's Messenger, and Allah knows that certainly you are His Messenger and Allah bears witness that the hypocrites are surely liars....And when it is said to them: 'Come, the Messenger of Allah will seek forgiveness for you, they turn back their heads and you may see them turning away in pride....They it is who say: Do not spent upon those who are with the Messenger of Allah that they may disperse. And Allah's are the treasures of the heavens and the earth, but the hypocrites do not comprehend. They say: If we return to Madinah, the mighty from it will surely drive out the weaker ones. And to Allah belongs might, and to His Messenger and the believers but the hypocrites do not know." (Surah al-Munafiqeen (63): Verses 1, 5 and 8)

Tabari, commenting on this Surah, says: "All these verses refer to 'Abdullah Ibn Ubayy Salul... Allah had revealed this Surah, from beginning to end, concerning him. All the people of interpretation and all the narratives say as we say."¹(1)2

Suyuti, commenting on this Surah, says that Ibn 'Abbas informed: "Everything revealed about the hypocrites (in this Surah) refers to 'Abdullah Ibn 'Ubayy."²(2)3

The relevant story, as narrated by the biographers and available in the exegeses, is summarized hereunder:

Jahjaah (Ibn Saeed) al-Ghifaari, one of 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab's workers, had a quarrel with Senaan al-Juhani, an ally of the Khazraj, over some water, after the the Battle of Bani al-Mustaliq. Juhani called out (for help): "O Ansar!" While Jahjaah called out: "O Migrants!" 'Abdullah Ibn 'Ubayy got angry. With him were a number of his people, including Zayd Ibn Arqam, then a youth. He shouted: "Did they do it? they are repulsive. They outnumber us in our own region. By Allah, we and the garments of Quraysh are like the saying: 'Fatten your dog, and he will eat you!' By Allah, if we return to Madinah, the mightier will surely drive out the weaker." Then he turned to those present of his people and said: "This is what you have incurred upon yourselves. You have received them in your places

¹ Tafseer al-Tabari, vol. 28, p. 270

² Al-Durr al-Manthoor of Suyuti, vol. 6, p. 223

and shared your proper ties with them. By Allah! Had you retained from them what you had in your hands, they would have turned away to other than your region." Zayd Ibn Arqam heard and reported it to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the presence of 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab.¹(3)1

'Umar Ibn Khattaab said: "Let me behead him, O Messenger of Allah!" He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: "*Many noses will thunder for him in Yathrib [Madinah].*" 'Umar said: "If you dislike, O Messenger of Allah, that a man of the Migrants should kill him, then order Sa'd Ibn Ma'adh and Muhammad Ibn Maslamah to kill him." He said: "*I dislike that people should talk about Muhammad killing his companions.*"²(1)2

'Abdullah went to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and swore that nothing of that happened. The Ansar blamed Zayd for his reporting, and told Abdullah: "If you see the Messenger of Allah, seek forgiveness for yourself." He turned his head away and said: "You had ordered me to believe, I did. You had ordered me to pay the poor-rate, I paid. There remains nothing but to prostrate for Muhammad." At this juncture, the said verses from the aforementioned Surah was revealed: "**They it is who say: Do not spend upon those who are with the Messenger of Allah, that they may disperse.**" It was he who was meant by the verse: "**And when it is said to them: 'Come the Messenger of Allah will ask forgiveness for you,' they turn back their heads...**"³(2)3

* * *

Allah, in this Surah, referred to 'Abdullah Ibn 'Ubayy, though a single person, by saying: "**They it is who say...**" and "**And when it is said to them: Come, the Messenger of Allah will ask forgiveness for you, they turn back their heads...**" The sayers and the doers are one, as the commentators unanimously say. All the narratives say so. We just wanted to give an example, and one may refer to many more similar examples in the Holy Qur'an, such as: "**And there are some of them who trouble the Prophet and say: He is only an ear...**" (Surah Taubah (9): Verse 61) and: "**Those to whom the people said: The people have gathered**

¹ Tafsir al-Tabari, vol. 28, p. 75.

² Ibid., vol. 28, p. 74

³ We have summarized several narratives stated in Tafseer al-Tabari, vol. 28, p. 71 as well as Suyuti's exegesis, vol. 6, p. 222 and in other exegeses and biographies.

against you..." (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 173) and: **"... saying: We have no hand in the affair..."** (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 154), and the like in which the plural is meant to refer to a singular. The Holy Qur'an contains many examples of this kind.

b. The Possessors of Authority (Ulul Amr): 'Ali and the Imams from his offspring (peace be on them)

The former successive and interwoven narratives confirm that 'Ali was the master of the believers and the master of their affairs after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). They also explain the meaning of the possessors of authority in the verse: **"O you who believe! Obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those possessing authority from among you."** (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 59)

It was further confirmed by the following hadiths:

1. It is in Shawaahid al-Tanzil that 'Ali (peace be on him) asked the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) about the verse and said: *"O Messenger of Allah! Who are they?"* He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"You are the first of them."*
2. Mujahid, concerning the above verse said: "Allah gave mastership of all affairs to 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) after Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) during his lifetime when he succeeded the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Madinah. Allah commanded His servants to obey him and refer to him in all disputes."
3. Abu Basir reports that (Imam) Abu Ja'far (al-Baqir) (peace be on him) was asked about Allah's saying: **"... obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those possessing authority from among you."** He (peace be on him) replied: *"It was revealed concerning 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both)."* I inquired: "People object: 'What prevented Him from naming 'Ali and his offspring in His Book?'" Abu Ja'far (peace be on him) retorted: *"Tell them: Allah ordered the prayers without mentioning three or four (units), and it was the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) who explained it. He ordained the Hajj without saying: Circumambulate the Ka'bah seven times, as it was the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) who explained it to them. He also*

revealed: 'Obey Allah, obey the Messenger and those possessing authority from among you.' It was regarding 'Ali' Hasan and Husain (peace be on them). The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) willed: 'I entrust to you the Book of Allah and my progeny. I invoked Allah not to separate the two until they meet me at the Pond (of Kauthar). He accepted my invocation..' ¹(1)

c. The Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) saying: My Ahl al-Bait are like Ark of Noah and like the Door of Hittah of the Bani Israel

A number of the Companions and Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), such as Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), Abu Dharr, Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, Ibn 'Abbas and Anas Ibn Malik, narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*The similitude of my Ahl al-Bait is like that of the ark of (Prophet) Noah - whoever got on board was safe, and whoever stayed behind drowned and perished.*"

In some other's wordings, he said: "... and like the Door of Hittah of the Bani Israel." The sources of the above hadith are:

- * Dhakhaer al-'Uqba by Muhib al-Deen al-Tabari, p. 20.
- * Al-Haakem's al-Mustadrak alaa al-Saheehain, vol. 2, p. 343 and vol. 3, p. 150
- * Hilyah al-Awliya' by Abu Nuaim al-Isfahani, vol. 4, p. 306.
- * Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatib al-Baghdadi, vol. 12, p. 19.
- * Majma' al-Zawaa'id by al-Haythami, vol. 9, p. 168.
- * Al-Durr al-Manthur by al-Suyuti; his exegesis under the verse of Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 58.
- * Tarikh al-Khulafa' by al-Suyuti, p. 270, in the biography of al-Mansur, quoting al-Ma'mun, al-Rasheed, al-Mahdi, al-Mansur, his father, his grandfather, Ibn 'Abbas, who quotes the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) who said: "*The similitude of my Ahl al-Bait is like that of the Ark of Noah; whoever got on board was safe and whoever stayed behind was drowned.*"

The sources are hereunder:

- * Kanz al-'Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 6, pp.153 and 216.
- * Al-Sawaa'iq al-Muhriqah by Ibn Hajar, p. 75, quoting Daarqutni, Tabaraani, Ibn

¹ The hadiths: 1, 2 and 3 are successively stated in Shawaahed al-Tanzil, vol. 1, pp. 148-150

Jarir Tabari, Ahmad Ibn Hanbal and others.

All the aforementioned texts are quoted from the Holy Quran and the Prophetic Sunnah. They prove that Allah the Almighty and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had appointed the possessors of authority after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). There are other texts in other wordings, as will be mentioned in the coming discussions.

**The Imams: ‘Ali and His Offspring (peace be on them all) Conveyers
from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)**

The Glorious Qur’an, in many verses, strictly confines the Messenger of Allah’s duty to conveying the message, as seen in the following verses:

"Nothing is (incumbent) on the Messenger but conveying (the message)."

(Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 99)

"Nothing is upon the Messenger but clear conveyance."

(Surah Noor (24): Verse 54) and (Surah Ankaboot (29): Verse 18).

"Know that upon Our Messenger is only clear conveyance (of the message)."

(Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 29) and (Surah Taghaabun (64): Verse 12).

"Is there upon the Messengers (any duty) other than clear conveyance (of the message)?"

(Surah Nahl (16): Verse 35).

The duty of the Seal of the Messengers (peace be on him and his progeny) is also confined to the conveyance of the message:

"Upon you is only conveying (the message)"

(Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 20) (Surah Nahl (16): Verse 35) and (Surah Ra’d (13): Verse 13).

"Nothing is (obligatory) upon you but to convey (the message)"

(Surah Shooraa (42): Verse 48)

Conveyance is divided into direct and indirect conveyances, and to convey whether the time to perform an action has come or its time has not yet come; such as how to judge two faithful groups fighting each other, or the duty of the Muslims in respect of a despotic ruler. The message itself is also of two kinds:

a. That which had been revealed both in its words and its meaning, i.e. the Book of Allah, which for the Muslims, is the Glorious Qur’an:

"And this Qur’an has been revealed to me, that I may with it warn you and whomever it reaches." (Surah An’aam (6): Verse 19)

b. That whose meaning alone was revealed to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and he conveyed it in his own noble words, such as his conveyance of the religious precepts.

Allah, The Glorified said: **"He has ordained for you of the religion that which he enjoined upon Noah and that which we have revealed to you and that which we enjoined upon Ibrahim and Moosa and Jesus: Establish the religion and be not divided therein."** (Surah Shoorā (42): Verse 13)

When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) fixed the numbers of the units of the prayers, its incantations and other details, as well as the precepts of the Islamic religion, or when he related the news about the past nations, or when he prophesied future events, in this world or in the Hereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) was conveying what had been revealed to him through other than the Glorious Qur'an: "... **Nor does he speak out of desire.**" (Surah Najm (53): Verse 3). Such conveyance by the the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is called, in this Ummah, the Noble Prophetic Hadith

The above-mentioned verses confine the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) duty in conveyance, which was his distinguished characteristic. So, when he (peace be on him and his progeny) said about somebody that "*he is from me*", he meant that he was from him even in matters of conveyance. This is not a superficial claim. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) himself made the statement in some of his hadiths, such as concerning the story of conveying the verses of Surah Bara'ah (Taubah):

The Story of Conveying the Verses of Surah Bara'ah (Taubah)

This story is recorded by Tirmidhi in his Sahih, Tabari in his Tafsir, Nesaa'i in his Khasaa'is, Haakem al-Nesaaboori in Mustadrak al-Sahihayn and others, quoting Anas, Ibn Abbas, Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas, 'Abdullah Ibn 'Umar, Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, 'Umar Ibn Maymun, Ali Ibn Abi Talib¹(1) and Abu Bakr. We chose to

¹ Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, pp. 164-165; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 151, vol. 3, p. 283 and refer to vol. 1, p. 150; Nesaa'i's Khasaa'is, pp. 28-29; Tabari's Tafsir, vol. 10, p. 46; al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, pp. 51-52; Majma' al-Zawa'id, vol. 7, p. 29 and vol. 9, p. 119

summarize the narration of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) as stated by Ahmad (Ibn Hanbal) in his Musnad. He said:

The Prophet sent Abu Bakr with the verses of Surah al-Bara’ah to the people of Makkah, to the effect that *‘no idolator will go for Hajj from then on, no naked man may circumambulate round the Ka’bah, none would enter Paradise except a Muslim, and whoever had a timed term with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his term would be observed’*, **"And Allah is dissociated from the disbelievers and (so is) His Messenger."**

He (the narrator) said: He journeyed with it for three days. Then he (the Messenger) said to ‘Ali: *"Catch up with Abu Bakr, tell him to come back to me, and you convey the verses."* He (Ali) followed the instructions. Returning to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), Abu Bakr wept and said: *"O Messenger of Allah! Is anything wrong with me?"* *"Nothing but good with you."* said the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), *"but I was ordered (by Allah) that none should convey these verses except me or a man from me."*¹(2)1

‘Abdullah Ibn ‘Umar narrated: *"... but I was commanded: ‘None conveys from you except you or a man from you’."*²(1)2

In the report of Abu Sa‘id: *"No conveyance should be done except by me or a man from me."*³(2)3

The factual evidences denote that, in those narratives and the like, the intention refers to the precepts of Allah the Almighty and instructions revealed to Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in order to be conveyed to the majority, at the beginning - a duty which is not to be carried out except by the Messenger himself or a man from him.

Compared to this conveyance is the conveyance of those responsible for these laws after these (laws) have been conveyed through the Messenger of Allah or a man from him; thus, it is their duty to convey these very laws to others. The

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 9, p. 3, Hadith No. 4 of Musnad-o-Abi Bakr (Ahmad Shakir said: "Its authority is correct."). Refer to Kanz al-'Ummal and Dhakhaa'er al-'Uqba.

² Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 51

³ Al-Durr al-Manthur, commenting on the verse.

permissibility of this conveyance is transferred and its inclination to whoever it reaches, i.e. he should convey it to others, forever.

It is clear that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) meant the first kind of conveyance by saying: "*Nobody should convey it except myself or a man from me.*"

The phrase "*a man from me*" in the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) hadiths is explained by the Hadith-e-Manzilah, which is as follows: "*Ali's position to me is like the position of Haroon to Moosa.*"

Bukhari in his Sahih (as well as Muslim in his Sahih, Tayaalisi in his Musnad, Ahmad in his Musnad, Tirmidhi in his Sunan, Ibn Maajah in his Sunan and elsewhere) said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to 'Ali: *'Your position unto me is as was the position of Haroon to Moosa, though there will be no prophet after me.'*" The texts of the others are almost the same.¹(3)4

Ibn Sa'd's narrative in his al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, quoting al-Baraaa' Ibn 'Aazib and Zayd Ibn Arqam, says:

"During the war of Jaysh al-'Usrah, i.e. the Battle of Tabuk, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both): *'Either I or you must stay back.'* He (peace be on him and his progeny) asked him (peace be on him) to stay. When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) set off, some people said: "He asked 'Ali to stay behind because he disliked something in him. Hearing this, 'Ali followed the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and caught up with him. He (peace be on him and his progeny) asked: *'What brought you here, O 'Ali?'*

¹ Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 2, p. 200, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib"; Sahih Muslim, vol. 7, p. 120 Chapter on "the Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib"; Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 171, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali"; al-Tayaalisi, vol. 1, pp. 28-29, hadiths: 205, 209 & 213; Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib", hadith: 115; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 170, 173-175, 177, 179, 182, 184-185, 330, vol. 3, pp. 32, 338, vol. 6, pp. 369-380; Al-Mustadrak, vol. 2, p. 337; Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqat al-Kubra, vol. 3, Section1, pp. 14-15; Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 109-111 and other sources

'Not that, O Messenger of Allah,' said 'Ali, 'but I heard people allege that you wanted me to stay back because you disliked something in me.' The Messenger said with a smile: " *O 'Ali! Are you not pleased to be unto me as Haroon was to Moosa except that you are not a prophet?" 'Yes! O Messenger of Allah!'* replied 'Ali. *'Then, it is so,'* said the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny).¹(1)1 Parts of this hadith has been referred to in the Chapter concerning those appointed by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) as his successors during some of his expeditions.

The Meaning of "Unto me" in the Messenger of Allah's hadiths

The phrase "*unto me*" in the hadith: "*You are unto me as Haroon was to Moosa*" is explained in the Messenger's other hadiths because Haroon was Moosa's partner in Prophethood and his minister in conveying the message, and 'Ali, to the seal of the Messengers, was in the same position as that of Haroon to Moosa, except that Ali was not a prophet. Thus, it remains for 'Ali to have the ministerial position of conveying the message.

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) further explained what he had meant by "*from me*" in his speech on the 'Arafat day of the Farewell Pilgrimage. He said:

*"Ali is from me and I am from 'Ali. None acts on my behalf save me or 'Ali"*²(2)2."

Therefore, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) explained the term "*unto me*" with utmost clarity and lucidity and what he meant by it; that Ali is unto him in the position of conveyance from the side of Allah to the responsible ones (who are bound by the Shariah laws) directly. Thus, through this one can understand the implication of the term "*unto me*" which has come in other traditions but has not been explained. For example, as has come in Buraydah's narrative about "the complaint", when the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him

¹ Ibn Sa'd's *al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra*, vol. 3, Q1, p. 15; *Majma' al-Zawaa'id* by al-Haythami, vol. 9, p. 111, with a slight difference.

² Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah in "the Preface", in the Chapter on "The Merits of the Companions", p. 92 of Vol. 1; Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 169, Book of "The Merits". Hadith No. 2531, p. 153 of vol. 6 of *Kanz al-Ummaal*, 1st ed.; *Musnad-o-Ahmad*, vol. 4, pp. 164-165, in the hadith of Habashi Ibn Junaadah, through several authorities

and his progeny) said: "*Don't disparage 'Ali as he is from me...*"¹(3)3 as also in 'Imran Ibn Husain's narrative: "*'Ali is from me...*"²(4)4

* * *

In all these narratives, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) meant to say that 'Ali and his offspring (peace be on them) were from him in respect of carrying the burden of conveying the message directly to all the people of all eras, and that their duty was the same as his. Thus, they were from him and he was from them; they were the same as he, as far as conveying was concerned, but they differed from him in that he received Allah's teachings through revelation, while they received them from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). That is, they were conveyers from the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to the nation. They had been prepared by Allah and His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to bear the burden of conveyance since they had been protected by Allah from uncleanness and He purified them a thorough purification, as Allah, the Glorified, had said in the Verse of Purification. The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) himself bestowed upon Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) in particular whatever Allah had revealed to him. Then, the next Imams inherited these from their father, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), one after the other, as is stated in the following narratives:

Bearer of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Knowledge

It is in Raazi's exegesis of the Holy Qur'an (viz. Mafaateeh al-Ghaib) and in Kanz al-'Ummaal, that 'Ali said: "*The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) taught me a thousand doors of knowledge, and from each door, there opened to me a further thousand doors.*"³(1)1

Tabari in his Tafsir, Ibn Sa'd in his al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, in Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, in Kanz al-'Ummaal and in Fath al-Baari, (from which we quote the following), quoted Abu al-Tufayl who said: "I heard 'Ali in a speech saying: '*Ask me. By Allah! If you ask me about whatever will happen till the Day of Resurrection, I*

¹ Refer to its authority under the title "the Muslims' Master of the Affairs".

² Ibid.

³ In explaining the verse: Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 33; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 6, pp. 392 & 405

can inform you. Ask me about the Book of Allah. By Allah! There is no verse but that I know whether it was revealed in the day or in the night, in a valley or on top of a mountain...'"¹(2)2

Therefore, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said, according to Jabir Ibn 'Abdullah: *"I am the city of knowledge and 'Ali is its gate. Whoever wants (to enter) the city, let him come through the gate."* Al-Haakem said: *"This hadith is correct."*²(3)3

In another version it is said: *"Whoever wants knowledge let him come through the gate."*³(1)1

Another narrator said: I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) on the Day of Hdaybiyyah say, taking 'Ali's hand: *"This is the master of the pious and the killer of the sinners. Victorious is the one who supports him and disappointed is the one who disappoints him (stretching his voice with it). I am the city of knowledge and 'Ali is its gate. Whoever wants (to enter) the city, let him come through the gate."*⁴(2)2

Ibn 'Abbas's narration is: *"I am the city of knowledge. Whoever wants (to enter) the city, let him come through its gate."*⁵(3)3

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"I am the house of knowledge and 'Ali is its door."*⁶(4)4

Ibn 'Abbas, further quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), said: *"I am the city of wisdom and 'Ali is its gate. Whoever wants wisdom let him come through the gate."*⁷(5)5

¹ Tafsir al-Tabari, vol. 26, p.116; Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2/Q 2/p. 101; Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 7, p. 337; Fath al-Baari, vol. 10, p. 220; Hilyah al-Awliya', vol. 1, pp. 67-68; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 1, p. 228.

² Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 126 and on p. 127 citing another chain of narrators; Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol.2, p.348, vol. 7, p. 172, vol. 11, p. 48 and on p. 49 quotes Yahya Ibn Mu'een to have said that the hadith was correct. ' Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, p. 22; Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 114; Tahdhib al-Tahdhib, vol. 6, p. 320, vol. 7, p. 427; Faydh al-Qadeer, vol. 3, p. 46; Kanz al-'Ummaal, 2nd ed. vol. 12, p. 201, hadith No. 1130; al-Sawaa'eq al-Muhriqah, p .73

³ Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, pp.127-129.

⁴ Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatib al-Baghdadi, vol. 2, p. 377

⁵ Kanz al-'Ummaal, 2nd ed., vol. 12, p. 212, hadith No. 1219. Look up Kunuz al-Haqaa'eq by al-Manaawi.

⁶ Al-Riyaadh al-Nadhirah, vol. 2, p. 193.

In another narrative, Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"I am the house of wisdom and ‘Ali is its door."*¹(6)6

Abu Dharr, quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), said: *"‘Ali is the door of my knowledge; he is the exponent of the message I have been sent with to my nation after me."*²(7)7

Anas Ibn Malik narrated that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to ‘Ali (peace be on him): *"You will explain to my nation after me what they dispute about."* Al-Haakem said: *"This hadith is correct on the stipulations of the two Shaikhs (Bukhari and Muslim)"*.³(8)8

In another narration, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said to him (peace be on him):

*"You will act instead of me, make them hear my voice and explain to them concerning that in which they differ after me."*⁴(9)9

Allah the Almighty had facilitated it for the Seal of His Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) to feed his cousin with knowledge, by arranging it for them to live in the same house ever since Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) was still a young boy, as is narrated by al-Haakem: *"It was one of Allah’s favours upon ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both) in the good He did to him: Once Quraysh had a hard time. As Abu Talib had a large family, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) suggested to his uncle, ‘Abbas, who was among the wealthiest Qorashites: "O Aba al-Fadhl! Your brother, Abu Talib, has a large family, and the people have been severely afflicted with this crisis, as you see. Let us go to him to give him some relief by taking some of his children (under our care). I will take one of his sons and you take another, and we will provide for them instead of him."* Abbas agreed. They went to Abu Talib and told him: *"We want to lighten your burden you from some of your children until people get some*

⁷ Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol.11, p. 204; Sunan al-Tirmidhi, Book of "Merits", Chapter on "The Merits of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib."

¹ Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol.13, p.171, Chapter on "The Merits of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib"; Hilyah al-Awliya’ by Abu Nuaim al-Isfahani, vol. 1, p. 64

² Kanz al-‘Ummaal, 1st ed. vol. 6, p. 156

³ Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 122; Kanz al-‘Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 6, p. 156; Kunuz al-Haqaaeq, p. 188

⁴ Hilyah al-Awliyyaa’, vol. 1, p. 63

respite from this difficulty." Abu Talib said: "Leave 'Aqil (with me) and you may take whoever you like." The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) took 'Ali and joined him to his household while 'Abbas took Ja'far and joined him to his family. 'Ali remained with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) until the proclamation of his Prophethood by Allah. 'Ali believed in him and followed him. 'Abbas took Ja'far, and remained with him until he adopted Islam and parted with 'Abbas."¹(1)1

Zayd Ibn 'Ali Ibn Husain, quoting his father, on the authority of his grandfather, reports: "Once the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was with his uncles, 'Abbas and Hamzah, together with 'Ali, Ja'far and 'Aqil, in a land which they used to till. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said to his uncles: '*Choose from them.*' One of them said: 'I choose Ja'far.' The other said: 'I choose 'Aqil.' He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*I gave you the chance to choose and you chose (for yourselves), and Allah chose 'Ali for me.*"²(2)2

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) once said about himself:

"... Certainly you know my position of close kinship and special relationship with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). As a young boy, he used to seat me on his lap, press me to his chest, embrace me in his bed, his body touching me, smelling his fragrance. He used to chew a thing and then feed it to me. He found no lie in my talk nor a senseless act. Ever since the time of his weaning, Allah appointed the greatest of the angels to guide him along the path of noble deeds and the world's highest conduct, day and night. I used to follow him like a young camel following its mother's foot-steps. Everyday he would manifest a new sign of high morality and order me to imitate him. Every year, he used to seclude himself in the Hera' (cave), where I, and none else, could see him. In those days, Islam could not be found except in the house of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) with Khadijah, and I was their third, discerning the light of Revelation and smelling the fragrance of Prophethood. When Revelation took place I heard Satan moan. I asked: 'O Messenger of Allah, what is this moaning?' He (peace be on him and his progeny) said: 'This is Satan.

¹ Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, vol. 3, p. 576

² Ibid., vol. 3, pp. 576-577

He has lost all hope of being worshipped. You do hear what I hear, and see what I see, but you are not a prophet. Yet, you are certainly a minister, and you are certainly upon goodness. I was with him (peace be on him and his progeny) when the crowd of Quraysh came to him and said to him: 'O Muhammad! You are claiming (something) big. None of your ancestors or of your kinsfolk had ever claimed it. But we are going to ask you something; if you agree and show it to us, we will know that you are a Prophet and a Messenger of Allah. But if you did not do it, we will know that you are a sorcerer and a liar.' The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: 'What do you want to ask?' They demanded: 'Call this tree to uproot itself, come and stand before you.' He said: 'Certainly, Allah is capable of doing everything. If Allah does it for you, will you believe and testify to the truth?' 'Yes,' they replied. He said: 'I will, then, show you what you want, though I am sure that you will not return to goodness while there are among you those who will be thrown into the Qaleeb¹(1)1, and those who will mobilize the allies²(2)2." Thereafter, he (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered: 'O tree! If you believe in Allah and in the Last Day and know that I am the Messenger of Allah, uproot yourself and stand before me, with the permission of Allah.' By Him who sent him with the truth! The tree moved, uprooted and came with a tremendous roar and a flapping like that of the wings of the birds, and stopped before the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) flickering and throwing its upper branches on the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and some of its braches came on my shoulder where I stood at the Messenger's right side. When the people saw this phenomenon, they said, out of pride and haughtiness: 'Order half of it to come to you and the other half to stay back.' He ordered it so; half of it came to him in an amazing way and with a great roar and was about to enclose the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Once again, they demanded, out of disbelief and rebellion: 'Order that half to return to its half as before.' He (peace be on him and his progeny) did and it returned. I said: 'There is no god but Allah! I am the first to believe in you, O Messenger of Allah, and the first to acknowledge that the tree

¹ The Qaleeb is a well in Badr in which some twenty-odd of the elite of Quraysh were killed and thrown during the Battle of Badr.

² Allies or Ahzaab were a number of different tribes who gathered to fight him (peace be on him and his progeny) in the Battle of the Trench (Khandaq).

*did what it did with Allah's permission, by way of testifying your Prophethood and exalting your word.' Nevertheless, all of them said: 'Rather (he is) a lying sorcerer, possessing astonishing and quick sorcery, Is there nobody to believe in you except someone like this?' meaning me."*¹(3)1

Thus, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) everyday, raised the Imam, who was still very young, through his high conduct and asked him to emulate him; he (peace be on him and his progeny) used to feed him, while he was a youth, with knowledge, choosing him alone for his confidential talks.

It is in Sahih al-Tirmidhi and elsewhere, quoting Jabir (Ibn Abdillah), that: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called 'Ali (peace be on him) on the Day of Taaef and started talking to him in confidence. The people said: 'His confidential talk with his cousin lasted long!' The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) retorted: *'It is not me who confided in him, but Allah has confided in him.'*"²(1)2

Another version says: "On the Day of Taaef, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) called 'Ali (peace be on him) and talked to him privately for a long time. Some of his Companions said..." (till the end of the narration).³(2)3

Jundab Ibn Naajiyah (or Naajiyah Ibn Jundab) narrated: "In the Battle of Taaef, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and 'Ali (peace be on him) walked together (talking). As they passed by, Abu Bakr said: 'O Messenger of Allah! Your confidential talk with 'Ali is quite prolonged today!' He (peace be on him and his progeny) rebutted: *'It is not me who confides in him but Allah confides in him.'*"⁴(3)4

Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was avid about learning from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Then the verse: **'O you who believe!**

¹ Nahj al-Balaaghah, Sermon No. 190

² Sunan al-Tirmidhi, Book of "the Merits", Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib", vol. 13, p. 173; Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatib al-Baghdadi, vol. 7, p. 402

³ 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 4, p. 27

⁴ Al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p. 185; al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 265

Kanz al-Ummaal, vol. 12, p. 200, Hadith No 1122; al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 265

When you confidentially talk with the Messenger, offer a charity before your talking." (Surah Mujaadalah (58): Verse 12)

Tabari says: "They were prohibited from confidential talks with the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) unless they offer a charity, So, nobody talked to him confidentially except 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib."¹(4)5

In Waahidi's Asbaab al-Nuzul, and elsewhere, quoting Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), he said: "*I had a dinar, which I changed, and gave a dirham as a charity whenever I had a confidential talk with the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) until I ran out of it.*"²(5)1

In another version: "*I had a dīnar which I exchanged for ten dirhams, and whenever I came to the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)...*"³(6)2

Zamakhshari, commenting on the verse, said: "He (Ali) gave charity for ten words which he asked from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)."

Imam Ali (peace be on him) is quoted to have said: "*There is in the Book of Allah a verse which none had applied before and none will apply after me. It is the verse of confidential talk: 'O you who believe! When you talk in confidentiality with...' I had a dīnar.... Then it was abrogated and no longer applicable, as the next verse was revealed: 'Do you fear that you will not (be able to) give any charity before your confidential talk? ...'*"⁴(1)3 (Surah Mujaadalah (58): Verse 13)

He was close to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till the last moment of his life.

'Aishah reports: "When the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) was about to die, he ordered: '*Call my beloved here.*' They called Abu Bakr. He (peace be on him and his progeny) looked at him, then put down his head, and ordered again: '*Call my beloved here.*' They called 'Umar. He (peace be on him and his progeny) looked at him, then put his head down. Then he (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered (for the third time): '*Call my beloved.*' They called 'Ali. Seeing him, he (peace be on him and his progeny) asked to enter

¹ Tafseer al-Tabari, vol. 28, pp. 14-15; al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p. 185

² Waahidi's Asbaab al-Nuzul, p. 308; Tafseer al-Tabari under the mentioned verse

³ Al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p. 185; al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 265

⁴ Al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p.185; al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 265; Tafseer al-Kashshaaf, vol. 4, p. 76

under his cloak and continued embracing him until he died with his hand on him."¹(2)4

Ibn 'Abbas recounts: "The Prophet's condition aggravated, while there were 'A'ishah and Hafsa [two of his wives] with him, when 'Ali entered. Seeing him, the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) raised his head and said to him: '*Come close to me, come close to me.*' He ['Ali] embraced him and remained thus until he died."²(3)5

Umm Salamah chronicles: "By the One by Whom I swear! 'Ali was the nearest to the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). We visited the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the morning. We heard him say: "*(Did) 'Ali come? (Did) 'Ali come?*" several times. Fatimah (peace be on her) said: '*I think you have sent him on an errand.*' Later, when he came." Umm Salamah said. "I thought that he needed him alone. So, we left the room and sat outside the door. I was the nearest to the door. The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) bent over him and went on whispering and secretly talking to him. The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) breathed his last on the same day. Thus, 'Ali was the closest one (to him)." Al-Haakem said: "This hadith is correct and authentic."³(4)1

* * *

Ibn 'Abbas said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: '*Whoever desires to live my life, die my death and to dwell in the Garden of Eden, grown by my Lord, he must accept the mastership of 'Ali after me. befriend his friends and follow the example of the Imams after me, as they are my offspring, created from my "clay", and endowed with my understanding and my knowledge. Woe unto the one from my nation who denies their merits, and severs my connection with them. May Allah deprive him of my intercession.*'"⁴(1)2

* * *

We have so far related what had been stated about the first successor after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

¹ Al-Riyaadh al-Nadherah, vol. 2, p. 237, 2nd ed. Daar al-Ta'lif Press, Egypt; Dhakhaaer al-'Uqba, p. 72.

² Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, p. 36

³ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol.6, p.300; al-Nesaa'i's al-Khasaaes, p. 40; Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, pp. 138-139

⁴ Hilyah al-Awliya' by Abu Na'im Isfahani, vol. 1, p. 86

Hereafter we are going to relate what has been stated about the successors after the first successor (peace be on them all).

The Two Grandsons of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Earlier, we talked a little about the first Imam ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both). Here, we will relate what has been said about the two grandsons of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). For each one of them, he said: "*He is from me.*" We have already known in the previous discussions what he meant by "*from me*".

Hasan and Husain (peace be on them both) are from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

Ahmad in his Musnad, quoting Miqdaam Ibn Ma’dikarb, said: "The Messenger of Allah seated Hasan on his lap and said: '*He is from me,*'..."¹(2)3

Al-Baraa’ Ibn ‘Aazib said: "The Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said about Hasan and Husain (separately): '*He is from me.*'..."²(3)4

Bukhari, Tirmidhi, Ibn Maajah and Haakem recorded on the authority of Ya’laa Ibn Murrah: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: '*Husain is of me and I am from Husain. May Allah love him who loves him. Husain is a grandson from the grandsons.*'..."³(4)5

In another version: "*Hasan and Husain are two of the grandsons.*"⁴(5)1

¹ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 132; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 13, pp. 99-100 and vol. 16, p. 262; Muntakhab al-Kanz, vol. 5, p. 106; al-Jaami' al-Saghir bi Sharh Faydh al-Qadeer, vol. 3, p. 145

² Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 16, p. 270

³ Al-Bukhari in al-Adab al-Mufrad, Chapter on "Embracing the boy", Hadith No. 364; al-Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 195, Chapter On "The Merits of Hasan and Husain." Ibn Maajah, Book of "Al-Muqaddimah", Chapter No. 11, Hadith No. 144; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 172; al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 177. He and al-Dhahabi considered the hadith as authentic; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 2, p.19 and vol. 5, p. 130

⁴ Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 16, p. 270.

Abu Ramthah reports that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*Husain is from me and I am from him, and he is a grandson from the grandsons.*"¹(1)2

Another narrative says: "*Hasan and Husain are two of the grandsons.*"² Al-Baraa' Ibn 'Aazib said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: '*Husain is from me and I am from him. May Allah love whoever loves him. Hasan and Husain are two of the grandsons.*'"³(3)4

The saying of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny): "*from me*" in respect of Hasanain [=Hasan and Husain] is the same expression which he used for their father, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him). By joining them in this expression, he meant to say that they were "*from him*" as far as the conveyance of the precepts of Islam was concerned.

Moreover, the reference to them as "*two of the grandsons*" did not mean that they were merely two grandsons like all other grandsons of the world. This is a nonsense far from being uttered by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Actually, the definite article "al" in the term "*al-asbaat*" (*grandsons*) denotes a reference to the same word stated in the Glorious Qur'an:

"Say: 'We believe in Allah and (in) what has been revealed to us, and (in) what was revealed to Ibraheem, and Ismaaeel and Is'haaq and Yaqub and the grandsons [their offspring], and (in) what was given to Moosa and Eesaa and (in) what was given to the Prophets from their Lord. We make no distinction between anyone of them, and to Him we are submissive.'" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 136)

"Or do you say that Ibraheem and Ismaaeel and Yaqub and the grandsons were Jews or Christians?" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 140)

Say: 'We believe in Allah and what has been revealed to us, and what was revealed to Ibraheem and Ismaaeel and Is'haaq and Yaqub and the grandsons'..." (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 84)

"We have revealed to you as We revealed to Nuh and the Prophets after him. And We revealed to Ibraheem and Ismaaeel and Is'haaq and Yaqub and the

¹ Ibid., vol. 13, p. 106

² Ibid., vol. 13, pp. 101 & 105.

³ Ibid., vol. 16, p. 270

grandsons and Eesaa and Ayyub and Yunus and Haroon and Sulaimaan..."

(Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 164)

Therefore, the definite article "al" in "al-asbaat" in the narrations of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning Hasanain (peace be on them both) denotes a known reference of the Muslims to those verses, and what the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said of them was the same as he had said of their father, that is, his position to him was as the position of Haroon to Moosa. This position has been explained by Allah the Exalted, when He said, through Moosa's invocation:

"And appoint for me a minister from my family, Haroon, my brother, to strengthen my back with him, and to take him as partner in my affair, that we may glorify You excessively, and remember You excessively. Certainly, You do know us (well). He said: 'Your has been granted, O Moosa'..." (Surah Taha (20): Verses 29: 36)

He also said: **"And my brother, Haroon, he is more eloquent in speech (than me), therefore send him with me, a helper verifying me, as I fear they will deny me. He said: 'We will strengthen your arm with your brother'..."** (Surah Qasas (28): Verses 34-35)

"... And Moosa told his brother, Haroon: 'Succeed me among my people and do good and do not follow the way of the mischief-makers'..." (Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 142).

"We gave Moosa the Book and appointed his brother Haroon as a minister." (Surah Furqaan (25): Verse 35)

"Then We sent Moosa and his brother, Haroon, with our verses and manifest authority..."(Surah Mominoon (23): Verse 45)

In these verses, Allah the Almighty made Haroon an assistant, a minister and a partner for Moosa in Prophethood, and a caliph of Moosa in his people. So, when the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) declared that the position of 'Ali to him was like the position of Haroon to Moosa, except the partnership in Prophethood, since there will be no Prophet after him, there remained for Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) to support him, be his minister and to partake in conveying the message during his life, and succeeding him, after his

martyrdom, among his people, and alone carrying the burden of conveying the teachings of the religion. The same thing was true with his two sons, Hasanain (peace be on them both). With the exception of the position of Prophethood, which was given to the grandsons only, since there could be no prophet after the last of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny), there remained for them both to carry out the responsibility of conveying the Islamic teachings for Allah the High.

Till now, we have been relating what has been narrated about the first three successors after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). Now, we will relate what has been narrated about the last of the successors of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in the Prophet's Sunnah.

Glad-Tidings of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) about the Reappearance of the Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance) in the Last Era

The Name of Imam Mahdi is the same as that of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)

Sunan al-Tirmidhi, Chapter on "What is said about al-Mahdi (peace be on him), Abu Dawud's al-Mahdi and other narrators relate that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) prophesied: *"The world will not end until the Arabs are ruled by a man from my Ahlul Bait, whose name is the same as my name."*¹(1)1

The authors of al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn, Musnad-o-Ahmad and others, say that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"The Hour will not be established until the earth is filled with injustice, tyranny and aggression. Then, a man from my Ahl al-Bait will appear to fill it with justice and equity as it was fraught with injustice and inequity."*²(2)2

Al-Mahdi is from the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

Ibn Maajah, quoting Abu Hurairah, in his Sunan, Chapter "The Holy War (al-Jihaad) ", records that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"If there remained from this world only a single day, Allah would lengthen it to such an extent till a man from my Ahl al-Bait rules the Mount of Daylam and Constantinople."*

¹ Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 9, p.74 also narrated by Abu Dawud in his Sahih, Book of "al-Mahdi", vol. 2, p. 7, and in the edition of Daar Ihya' al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah (d.t.), vol.4, pp. 106-107, Hadith No. 4282; Hilyah al-Awliya'by Abu Noaim Isfahani, vol. 5, p. 75; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, p. 376; Tarikh-o-Baghdad by al-Khatib al-Baghdadi, vol. 4, p. 388; Kanz al-'Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 7, p. 188, with the addition of *"and his temperament is like my temperament."* al-Suyuti in his commentary on Surah Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), explaining the verse **"Do they then wait for ought but the Hour..."** (Surah Muhammad (47): Verse 18) al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p. 56

² Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 4, p. 557; Abu Na'im Isfahani in his Hilyah, vol. 3, p. 101 with slight difference. Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 3, p. 36 and others. Al-Suyuti in his comment on the verse **"Do they then wait for ought but the Hour..."** of Surah Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny), vol. 6, p. 58

Again in Sunan-o-Ibn Maajah, in the chapters on "Disturbances" "The Appearance of the Mahdi", and in Musnad-o-Ahmad, it is stated, quoting 'Ali (peace be on him) that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) informed: *"The Mahdi is from us Ahl al-Bait. Allah would reform him (i.e. his condition) in a (single) night."*

This hadith is narrated by others too.¹(1)1

Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain reports on the authority of Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) informed: *"The Mahdi is from us Ahl al-Bait, highborn, with an aquiline nose and good looking. He will fill the earth with equity and justice as it would be fraught with tyranny and injustice. He will live like this (and he opened his left palm, the index finger and the thumb, closing the other three fingers)."*

He said that hadith was authentic, though the two Sahihs (Bukhari and Muslim) did not record it. But Abu Dawud has recorded it.²(2)2

Al-Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance) is of Fatimah's (peace be on her) Offspring

Umm Salamah reports, as recorded in Sunan-o-Abi Dawud, that she heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *"The Mahdi is from my family, from Fatimah's offspring"*³(3)3

¹ Abu No'im in his Hilyah, vol. 3, p. 177, to which he added: "in two days"; Ahmad Ibn Hanbal narrated it, too, vol. 1, p. 84; al-Suyuti in al-Durr al-Manthur, vol. 6, p. 58 commenting on the verse: **"Do they wait for ought but the Hour?"** (Surah Zukhruf (43): Verse 66). He added that it was narrated by Ibn-o-Abi Shaybah, Ahmad and Ibn Maajah, quoting 'Ali (peace be on him), the Book of "The Disturbances", Chapter on "The Appearance of the Mahdi", Hadith No. 4085.

² Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 4, p. 557; Abu Dawud's Sahih, vol. 6, p. 136, Book of "al-Mahdi" of Sunan-o-Abi Dawud, vol. 4, p. 107, Hadith No. 4285

³ Al-Mahdi, vol. 4, p. 7, Hadith No. 4284; Al-Fetan, Chapter on "The Appearance of al-Mahdi", vol. 2, p. 1368; Sunan-o-Abi Dawud, vol. 7, p. 134; Ibn Maajah in his Sahih, Chapters on the Disturbances, and "The Appearance of the Mahdi", in which he said: *"The Mahdi is from Fatimah's offspring"*. Al-Haakem in his Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 4, p. 557 narrated it also and said: "It is true; he is from Fatimah's offspring." Suyuti also narrated it in al-Durr al-Manthur, in his commentary of Surah Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) under the verse: **"Do they wait for ought but the Hour?"**, vol. 6, p. 58 and said: "It is related by Abu Dawud, Ibn Maajah, Tabaraani and Haakem, quoting 'Umm Salamah. Dhahabi also

The author of Kanz al-'Ummaal, quoting 'Ali (peace be on him) to have said: "*The Mahdi is a man of us, from Fatimah's offspring.*"¹(4)4

The Mahdi is from Husain's (peace be on him) Offspring

It is reported in Dhakhhaer al-'Uqbaa, on the authority of Abu Ayyub al-Ansari, that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) prophesied: "*They (Hasan and Husain) will beget the Mahdi of this nation.*"²(1)5

It is in the same source, too, quoting Hudhaifah, that the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*If there remained only a single day of the world, it would be prolonged until Allah sends a man from my sons; his name will be my name.*" Salman asked, "*Of which of your sons, O Messenger of Allah?*" He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: "*From his progeny,*" patting Husain (peace be on him) on the back.

* * *

In his hadiths, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) stressed the Imamate of the first Imam 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on him) more than the others, and gave tidings of the last al-Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance), as well as their being twelve in number, because confirming the first, the last and the number, there would remain no doubt about who the twelve Imams were beginning with Imam 'Ali (peace be on him and his progeny) and ending with the Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance).

narrated it in his Meezan al-E'tidaal, vol. 2, p. 24 and said: "*The Mahdi is from Fatimah's offspring.*"

¹ Kanz al-'Ummaal, 1st ed., vol. 7, p. 261

² Dhakhhaer al-'Uqbaa, p. 136.

Texts Proving the Imamate of the Imams from the Ahlul Bait (peace be on them all)

Texts quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) concerning the Imamate of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) are numerous. Some are about all the Imams of Ahl al-Bait while others are about particular ones of them. Of the first category is Hadith al-Thaqalain (Narration of the Two Precious Things).

Hadith al-Thaqalain

a. In the Farewell Pilgrimage (Hajjah al-Wedaa‘)

Tirmidhi, quotes Jabir: I saw the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) during his Hajj on the Day of ‘Arafah, on his she-camel [named] al-Qaswa’, delivering a speech. I heard him say: "... *O people! I am leaving among*

you that which if you adhere to, you will not go astray: The Book of Allah and my family, my Ahl al-Bait."

Tirmidhi said: "In this respect, Abu Sa'id, Zayd Ibn Arqam and Hudhaifah Ibn 'Usayd, are quoted, too."¹(1)1

b. In Ghadir-e-Khumm

Zayd Ibn Arqam, as quoted in Sahih Muslim, Musnad-o-Ahmad, Sunan al-Daaremi and Sunan al-Baihaqi, said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) delivered a speech near a pond called Khumm, between Makkah and Madinah ... He said: '*O people! I am but a human and am about to respond to my Lord's call... I am leaving among you two precious things. The first of them is the Book of Allah, in which is guidance and light; so, take the Book of Allah and cling to it ..., and (second is) my Ahl al-Bait..*'"²(2)2

Sunan al-Tirmidhi - as well as Musnad-o-Ahmad - state that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*I am leaving with you that if you stick to it, you will not go astray after me. The one is greater than the other: The Book of Allah, a rope extended from the sky to the earth, and my progeny Ahl al-Bait. They will never separate from each other till they meet me at the Pond (of Kauthar). So, be careful how you treat them after me.*"³(1)1

In Mustadrak al-Sahihain, "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is quoted to have said: "*I think I am summoned (by my Lord) and I have to respond. I have left the two precious things with you, one is greater than the other: The Book of Allah and my progeny. So, look how you treat them after me. They will never separate from each other till they meet me at the Pond (of Kauthar)...*"⁴(2)2

¹ Tirmidhi, vol. 13, p. 199, Chapter on "The Merits of the Prophet's Ahl al-Bait". Look up Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 1, p. 48.

² Sahih Muslim, Chapter on "The Merits of 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib". Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, p. 366; Sunan al-Daaremi, vol. 2, p. 431 (in brief). Sunan al-Baihaqi, vol. 2, p.148 and vol. 7, p. 30, with a slight difference in the wordings. Look up Tahaawi in his Mushkil al-Athar, vol. 4, p. 368

³ Trimidhi, vol. 13, p. 201; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol.2, p. 12 in the biography of Imam Hasan (peace be on him); al-Durr al-Manthur commenting on The Verse of Love (Aayah al-Mawaddah), verse 23 in Surah al-Shura (42).

⁴ Mustadrak al-Sahihain and its summary vol. 3, p. 109; al-Nesaa'i's al-Khasaais, p. 30. In Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 3, p. 17, it is said: "*I am about to be summoned and*

In another version, he (peace be on him and his progeny) declared: "*O people! I am leaving among you two things; you will not go astray if you follow them. They are: The Book of Allah and my Ahl al-Bait, my progeny...*"

Al-Haakem said that the said hadith was correct.¹(3)3

The same narrative, in different wordings, is stated in Musnad-o-Ahmad, Hilyah al-Awliya' and others²(4)4, quoting Zayd Ibn Thaabit.

* * *

In the former hadith, the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in the last year of his life, informed that he was a human, was about to receive his Lord's envoy and was to answer the call and join his Lord. He said: "*I am leaving with you what if you stick to (both of them), you will not go astray after me. One is greater than the other: The Book of Allah, a rope extended from the sky to the earth, and my progeny Ahl al-Bait. They will never separate from each other until they meet me at the Pond (of Kauthar). So, be careful how you treat them after me.*"

He (peace be on him and his progeny) once said on the Day of 'Arafah (i.e. 9th of Zilhajj) and once again in Ghadir-e-Khumm (on the 18th of Zilhajj).

This declaration of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in appointing the authority after him referred to all the Imams of his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them all). And in other narratives:

to respond..." More details are in it on pp. 14, 26 and 59; Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra, vol. 2, Q 2, p. 2; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 1, p. 47, and briefly on p. 97

¹ Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 109 through two chains of narrators. In vol. 3, p. 148 there is almost a similar narrative

² Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 4, pp. 367 and 371, vol. 5, p. 181; Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol. 8, p. 442; Hilyah al-Awliya', vol. 1, p. 355 and vol. 9, p. 64; 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol. 3, p. 147; Majma' al-Zawaa'id, vol. 9, pp. 163 and 164

Irrrefutable Texts from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) their Number

The Hadith on the Number of Imams (peace be on them)

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said that the Imams to come after him will be twelve, as quoted by the authors of the Sahihs and the Musnads as follows:

a. Muslim narrated that Jabir Ibn Samurah heard the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *"This religion will continue until the Hour comes or there will rule over you twelve caliphs; all of them will be from the Quraysh."*

In another version: *"... The affair of the people will go on..."* In two such hadiths: *"... until twelve caliphs..."*

In Sunan-o-Abi Daawood:

".. until twelve caliphs will rule over you..." In another version: *"... till twelve..."*¹(1)

In Sahih al-Bukhari: "I heard the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) say: 'There will be twelve Emirs', then he (peace be on him and his progeny) said something which I did not hear, but my father said: 'He said: All of them will be from the Quraysh.'

In another version: "... then the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) said something which I could not hear, so I asked my father: 'What did the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say? 'He said: 'All of them will be from Quraysh.'"2(2)

¹ Sahih Muslim, vol. 6, pp. 3-4, Book of "The Rule", Chapter "The People Follow Quraysh"; We chose this text because Jabir has written it. Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 4, p. 165, Book of "Al-Ahkam"; Sunan a;-Tirmidhi, Chapters on "the Disturbances". Chapter "About the Caliphs"; Sunan-o-Abi Daawud, vol. 3, p. 106, Book of "al-Mahdi"; Musnad al-Tayaalisi, Hadiths: 767 and 1278; Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 5, pp. 86-90, 92-101, 106-108; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 13, pp.26-27; Hilyah al-Awliya', vol. 4, p. 333. Jaabir Ibn Samurah Ibn Janaadah al-Aameri al-Sawa'i, son of Sa'd Ibn Abu Waqqaas' sister and their ally. He died in Kufa after 70 A.H. The authors of the Sahihs quoted 146 hadiths from him. His biography is in 'Usud al-Ghaabah and Taqrib al-Tahdhib. Jawaami' al-Sirah, p 277.

² Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 338; Mustadrak al-Sahihain, vol. 3, p. 617

In another narration: "*They would not be harmed by the hostility of those hostile to them.*"¹(3)3

b. In another narration: "*The affair of this nation will go on smoothly, overcoming its enemy, until twelve Imams of them, all of them of Quraysh, have passed; then there will be chaos.*"²(1)4

c. In another narrative: "*This nation will have twelve princes. They will not be harmed by those who forsake them. All of them will be from the Quraysh.*"³ (2)1

d. "*The people's affairs will go on (smoothly) as long as they are ruled over by twelve men.*"⁴(3)2

e. Anas narrated: "... *This religion will subsist along with twelve from Quraysh. When they have passed away, the earth will swell in agitation with its people.*"⁵(4)3

f. In another narration: "*The status of this nation will remain triumphant as long as there rise twelve (men); all of them will be from the Quraysh.*"⁶(5)4

g. Ahmad, Haakem and others, quoting al-Masruq, said, according to the narration of the first: "One night, we were sitting with 'Abdullah (Ibn Mas'ud) who was reciting the Holy Qur'an for us. A man asked him: 'O Abu 'Abd al-Rahman! Did you ask the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) how many caliphs would rule over this 'Ummah?' 'Abdullah said: 'Ever since I came to Iraq, none asked me this question before you. We did ask him. He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: 'Twelve, the number of Banu Israel's princes.'"⁷(6)5

¹ Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 338

² Muntakhab al-Kanz, vol. 5, p. 321; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 6, p.249; Suyuti's Tarikh al-Khulafa', p. 10; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 13, p. 26; al-Sawaaeq al-Muhriqah, p. 28.

³ Kanz al-Ummaal, vol. 13, p. 27; Muntakhab al-Kanz, vol. 5, p.312.

⁴Exposition of Nawawi on Sahih Muslim, vol. 12, p. 202; al-Sawaaeq al-Muhriqah, p.18; Tarikh al-Khulafa' by Suyuti, p.10

⁵ Kanz al-Ummaal, vol. 13, pp. 27

⁶ Ibid., quoting Ibn al-Najjaar.

⁷ Musnad-o-Ahmad, vol. 1, pp. 398 and 406; Ahmad Shakir, commenting in the foot note on the first: His authorisation is correct. Haakem's Mustadrak and its summary by Dhahabi, vol. 4, p. 501; Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 339 summarized. Majma' al-Zawaaed, vol. 5, p. 190; al-Sawaaeq al-Muhriqah by Ibn Hajar, p. 12; Tarikh al-Khulafa' by Suyuti, p. 10 and his al-Jaame' al-Saghîr, vol. 1, p. 75; Kanz al-Ummaal, vol. 13, p. 27. He said: "It is narrated by Tabaraani and Noa'im Ibn

h. Ibn Mas'ud, in a narrative, reports that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*After me there will be caliphs equal to the number of the companions of Moosa.*"¹(7)6

Ibn Kathir said (as is also related by 'Abdullah Ibn 'Umar, Hudhaifah and Ibn 'Abbas)²(1)7: We do not know, however, whether the narrative of Ibn 'Abbas is the same which was related by Hakim Haskaani, quoting Ibn Abbas and others. The said narrative confirms that the numbers of the masters will be twelve and that they will be from the Quraysh. Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) has explained what was meant by "Quraysh". He said:

*"The Imams will be from Quraysh from the clan of Hashim. It (the Imamate) would not suit others nor would others be suitable as masters..."*³(2)1 and said: "*O yes, by Allah! The land does not remain void of a living divine evidence, either apparant and known, or hidden and unknown, so that Allah's proofs and evidences may not be rendered invalid.*"⁴(3)2

Ibn Kathir said: "It is stated in the Torah which is in the hands of the people of the Book that Allah the Exalted gave to Ibraheem tidings of his bearing Ismaaeel, and He would grow and multiply him, and will raise from his offspring twelve great men."

He also said: "Ibn Taymiyyah said: "They are the glad tidings in the hadith of Jabir Ibn Samurah, and it was decided that they should be spread among the nation, and that the Hour will not come until they come into existence."

Hammaad, in book "The Disturbances"; Faydh al-Qadîr fi Sharh al-Jamî' al-Saghîr by al-Manaawi, vol. 2, p. 458. Ibn Kathir related the two narratives in his Tarîkh, quoting Ibn Mas'ud, Chapter on "The Twelve Imams all of whom are from Quraysh", vol. 6, pp. 248-250.

¹ Ibn Kathir, vol. 6, p. 248; Kanz al-'Ummaal, vol. 13, p. 27; Shawaaahid al-Tanzil by Haskaani, vol. 1, p. 455, Hadith No. 626

² Ibn Kathir, vol. 6, p.248

³ Nahj al-Balaaghah, Sermon No. 142

⁴ Yanaabî' al-Mawaddah by Shaikh Sulaiman al-Hanafî, Chapter 100, p. 523. Look up Ihya'-o-'Uloom al-Dîn by al-Ghazzaali, vol. 1, p. 54; Hilyah al-Awliyaa', vol. 1, p. 80, briefly

Commenting on this, he said: "Many Jews, who had the honour of adopting Islam, mistakenly thought that those were the ones publicized by the Rafidi sect (i.e. the Shiites) whom they followed."¹(4)³

The author says:

The said tidings is stated in the Book of Genesis, Ch. 17 Nos. 18-20, of the Torah in circulation nowadays, which reads in English, concerning Ismaeel:

"I will bless him and give him many children and many descendants. He will be the father of twelve princes, and I will make a great nation of his descendants"²(1)⁴

This quotation refers to the fact that the blessing, fruitfulness and propagation were in Ismaeel's loins... a fact which makes it clear that it meant the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), being the extension of Ismaeel's offspring, since Allah (the Exalted) ordered Ibraheem to leave the land of Nimrod to Syria. He set out with his wife, Sarah, and (Prophet) Lut, migrating to where Allah the Almighty ordered them. They settled in Palestine. Allah the High bestowed upon Ibraheem with opulence. He said: *"My Lord! What shall I do with wealth while I have no son?"* Allah (the Exalted) revealed to him: *"I will multiply your sons such that they will be equal to the number of stars."* Haajar was Sarah's maid. The latter gifted her to Ibraheem (peace be on him). She bore him Ismaeel (peace be on him) while he was eighty-six years old.³(2)¹

This episode is referred to in the Holy Qur'an, when Ibraheem turned to his Lord, saying: **"Our Lord! I have settled some of my offspring in a valley which has no cultivation, near your holy House, our Lord, that they may perform the prayers; so make the hearts of some people turn towards them and provide them with fruits that they may be thankful."** (Surah Ibraheem (14): Verse 37)

The above verse confirms that Ibraheem (peace be on him) had settled some of his offspring viz. Ismaeel and his children who were born in Makkah. He prayed to Allah (the Exalted) to place in them His mercy and guidance for the humanity

¹ Ibn Kathir's Tarikh, vol. 6, pp. 249-50.

² Good News Bible, Today's English Version, T.E.V. 040 p-75m-1977.

³ Al-Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 1, pp. 24-25, published by the Establishment for publishing the culture of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), Qom, I.R. Iran.

forever. Allah the High responded to his prayers by making from his offspring Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) and the twelve Imams (peace be on them) after him. Imam Baqir (peace be on him) said: "*We are the descendants of that family. Ibraheem's prayer was for us.*"¹(3)2

Conclusion:

We conclude from the aforementioned narratives that the number of the Imams in this nation are twelve, one after the other (without a break), and that after the twelfth, the world will come to an end.

In the first hadith, it was said:

"This religion will continue until the Hour comes or there will rule over you twelve caliphs..."

This hadith specifies the period of the continuation of the religion and limits it to the coming of the Hour. It also defines their number to be twelve persons.

The fifth hadith says:

"The affairs of this nation will go on smoothly, overpowering its enemy, until twelve Imams of them, all of them will be from Quraysh, have passed; then there will be chaos."

This hadith confirms the continuation of the religion simultaneous to the existence of the twelve, and that after them, there will be chaos and bedlam.

In the eighth hadith, their number is mentioned as twelve: "*After me there will be caliphs equal to the number of the companions of Moosa.*"

This means that there will be no caliphs after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) other than the twelve. It can also be said that the wordings of these hadiths, which clearly say that the number of the caliphs are twelve, and that after them there will be chaos in the earth until the Hour comes, explain the other hadiths whose wordings may not be as clear.

¹ The original Hebrew text was taken from the Torah, and the comment was quoted from an article written by Ahmad al-Waasiti and published in al-Tawhid Magazine, No. 54, pp. 127_8, issued by the Islamic Propagation Organization, Tehran, I.R. Iran.

Consequently, the life of one of them must be extraordinarily long in comparison with the common lives of normal humans, as is the actual life of the twelfth of the Imams, the successors after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).

Their Perplexity in Interpreting the Hadith

Actually, the scholars of the Caliphate School are at a loss in explaining the number twelve stated in those hadiths. Hence, there are terrible contradictions in their interpretations.

Ibn Arabi, explaining Sunan al-Tirmidhi, said: "We counted after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) twelve Emirs, as follows: Abu Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthman, 'Ali, Hasan, Mu'awiyah, Yazid, Mu'awiyah Ibn Yazid, Marwan, 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Marwan, Walid, Sulaiman, 'Umar Ibn 'Abdul 'Aziz, Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, Marwan Ibn Muhammad Ibn Marwan, as-Saffaah...", then after those he counted twenty-seven of the Abbasid caliphs till his own time. Then he said: "If we count them by persons, the number will end at Sulaiman, and if we count them by meaning, there we shall have five of them: the four Caliphs and 'Umar Ibn 'Abdul 'Aziz. I knew no meaning for the hadith."¹(1)1

Qadi 'Ayaadh, refuting those who say: "There were more than the said number", said: "This is an invalid objection because he (peace be on him and his progeny) did not say there would be only twelve. So, this number had actually been fulfilled and that would not mean that the number may not exceed them."²

Suyuti, in the answer, said: "It means the existence of the twelve caliphs during the entire period of Islam till the Day of Resurrection, who would practise the right, even if they did not come successively (i.e. one after the other)."³(2)1

In Fath al-Baari it is said: "... Of them, the four caliphs had passed and the rest must necessarily come before the advent of the Hour."⁴(3)2

Ibn al-Jawzi said: "Thus, what was meant by '*then there will be chaos*' was the mutinies heralding the coming of the Hour, such as the appearance of the Anti-Christ and what follows him."⁵(4)3

¹ Ibn 'Arabi's commentary on Sunan al-Tirmidhi, vol. 9, pp. 68-69

² Nawawi's explanation of Sahih Muslim, vol. 12, pp. 201-202; Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 239, who has been quoted verbatim. He repeated them on p. 341

³ Suyuti's Tarikh al-Khulafa', p. 12.

⁴ Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 341 and Tarikh al-Khulafa', p. 12.

Suyuti said: "Of the twelve, there were the four caliphs followed by Hasan, Mu'awiyah, Ibn Zubair and 'Umar Ibn Abd al-'Aziz, which makes it eight. To this, you can add the Abbasid al-Mahdi because he was like 'Umar Ibn Abd al-'Aziz of the Umayyads, as well as the Abbaside al-Taahir, owing to his equity and justice. Thus, there remain two: one is the Mahdi because he is from the Ahl al-Bait."¹(5)⁴

It was also said: "It means that the twelve should be during the glorious period of the caliphate which was the strength of Islam and the smoothness of its affairs, that is, in whose days Islam would be mighty and the Muslims would unanimously accept them."²(6)⁵

Baihaqi said: "This number, according to the given specifications, was found till the days of Walid Ibn Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, as after him there occurred chaos, bedlam and great mutinies. Then there appeared the Abbaside rule. The number, however, would increase if the given specification was left out, or if the number of them was counted after the said turmoil."³(1)⁶

"Those who were unanimously accepted were the three caliphs and then 'Ali until the case of the two arbitrators in Siffin, after which Mu'awiyah, acquired the name of the caliph. Thereafter, they generally accepted Mu'awiyah after Hasan's peace-treaty. Then, Muawiyah's son Yazid, was accepted, since Husain's affair did not last long, as he was killed before that. When Yazid died, there were disputes until they unanimously accepted 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Marwan after the murder of Ibn Zubair. They acknowledged his four sons too in succession: Walid, Sulaiman, Yazid and Hisham. But between Sulaiman and Yazid, there came 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz. The twelfth was Walid Ibn Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, who was unanimously recognized after Hisham, and he ruled for four years."⁴(2)¹

⁵ Ibid.

¹ Al-Sawaaeq al-Muhriqah, p.19; Tarikh al-Khulafa' by Suyuti, p. 12. Consequently, the followers of the Caliphate School are expecting two Imams, one being the Mahdi, while the followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on him and his progeny) School wait only for one Imam viz. the Mahdi

² Nawawi's explanation of Saheeh Muslim, vol. 12, pp. 202-203; Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, pp. 338-341; Tarikh al-Khulafa' by Suyuti, p.10.

³ Ibn Kathir quoted this from Baihaqi in his Tarikh, vol. 6, p. 249

⁴ Tarikh al-Khulafa', p. 11. al-Sawaaeq' al-Muhreqah, p. 19; Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 341

Consequently, it is taken that the caliphate of those twelve was correct because they was a consensus among the Muslims, and that it was they about whom the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had given the Muslims glad tidings of their succeeding him in carrying Islam to the people.

Ibn Hajar, commenting on this version, remarked: "This is the most recommendable version."

Ibn Kathir said: "The opinion of Baihaqi, which was accepted by many others, to the effect that they were the successive caliphs down to Walid Ibn Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, the atheist, whom we have already disparaged, is a questionable opinion, because the caliphs, down to the days of Walid Ibn Yazid, count more than twelve in number. In any case, the proof is that the caliphate of the four caliphs, Abu Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthman and 'Ali is unquestionable. Then came (Imam) Hasan Ibn 'Ali (peace be on them both) as 'Ali appointed him and he had the allegiance of the people of Iraq... until he signed the peace-treaty with Mu'awiyah ... Then his son, Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah, then his son Mu'awiyah Ibn Yazid, then Marwan Ibn al-Hakam, then his son, 'Abd al-Malik Ibn Marwan, then his son, Walid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, then Sulaiman Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, then 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz, then Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, then Hisham Ibn 'Abd al-Malik, making fifteen altogether, then Yazid Ibn 'Abd al-Malik. If we count the caliphate of Ibn Zubair before 'Abd al-Malik, there would be sixteen of them. At any rate, they became twelve before 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz. On this consideration, Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah is to be counted with the twelve, and 'Umar Ibn Abd al-Aziz is to be discounted, although all the Imams praised him, thanked him and regarded him among the orthodox caliphs; people unanimously accepted him to be just, and that his were of the most equitable days, as even the Rafdis admit. So, if somebody objected that he would only accept the one who was unanimously accepted, he must, then, leave out 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib, and his son, because the people did not unanimously accept them, since the entire Syrian populace did not pay their allegiance to them (Ali and Hasan - (peace be on them both)).

It was said that some had counted Mu'awiyah, his son, Yazid and Mu'awiyah Ibn Yazid, not limited by the days of Marwan, not Ibn Zubair because the nation did not unanimously accept either of them. So, consequently, they count the three caliphs followed by Mu'awiyah, Yazid, 'Abd al-Malik, Walid Ibn Sulaiman,

‘Umar Ibn Abd al-‘Aziz, Yazid and finally, Hisham. They come to ten. They are followed by the agnostic despot, Walid Ibn Yazid Ibn ‘Abd Malik, and thus, ‘Ali and his son, Hasan, are to be left out, which is contrary to what was fixed by the Imams of the Ahle Tasannun, as well as the Shiite in particular."¹(1)

Ibn al-Jawzi, in his Kashf al-Mushkil, relates two aspects of the answer:

First: "He (peace be on him and his progeny) pointed in his hadith to what would happen after him and his Companions, and that the rule of his Companions was connected to his. He informed about the rules that would take place after them, as if he was referring to the number of the Umayyads caliphs, and by his saying: "*the religion will continue*", he meant the rule until twelve caliphs pass; thereafter, he proceeds to an explanation harder (to digest) than the first, starting with Yazid Ibn Mu‘awiyah and ending with Marwan the Donkey, who makes it thirteen in number, leaving out ‘Uthman, Mu‘awiyah and Ibn Zubair because they were of the Companions. By dropping Marwan Ibn Hakam, as his companionship was doubted, or because the unanimity of the people was first for ‘Abdullah Ibn Zubair, the count would be correct. After that, when the caliphate was snatched from the Umayyads, there happened great mutinies and numerous bloody battles, till the establishment of the Abbaside dynasty. Subsequently, the situations changed a great deal than they were before."²(2)

Ibn Hajar, in his Fath al-Baari, refuted the above reasoning. Then he related the second aspect of the answer (which was collected by Abu al-Husain Ibn al-Munaadi in al-Mahdi.)

Second: "It is possible that it will happen after the Mahdi, who will appear in the end of the time, as I found in Daniel’s Book that: After the death of the Mahdi, five men from the offspring of the elder grandson [Hasan] will rule, then five men from the offspring of the younger grandson [Husain], then the last of them will appoint a man from the offspring of the elder grandson. After him, his son will take over and thus, there will be twelve kings; each one of them is Imam Mahdi...

¹ Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 6, pp. 249-250.

² Fath al-Baari, vol. 16, p. 340, quoting Ibn al-Jawzi from his Kashf al-Mushkil

In another narrative, he said: Then after him come twelve men: six of Hasan's offspring and five of Husain's offspring, and one not from them. Then he dies, after which there will be corruption overall."

Ibn Hajar, commenting on this last narrative in his Sawaaeq, said: "This narrative is very weak and cannot be replied upon."¹(1)1

Others said: "Most probably, he (peace be on him and his progeny) in this hadith foretold of wonders which would happen after him, and the disturbances which would cause the people to divide under twelve Emirs. Had he desired to say otherwise, he would have said:

'There will be twelve Emirs who will do such; But as he deprived them of the news, we realize, that he meant to say that they would be at the same time...'"²(2)2

Others said:

"It happened in the fifth century, in Spain (erstwhile Andalusia), where there were six persons simultaneously calling himself the caliph beside the ruler of Egypt and the Abbasides in Baghdad, other than the 'Alawis and the Kharijites who also claimed to be caliphs in different parts of the world."³(3)3

Ibn Hajar said: "This is the talk of the one who knows nothing of the ways of hadith except the narrative which was briefly related in al-Bukhari..."⁴(4)4 and said: "Their existed at the same time denotes the very separation. So, it is not intended."⁵(5)5

The author says:

They (the opponents) did not agree on a unified opinion in interpreting the aforementioned narratives. Yet, they neglected stating the ahaadith in which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) named the twelve Imams, as such ahaadith did not coincide with the policy of the governments in the Caliphate School along centuries, while they were stated by the narrators of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School in their writings, on the authority of pious

¹ Fath al-Baari, vol.16, p. 341; al-Sawaaeq al-Muhreqah, p. 19.

² Ibid., vol.16, p. 338.

³ Ibid., vol.16, p.339 and Sharh al-Nawawi, vol. 12, p. 202

⁴ Ibid., vol.16, p.338

⁵ Ibid., vol.16, p.339

companions, quoting the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) himself. We will be content relating just a few of ahaadith narrated by both sects:

The Names of the Twelve Caliphs in the School of Caliphate

a. Al-Juwayni¹(1)1, quoting ‘Abdullah Ibn Abbas, said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *‘I am the Chief of the Prophets and ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib is the Chief of the successors. My successors are twelve, the first of them is ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib and the last of them is the Mahdi.*"

b. Al-Juwayni, again, quoting Ibn Abbas, said that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"My caliphs and my successors, the proofs of Allah upon the people after me, are twelve; the first being my brother and the last my son."*

He (peace be on him and his progeny) was asked: "O Messenger of Allah! Who is your brother?" He (peace be on him and his progeny) replied: *"‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib."* They inquired: "And who is your son?" He (peace be on him and his progeny) answered: *"The Mahdi, who will fill it (the earth) with justice and equity, as it would be fraught with injustice and inequity. By the One who sent me with the truth as a giver of glad-tidings and as a warner! If there remains only one day for the world (to end), Allah will make it prolong it till my son, the Mahdi, will appear, and Allah’s spirit, Jesus, the son of Mary, will descend and perform the prayers behind him. The earth will be illuminated with the light of its Lord and his rule will cover the entire universe."*

c. Al-Juwayni, once again, quoting the same authority, said: "I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) say: *‘I, ‘Ali, Hasan, Husain and nine of Husain’s offspring are purified and infallible.*"²(2)2

* * *

¹ Al-Dhahabi, in the biography of his teachers in his Tadhkerah al-Huffaaz, p. 1505, says about him: "The Imam, the narrator, the unique, the more perfect, the pride of Islam, Sadr al-Deen Ibraheem Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hamwayh al-Juwayni al-Shafi’i, the leader of the Sufis. He was extremely careful in narration and acquiring the details. King Ghaazaan accepted Islam at his hands.

² The ahaadith (a), (b) and (c) are quoted from Faraaed al-Simtayn, a photocopied manuscript kept in the Central Library of Tehran University, under serial No. 1164/1690-1691, paper No. 160

The governing policy of the Caliphate School necessitated, along centuries, the concealment of such ahaadith from the Islamic nation and veiled them. Most of the followers of this School strived in this way, as we saw what they did to similar ahaadith in the discussion of how the Caliphate School dealt with texts of the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah which were contrary to the inclinations of this school. However, we do not intend to refer to them here. Yet, we are going to relate hereunder the identities of the twelve who have so much been referred to, and whose names were confirmed in the ahaadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

The Identities of the Twelve Imams after the Messenger(peace be on him and his progeny)

The first Imam:

He is Amirul Mu'minîn, 'Ali (peace be on him).

His father: Abu Talib Ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib Ibn Hashim.

His mother: Fatimah bint Asad Ibn Hashim Ibn Abd Munaf.

His agnomen: Abu al-Hasan wa al-Husain, Abu Turab.

His title: Al-Wasi, Amir al-Mu'minîn [The Chief of the faithful].

His birthplace: He was born in the Holy Ka'bah in the house of Allah¹(1)1, in the year 30 after the Year of the Elephant.

Martyrdom: He was assassinated by (the accursed) 'Abd al-Rahman Ibn Muljam in the prayer-niche of the Mosque of Kufah, in the blessed month of Ramdan circa 40 A.H. He was buried outside Kufah, in al-Najaf al-Ashraf.

The Second Imam:

He is Hasan Ibn 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them)

¹ His mother, Fatimah bint Asad, used to circumambulate the Ka'bah when pregnant with 'Ali (peace be on him). On the moment of delivery, the wall of the Ka'bah split open for her. She went in and gave birth to her child there. Al-Mustadrak, vol. 3, p. 483. Look up Tadhkerat-o-Khawaas al-'Ummah, p. 10. Al-Manaaqib by Ibn al-Maghaazili, p.7

His mother: Fatimah al-Zahra', the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

His agnomen: Abu Muhammad

His title: The elder Sibṭ; al-Mujtaba [the chosen one].

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah on the 15th of the blessed month of Ramadan, in the year 3 A.H.

Martyrdom: 28th of the month of Safar, 50 A.H., and buried in the Jannah al-Baqi', in Madinah Munawwarah.

The Third Imam:

He is Husain Ibn 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them)

His mother: Fatimah az-Zahra', the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)

His agnomen: Abu 'Abdillah.

His title: Al-Sibṭ; the martyr of Karbala'

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah, in the month of Sha'baan, in the year 4 A.H.

Martyrdom: He was killed by the army of the despot Yazid, together with his family and helpers, in the month of Muharram, in the year 61 A.H. His grave is in Karbala', a town in Iraq.¹(1)1

The Fourth Imam:

He is 'Ali, the son of Husain the martyr.

His mother: Ghazalah, or, as some say: Shah-e-Zanaan.

His agnomen: Abu al-Hasan.

His title: Zayn al-'Abedin [The adornment of the worshippers], Sajjad [the excessive prostrater]

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah in the year 38 or 37 or 33 A.H.

¹ Look up the biographies of Imam 'Ali and his two sons, Hasan and Husain (peace be on them all) in the statements about the events of the years 40, 50 and 60 A.H. In the Tarikhs by Tabari, Ibn Athir, Dhahabi, Ibn Kathir and in Tarikh Baghdad, Tarikh Demeshq, al-Istia'ab, Usud al-Ghaabah, al-Isaabah, Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra (its European and Beirut editions did not include their biographies. They were printed later.)

His death: He died in the year 94 A.H. and is buried in Jannah al-Baqi' next to his uncle, Hasan.¹(2)2

The Fifth Imam:

He is Muhammad Ibn 'Ali

His mother: 'Umm 'Abdillah bint Hasan Ibn 'Ali.

His agnomen: Abu Ja'far.

His title: Al-Baqir [The Splitter (of Knowledge of the Divine Prophets)].

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah in the year 45 A.H.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in the year 117 A.H., and is buried in Jannah al-Baqi' next to his father.²(1)3

The Sixth Imam:

He is Ja'far Ibn Muhammad

His mother: 'Umm Farwah bint Qasim Ibn Muhammad Ibn Abi Bakr.

His agnomen: Abu 'Abdillah.

His title: Sadiq [The Truthful].

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah in the year 73 A.H.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in the year 148 A.H., and is buried in Jannah al-Baqi' next to his father.³(2)1

The Seventh Imam: He is Musa Ibn Ja'far

His mother: Hamidah

His agnomen: Abu al-Hasan.

His title: Al-Kazim [The one who restrains his anger]

His birthplace: He was born in Madinah in 128 A.H.

¹ Look up his biography in the statements of the events of the year 94 A.H. in the Tarikhs by Ibn Athir, Ibn Kathir, Dhahabi, Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaqaat al-Kubra and in Hilyah al-Awliya', Wafayaat al-A'yaan, Ya'qubi's Tarikh and Mas'udi's Murju al-Dhahab, vol. 3, p.160

² Look up Tadhkerah al-Huffaz by Dhahabi; Wafayaat al-A'yaan; Safwah al-Safwah. Hilyah al-Awliya'; Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol.2, p.320; Dhahabi's Tarikh al-Islam; Ibn Kathir's Tarikh stating the events of the years 115, 117 and 118 A.H.

³ Look up Hilyah al-Awliya'; Wafayaat al-A'yaan; Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 381; Mas'udi, vol.3, p. 346

Martyrdom: 183 A.H. in the prison of the Caliph Haroon al-Abbasi in Baghdad, and buried in the Quraysh cemetery, on the western section of Baghdad (Kazimiyyah township of today) in Iraq.¹(3)2

The Eighth Imam:

He is ‘Ali Ibn Musa.

His mother: Khayzuran.

His agnomen: Abu al-Hasan.

His title: al-Rida [The one satisfied with Allah].

His birthplace: He was born in the year 153 A.H. in Madinah.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in the year 203 A.H. and is buried in Toos, in Khurasan (Iran).²(4)3

The Ninth Imam:

He is Muhammad Ibn ‘Ali

His mother: Sukaynah.

His agnomen: Abu ‘Abdillah.

His title: Al-Jawad [The Generous].

His birthplace: He was born in 195 A.H. in Madinah.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in 220 A.H. in Baghdad and is buried next to his grandfather, Musa Ibn Ja‘far, in the Quraysh cemetery.³(1)1

The Tenth Imam:

He is ‘Ali Ibn Muhammad

His mother: Samaanah al-Maghribiyyah

His agnomen: Abu al-Hasan

His title: Al-Hadi [The Guide].

¹ Look up his biography in Maqaatil al-Talibiyeen; Tarikh-o-Baghdad; Wafayaat al-A‘yaan; Safwah al-Safwah; Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, vol. 2, p.18; Ya‘qubi’s Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 414.

² Look up Tabari’s Tarikh; Ibn Athir, Tarikh al-Islam. Ibn Kathir’s Tarikh, in the events of the year 203 A.H; Wafayaat al-A‘yaan; Ya‘qubi’s Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 453; Mas‘udi, vol. 3, p. 441

³ Look up Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol.3, p.54; Wafayaat al-A‘yaan; Shadharaat al-Dhahab, vol.2, p. 48; Mas‘udi, vol.3, p. 464

His birthplace: He was born in 214 A.H. in Madinah.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in 254 A.H. and is buried in Saamarra' in Iraq.¹(2)2

The Eleventh Imam:

He is Hasan Ibn 'Ali

His mother: A slave-girl called Sosan.

His agnomen: Abu Muhammad.

His title: Al-'Askari [Confined to the Cantonment] (due to his being forced to live in Saamarra', a military encampment then).

His birthplace: He was born in 231 A.H. in Saamarra'.

Martyrdom: He was poisoned in 260 A.H. and buried in Saamarra'.²(3)3

The graves of all of the aforementioned eleven Imams (peace be on them) are visited by Muslims. Most of the graves have high domes, except the four in al-Baqi' in Madinah because when the Wahhabi rulers entered Madinah, they pulled down the domes and destroyed their shrines along with graves of the wives of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Companions'.

The Twelfth Imam:

He is al-Hujjah Muhammad Ibn al-Hasan.

His mother: A slave-girl called Narjis or Sayqal.

His agnomen: Abu 'Abdillah and Abu al-Qasim.

His titles: al-Qa'im [The One who will rise], al-Muntazar [The Awaited One], al-Khalaf [The Successor], al-Mahdi [The Guided], Saahib al-Zamaan [The Master of the Time].

His birthplace: He was born in Saamarra' in 255 A.H.

He is the last of the infallible Imams and is still alive.³(1)1

¹ Look up his biography in Tarikh-o-Baghdad, vol.12, p. 56; Wafayaat al-A'yaan; Ya' qubi's Tarikh, vol. 2, p. 484; Mas'udi, vol.4, p. 84

² Look up his biography in Wafayaat al-A'yaan, Tadhkerat-o-Khawaas al-Ummah by Sibte Ibn al-Jawzi al-Hanafi, Mataalib al-So'l fi Manaajib Aal al-Rasul by al-Shaykh Kamaal al-Deen Muhammad Ibn Talhah al-Shaafi'i (d. 656 A.H.) and Ya'qubi's Tarikh, vol.2, p. 503

³ . Tadhkerat-o-Khawaas al-Ummah by Sibte Ibn al-Jawzi; Mataalib al-So'l and Wafayaat al-A'yaan.

Important Note:

It was related in one of the aforementioned ahaadith: "... *until twelve Imams of them, all of them of Quraysh, have passed, then there will be chaos.*"

In another, it was related: "... *This religion will continue alongwith twelve of Quraysh. When they have passed away, the earth will swell in agitation with its people.*"

Both texts denote that the world will end after the last of the twelfth who came after the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny). Therefore, the life of one of the twelve will be as long as the life of the world, And this is what actually happened, as the twelfth successor, the Mahdi, Muhammad Ibn Hasan al-‘Askari (peace be on them both) is still alive, since all the narratives come true in respect of the twelve Imams (peace be on them) as mentioned before, and these narratives cannot be applied to anybody else but them. Praise be to Allah!

CHAPTER FOUR

Summing up the Discussion of Imamate according to both schools

- © The Historical Reality of the Establishment of the Caliphate in the Early Days of Islam.
The Opinions of the Caliphate School about the Caliphate.
- ©
- © Discussing the Opinions of the Caliphate School On the Caliphate and the Imamate. Evidences From Imam 'Ali's Speeches.
- © The Duty of Obeying the Ruler, not Deposing him nor revolting against Him.
- ©
- © The Imamate at the Ahl al-Bait School.
©The twelve Successors of the Holy Prophet(peace be on him and his progeny)
- © The Policy of the Ruling Authority During Some Thirteen Centuries.

The Historical Reality of the Establishment of the Caliphate

In the Early Days of Islam

It is befitting first to study the historical reality of the establishment of the caliphate before parading the opinions of the two Schools concerning the caliphate and Imamate.

The Beginning

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), in his illness which led to his demise, appointed Usaamah, his servant, commander of an army consisting of the Migrants and the Ansar, such as Abu Bakr, 'Umar, Abu 'Ubaydah and Sa'd Ibn Abi Waqqas. He camped in al-Jurf. He was angry on hearing them disapproving of his appointing Usaamah as their leader. Having told them that he was worthy of the post, they left to join their camp. The state of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) worsened. 'Usaamah came to take his leave and bid him farewell. The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) said: *"Carry out 'Usaamah's expedition."* On Monday, while they were preparing to leave, they were informed that the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) was dying. They returned to the town and went to the Messenger's house. He (peace be on him and his progeny) told them: *"Come, let me write for you a letter with which you will never go astray."* 'Umar said: "The Messenger is overcome by pain. He is speaking in delirium. We have the Book of Allah, it will suffice for us." As their noisy arguments got louder, he said: *"Leave me alone! It is improper to quarrel in the presence of the Prophet."*

Ibn 'Abbas relates: "They disputed. Though it is improper to dispute at the presence of the Prophet." They said that the Messenger was talking in delirium (i.e. he has lost his senses). Ibn 'Abbas wept so much that his tears moistened the sand.

The Attitude of the Caliph ‘Umar

When the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) died, Abu Bakr was absent as he was in Sonoh (where he had a house). ‘Umar was shouting: "The Messenger of Allah did not die. He went to his Lord as Moosa had gone and was absent from his people for forty nights. By Allah! The Messenger of Allah will be back and he will cut off the hands of those who assert that he has died." He added: "Whoever says he is dead I will be over him with my sword." Somebody recited to him the verse: *"And Muhammad is no more than a Messenger, the messengers have already passed away before him, if then he dies or is killed, will you turn back upon your heels?"* (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 144)

‘Abbas (the Prophet’s uncle) told him: "The Messenger is dead. If anyone of you had received a promise from the Messenger of Allah at his demise, let him tell us." No sooner ‘Umar had finished his threats, his mouth was foaming. But when Abu Bakr came in and recited the said verse, ‘Umar became silent.

The Saqifah of Banu Sa‘idah and Abu Bakr’s Allegiance

The Ansar gathered in the Saqifah of Banu Sa‘idah, while the Messenger’s body was still being given the ritual bath by his family. They brought Sa’d Ibn Ubaadah, who was sick. He spoke of the merits of the Ansar and said: "Seize this affair alone." They said: "Well said! We shall keep to what you say. We put you at the head of the affair." Abu Bakr and ‘Umar hearing about that meeting, rushed with their groups to the Saqifah. On reaching there, Abu Bakr spoke of the merits of the Migrants and said: "They are his (Prophet’s) friends and his tribe, and they deserve this affair more than any other group after him. None denies it but an unjust."

Habbaab Ibn Mundhir said: "O Ansar! Take charge of your affair, as the masses are in your control, and none would dare to contradict you. If they reject what you heard, then (at least) an Emir from us and an Emir from them."

‘Umar said: "Far from that! Two cannot join on one summit... The Arabs would not accept you the rulers while their Prophet is not from you!" They threatened one another.

The Ansar, or some of them, announced that they would not give their allegiance to other than ‘Ali. ‘Umar, fearing disagreement, called out to Abu Bakr: "Extend

your hand to give you my allegiance." Bashir Ibn Sa'd preceded him in giving his allegiance to Abu Bakr. Habbaab Ibn Mundhir called out to him: "O you treacherous! Do you envy your cousin on his chieftainship?"

'Umar and Abu 'Ubaydah gave their allegiance to Abu Bakr, The Aws (tribes) said: (among themselves): "Once the (Banu) Khazraj come to power, they will get the virtue over you, and they will give you no share. So, give your allegiance to Abu Bakr." Thus, the situation turned against Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah and the Khazraj, and they were about to tread on Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah. Some of his companions said: "Beware, lest you tread on Sa'd!"

'Umar said: "Kill him! May Allah kill him!" Saying this, he stood at his head and said to him: "I was about to tread on you till you fall down in pieces." Qays Ibn Sa'd took 'Umar's beard and said: "If you touched a single hair of him, you will return with no tooth in your mouth!"

Abu Bakr said: "Take it easy, 'Umar! Leniency is more effective in such situations." 'Umar turned away from him, and Sa'd was carried home.

Abu Bakr was brought out of the Saqifah, where he was given the allegiance by the Aslam tribe. He was, at that, successful, and was brought in a procession to the Mosque of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), where he ascended the pulpit. They were too engaged to attend the funeral of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) till Tuesday. They came to the Mosque once again and Abu Bakr sat on the pulpit of the Messenger of Allah. 'Umar stood up and repeated what he had said the day before was not from the Book of Allah nor was it a promise from His Messenger. But he thought that the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) would manage their affairs and that he would be the last, and that Allah had kept the Qur'an among them so as to be guided by it, and that their opinion was unanimously placed on the Companion of the Messenger of Allah. "So, come and give your allegiance to him." They did so, after their allegiance in the Saqifah. Then Abu Bakr delivered a speech in which he said: "I have been put to rule over you, though (I am) not the best. So, if I do good, help me and if I err, rectify me."

Thus, they were distracted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) for the rest of Monday, the night of Tuesday and the whole of Tuesday. The Muslims performed the prayers over the Messenger of Allah (peace be on

him and his progeny) group after group. His Companions left his body to his family to take care of his burial. Abu Bakr and ‘Umar did not attend the ritual of washing the body of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), shrouding and burying him.

‘A’ishah said: "We did not know about the burial of the Messenger until we heard the sound of the shovels in the heart of the night."

Some of the Migrants, Ansar and the Banu Hashim refrained from paying their allegiance to Abu Bakr and were inclined to ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib (peace be on them both). Therefore, they went to ‘Abbas to get his sympathy but he rejected them.

A group of Banu Hashim, the Muhajirs and the Ansar fortified themselves in Fatima’s (peace be on her) house. Abu Bakr sent ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab to them in order to drag them out of the house, and instructed: "If they refuse, fight them."

So, He came with a brand of fire, intending to set the house on fire. Fatimah (peace be on her) met them and said: "*O son of al-Khattaab! Have you come to set our house on fire?*" "Yes," he said, "or you accept what the nation has already accepted."

It was to this that Abu Bakr alluded in his deadly illness, by saying: "In fact, I regret nothing in this world except three (acts) which I did and I wish I had not done... I wish I had not exposed Fatimah’s house even if it was closed for war..."

At night, ‘Ali accompanied Fatimah to the houses of the Ansar, asking them to help, and Fatimah also asking them to support him, but they told them: "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah! We have already given our allegiance to this man. Had your cousin come to us before Abu Bakr, we would not have equalled him (with any body)." ‘Ali objected. "Was I to leave the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in his house without performing his funeral rites, and go out to the people to dispute with them about his power?" and Fatimah

told them: "*Abu al-Hasan did what he had to, and they did what will be reckoned with by Allah.*"

Mu'awiyah reviled Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali for this procedure, and said: " I remember you yesterday carrying the sitter of your house [your wife] on an ass, at night, holding by the hands your two sons, Hasan and Husain, the day of giving the allegiance to Abu Bakr, as-Siddiq. You left none of the people of Badr and the veterans without calling them to yourself. You approached together with your wife and impressed them with your two sons, demanding their help against the Companion of the Messenger of Allah... Yet, only four or five responded to you... And if you do forget I will not forget your saying to Abu Sufyan, when he moved and exited you: *'Had I found (among them) forty resolute men I would have resisted them.*'"

Bukhari related the conversation that took place between the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and Abu Bakr and said: "Then Fatimah deserted him and never talked to him till her death after six months. Her husband buried her without informing Abu Bakr. 'Ali had a face among the people during the life of Fatimah but when she died, the people turned their faces from him, so he did not give his allegiance for six months, neither anyone from the Bani Hashim, until he gave him his allegiance, as when 'Ali noticed that the people were turning away from him, he was inclined to make peace with Abu Bakr."

Balaadhuri said: "None set off to fight the enemy before 'Ali gave his allegiance." Of those who delayed giving their allegiance to Abu Bakr were Farwah Ibn 'Amr, and Khalid, Abaan and 'Umar, sons of Sa'id al-'Umawi. When Banu Hashim gave their allegiance, they followed suit.

Sa'd Ibn 'Ubaadah did not give his allegiance. The Ansar suggested that he should be left alone, as he would rather be killed than give his allegiance, and he cannot be killed before his sons, family and a number of his tribe are killed first. So, he was left alone. 'Umar, at the beginning of his caliphate said to him: "Whoever dislikes a neighbour quits his neighbourhood." So, he went to Syria. 'Umar sent a man and told him: "Ask him to give his allegiance, if he refused get Allah's help against him." The man travelled to Syria and there he found Sa'd in a village

called Hawarîn, near Aleppo. He asked him for the allegiance, but he refused, so he shot him with an arrow and killed him.

‘Umar’s Allegiance

When Abu Bakr was on his death-bed, he sent for ‘Uthman, alone, and ordered him to write: "In the Name of Allah the Beneficent the Merciful. This is what Abu Bakr Ibn Abi Qahaafah entrusts the Muslims with ..." then he lost consciousness. ‘Uthman continued writing: ‘I appoint ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab as my successor among you, and I spared no effort in doing good to you’. At this juncture, Abu Bakr regained consciousness. ‘Uthman read to him what he had written. Abu Bakr endorsed it.

Then ‘Umar came with the letter to the Mosque of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and said to the people: "Hear and obey what the successor of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) says. He says: "I spared no effort in doing good to you."

Thus, people gave their allegiance to ‘Umar.

The Consultative Council (Shura) and ‘Uthman’s Allegiance

When ‘Umar was stabbed, he was asked: "How if you appointed your successor?" "Had Salim been alive," replied ‘Umar, "I would have appointed him. Had Abu ‘Ubaydah been alive, I would have appointed him." Then he said: "I will appoint a council of six members." He chose them from Quraysh. He ordered Abu Talhah Zayd Ibn Sahl al-Khazraji to command fifty men of the Ansar and ordered Suhayb to lead the congregational prayers for three days. After three days, they (the six) were to choose one of themselves (as successor), and Abu Talhah was to behead the opposer. If three of them chose one and the other three chose another one, the one who was chosen by the group including Abd al-Rahman, was to be accepted by the others. If Abd al-Rahman clapped his hands on the other, they must follow him and whoever abstained was to be beheaded.

When Umar died, Abd al-Rahman said: "I withdraw myself and Sa’d out of it but I am going to choose one of you." They all agreed except Ali who abstained. When pressurized, he asked Abd al-Rahman to take the oath not to be inclined to a

desire, to prefer the truth and not to favour any relative. When he agreed, ‘Ali said to him: "Choose! May you be guided!"

They all went to the Mosque of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). There he (‘Abd al-Rahman) extended his hand to ‘Ali and said: "Extend your hand to give you my allegiance on the Book of Allah, His Messenger’s Sunnah and the conduct of the two Shaykhs [Abu Bakr and ‘Umar]."

‘Ali said: *"I will lead you according to the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Prophet, to the best of my ability."*

He extended his hand to ‘Uthman, who accepted (his conditions).

He once again extended his hand to ‘Ali, who repeated his former saying.

‘Ali’s answer was the same, again. He turned to ‘Uthman and repeated his offer.

‘Uthman agreed again. He then turned again to ‘Ali and repeated his offer.

Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him) said: *"With Allah’s Book and His Prophet’s Sunnah, there will be no need to follow anybody else’s conduct. You are striving to move it away from me."*

‘Abd al-Rahman returned to ‘Uthman and repeated his offer. He accepted as before. He, then, clapped his hand on his and gave him his allegiance. ‘Ali (peace be on him) said to Abd al-Raman: *"You have given him a gift of a life-time. This is not the first time in which you backed each other against us. So, we shall be patient against what you describe. By Allah! You appointed ‘Uthman only to return it over to you. Allah is all the time in a (new) state."*

The members of the Consultative Council (*shura*) gave their allegiance to ‘Uthman. ‘Ali, who was standing, left the place angrily. Abd al-Rahman said to him: "Give your allegiance or I will cut off your head." However, none of them had a sword with him. They followed him and said to him: "Give your allegiance or we will fight against you." He returned with them and paid his allegiance to ‘Uthman.

Imam ‘Ali’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Allegiance

After the murder of ‘Uthman, the Muslims regained control over their affairs and being relieved from their former allegiance, they crowded around Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him). The Migrants and the Ansar, as well as Talhah and Zubair,

came to ‘Ali (peace be on him) and said to him: "Come let us give you our allegiance."

He said: *"I am in no need of your affair. I am with you. Whoever you choose, I will accept."* They replied, "Never! By Allah we choose none other than you." They kept coming to him time and again. At last, they came to him and said: "The people's affair cannot be improved without a leader and it took too long a time. By Allah! We shall do nothing unless we give you our allegiance." He (peace be on him) said: *"Then let it be in the Mosque, as my allegiance must not be in secret and must be with the consent of the Muslims."*

They all gathered in the Mosque, hastening to him. The first who ascended to him and gave him his allegiance was Talhah. Then the Migrants, the Ansar and other people gave him their allegiance in succession.¹(1)

* * *

Next, we are going to study the opinions of the two Schools about the Imamate and the Caliphate.

* * *

The Opinions of the Caliphate School of the Imamate

First: The Caliph Abu Bakr, on the day of Saqifah said: "This affair cannot be except for this branch of Quraysh. They are of the highest lineage and family of the Arabs." Then he said: "I choose for you ‘Umar and Abu ‘Ubaydah. Give your allegiance to either of them."²(1)

According to another narrative, he said:

"They are his friends and kinsfolk, and have more right than all people for this affair after him, and none would dispute it with them except an unjust person."³(2)

Second: ‘Umar, addressing the Ansar in Saqifah, said: "By Allah! The Arabs would not agree to have you as their rulers while their Prophet is from other than you. But the Arabs would not refrain from giving the command of their affair to

¹ Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah by Ibn Abi al-Hadid, 1st ed., vol. 1, p. 240 and the edition edited by Muhammad Abul Fadhl Ibrahim, vol. 4, pp. 8-9.

² Al-Bukhari, book of "al-Hudud", Chapter on "Stoning a Pregnant Woman", vol. 4, p. 120.

³ Tabari's Tarikh, Eu. ed., vol. 1, p. 1840

those in whom was the Prophethood and the Guardian was from among them. We have our clear proof and manifest authority against whoever denies it. Who is that who would deny us Muhammad's authority and rule, since we are his friends and kinsfolk, unless he be arguing with falsity, turning to sin or entangling in a peril."¹(3)3

Yet, on hearing somebody, during the last month of his days, saying that if the Amir al-Muminin died, he would give his allegiance to so-and-so, he said: "Whoever gives his allegiance to a man of the Muslims without consulting the Muslims, both the giver of the allegiance and the one to whom it was given must be killed."²(4)4

Appointing the six-member council, after having been stabbed, Umar said: "If two men had stayed alive till now, I would have certainly entrusted one of them with this affair: Salim, slave of Abu Hudhayfah, and Abu 'Ubaydah al-Jarrah"³(5)5 Then he added: "Had Salim been alive I would not have suggested a consultative council."⁴(1)1

Third: The followers of the Caliphate School say that the Imamah is established by the assignment of the previous Im'am, since Abu Bakr assigned 'Umar for it, without confining it to the consent of the Companions, and still it was not established by the choice of the people of rank and high social standings. There was difference about the quorum. Some said it would be established by at least five persons, since Abu Bakr's allegiance was established by only five persons, and because 'Umar had authorised six persons so that five of them may choose the sixth.

Most of them say that it may be established by a single person because 'Abbas had said to 'Ali: "Extend your hand in order to give you my allegiance. They also say that it was a judgement, and the judgement of a single judge is valid.

They further say: "Whoever overcame them by the sword until he became the Caliph and was named Amir al-Mu'minin, no believer in Allah and in the Day of

¹ Ibid., vol. 1, p. 1841.

² Bukhari, Chapter on "Stoning a Pregnant Woman", vol. 4, p. 120.

³ Ibn Sa'd's al-Tabaaqat al-Kubra, Beirut ed. Dar Sadir Publication, vol. 3, p. 343

⁴ Al-Isti'ab and 'Usud al-Ghaabah, vol.2. p. 246 in the biography of Salim.

Judgement could pass that night without accepting him as an Imam, be he a pious or a debauchee, as he would be Amir al-Mu'minîn."¹(2)2

They narrate that the Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny)had said: "Listen to the Emir and obey him even if he lashed your back and took your property."

They also say that the Caliph can not be deposed for debanchery, despotism or suspension of rights, and it is not allowed to revolt against him for those causes. He must be advised and frightened, according to the ahaadith which have been narrated in this regard.

Such are the opinions of the followers of the Caliphate School. Before discussing the said opinions, we must first study the terminology used in these discussions:

First: The Consultative Council (*Shura*):

In Arabic, counsel and consultation mean, reaching an opinion from consulting others. This same meaning is mentioned in the Holy Qur'an: "... **and their affairs are a matter of counsel among themselves**" (Surah Shura (42): Verse 38) That is, they consult each other concerning their affairs. So, the term is not an Islamic one.

Second: Allegiance:

a. In Arabic, it refers to a "handclasp" or "hand-clapping", in concluding a deal or a sale. When this clasping or clapping takes place between the two parties of a transaction, it denotes that the deal has been concluded.

The Arabs used to conclude an agreement, a pact, a contract etc. in different ways. They used, for example, to put their hands in a basin filled with perfume and agree on something. The basin may be filled with blood.

b. The allegiance in Islam is a pledge indicating that the giver of the allegiance promises the receiver of the allegiance to obey him in all matters concerning the subject of the allegiance. Allah the Exalted says: **Surely those who swear allegiance to you do but swear allegiance to Allah. The hand of Allah is above**

¹ Refer to the previous discussion of the opinion of the Caliphate School of the Imamate.

their hands..." (Surah Fath (48): Verse 10) The first allegiance received by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) from the people was in al-'Aqabah, on accepting Islam (as their religion). It was called "Bay'ah al-Nisaa'", as it included no fighting.

The second grand allegiance also took place in al'Aqabah, given on fighting for the establishment of the Islamic community.

The third allegiance was in Hudaibiyyah, under a tree, when he called the people for the 'Umrah (minor pilgrimage). When they came out wearing their pilgrimage cloth (ehraam) for the 'Umarh, the Quraysh prevented them from performing the Umrah. So, they prepared themselves to fight and their journey's purpose was changed from performing the 'Umrah to fighting – a case which was different from the one they were called for. Thus, the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) had to obtain their allegiance for the unexpected new situation. They gave him their allegiance, and it had its frightening effect on the residents of Makkah.

Thus, the first allegiance was on Islam, with no fighting. The second was on the establishment of the Islamic state and fighting for it. The third was the allegiance on fighting during the said journey. This is what had been recorded in the biographies of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in respect to the allegiance. He had related in his ahaadith that he used to take the people's allegiance on obeying him as much as they could. He would not take the allegiance from the young who had not yet legally come of age.

By studying the biography of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), we gather that the allegiance is based on three foundations:

1. The giver of the allegiance.
2. The receiver of the allegiance.
3. Pledging obedience.

The allegiance is established on understanding the requisites of obedience, then the contract is concluded by the giver of the allegiance clasping his hand over the hand of the receiver of the allegiance. Such being the case, the word allegiance is an Islamic term. Yet, the conditions for concluding an allegiance according to the Islamic Law are not clear to many Muslims. These conditions are as follows:

a. The giver of the allegiance must legally be sane and mature, as allegiance of an of a junior or of an insane is not accepted because they bear no legal responsibility or obligation.

He should also give it on his free will because a allegiance is like a sale deed or contract, which cannot be concluded forcibly taking a thing from the buyer and giving it to the seller. So, the allegiance is not to be taken by force or "at the edge of the sword."

b. The giver of the allegiance must not be an open sinner because the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*No obedience (is acceptable) from the one who disobeys Allah, the Exalted and Most High.*"¹(1)1

c. The allegiance which is taken to perform what is forbidden by Allah and contrary to His and His Messenger's commands, as the Messenger of Allah said: "*If a disobedience (of Allah) was ordered, then these can be no hearing and no obeying.*"²(2)2

Third and Fourth: The Caliph and Amir al-Mu'minîn:

Khilaafah in Arabic means to represent another. The Khalifah is the one who takes the place of someone else and replaces him - a successor.

The Holy Qur'an, in this meaning, says: "**And remember when He made you successors after Noah's people...**"(Surah A'raaf (7): Verse 69) and in a narration by the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), he said: "*O Allah! Have mercy on my Caliphs'.*" Defining his caliphs, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*They are those who come after me, narrating my ahaadith and Sunnah.*"

Therefore, the Caliph, according to the Noble Qur'an and the ahaadith, is not the name of the one who rules in the capacity of a deputy for the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). This was the case till the time of 'Umar, who was called: the Caliph of the Caliph of the Messenger of Allah. Then he was called: Amir al-Mu'minîn. This continued till the Abbasides, who were called: the

¹ Look up Chapter on "Terminology", 5th: "Al-Allegiance".

² Ibid.

Caliph of the Messenger of Allah, besides addressing them as: Amir al-Mu'minîn. During the Ottoman era, the supreme Islamic ruler was called "the Caliph" - which remains common among the Muslims till this day.

Thus, the word al-Khalifah is a term coined by the Muslims and not an Islamic one. This is true of the term Amir al-Mu'minîn too.

Fifth: The Imam:

In Arabic lexicon, this word means the one who is the head of the people who follow him. The Glorious Qur'an puts certain limits for an Imam, as in the verse, addressed to the Prophet Ibraheem (peace be on him): "... **I will make you an Imam of the people.**" Then He said: "... **My covenant does not include the unjust.**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 124)

Thus, the Imamate is a covenant from Allah, which He does not grant to the unjust, whether he oppresses himself or others. Therefore, this is an Islamic term.

Sixth: The affair (*amr*) and the guardians of the affairs (*Ulul amr*):

The term "*amr*" is used in the Arabic language, in the Muslims convention and in Islamic texts to mean ruling over the people and guarding their affairs.

As for "*ulul amr*", it can be regarded as an Islamic term, since it is used in the Holy Qur'an to mean the authority and guardianship over the people. It says: "**O you who believe! Obey Allah and the Messenger and the 'Ulul amr among you.**" (Surah Nisaa (4): Verse 59).

The two Schools differ in specifying the "*master of the affair*" and the "*masters of the affairs*" after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny). The Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School believes that the appointment of the Imam and the master of the affair after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) is Allah's prerogative. He appoints whoever He wills and the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) conveys the information to the people.

The Caliphate School believes that he is determined through taking the allegiance from the people, through coming to power by force and by overcoming the people; after seizing the rule, by whatever method, the duty of the people would

be to obey him. On this basis, they obeyed the Yazid as a Calipha in killing the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and took his women and children as prisoners. He soldiers plundered the city of the Messenger, killed his (peace be on him and his progeny) Companions and their Tabi'în; later, he shelled the Holy Ka'bah with fire-balls from catapults, and yet he was called, and is still addressed, as Amir al-Mu'minîn [The Chief of the Believers!], up till this day.

Seventh: The Successor (*wasi*) and the Prophet's successor (*wasi*)

A successor, in the Book and the Sunnah, is a person entrusted by somebody to execute the will, after the death of the one who makes the will. To do this, the one making the will [the Testator] says to the successor [the executor of the will] "I entrust you to do such-and-such tasks after my death." Similarly when one wants to inform the other about the succession, one may say: "So-and-so will perform such-and-such tasks after me," and similar expressions denoting succession. The Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) successor is the one to whom he entrusted the affairs of his Shari'ah and nation after him.

Discussing The Opinion of the Caliphate School Concerning the Caliphate and Imamate

Firstly: The Consultative Council (Shura)

The first who suggested the Shura for the establishment of the caliphate was ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, without any evidence from the Book or the Sunnah. It was his own whim. So, whoever takes the conduct and the sayings of the Companions to stand on the same footing as the Book of Allah and Sunnah of His Messenger to be from the sources of the Islamic Shari‘ah, then he may also take this Sunnah of ‘Umar as a support backing this method of establishing the caliphate. It goes without saying that his Sunnah contradicts his own Sunnah and that of his predecessor Abu Bakr in respect of the establishment of the first caliphate of the First Caliph, Abu Bakr, which "was an error", as ‘Umar had put it according to his judgement. Yet, it is contrary to both these Sunnah in establishing the caliphate of the second Caliph, ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab, because the first Caliph, Abu Bakr, personally appointed ‘Umar as his successor. Neither consulted the people in both instances. Furthermore, this conduct was also contrary to ‘Umar’s saying that had Abu ‘Ubaydah been alive, he would have appointed him, or had Salim, the slave of Abu Hudhayfah been alive, he would have appointed him. It is obvious that was contrary to the principle of referring to the Shura!!!

Let us assume (for the sake of argument) that it was right to establish the caliphate on the basis of the Shura as suggested by ‘Umar, what would be its modalities? How was it to be conducted? How many members would constitute the Consultative Council? They generally said the members of the Shura were confined to six, five of them give the allegiance to the sixth, to which one may add his question: What was the justification to give Abd al-Rahman Ibn ‘Awf, in particular, the privilege of taking the final decision, excluding others from having a similar right in that Shura? Furthermore, what justification was there to kill whoever refused to accept ‘Abd al-Rahman’s opinion and decision? Who were they afraid of to oppose ‘Abd al-Rahman’s opinion with the exclusion of others?

Lastly, did the Caliphate School ever apply the ‘Umarite Shura again even for a single instance to establish a caliphate along the past centuries?

As regards the arguments of the Caliphate School on this topic, they resorted to the verse: "**And their affair is a matter of counsel among them**" (Surah Shura (42): Verse 38), which is nothing more than a recommendation for consultation to the Muslims concerning their affairs. Had it been mandatory, Allah would have said: "It is prescribed upon the believers," or "It is incumbent upon you," and similar expressions denoting a command.

As to their reference to the verse: "**And take counsel with them in the affair**" (Surah Aale Imran (3): Verse 159), we have already explained that this verse is directing the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to calling the people to fight through consultation, not forcing them to fight like the orders of tyrant kings who issued decrees: "We, the King of... have issued our Royal ordinance that..." The Almighty Himself adds in the same verse, that it is not binding upon the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), to obey the suggestions of the advisors, by saying: "**So, when ‘you’ have decided, then trust Allah.**" Hence, carrying out the act depends on the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) decision not on the opinions of the consulting members of the Shura. This was clear in the examples of the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) consultation with the Muslims in instances whose outcome was already known to the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny), such as his consulting with them to the fight the Battle of Badr.

The Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) consultation, however, aimed at getting acquainted with the Muslims opinions concerning how to carry out the Islamic precepts. It was not aimed at inferring a legislative decree, especially that Allah the Exalted says: "**And it is not for a believing man nor for a believing woman that when Allah and His Messenger have decided an affair, that they should have any choice/option in that affair; and whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger, he has indeed gone astray, a clear deviation.**" (Surah Ahzaab (33): Verse 36)

Secondly: Allegiance:

We have already said that the allegiance is not to be concluded for an act in disobedience of the Creator nor is it to be given to one who openly disobeys Allah nor taken by force and "at the edge of the sword."

However, the followers of the Caliphate School suggest that the allegiance can be concluded by five persons. Others opined that it can be concluded by a single person with two witnesses. This opinion is based on the practice of the Companions.

Thirdly: The Companions' Practice:

To depend on the practices of the Companions and regard them as an evidence would be all right if the conduct of the Companions enjoyed the same authenticity as the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) vis-a-vis the Islamic legislation. But the conduct of the companions were mostly self-contradictory, as we have already given some examples. So, whose example should we follow and whose sayings must we accept?

Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) Opinion as a Proof

As for the saying of Imam Ali (peace be on him) which they cite as evidence, it was an objection against Mu'awiyah and his followers by which they had to abide. But the unanimity of the Companions, including Imam 'Ali and his two sons, Hasan and Husain, (peace be on them) is enough proof. Actually, this was what Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) meant to say.

The Compulsory Obedience of the Ruler and not Deposing Him for Transgression or Sinning

They say: "The ruler – whom they call Imam – cannot be deposed for transgression, misdemeanor and sinning blatantly."

They also say: "A Muslim has to listen and obey the sinful Imam, even if he (the Imam) whips him on the back and confiscates his property. It is not allowed to revolt against him.

They further say: Yazid Ibn Mu'awiyah, who used to publicly practice transgression and malevolence became the Chief of the Believers (Amir al-Mu'minîn) (as a caliph) on receiving the people's allegiance. As a result of believing in the validity of his allegiance, he could recruit an army of those who believed in his allegiance, and use them to kill the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Karbala, take their women and children as prisoners, and make them travel as captives on the scorching sand from Karbala to his capital in Syria.

On account of the allegiance, he could mass another army of believers in his allegiance, with whom he invaded the town of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and proclaimed it open to the appropriation of his army for three days. They killed a number of Companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and their followers, and forced others to give their allegiance regarding them to be Yazid's slaves, after committing acts of rape and other crimes unprecedented in the history of Islam. Thereafter, he invaded Makkah and attacked the Holy Ka'bah and the Sacrosanct House of Allah by fireballs from catapults. Nevertheless, after all these crimes, he is still called Amir al-Mu'minîn and tomes are written in his praise. **We are from Allah and unto Him shall we return.**

The Imaamah According to the Ahlul-Bait (peace be on them) School

So far we have been relating the opinions of the Caliphate School about Imamate and Caliphate and their arguments. As for the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School, it presents as a proof Allah's address to Ibraheem (peace be on him): "... **I will appoint you an Imam**", and then Allah's reply to Ibraheem (peace be on him) when he asked: "...**and of my offspring? My covenant does not include the wrong doers.**" (Surah Baqarah (2): Verse 124). That is, the Imamate is Allah's covenant which is not obtained by an oppressor, whether he is unjust to himself or to others. It also argues that Allah said, in favour of Ahl al-Bait: "**Allah**

wants to keep away the uncleanness from you, O Ahl al-Bait, and purify you a thorough purification.", which speaks of the infallibility of the offspring of Muhammad (peace be on him and his progeny) i.e. they are immaculate and never sin. It further speaks of the conduct as history did not record even a single sin against any one of them.

As regards the evidences to prove the Imamate of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), we have to study the Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) procedure in appointing the master of the affair after him. Doing so, we find that the question of the Imamate after him was not away from the attention of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) and of those around him. As a matter of fact, someone even demanded from the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to entrust it to him, but he rebutted: "*The affair belongs to Allah, and He entrusts it to whoever He wills.*" He took their allegiance on the establishment of the Islamic community, and on giving their pledge "*not to dispute the affair with its people.*" He appointed Imam 'Ali, on the first day of his call for Islam, as his minister and successor after him. We have also seen the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) appointing 'Ali as his deputy – governor of Madinah – whenever he was absent from the town on some assignment, even if the distance was a mile or lesser.

He (peace be on him and his progeny) could never neglect his nation forever. He, actually, did as the divine Prophets had done before him. They had appointed their successors and informed their people about them. He (peace be on him and his progeny), too, appointed his successor and master of the affairs after him on different occasions, places and times, confirmed by successive narratives quoted from him, such as his reply when Salman asked him about his successor after him: "*My successor and the custodian of my secrets... is 'Ali Ibn Abi Talib,*" and many other of his ahaadith, in which he confirmed that 'Ali (peace be on him) was the Master of the affairs after him. Consequently, Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) was called "the successor" (*wasi*) up to centuries afterwards, such that it was referred to by the poets in their poems, the orators in their speeches and in the arguments of the debates of the Companions, the Taabi'în, the Caliphs and the Emirs, as has already been referred to.

Now as the renowned title of the successor of the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) was contrary to the policy of the caliphs and of the direction of their School, they tried hard, generation after generation, to conceal the ahaadith of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) which declared ‘Ali (peace be on him) as his successor through the very word: successor (*wasi*), or by other words, such as the Master (*wali*) or the Master of Affairs (*wali al-amr*). We have already related ten kinds of their concealments, including omitting a part of the narration and replacing it with a vague word, as they did with the hadith: "*My caliph and my successor among you...*" ,which is of the Holy Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) sunnah. This phrase has been omitted and replaced by "*so and so*", and their interpretation of some of the texts of the Messenger’s sunnah which referred to this question, and prohibiting the writing down of the Messenger’s traditions, and killing whoever disagreed with them, such as their killing Nesa’aei, one of the authors of the six Sahih, because he wrote the book “The Special Characteristics of Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).”

Their prohibition was not confined to the publication of the facts about the texts concerning the right of the twelve Imams (peace be on them). It further covered everything that contradicted the interest of the ruling classes. The envoy of the Caliph Yazid told Abdullah Ibn Zubair, - who had denounced Yazid - during their meeting in Makkah: "O Son of Zubair! Was it you who ascended the pulpit and talked against Amir al-Mu’minin, accusing him of every ugliness, and said that you were like the doves of Makkah?" Then he ordered his page to fetch his bow and arrows. He took an arrow and put it in the bow and aiming at one of the doves of Makkah, said: "O dove! Does Amirul Mu’minin drink? Say: ‘Yes’! By Allah if you say yes, my arrow will never miss you! O dove! Does Amirul Mu’minin play with the apes and the leopards, and transgress the religion? Say yes, and by Allah if you say yes, my arrow will never miss you..."¹(1)

They exaggerated, particularly in changing the facts about the Messenger’s successor to the extent of cursing him in the Friday Sermons for about ninety years all over the Islamic lands, except in Sajistaan (present day Sistaan in Iran).

¹ This narrative is fully related, together with its sources, under the title "The revolution of the people of al-Haramayn", in the 3rd volume of this book

Yet, despite all those restrictions and strict constraints - to the extent of killing whoever narrates any Prophetic hadith exalting 'Ali's merits - some ahaadith were leaked, contrary to the interests of the Caliphs, and were recorded in some books of ahaadith, exegeses, biographies and the like. The followers of their School confronted that by burning the libraries containing hundreds of thousands of manuscripts written by the hands of their authors¹(2), just because they suspected them to include something harmful to the interest of the caliphs. Nevertheless, after the said vehemence in preventing the spread of the facts, there remained of the Messenger's Sunnah in our hands, through the ways of the Caliphate School, the following text in favour of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), such as the Messenger's hadith: "*Ali to me is as Haroon was to Moosa, except that there will be no prophet after me.*"

In Ghadir Khumm, when Allah the Almighty ordered His Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) to appoint the master of the affairs after him, as the verse which was then revealed said: **"O Messenger! Convey what has been revealed to you from your Lord, and if you do it not, then you have not conveyed His Message at all; and Allah will protect you from the people..."** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 67). Immediately, the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) ascended a pulpit made of camel-saddles. He (peace be on him and his progeny) raised 'Ali by the hand and said: "*Allah is my Master, and I am your master. Of whoever I am his master, this 'Ali is his master (too). O Allah! Take him as a slave who takes Ali as his master and be an enemy to the one who takes Ali as his enemy.*" Then he put his turban, called Sahaab, on 'Ali's (peace be on him) head, after which the following verse was revealed: **"This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favour on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion."** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 3)

Another verse was further revealed: **"Only Allah is your Master and His Messenger and those who believe, who keep up the prayers and pay the poor-rate during bowing (in the prayers)."** (Surah Maaedah (5): Verse 55)

Concerning both his grandsons, Hasan and Husain, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*He is from me.*"

¹ Look up the title "Burning Books and Libraries"

He (peace be on him and his progeny) also said: "*Hasan and Husain are two from the grandsons.*"

Concerning the Imams (peace be on them) after him, Imam 'Ali and the eleven Imams of 'Ali's offspring (peace be on them all), the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*They are the masters of the affairs referred to in the verse: **O you who believe! Obey Allah and the Messenger and those possessing authority from among you.***"

The Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) further said concerning them: "*My Ahl al-Bait are like Noah's ark; whoever boarded it was safe, and whoever lagged behind was drowned.*"

He (peace be on him and his progeny) placed them on an equal status with the Holy Qur'an:

"I am leaving among you two precious things: The Book of Allah and my offspring. As long as you fasten unto them, you will not go astray after me. The Gracious and the Aware (Allah) informed me that they will not separate with each other until they meet me at the Pond (of Kauthar)."

It is inferred from this hadith of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) that one of the Imams must live so long as to continue accompanying the Holy Qur'an till the Day of Resurrection.

He (peace be on him and his progeny) even mentioned their number and said: "*This religion will subsist until the Resurrection Hour or twelve rule over you.*" In a narrative:

"The people's affair will continue up till twelve..."

In another narrative after that he (peace be on him and his progeny) said: "*... Then there will be chaos..*"

Another narrative says: "*... When they die the earth will drown with its people.*"

In yet another narration, he (peace be on him and his progeny) said that their number was twelve like the number of the chiefs of Bani Israel.

All those narrative do not come true except in respect of the twelve Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them), of whom the last will live long, and after them the world will perish. But as the scholars of the Caliphate School did not accept the

Imams of Ahl al-Bait, they were confounded while explaining those true narratives. They also could not interpret them satisfactorily.

Hereunder are the names of those twelve as declared by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in one of his ahaadith.

The successors of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) after him:

The first: ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib, Amirul Mu’minîn, the successor.

The second: Hasan Ibn ‘Ali, the elder grandson.

The third: Husain Ibn ‘Ali, the younger grandson, al-Shaheed.

The fourth: ‘Ali Ibn Husain, al-Sajjad.

The fifth: Muhammad Ibn ‘Ali‘ al-Baqir.

The sixth: Ja‘far Ibn Muhammad, al-Sadiq.

The seventh: Musa Ibn Ja‘far, al-Kazim.

The eighth: ‘Ali Ibn Musa, al-Rida.

The ninth: Muhammad Ibn ‘Ali, al-Jawad.

The tenth: ‘Ali Ibn Muhammad, al-Hadi.

The eleventh: Hasan Ibn ‘Ali, al-‘Askari.

The twelfth: Muhammad Ibn Hasan, al-Mahdi, the Awaited One, the Divine Proof.

The Inclination of the Ruling Authorities during 13 Centuries

The evidences proving the Imamate of the Twelve Imams of Ahlul Bait (peace be on them), which we have so far related, were all taken from the most authorised sources of Islamic studies at the Caliphate School. Besides these sources, there are other sources of the Islamic studies of the Ahl al-Bait School, which include many texts successively and uninterruptedly quoted from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), confirming the Imamate of the twelve Imams, stating their names and attributes.

The followers of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School say that it should not be neglected that the authenticity of the Caliphate of the caliphs, whether Umayyads, Abbasides, Ottomans, and others, as well as the authenticity of their agents, governors, judges, Emirs and the Imams of the congregational prayers, all

over the Islamic countries, within some thirteen centuries, were all due to the concealment of the narratives proving the Imamate of Imam ‘Ali Ibn Abi Talib and the Imams from his offspring (peace be on them all).

Take, for example, Abu Yusuf, who was appointed as the chief of the judges by the Caliph Harun al-Abbasi. The authenticity of his post depended upon the authenticity of the caliphate of Harun, and the authenticity of his caliphate, depended upon there being no text on the Imamate of the twelve Imams. The same idea holds true also in respect of the ministry of the Barmakis, as they too were appointed as ministers by the caliphs of the Muslims on the authenticity of Harun’s caliphate. Likewise, all commanders of Muslim armies of his time were appointed by the Caliph of the Muslims Harun al-Abbasi. It was the same with the governors of different parts of the Islamic countries, such as the Emirs of San‘a’, Makkah, Madinah, Kufah, Syria, Alexandria, Rayy (modern day Tehran), Khurasan and other countries and regions, as well as the Friday Imams from the farthest lands of Africa till beyond Khurasan, Hijaz, Yemen, Syria, Iraq and other Islamic lands. All of them ran, in their posts, a luxurious life thanks to the authenticity of the caliphate of Harun, the caliph whose authenticity was based on there being no specific Imam appointed by Allah and confirmed by the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) in that time, viz. Imam Musa Ibn Ja‘far (peace be on them both) nor even the former Imams (peace be on them).

This was usually during the rule of Yazid, Mu‘awiyah, ‘Uthman and others down to the Ottoman caliphs. All those who benefitted by the post of caliphate all the time, did so because of their posts and living conditions, since there was no text denoting the Imamate of any Imam except the Caliphs, as they allege. Nevertheless, the above mentioned text confirming the Imamate of the Imams of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) remained dispersed inside the sources of the Islamic studies of the Caliphate School till date. This is because Allah the Almighty willed to complete His argument against the people till eternity.

And what Allah willed did happen.

* * *

Having finished our study of the opinions of the two Schools about the Companions and the Imamate, we now depend on Allah's help in studying by Allah's will, the opinions of the two Schools about the sources of the Islamic Shari'ah, and how each party utilized it.

KEYS TO ARABIC PRONUNCIATION

Transliterations

['] as 'a' at the beginning of an English word.

[th] as the 'th' in 'theree'.

[h] an audible guttural sound of 'h'.

[kh] as the german 'ach' or the Russian 'x'.

[dh] as 'the' in 'this'.

[s] a thick sound of 's'.

[d] formed by touching the upper incisor teeth with the tip of the tongue.

[t] as a common 'ti', but pronounced with a deep smacking sound.

[z] as 'd', but with half-closed mouth.

['] aguttural sound formed at the end of the throat.

[gh] like the parisian 'r'.

[q] formed by pressing the middle of the tongue to the palate.

Long Vowels [a] as in 'far'. [u] as in 'sure'.

[i] as the 'ee' in 'feet'.

Short Vowels [a] as in 'cat'. [u] as in 'put'. [i] as in 'fit'.

GLOSSORY

A

Adhan: call to the prayers.

‘ahd: covenant, agreement, pledge.

A.H.: abbreviation of "After the Hijrah"

Ahl al-Bait: The People of the House, i.e. the offspring of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

Alawi: the offspring of ‘Ali Ibn Abi Taib.

Alawism: the school of thought of ‘Ali and his followers.

Amr: affair, wordly life, rule.

Ansar: The Supporters: The people of Madinah who supported the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and the Migrants.

‘Arsh: The Supreme throne of Allah (a symbolic name).

verse: a sign or a mark / a Qur’anic verse.

B

batil: wrong, void, false and falsehood.

allegiance: a contract, a transaction, pledge of allegiance.

Bait: house, family.

Baitullah al-Haram: The sacred House of Allah (the ka‘bah and its surrounding square).

Bait al-maal: The Public Treasury

bid‘ah: innovation (contrary to the sunnah).

D

dirham: a silver Islamic coin.

du‘a’: invocation / supplication.

E

Emaarah: commandership / principedom

Emir: commander / prince.

F

Farsakh: a measure of distance of about 8 km.

fasiq: disobedient / sinner.

fatwa (Pl.fatawa): a mujtahid’s religious judgement or a decree.

fiqh: jurisprudence.

fisq: sinning / disobedience.

fujur: debaucheries.

G

ghusl: a ritual washing of the body.

H

hadith: a narrative concerning the Prophet’s sunnah.

hajj: pilgrimage to Makkah and performing special rituals in certain months of the year.

haq: truth / right.

haram: any holy place: al-Haram al-Makki = the mosque surrounding the ka‘bah.

haraam: religiously unlawful / prohibited / not allowed.

hijrah: migration / the year on which the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) migrated from Makkah to Madinah.

helf (pl. ahlaaf): pact / alliance.

hujjah: a proof / an evidence.

I

‘Id (pl. A‘yaad): a feast.

‘Idayn: The Two ‘Ids = ‘Idul Adha (the tenth day of the month of Dhul Hijjah, and ‘Idul fitr (the first day of the month of Shawwal).

Ijtihad: endeavour / independent judgement in a theological question.

Imam: a religious leader in performing the congregational prayers / a highly-revered man of religion.

Imaamah: the position of being an Imam.

insha’llah: if Allah wills.

‘isha’: evening / evening salat / supper.

isra’: nocturnal journey.

J

jaahiliyyah: time of paganism = the pre-Islamic era.

jirīb: acre.

K

Ka‘bah: the holy place in Makkah to which all the performers of the prayers, all over the world, should direct their faces.

khilaafah: caliphate. khalīfah: caliph.

khawarij: Kharijites

Kisaa’: any cloth covering a person / a mantle / a cloak.

Kursi: a chair / the divine throne.

M

maghaazi (pl. of ghazwah): setting out for a raid of an expedition.

maqam: standing place (specially of a holy man).

mash‘arul haram: a place near Makkah where some rites are to be performed during the Hajj.

mawla: friend / companion / master.

minbar: pulpit (many-stepped platform for delivering speeches).

Muhajir: a Migrant / of those who migrated with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) to Madinah.

mujahid: a fighter in Allah’s way.

mujtahid: the jurist/prudent who practises ijtihad.

musalla: place for performing prayers

mushrik: an idolator/polytheist.

R

rafidi: one who rejects or refutes

rak‘ah: a complete unit of the prayer.

ruku‘: bowing in the prayer as an important part of the prayer.

S

S.A.W.A.: abbreviation of the Arabic phrase sallallahu ‘alaihi wa aalehi (may Allah’s blessing be upon him and his progeny).

Sa‘: a measure for grain.

sahabi (Pl. sahaabah): a companion of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

sajdah: prostration on the ground which constitutes an important element of the prayer.

sa‘i: a part of the Hajj rituals.

salat: the Islamic prayer.

salawaat: sending blessing upon the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his progeny.

sawm or siyam: fasting according to Islamic teachings.

sibt (Pl. asbaat): grandson / tribe of the Israelites.

shari'ah: the Islamic Law.

shi'ah: shiite.

sirah: biography, especially of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

polytheism: idolatry.

shura: council.

sultan: power / authority / king.

sunnah: the total conduct, conversations and speeches of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).

surah: a chapter of the Noble Qur'an.

T

Tabi'in: (Pl. of Tabi'): followers / those who did not see the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) but saw his Companions.

Tabuk: a place and the name of one of the Messenger's battles in that place.

Tafsir: Exegesis of the Holy Qur'an.

taghut: false deity / tyrant.

takbir: to say: "Allahu Akbar". i.e. Allah is the Greatest.

tulaqa' (Pl. of taliq): those polytheists of Makkah who had been released after conquering the town.

tawhid: monotheism.

thaqalayn: The Two Precious/Invaluable things, i.e. the Book of Allah and Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)

U

ulama' (Pl. of alim): scholars.

ulul amr (Pl. of walyyul amr): the rulers / those possessing authority.

ummah: the nation / the people.

‘umrah: the minor pilgrimage.

usul: fundamental/dogma.

W

wali: guardian / master.

wasi: successor / executor of a will.

wasiyyah: will / bequest.

wilaayah: mastership/ guardianship.

wasiyyah: executorship.

Z

zakat: Islamic taxes.

A Call and Invitation to Renew the Life of Islam And to Unite the word of the Muslims

To the Islamic World League in Makkah.

To the Islamic University in Madinah.

To the Scholarly centres in Najaf, Khurasan, Qum, and Isfahan, al-Azhar University in Cairo, the Zaytuna and Qirawan Universities in Tunisia, and al-Qurawiyyn University in Morocco.

To the thinkers, scholars and writers of the Islamic world.

To the faithful warriors fighting for the sake of restoring Islam to the Islamic countries.

To the zealous reformers who try to unite the word of the Muslims.

To you all I announce this call and present this invitation,

with utmost respect. I say that the Islamic world has started a renaissance to renew the Islamic life. In order to achieve this great goal, an entirely objective study should be done of the heritage of all Muslims,

i.e. the sources of the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny), his conduct and his ahaadith. We must not keep imitating our ancestors in the field of deducting legislative religious precepts nor follow their way of interpreting the ahaadith. In this way, Islam can be comprehended through the Holy Qur'an and the Sunnah, and then it would be easier to unify the word of the Muslims around them and implement the renewal of Islamic life.

Here, I have presented to you all these discussions arranged in such a way aiming at the said goal. I hope you consider them with scientific impartiality and point out to me the errors which accompany the fallible humans.

"Say: "This is my way! I call to Allah, with full awareness, I and those who follow me. Glory be to Allah and I am not of the polytheists." (Surah Yusuf (12): Verse 108)

The Author